University of Helsinki, Institute of Behavioural Sciences,
Studies in Educational Sciences 253

**Chia-Chien Chang**

# HIGHLY EDUCATED TAIWANESE WOMEN SEEKING A SELF-ACCEPTABLE SOCIAL POSITION IN FINLAND

Helsinki 2014

**Custos**
Professor Gunilla Holm, University of Helsinki

**Supervisors**
Professor Gunilla Holm, University of Helsinki
Docent Sirpa Lappalainen, University of Helsinki

**Pre-examiners**
Professor Leena Koski, University of Eastern Finland
Docent Seija Keskitalo-Foley, University of Lapland

**Opponent**
Dr. Ghazala Bhatti, Bath Spa University, UK

**Cover photograph**
Chia-Chien Chang *Flying with Purpose, Not Just Drifting with the Wind*

Unigrafia, Helsinki

ISBN 978-952-10-9370-8 (pbk)
ISBN 978-952-10-9371-5 (pdf)

ISSN-L 1798-8322
ISSN 1798-8322

University of Helsinki, Institute of Behavioural Sciences,
Studies in Educational Sciences 253

**Chia-Chien Chang**

# HIGHLY EDUCATED TAIWANESE WOMEN SEEKING A SELF-ACCEPTABLE SOCIAL POSITION IN FINLAND

## Abstract

Studies have identified immigrants' barriers to full employment in Finland but have revealed very little about how the intersections of gender, race/ethnicity and class influence the settlement process in Finnish society. The main purpose of the study was to investigate how highly educated (university-educated) Taiwanese women acquire, transfer and transform their cultural capital through their middle-class habitus to seek a self-acceptable social position in Finnish society. The study's theoretical frameworks have drawn on Bourdieu's concept of habitus, capital, field, and practice, and incorporate an intersectionality perspective into the data analysis in the interest of gaining deeper insights into the complexities of the women's experiences in terms of their multiple positions in different social settings in Finland.

This study employed a feminist standpoint epistemology in terms of epistemic commitments and used narrative inquiry with thematic analysis as the methodological strategy. Narrative inquiry as a methodological approach was used to elicit the stories of ten Taiwanese women who married Finns and immigrated to Finland. The data were produced through life-story interviews conducted in the women's first language, Chinese or Taiwanese in 2006. The discussion of the findings has been organized according to the three key themes: employability, underemployment, and mothering.

The common pattern of downward social mobility for first generation immigrants was found to repeat among these highly educated Taiwanese women, a pattern is not independent of questions of race/ethnicity in the Finnish labor market. Despite the weak link between cultural capital and employment outcomes, many of them have had no choice but to stay optimistic for – Luck is when preparation meets opportunity – by improving their never-good-enough Finnish language skills and acquiring more education or training, as part of an endeavor to reverse the "temporary" downward mobility. Some of the women have turned to care work beyond their previous training and formal qualifications; they have made compromises, have retrained and work as practical nurses due to a lack of employment opportunities in their fields.

Acculturation and maintaining their heritage within the Finnish context have become problematic for many of the women and their mothering practices. Finnishness has the utmost capacity to determine the legitimation of each member's capital and creates social boundaries which either promote or limit access to social mobility. In order to secure and maintain a better position for their children, the women raise their children as Finnish children by distancing themselves from their Taiwanese cultural heritage and espousing Finnishness. Paradoxically, these highly educated Taiwanese women are confined to a marginal position in the Finnish labor market, but on the other hand, middle-class privilege is identified in their mothering practices in terms of parental involvement in their children's education. Their home-based and school-based parental involvement hold the greatest hope for their children's realization of their full potential and ultimately maintaining their status as middle-class members of the dominant group. The stories of these Taiwanese women disclose how the intersections of social class, gender and race/ethnicity (re)produce inequalities in a Finnish context.

**Key words:** Habitus, cultural capital, intersectionality, Taiwanese immigrant women

Helsingin yliopiston käyttäytymistieteiden laitos
Kasvatustieteellisiä tutkimuksia 253

**Chia-Chien Chang**

# KORKEASTI KOULUTETUT TAIWANILAISNAISET ETSIMÄSSÄ ITSEHYVÄKSYNTÄÄ JA SOSIAALISTA ASEMAA SUOMESSA

## Tiivistelmä

Suomeen saapuneista maahanmuuttajista tehdyissä tutkimuksissa on tunnistettu maahanmuuttajien aliedustus työmarkkinoilla sekä esteet vakituiselle työllistymiselle, mutta toisaalta tutkimukset eivät ole juurikaan tuoneet esille minkälainen vaikutus sukupuolella, rodulla/etnisyydellä ja yhteiskuntaluokalla yhdessä ja risteävinä tekijöinä on integroitumisprosessissa suomalaiseen yhteiskuntaan. Tämän tutkimuksen tavoitteena oli tutkia miten korkeasti koulutetut (ylemmän korkeakoulututkinnon omaavat) taiwanilaiset naiset kartuttavat, siirtävät ja muuntavat kulttuurista pääomaansa yhteiskuntaluokkapohjaisen habituksensa kautta, löytääkseen itse hyväksymänsä sosiaalisen paikkansa suomalaisessa yhteiskunnassa. Teoreettinen viitekehys tässä tutkimuksessa on pääosin lähtöisin Bourdieun habituksen, pääoman, kenttien ja käytäntöjen käsitteistä. Lisäksi tutkimusaineiston käsittelyyn käytettiin teoreettisena näkökulmana intersektionaalisuutta, jotta saatiin luotua parempi käsitys siitä monimutkaisuudesta, jota taiwanilaiset naiset kokevat, olleessaan erilaisissa sosiaalisissa asemissa ja erilaisissa sosiaalisissa tilanteissa Suomessa.

Tässä tutkimuksessa käytettiin menetelminä feminististä standpoint-epistemologiaa, narratiivisen tutkimusmenetelmää ja temaattista analyysiä. Narratiivinen tutkimusmenetelmä oli tarpeellinen ja arvokas, kun haluttiin tunnistaa taiwanilaisnaisten intersektionaalinen asema Suomessa sekä saada selville heidän erilaiset ja yksilölliset näkemyksensä yhtä oikeellisina keskenään. Tutkimukseen osallistui kymmenen naishenkilöä, joilta kerättiin tutkimustietoa elämäntarinahaastatteluilla. Haastattelut suoritettiin naisten äidinkielellä, kiinaksi tai taiwaniksi, vuonna 2006. Haastatteluiden tulokset jaettiin kolmeen pääteemaan, jotka nousivat esille haastatteluaineiston analyysissä: työllistyminen, alityöllisyys ja äitiys.

Sosiaalisen aseman lasku toistuu kaavamaisesti korkeasti koulutettujen, ensimmäisessä sukupolvessa maahan muuttaneiden taiwanilaisnaisten elämässä, mihin vaikuttaa suomalaisen työvoiman rotu-/etnisyysasetelma. Huolimatta heikosta sidoksesta kulttuurisen pääoman ja työllistymisen onnistumisen välillä, monilla naisista ei ole muuta vaihtoehtoa kuin ylläpitää toivoaan sen suhteen, että “Onnekkuus on sitä, kun valmistautuminen kohtaa mahdollisuuden”, ja parantaa aina riittämättömäksi osoittautuvaa suomenkielentaitoaan tai hankkia

lisää paikallista koulutusta kääntääkseen “väliaikaisen” sosiaalisen aseman laskukierteen. Jotkut naiset ajautuvat terveydenhoitoalalle lähihoitajiksi, mutta valinta on kompromissi parempien työskentelymahdollisuuksien puutteessa, eivätkä he tee valintaa sen vuoksi, että ovat naisia. Lähihoitajiksi päätyvien osalta tapahtuu leimautumista työvoimassa sukupuolen ja rodun/etnisyyden osalta.

Naiset kasvattavat lapsensa yksinomaan suomalaisiksi etäännyttäen heidät taiwanilaisesta kulttuuriperimästään ja suosien suomalaisuutta. Paradoksaalisesti korkeasti koulutetut taiwanilaiset naiset on rajattu mitättömään rooliin suomalaisilla työmarkkinoilla, mutta toisaalta heidän keskiluokkainen etuoikeutettu roolinsa tulee esille äitiydessä ja tavassa, jolla he osallistuvat ja vaikuttavat lastensa kouluttautumiseen. Heidän kotona ja koulussa tapahtuva vanhemman rooli keskittyy suureen toiveeseen siitä, että he mahdollistavat lapsilleen hyödyntää täysi potentiaalinsa ja lopulta tulla tasavertaisiksi keskiluokan edustajiksi valtaväestön keskuudessa. Näiden taiwanilaisnaisten tarinat paljastavat, että sosiaalinen asema yhdessä sukupuolen ja rodun/etnisyyden kanssa tuo esille eriarvoisuutta suomalaisessa viitekehyksessä.

**Avainsanat:** habitus, kulttuurinen pääoma, intersektionaalisuus, taiwanilaiset maahanmuuttajanaiset

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First and foremost, I would like to thank all of the participants for sharing their time and personal experiences with me. You have inspired me to do my best because your stories are worth telling and reading with integrity and sincerity. Without your help and contribution, this dissertation would not have been possible.

I would like to express my deepest thanks to my supervisors who have challenged, enlightened, and educated me: Professor Gunilla Holm and Docent Sirpa Lappalainen. Thank you for your patience, inspiration, and guidance. I am profoundly thankful for your beliefs in the significance of my work. There are no words that can adequately express my gratitude.

I would like to give very special thanks to Professor Elina Lahelma for taking an interest in my research proposal and opening the door to my research life. Special thanks also go to Professor Diane Reay for her inspirational feedback and interesting discussions during my participation in an Erasmus exchange program at the University of Cambridge. I would like to express my sincere appreciation to my pre-examiners, Professor Leena Koski and Docent Seija Keskitalo-Foley, for their thought-provoking statements to improve the quality of this work.

My appreciation is extended to Harriet, Laia, and Tuija for their feedback and comments on my work at various stages. I owe a great deal of gratitude to Docent Paul Ilsley who spent his precious time in carefully proofreading my work and offering invaluable comments. My thanks also go to Mr. Tuomo Aalto for his assistance with formatting and layout of my dissertation.

I would like to acknowledge the Institute of Behavioural Sciences at the University of Helsinki, the Ministry of Education of Taiwan, Suomalainen Konkordia-liitto, and Niilo S. ja Helen Alhon säätiö for providing me with funding support to carry out this work.

I am greatly indebted to my family and especially my sister Chia-Ling and cousin Ting-Feng for their constant support and having an unwavering belief that one day I could complete my PhD. I would also like to extend my heartfelt thanks to my dear friends (in alphabetical order), Chieh-An, Chiung-Lin, Grace, Huei-Yi, Judy, Lana, Li-Fen, Michelle, Naoko, Su-Ping, Wen-Fu, Ya-Fen, and Yu-Fen, for their encouragement and comforting words to help me through difficult times.

Last, but most important, I would like to thank to my witty and handsome husband, Mikko. You are my source of joy, happiness, and strength, and you are the only reason for me to be in Finland. You never doubted that I would make it, even though I doubted myself quite often. Without your endless support, amazing tolerance, and unconditional love, I could never have finished this work.

Vantaa, May 2014

Chia-Chien Chang

# CONTENTS

# CHAPTER ONE

## Introduction

### 1.1 Re-Searching Myself: Looking Back at What Sparked My Research

I used to be a teacher at a junior college in Taiwan. In 2001, I married my Finnish husband and moved to Finland in the following year. As a matter of course, I completely submerged myself in learning the Finnish language in order to be employable in the local labor market. In some way, I believed that as soon as I could speak Finnish fluently, I would have a bright future in a country known for equality (see Hausmann, Tyson, & Zahidi, 2012; OECD, 2008). At the same time, I actively attended the Taiwanese in Finland Association's gatherings not only to share my nostalgia but also to find some useful information, such as materials and resources for learning the Finnish language, employment possibilities, and cultural differences. Nearly all of the permanent members of the Association were women married to Finns who had immigrated to Finland. I was navigating for the uncharted terrain through my own experience and that of other women.

I am married to a white Finn. My husband's parents, close relatives, and close friends whom I have been in regular contact with in Finland are all native-born white Finns. They are seemingly interested in getting to know me as a family member or a friend although sometimes I still have the feeling of being an outsider particularly when celebrating Finnish holidays and festivals. As an adult growing up in Taiwan, I never thought to define myself along racial/ethnic lines because everyone, including Taiwanese aboriginal people, I had contact with had black hair, black eyes, and yellow skin. Interestingly, from time to time, my peers (white immigrants) from the Finnish language programs asked me if I had experienced something bad or uncomfortable in Finland since my appearance, unlike theirs, is obviously different from Finns' appearance. For instance, a lady from the former Yugoslavia said to me, "as long as I keep my mouth shut, no Finns can tell I am an immigrant. But you even don't need to say a word, I immediately know you are not a Finn but an Asian."

Moreover, I vividly remember that one of my peers, a white American man marrying a Finnish wife, ambivalently bragged about his parents-in-law's loyalty to the True Finns Party (Perussuomalaiset) and anti-immigrant attitudes toward "certain" immigrant groups. When he said his in-laws saw him as "an American" rather than "that kind of immigrant who is not welcome to Finland", there was a

question in my mind that I never asked him: “If you were an Asian- or African-American, do you think you would still receive so much hospitality and warm welcome from Finns based on your Americanness?” (see Leinonen, 2012a)

Every now and then, my Finnish husband reassures me “Finns appreciate hardworking people. Asian people have a reputation of being hardworking.” Even if Asians are more culturally accepted thanks to “positive stereotypes” (see Chou & Feagin, 2010), does it supposedly mean that Asian immigrants have the same life chances in Finnish society? In late 2003, I got into a preparation program for immigrants who used to be teachers in their home countries. Yet, I started questioning about my future in Finland after a Korean woman in the same program told me that “even I myself don’t want my children to be taught by immigrants. What do you think about those Finnish parents? I take this program only because winter is the offseason for tourism and I have nothing to do. I don’t want you to get discouraged but just be realistic since I see the young me in you.” She used to be a Mathematics teacher in South Korea before moving to Finland. She had lived in Finland for eight years and spoke Finnish fluently. She tried whatever she could in an effort to have a teaching job; however, she ended up working as a tourist guide. My heart sank and I confusingly looked around the classroom at other immigrants, mostly from Russia and Estonia, and pondered what could go beyond the language barrier in a country known for equality.

Later, I learned that some of my university-educated friends and acquaintances became practical nurses (lähihoitaja) one after another. For example, my Japanese friend who also is married to a Finn recently took the suggestion from the municipal employment office to apply for the practical nurse training. She, a professional painter and a qualified art teacher in Japan, spent two years taking extra studies to fulfill the requirements for teaching jobs in Finland. Nevertheless, the only secure job she could get in the last eight years was to make Sushi in Japanese restaurants although she speaks Finnish fluently. It is hard not to question whether visible immigrants regardless of their education and gender face some unrevealed disadvantage.

At the end of 2004, I visited my home country Taiwan, and the most amazing experience was that I immediately regained the sense of power and control as a member of the majority group. Suddenly, I truly grasped the meaning of “unearned privilege”. I could go outside without being self-conscious of being a visible “outsider”. It was something beyond the feeling of belonging. During my stay, when I wandered in the city center, I sometimes spent a few hours sitting on a park bench, admiring flowers and enjoying the subtropical climate. While I saw numerous Indonesian and Philipino female workers wheeling the elderly or disabled people and babysitting young children in the park for some fresh air, I could not help thinking of my university-educated friends who were doing

similar jobs in Finland. I realized that caring jobs, either in Taiwan or in Finland, whether paid or unpaid, are still done mainly by women. Seemingly, women only compete with women. To some extent, women's empowerment is actually at the expense of other women's disempowerment either locally or globally (see Dejardin, 2008; Ehrenreich & Hochschild, 2003).

I had been struggling to figure out something or anything I could do in Finland. In spite of the discontinuity in my profession, I still had a strong longing for having a socially meaningful life; therefore, I started my doctoral studies in 2005. At a casual dinner gathering, I happened to mention my research plan. My Chinese friend, who is also married to a Finn, worriedly said that "we are not refugees who don't have any choices. Nobody forces us to stay here. You will upset many Finnish scholars. Be realistic! You are in no position to criticize as long as you are an immigrant in Finland." As Rastas points out, as a white native Finnish mother, the difference between her privileged position and other immigrant mothers is "how our talk is received: sometimes even their right to talk is questioned" (2004, p. 101).

Up until now, there is little public interest in hearing immigrants speak for themselves about their lived experiences in Finland. While the four largest immigrant groups, Estonians, Russians, Swedes, and Somalis, have received some attention from the mainstream academia in Finland, many small immigrant groups, such as Taiwanese, have been totally left out behind "the numbers". Occasionally, people still question me: "Why are you doing this research? What's so special about these Taiwanese women?" To me, there is no Why but Why Not. My research interest in this study stems partly from questions I have been struggling with myself and from my own lived experiences and my own observations that I have been interested in learning more about. As an insider, I can provide a distinctive perspective and fill gaps in the literature about the immigration studies in the host society. Moreover, adult immigrants' voices are fairly overlooked in the field of education. Regardless of age, gender, or race/ethnicity, immigrants' own understanding and interpretation of their experiences have been until very recently either unrecorded or silenced.

When compared with other advanced Western countries, Finland generally fares quite well in terms of equality. However, many of my university-educated friends (East Asian immigrant women) ended up choosing underemployment over unemployment and still struggle with underemployment resulting in lower self-esteem, lower status, and lower paying positions in spite of the fact that they speak Finnish and even have local degrees. Somehow, from my own observations in my immediate social circle, I cannot help having a pessimistic perception of the probability of visible immigrants' successful integration in Finnish society.

We Taiwanese have been taught to believe the notion of "No pain, No gain". Paradoxically, society continues, as it is today, to overlook the fact that the

intersections of social divisions, such as race/ethnicity, gender, or class, are associated with social inequality; thereby, some have to endure a lot of pain for little gain. Aside from immigrants' personal qualities and employability skills, there has not been enough debate and research on social power structures that actually limit the life chances of some immigrant groups (e.g., visible immigrants) and further contribute to reproducing existing social inequalities in Finland.

## 1.2 Research Background: Recent Immigration Trends in Finland

Since the mid-90s, the number of immigrants in Finland has been rising steadily. Recently Estonians have surpassed Russians as the largest group of immigrants in Finland. The next largest groups of immigrants are from Sweden, Somali, China, Iraqi, Thailand, Turkey, Germany, and India. However, immigrants only made up 3.1% of the total population in Finland at the end of 2010 (Statistics Finland, 2011). Family-ties have been one of the main reasons for immigrating to Finland (see Forsander & Ekholm, 2001; Forsander, 2004; Heikkilä, 2011a; Koskela, 2010; Lainiala & Säävälä, 2012; Raunio & Sotarauta, 2005). Intermarriage in which one spouse is foreign-born and the other is native-born accounted for 3.6% of the total married population in Finland in the 2008-2010 period (Lanzieri, 2012). Not surprisingly, Finnish spouses play an important role in facilitating integration of their foreign-born spouses (see Jääskeläinen, 2003; Lumio, 2011). According to Heikkilä (2008), intermarriages may help bridge various racial/ethnic and cultural groups in Finnish society. Intermarried couples are not less satisfied with their relationships than couples in which both partners are native-born Finns (Lainiala & Säävälä, 2012); however, intermarried couples suffer a higher divorce rate than other couples in Finland (Heikkilä, 2011a; SVT, 2012).

Some studies have documented various aspects of intermarriages in the Finnish context. For example, Jääskeläinen (2003) has reported that Russian and Estonian immigrants women married to native Finns are more successful in social and economic integration than their co-ethnic married counterparts residing in Finland. According to Reuter and Kyntäjä (2006), Russian women of low socioeconomic status who marry Finnish men are more likely to be stigmatized as prostitutes or gold-diggers. Hartikainen (2006) has claimed that domestic violence against Thai women is commonplace in Thai-Finnish intermarriages (see also Lumio, 2011). Sirkkilä's (2005) study has proposed that the model of male breadwinner adn female housewife predominates in Thai-Finnish intermarriages despite that the dual earner model is the norm in Finnish society. Lumio (2011) has identified the obstacles faced by the intermarried Thai women such as poor Finnish language skills, a lack of employment

opportunities, workplace bullying, and unawareness of available social services. In a study to investigate the elite white immigrants in American-Finnish intermarriages, Leinonen (2012a; 2012b) has contended that Americans have the privilege of disassociation from the racialized/ethnicized and class-based category of undesirable immigrants in Finland because of their nationality, race/ethnicity, and world status of the English language as an international language.

Immigrant presence in the Finnish labor market made up only three percent of the whole labor force. Immigrants suffer from higher rates of unemployment than native-born Finns. The unemployment rate among immigrants is three times higher than the national average (Heikkilä & Pikkarainen, 2008; Statistics Finland, 2012; Väänänen et al., 2009). The largest groups of immigrant participation in the Finnish labor market are Estonians and Russians. The next largest groups are Swedes, Thais, Chinese, Turks, Brits, and Germans. The average unemployment rate among immigrants (23%) is substantially higher than among the native-born population (10%). In terms of differences between nationalities, the unemployment rate is over 60% among Iraqs, Somalias and Afghanistans each, whereas the unemployment rate is below 13% among Germans, Estonians, and Chinese (Statistics Finland, 2012). International immigration research has confirmed that immigrants are often socio-economically underprivileged and disadvantaged in the host society; as a result, upward socioeconomic mobility is seldom achieved for first generation immigrants, in particular recent immigrants (Aycan & Berry, 1996; Reitz, 2001; Winter-Ebmer, 1994).

Most of the scholarly literature on immigration research in Finland has examined the economic performance of immigrants in the productive sphere and various aspects of employment situation, in particular the challenges and barriers to enter the Finnish labor market (e.g., Keski-Nisula, 2007; Heikkilä, 2012; Perhoniemi & Jasinskaja-Lahti, 2006). In a study on immigrants from the Indian subcontinent in the Helsinki Metropolitan labor force, Ahmad (2005, 2011) has revealed that co-ethnic contacts or networks play a significant role in mobilizing job information but, at the same time, immigrants are channeled into low skilled jobs in ethnic enclaves since immigrants lack access to the better socio-economic networks of the mainstream society. Research on the Turkish ethnic economy in Finland by Wahlbeck (2007, 2008) has shown that Turkish immigrants face a mobility trap in the ethnic economy in Finland although being self-employed or employed in "kebab economy" is an alternative pathway for Turkish immigrants to achieve social and economic integration. Habti (2012) has confirmed that family reasons (e.g., having a Finnish spouse, children) and career advancement opportunities are the key drivers of permanently staying in Finland for the highly skilled professionals from the Middle East and North

African countries although their relatively high-status occupations do not improve their social position in light of the racial/ethnic hierarchy of the host society. Sarvimäki's (2011) study has shown that non-OECD immigrants even 20 years after arriving in Finland are unable to achieve earnings parity with their native low-skilled counterparts and the earnings gap between immigrant women from non-OECD countries and their native counterparts is particularly large over the long run.

The barriers for immigrants entering the Finnish labor market have been identified as insufficient Finnish language skills, unrecognized foreign qualifications and a lack of local working experience (Forsander & Alitolppa-Niitamo, 2000; Paananen, 1999; Pehkonen, 2006; Tiilikainen, 2008). Local language proficiency and local work experience may facilitate employment when job seekers hold foreign educational qualifications (Friedberg, 2000). Nevertheless, proficiency in the Finnish language should not be considered a stand-alone causative factor for economic integration since Finnish language proficiency does not guarantee immigrants' future employment or career development (Joronen, 2005). Furthermore, research by Kyhä (2011) has alleged that being a highly educated immigrant does not necessarily increase the chance of finding a job in the Finnish labor market; thus, highly educated immigrants often experience downward occupational mobility. While immigrants have difficulty finding jobs in the mainstream labor market, they often turn to be self-employed, co-ethnic employed or employed in ethnic-specific jobs usually with low pay and low prestige as a route out of economic disadvantage (see also Ahmad, 2005, 2011; Forsander, 2002b; Tiilikainen, 2008; Wahlbeck, 2007, 2008). Moreover, immigrants are over-represented in temporary and low-skilled jobs with poor working conditions and have a higher likelihood of doing routine manual and less interactive tasks in comparison to their native-born counterparts in Finland (Kangasniemi & Kauhanen, 2013; Sutela, 2005; Väänänen et al., 2009).

Direct or indirect discrimination implicitly or explicitly in a variety of forms on the grounds of race, ethnicity, and/or national origin is not uncommon in Finnish society (Jasinskaja-Lahti, Liebkind, & Vesala, 2002; Joronen & Salonen, 2006; Jaakkola, 2009; Valtonen, 2004). Some studies have confirmed that racial/ethnic discrimination in every aspect of employment, such as recruitment, hiring, wages, work assignments, or layoffs, exists in the Finnish labor market (e.g., Aaltonen, Joronen, & Villa, 2009; Ahmad, 2011; Heikkilä, 2005; Larja et al., 2012; Paananen, 1999; Salmenhaara, 2008; Tanttu, 2009; Valtonen, 2001). For instance, Joronen (2005) has noted that immigrants from Somalia are more likely to be discriminated against than other immigrant groups in the Finnish labor market. Although the Non-Discrimination Act (21/2004), amended by several acts, including No. 84/2009, strengthens protection against employment

discrimination in Finland (FINLEX, 2012), the reality of immigrant integration into the Finnish labor market is still far from promising. Inequalities and discrimination on the ground of racial/ethnic origin or nationality in the workplace persist in the Finnish labor market, which contributes to structural marginality and social exclusion of immigrants (Larja et al., 2012; Wrede & Nordberg, 2010).

According to Migration Integration Policy Index III (MIPEX), Finland with slightly favorable integration policies remains at fourth position of the best integration policies towards immigrants, comparing immigrant integration policies in 31 countries including the EU countries, Canada, Norway, Switzerland and the United States (Huddleston, Niessen, Chaoimh, & White, 2011). Despite this, previous studies have pointed to the fact that systematic differential integration outcomes among immigrant groups persist in Finland. For instance, Western immigrants are more likely to be hired in spite of their non-Finnish education since Western European or North American qualifications are more likely to be acknowledged by the Finnish employers and facilitate the integration into the Finnish labor market (Forsander, 2003; Jaakkola & Reuter, 2007; Leinonen, 2012a; Paananen, 1999; Pöllänen, 2007; Tiilikainen, 2008). According to a study of attitudes toward immigrants covering 21 European countries (Hainmueller & Hiscox, 2007), Finns favor immigrants from European countries over those from non-European countries and prefer immigrants from richer European countries to those from poorer European countries; in other words, the most preferred immigrants in Finland are from richer European countries whereas the least preferred are from poorer countries outside Europe. Moreover, studies have confirmed that immigrants from developing countries experience most difficulties integrating into Finnish society and the most successful immigrants in Finland are Westerners (Pitkänen & Kouki, 2002; Heikkilä, 2005, 2012; Pehkonen, 2006). In other words, there is a hierarchy of preferences between immigrant groups within racial/ethnic category in Finnish society. Previous research thus leads us to expect that immigrants whose race/ethnicity and culture are similar to Finns' may relatively have better economic and social integration outcomes than other immigrants do in Finland. Therefore, social mobility is less attainable for visible immigrants in Finnish society.

The consistency of results among immigrant populations is found in New Zealand studies (Daldy, Poot, & Roskruge, 2012; Sobrun-Maharaj, Rossen, & Kim, 2011; Spoonley & Meares, 2009; Trlin, Henderson, & North, 2004) which have confirmed that employment rate for highly skilled immigrants from the Asia-Pacific region is much lower than for immigrants from Western countries and is influenced by factors such as inadequate language proficiency, non-recognition of qualifications, cultural differences, a lack of local work experience,

and employment discrimination. In line with research findings of Green, Kler and Leeves (2007) in the Australian context, Europe or North America immigrants are the best with regard to matching education to jobs while Asian immigrants have the highest rate of overeducation (i.e., underemployment). Similarly, studies in Canada have shown that many of barriers immigrants face in the Canadian labor market are strongly linked to their liability-of-foreignness which is evident in either negatively stereotyping the immigrants' country of national origin or discriminatory hiring practices (Fang, Samnani, Novicevic, & Bing, 2012; see also Bauder, 2003; Wald & Fang, 2008). In the Swiss context, the highly skilled immigrant women from non-EU countries face serious discrimination in employment based on country of origin, race/ethnicity, or religion (Riaño & Baghdadi, 2007). Moreover, a Europe-wide study has indicated that immigrants' potential is rarely fully utilized since the occupation-qualification mismatch of immigrants remains a salient feature of immigrants' employment outcomes in destination countries. Particularly, underemployment, i.e., overeducated or overqualified for a job, is determined to a great extent by the destination-country's economic situation and the labor force institutions (Aleksynska & Tritah, 2011). Non-Western immigrants in Sweden are more likely trapped in jobs which they are overqualified for (Andersson Joona, Datta Guptab, & Wadensjö, 2012); non-Western immigrants who face deskilling or decredentializing of their prior education and work experience is also found in Denmark (Brodman & Polaveja, 2011;Nielsen, 2011).

Forsander, Salmenhaara, Melegh, and Kondrateva (2008) argue that globalization has obvious implications for immigration by reproducing economic, ethnic and national hierarchies of power. The employment situation of immigrants in Finland, not surprisingly, follows a global pattern. Since Western immigrants are fare better on integration outcomes, there is a possible mechanism linking racial/ethnic segregation to integration outcomes for non-Western immigrants in Finland. Finnish society emphasizes the virtue of equality, yet the Finnish labor market implicitly espouses a perplexing and contradictory logic based on the racial/ethnic ladder, which (re)produces social injustice and inequality. Over the last decade, studies have identified immigrants' underrepresentation and barriers to full employment in the Finnish labor market but have revealed very little how the intertwined influence of gender, race/ethnicity and class may take place in the process of resettlement in Finnish society. Discrimination or inequality based on gender, race/ethnicity, nationality or other social divisions often remains concealed within institutional practices that operate to marginalize non-preferred immigrant groups in multifaceted social relations and processes. Although it is essential on behalf of the state to prioritize the labor force participation rate of immigrants, not enough public attention is paid to highly educated immigrants who are not

placed in suitable jobs at levels commensurate with their skills, experience and education.

## 1.3 Research Purpose and Question

We often hear that today's Finnish aging society requires a highly skilled workforce, but that does not necessarily translate into an abundance of equal employment opportunities for highly educated and skilled immigrants. When immigrants are over-represented among the unemployed and underemployed in Finland, the difficulty associated with integration into Finnish society may be exacerbated by race/ethnicity, gender or class. There are often simplified and prejudicial assumptions found in immigration research, including that immigrant women struggle against their patriarchal culture and that the host society offers an unproblematic avenue for gendered emancipation or women's empowerment while research often fails to link the socio-cultural context with individual narratives (see Erel, 2009; Riaño, 2011).

The purpose of this study is to gain a better understanding of the highly educated Taiwanese women's experiences, explore the relevance of cultural capital to their social position, and discover the intersections of race/ethnicity, class, and gender perceived from the perspective of individuals in Finnish society. The extent to which the Taiwanese women interpret themselves as members of an ethnic immigrant group and internalize or externalize social practices associated with that status and the influence of those practices on the process of resettlement in Finland is of interest. In order to address the research purpose, this study poses the specific research question:

**How do the highly educated Taiwanese women acquire, transfer and transform their cultural capital to seek a self-acceptable social position in Finnish society?**

To answer the above question, this study's theoretical frameworks have drawn on Bourdieu's theory of practice (Bourdieu, 1977) and incorporate an intersectionality perspective (Crenshaw, 2011) into the data analysis. This study is an in-depth exploration of the life stories of ten Taiwanese women in the interest of gaining deeper insights into the complexities of the women's experiences in terms of their multiple positions in Finland.

## 1.4 An Outline of the Dissertation

Before moving onto the next chapter, I briefly outline the structure of the body of this dissertation. In addition to a broad overview of the research in this chapter, Chapter 2 outlines Bourdieu's theoretical premises and presents particular reference to the concepts of habitus, capital, field and practice. Each social group strategically uses available capital, and the chosen strategies depend on what appears to be valued in a given social context. The highly educated Taiwanese women are solely dependent on their capital (mainly cultural capital) and class-based habitus to integrate into Finnish society. On a wider level, the concept of intersectionality is also introduced since an intersectional perspective yields further insight in examining how the interplay of race/ethnicity, gender and class influences immigration experiences of the Taiwanese women.

Chapter 3 details the rationale for drawing on a feminist standpoint epistemology and for using the narrative approach. The key characteristics of the methodology and the specific research design used are discussed. The research design, including the participants, data collection, and data analysis, are discussed in different sections. My reflection on the methodological challenges emerging from the research process is elaborated. Ethical issues such as assurances of consent and confidentiality concerning participants' rights are addressed and taken into serious consideration. Strategies for increasing trustworthiness, including triangulation, member checking, analysis of negative case evidence, and peer debriefing, are employed in the research procedures.

Chapter 4 highlights the impact of downward social mobility for these highly educated women who had been relatively well off and had a high social status with socio-economically advantaged backgrounds in Taiwan. They possessed considerable cultural capital by the time they moved to Finland since they all have university-level qualifications obtained in Taiwan. They continually strive to improve their employability in order to continue careers in their prior occupations while negotiating unfamiliar labor practices without social capital or the recognized cultural capital that Finns take for granted. There is a disjuncture between the portrayal of Finland as an egalitarian country and the reality experienced by these Taiwanese women. In a way, these women are legitimized as representatives of how to play the game since they have cultural capital valued in the field of practice. Yet, their immigrant backgrounds present negative or lower symbolic power in the given field.

Chapter 5 examines how these women explore the possibility of acquiring more valued capital by learning the Finnish language and pursuing local higher-education degrees. Their integration trajectories are strongly shaped by their middle-class habitus although they experience the change from being privileged as a member of the dominant group in Taiwan to being disadvantaged as a

member of a small immigrant ethnic group in Finland. They embrace a pragmatic strategy by redoing tertiary education and learning the destination language, while realizing that their non-Finnish qualifications and work experience are not valued and rewarded. They commit to sustaining their middle class position by taking responsibility to obtain the necessary Finnish qualifications and language proficiency in order to successfully integrate into the Finnish labor market.

Chapter 6 presents transformation of gender expectations in a cross-cultural context. Growing up in Taiwan, a Confucian society, and then immigrating to Finland, an egalitarian society, brings a variety of changes to these women's lives. Survival in Finnish society requires these women to shift and negotiate their perceptions of womanhood so they fit in with Finnish standards of an acceptable female role. Half of these highly educated women are full-time or part-time underemployed in traditionally female-dominated fields, such as long-term care for the elderly and the disabled, where labor shortages offer more employment opportunities. Immigranthood and gender equality are incompatible since these women's ghettoized status is complicated by a gendered and racialized/ethnicized labor market.

Chapter 7 demonstrates the intergenerational transmission of social status through mothering. While they still believe education is the key component to improving one's social status, in a way, they have been transforming from being vulnerable immigrants to active middle-class reproducers. For these Taiwanese women, Finland is a society characterized by the persistence of racial/ethnic stratification. They adopt the existing racial/ethnic hierarchy in which immigrants are the "other" in the eyes of the Finns. They espouse Finnishness in the reproduction of social class and racial/ethnic hierarchy through their mothering practices.

Chapter 8 provides a summary of the findings from the data chapters. This research provides an on-the-ground view of highly educated immigrants striving to be middle-class in Finnish society through the lens of ten Taiwanese women. One should note that it is not my intention here to provide a conclusion that can act as a universal truth about Taiwanese immigrant women in Finland. Nor does this study propose any solutions for successful integration. Instead, this study reveals the impact of the intersectionality of class, gender and race/ethnicity from the participants' life stories. Therefore, this study is a part of a process to develop a broader understanding of what counts as cultural capital for each of the women who took part in this study and how they have used valued cultural capital not only to improve their individual life chances but also to benefit the next generation.

# CHAPTER TWO

## Theoretical Framework

This study draws on Bourdieu's theory of practice to explore the relevance of cultural capital to highly educated Taiwanese women's social position in Finnish society in order to understand the structural reasons behind the individual choice making and practice in the processes of social reproduction. The centre of Bourdieu's theoretical premises is the relationships of struggle, competition, power and reproduction between structure and agency through dynamic practices in the fields. Considering that immigrants are not homogeneous groups, it is important to recognize the impact of multiple statuses immigrants hold in the process of resettlement. An intersectionality perspective is also incorporated in order to give sufficient attention to the complexity of gender, race/ethnicity, and class in terms of social inequalities.

### 2.1 Bourdieu's Theory of Practice

Bourdieu's theory of social reproduction has been highly influential in the sociology of education by proposing a paradigm of class analysis. To some extent, living and working conditions of all classes have improved; however, the social ladder in which each member of the group is assigned a certain status or position almost remains constant (see Bourdieu, 1973). For Bourdieu, society is made up of "directly visible beings, whether individuals or groups, [who] exist and subsist in and through difference; that is, they occupy relative positions in a space of relations" (Bourdieu, 1998, p. 31). Bourdieu deploys a number of compelling concepts, including capital, habitus, field, and practice. Social practice, led by a practical logic but not by consciousness, takes place in time and space through limitations and opportunities.

Since the social world runs on individuals pursuing their self-interests, all human behavior is interest-oriented by using different strategies based on a practical logic. As Bourdieu points out, "the structure of the social world is defined at every moment by the structure and distribution of the capital and profits characteristic of the different particular fields" (Bourdieu, 1985, p. 734). Individuals or groups take up the positions that significantly reflect the respective habitus, which depends on the volume and various forms of capital they bring to the fields (Bourdieu, 1997; Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). The concepts of habitus, capital and field illustrate the tendency to reproduce

structures and perpetuate inequalities. Bourdieu presents the following formula:

[(habitus) (capital)] + field = practice (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 101)

The formula underlines the interlocking nature of Bourdieu's three main "thinking tools": habitus, field and capital (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1989, p. 50). Bourdieu frequently makes an analogy between his theory of practice and a game (Bourdieu, 1977, 1986, 1990a; Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). A game where social inequalities are systematically reproduced operates through players' strategic positioning.

The more the capital increases, the greater the chance of profiting from the game. Some strategies are intended to maintain or improve players' positioning within the field by increasing capital whereas other strategies are for converting one form of capital to another. A player's skill at playing the game involves an evolving process of internalized experience and constantly shaping dispositions. Players who possess particular forms of capital are already advantaged at the outset to build more capital and advance further than other players. Each field has a particular type of "illusio" as a fundamental belief or an inherent craving that makes all players agree on the worth of the game (Bourdieu, 2000). In short, a player's chance of profiting from the game is enhanced by the respective habitus and the accumulation of capital. Bourdieu's formula concisely portrays the process of practice generation, captures the dynamic relationship between structure and agency, and encapsulates the interconnectedness and inter-dependence of the key concepts.

### 2.1.1 Habitus as a set of internalized schemes

Habitus, the central concept of Bourdieu's theory of practice, is a system of enduring dispositions, i.e., a set of acquired patterns of thought, behavior, taste, and tendencies, which lead to the appropriateness of practices in meaningful contexts (Bourdieu, 1987; 1990; 2002). For Bourdieu, power is created culturally and symbolically, and constantly re-legitimized by the interaction between individual agency and social structures, which happens through "habitus" that shapes behavior and thinking. Habitus can be identified along a continuum from abstract (i.e., dispositions as the core of habitus) to concrete (i.e., practices as the product of habitus) since habitus is structured by past experiences and present circumstances simultaneously as well as structuring one's present and future practices (Bourdieu, 1990). In Bourdieu's words, habitus is a "structured and structuring structure" which mediates between objectivity and subjectivity (Bourdieu, 1994, p. 170). While functioning as a matrix of perceptions,

appreciations, and actions, habitus shapes individuals' attitudes, guides individuals' actions and generates practices in different fields (Bourdieu, 1977).

Noteworthily, habitus is not a cluster of inborn traits; more often than not, it is passed down through generations. From childhood onwards, acquisition of habitus is formed by past experience along with a time dimension, both individual and collective, and by cumulative exposure to particular social positions across different fields (Bourdieu, 1977, 1993). Habitus plays a unique role between social structure and individual agency as Bourdieu and Wacquant suggest that "the notion of habitus accounts for the fact that social agents are neither particles of matter determined by external causes, nor little monads guided solely by internal reasons, executing a sort of perfectly rational internal program of action" (1992, p. 136). External structures are internalized in the early socialization experiences and the internalized dispositions guide individuals' practices through further socialization based on neither rationally calculating interest nor obeying the rules in different fields. In other words, practices correspond to the existing socialization since individuals respond to various types of social conditions on the basis of internalized dispositions in terms of the opportunities and limitations in various situations (see Krais, 2006).

Bourdieu uses the metaphor of "feeling like a fish in water" to describe the relation of field and habitus when habitus encounters a social world of which it is the product (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 127). Conversely, the mismatch between habitus and field may cause one to feel like a fish out of water. Moreover, the resulting disjuncture between expectations of habitus and opportunities in the given field can cause a "cleft habitus" which generates conflicts and tensions (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 109). Although stability of habitus is the default setting, habitus may be modifiable but resistant to change over a long historical period. Moreover, habitus is mainly from class-based experiences of socialization, which begins in early childhood and continues throughout life. For Bourdieu, habitus as a class-contingent set of dispositions shapes how individuals make sense of, orient to, and practice their daily world in a particular way of doing which is usually considered the only possible way of acting. Hence, habitus is central to understanding individuals' perceptions of their future prospects. Furthermore, individuals who internalize similar life chances share a similar habitus since individuals acquire schemes of perceptions in accordance with the social groups they belong to.

As Bourdieu proposes that "the practices of the members of the same groups or, in a differentiated society, the same class, are always more and better harmonized than the agents know or wish" (1990, p. 59). Same social position in society leads to the same habitus, which simultaneously reproduces social structures. While individuals' habitus has resonance with others who make and

display similar choices, habitus not only reflects the relative position of individuals and groups in the class hierarchy but also maintains the existence of homologous characteristics of social fields (Bourdieu, 1984). Habitus confines possibilities and determines practice based on the influence of and response to the past, present, and anticipated future, (Bourdieu, 1977; 1990). Through "subjective expectation of objective probabilities" (Bourdieu, 1977, p. 72), individuals tend to predict the future that fits them based on their class-based habitus (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). Social practices produce and reproduce the social world through the "schemes of perception, conception and action common to all members of the same group" (Bourdieu, 1977, p. 86). Hence, habitus facilitates systemic social inequality whereas social reproduction takes place through habitus.

### 2.1.2 Capital as a form of social power

Capital represents the different forms of social power which individuals seek to maximize in an attempt to maintain or improve their position in the social hierarchy within a given field (Bourdieu, 1986; 1997). Capital brings further rewards to the holder since "the kinds of capital, like trumps in a game of cards, are powers which define the chances of profit in a given field" (Bourdieu, 1985, p 724). Moreover, Bourdieu's concept of capital is not limited to the traditional economic form of money (see Bennett, Emmison, & Frow, 1999); rather, all fields function in a similar way in terms of the field of economics. That is, individuals require capital to participate, compete and succeed while entering a particular field in order to gain rewards. This social struggle for symbolic resources is central to Bourdieu's theory of practice. Bourdieu (1986) argues that the significance of the different forms of capital in explaining social relations lies in the modes of investment, accumulation, transmission, reproduction, and conversion; therefore, social groups compete for social-class positions by displaying the various forms of capital. Once certain form of capital is widely accepted and acknowledged within a society as relations of power whereby domination becomes social mechanisms to reproduce relations of domination and maintain the class-based structure of society without direct involvement by the dominant group in society.

Bourdieu identifies four types of capital that enable individuals to struggle for dominance. These forms of capital are economic capital (e.g., monetary rewards, wealth, assets, possessions), social capital (e.g., acquaintances, social connections, social networks, relational ties), cultural capital (e.g., language ability, knowledge and tastes, educational and occupational aspiration), and symbolic capital (e.g., legitimation, recognition) (Bourdieu, 1986; Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). Economic, social and cultural capital can be either material or

symbolic, and symbolic capital can be either of these capitals in socially recognized and legitimized form (Fuchs, 2003). In other words, symbolic capital, to some extent, encompasses all the forms of capital because symbolic capital has the function of legitimizing other forms of capital.

Under certain conditions and at certain rates, each form of capital can be converted into another form of capital. The interconversion of various forms of capital can vary from society to society. Economic capital such as income, wealth and assets, is "immediately and directly convertible into money" (Bourdieu, 1986, p. 47). Economic capital can also be institutionalized in the form of property entitlements and ownership. Bourdieu explicitly states that "economic capital is at the root of all other types of capital" (1986, p. 252). Economic capital, the predominant form of capital in a society, usually combines with other forms of capital to produce and reproduce inequality and social hierarchy.

Social capital is "the sum of the resources, actual or virtual, that accrue to an individual or a group by virtue of possessing a durable network of more or less institutionalized relationships of mutual acquaintance and recognition" (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 119), which can be institutionalized in the form of status titles and can be converted into economic capital. Social capital, a form of power that facilitates trust, provides access to goods and services through the social relationships and networks. Moreover, these durable social ties affirm and reaffirm mutual recognition only by individuals sharing similar status in the persistence of social groups (Bourdieu, 1986).

The definition of cultural capital has varied over time since cultural capital encapsulates all forms of "widely shared, high status cultural signals," including "attitudes, preferences, formal knowledge, behaviors, goods and credentials" (Lamont & Lareau, 1988, p. 156). Some research literature focuses, in the narrow sense, primarily on highbrow cultural activities such as classical concerts, operas, live plays, classical literature or art museums; however, cultural capital can come in a variety of forms (Lamont & Lareau, 1988; Lareau & Weininger, 2003). In general, cultural capital refers to the normative standards and knowledge of the dominant groups although cultural capital enumerated by Bourdieu ranges from narrowly defined forms (e.g., highbrow cultural tastes, educational credentials) to broadly defined forms (e.g., attitudes, knowledge, behaviors, preferences). Cultural capital, as a form of intellectual capital, affects individuals' life chances while reproducing a specific social order. Accordingly, cultural capital enables individuals and families with knowledge of high-status cultural signals to build and sustain advantage in competing better for social positions. As a symbol of distinction, cultural capital distinguishes particular members of groups in society by assisting them in obtaining resources and sustaining privileges (Lamont & Lareau, 1988; Webb, Schirato, & Danaher, 2002). Transmissibility of cultural capital plays a crucial role within Bourdieu's

theory of practice. Cultural capital is largely generated and transmitted within families, and in turn within classes, by the formation of the habitus of their group members.

Bourdieu further indentifies three subtypes of cultural capital: the embodied form, the objectified form, and the institutionalized form (Bourdieu, 1986). The embodied cultural capital, such as values, habits, knowledge, and attitudes, is in the form of long-lasting dispositions of the mind and body. The embodied cultural capital is an intangible possession of the individual, which begins in early childhood in terms of social and learned aspects and takes time to accumulate through the socialization process. Therefore, embodied cultural capital requires "pedagogical action", that is "the investment of time by parents, other family members, or hired professionals to sensitize the child to cultural distinctions" (Swartz, 1997, p. 76). The objectified cultural capital consists of cultural goods, such as books, works of art, instruments, and machines which are tangible products requiring specialized cultural knowledge, abilities and skills to use. Bourdieu (1986, p. 50) defines objectified cultural capital as "cultural capital objectified in material objects and media." The objectified cultural capital, like all other forms of capital, functions to maintain or enhance individuals' positions by holding value in relation to legitimacy in a given field. The institutionalized cultural capital, such as academic qualifications, certificates and degrees, presents "institutional recognition" (Bourdieu, 1986, p. 51). In other words, the institutionalized cultural capital is a standardized and officially recognized specific indicator of cultural competence and professional skills. Bourdieu (1977) considers the institutionalized cultural capital vital to the form of cultural capital as he states, "academic qualifications are to cultural capital what money is to economic capital" (p. 187). Lareau (1989) posits a three-stage process for transforming resources into cultural capital and then into social benefits. First, cultural resources need to be possessed. Second, the value of these resources must be recognized and converted to cultural capital. Finally, cultural capital must be activated or invested, so a social benefit or profit is (re)produced.

Capital, as a form of power, is distributed unequally and differently between and within social groups, which is an important dimension of social inequality in societies. The volume of capital, whether economic, social or cultural capital, determines individuals' social positions within fields. Individuals or groups who already possess certain amount of capital get great odds for further success based on the existing experience, resources, skills, or social contacts, which consequently results in creating a winner-take-all rule (Webb, Schirato, & Danaher, 2002). Thus, capital should be understood in terms of its practical consequences. Social relationships constructed by domination, subordination or equivalency are interwoven with the power of capital. Power, therefore, is maintained by the amount and distribution of capital across fields.

### 2.1.3 Field as a site of struggle and competition

In Bourdieu's writings, a number of terms, such as social position, social world, social space, and situation, are used in various contexts to refer to the notion of field. Field is represented as "a network, or configuration, of objective relations between positions. These positions are objectively defined, in their existence and in the determinations they impose upon their occupants, agents or institutions, by their present and potential situation in the structure of the distribution of species of power (or capital)" (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 97). Bourdieu uses the notion of social space or field to illustrate the power relations in the social world. By power, Bourdieu means those who have field-specific capital in the given field.

Comparing Bourdieu's concept of field to a poker game, a poker game may offer the players an opportunity to challenge and play with other players who adhere to the rules of the game; however, every player does not begin with the same amount of chips, which indicates the unequal distribution of capital. The pile of chips in front of the players influences how they play and strategize differently within the game (Swartz, 1997). Hence, fields denote a dynamic social space in which individuals or groups struggle for social positions not only on the basis of ownership of volume and forms of capital but also on the basis of unequal distribution of capital (Bourdieu, 1998).

Fields are "structured spaces that are organized around specific types of capital or combinations of capital" (Swartz, 1997, p. 117). When habitus and field are aligned, what an individual feels inclined to do will match the given expectations of field since a range of possible practices is already suggested by each individual's habitus. In other words, practices within a field, do not follow explicit rules but regular patterns. Fields are structured not only by a system of explicit and implicit rules, but also by the distribution of the various forms of capital (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992; Swartz, 1997). Each individual or group employs strategies for seeking greater positions within different fields and institutional realms such as education, religion, politics, and economy. Thus, fields are arenas of social struggle.

The field of power refers to the dominance in social space. As a result, the field tends to benefit dominant classes but to disadvantage dominated classes who have incompatible habitus and a lack of capital. Moreover, dominant classes utilize their capital to sustain social positions and reinforce the structures that persistently endow them with the dominant legitimacy. Thus, a field can reproduce the fundamental structure of social inequality and the system of unequal relations while creating symbolic capital and regulating the distribution of capital.

## 2.2 Implications and Limitations of Bourdieu's Concepts

Bourdieu's notions of habitus, capital, and field have become foremost in the study of social inequality and reproduction of social stratification. Since immigrant integration can be seen as social practices that reflect and are embedded in broader social structures with mechanisms of privilege and inequality, scholars in different disciplines have adopted the concepts for studying immigrants. For instance, drawing on Bourdieu's notions of capital and practice, Adamuti-Trache (2013) has examined the relationship between language capital and social integration in Canada. An ethnographic study of two middle-class Chinese immigrant families has illustrated how immigrant parents' class habitus and socioeconomic resources facilitate their newcomer adolescents' English language acquisition and social integration in the United States (Chao, 2013). Bauder (2003) has explored how the institutionalized processes of cultural distinction contribute to the segmentation of immigrant labor by extending Bourdieu's cultural capital and reproduction of social inequalities in the educational system to an immigration context in Canada (see also Bauder, 2005; Girard & Bauder, 2007).

Erel (2010) has investigated the mechanisms of validation for new forms of cultural capital created by the highly educated women immigrants from Turkey in Germany and Britain, and identified the immigrant's own ethnic group is an important site for creating and validating the cultural resources of immigrants in the countries of residence. A study of immigrants living in remote mountainous areas in South Korea has discovered immigrants' accumulation of multicultural capital by acquiring cultural capital of the host country and maintaining that of their home countries through both the host country and home country media (Yoon, Kim, & Eom, 2011). Oliver and O'Reilly (2010) have analyzed immigration lifestyle of British immigrants in terms of (re)production of social class in Spain. Research by Leopold and Shavit (2013) have underlined the effects of cultural capital on immigrant children from the former Soviet Union in the context of the mainstream curriculum in Israel. Nowicka (2013) has focused on the social positions of Polish immigrants in association with the intersections of different types of capital in Germany.

Bourdieu's contribution to our understanding of the issue of cultural reproduction of social inequalities has been highly acknowledged. Yet, many studies using Bourdieu's notions, as exemplified above, tend to focus on capital in terms of social stratification and mobility but overlook the correspondence between habitus and field for a more contextual analysis (see Gaddis, 2013). Capital is fundamentally linked to field and habitus according to Bourdieu's formula; thus, the partial usage of key concepts in analyses insufficiently comprehends the theory of practice (Bourdieu, 1984; see also Emirbayer &

Johnson, 2008; Hurtado, 2010; Swartz, 2008). Moreover, Bourdieu faces criticism for downplaying other sources of social inequality by overemphasizing class since there has been relatively little effort devoted to other dimensions of social inequality (e.g., gender inequality, racial/ethnic inequality) in most of Bourdieu's work (Moi, 1991; Lovell, 2000; see also Swartz, 1997).

Gender supports class reproduction in the analytical context, but not necessarily vice-versa, since gender is placed as ultimately secondary to social class based on Bourdieu's androcentric bias (Lovell, 2000; McCall, 1992). McNay (1999, 2000) and Adkins (2004) criticize Bourdieu for not integrating a gender lens into the effects of movement across fields in a differentiated society and for making no attempt to explain changes in gender over the past few decades. However, Moi (1999) suggests that we should think of gender as part of a field which is a "particularly combinatory social category, one that infiltrates and influences every other category" (p. 288). An individual holds multiple statuses at any point in time; thus, the degree and specific form of social inequality may be more pronounced in some aspects of social structure than in others. Therefore, it is useful and feasible to extend Bourdieu's approach to explore the connection between various forms of social stratification and different types of social inequalities enacted in society.

Class plays a role in the activation and usage of cultural resources to (re)produce social status; however, all societies have other social orders, such as gender and race/ethnicity, constructed by complex differential power relationships across fields. Recognition of the intersectional ways that all social divisions work together to shape the experiences of individuals or groups across different social contexts in societies is also central to this study. Therefore, an intersectionality perspective is also incorporated in this study. The following section provides an introduction to the concept of intersectionality, which furthers our understanding of how other social divisions, such as gender and race/ethnicity, come together with class to constitute the complex intersections of structures of disadvantages embedded into society in order to shed light on the Taiwanese women's barriers to the process of resettlement in Finnish society.

## 2.3 Intersectionality

The experiences of the underprivileged groups in the study of inequality may be inevitably overlooked while only focusing on one social division often oversimplifies the complex nature of hierarchies of power existing along multiple socially defined categories such as gender, race/ethnicity, and class (Acker, 2006; Anthias, 1998; Brah & Phonix, 2004; Cole, 2009; Crenshaw, 1995; Hancock, 2007). More often than not, social divisions are treated one at a time and are

studied individually (see Simien, 2007) as if they were completely separate from each other despite the multi-intersecting elements that figure into individuals' lives. Nevertheless, given that all of social divisions interact with one another, Collins (1993) argues that they are "distinctive yet interlocking" (1993, p. 26). All social divisions that reinforce or counteract one another are elements of social structures that generate inequality within and across groups (Collins, 1997; Staunæs, 2003). An intersectionality approach more accurately reflects the complexity of social position and behavior (Cole, 2009).

In light of the fact that social inequality can take place on individual, interpersonal, intergroup, institutional, structural, and cultural levels that may be interrelated and interactive simultaneously (Acker, 2006; Sidanius, Pratto, van Laar, & Levin, 2004). An intersectional analysis can do justice to the complexity of structural power relations and social inequality by revealing how individuals are empowered and disempowered in different structural locations (Ferree, 2011). The traditional mainstream feminism, constructed predominantly by white, western, middle-class, and heterosexual feminists, claims to represent the best interests of all women while marginalizing the interests of women of color within feminism all over again (Anthias, 2002; Anthias & Yuval-Davis, 1983; Brah & Phoenix, 2004; hooks, 1981, 1984; Mohanty, 1988). The multiple disadvantages experienced by women, particularly women of color, stem from the interdependent relationships between different forms of structural inequality (Hancock, 2007). The big picture of inequality and injustice has been obscured by a predetermined order of social divisions, for instance, gender over class, or gender over race/ethnicity.

As Garry (2012) highlights the necessity for women of color "to refuse to let white women 'own' a gender that is not white women's to own" (p. 516) in order not to universalize the experiences of women. Hence, it is necessary to recognize that "the area of race, class and gender studies struggles with the complex question of how to think about intersections of systems" (Collins, 1997, p. 73). In response to the white feminist dominance, several influential theorists, such as Avtar Brah, bell hooks, Chandra Talpade Mohanty, Floya Anthias, Hazel Carby, Patricia Hill Collins, and Nira Yuval-Davis have contributed to the further development and evolution of intersectionality in the 1990s (Erel, Haritaworn, Rodríguez, & Klesse, 2010, p. 58) since Crenshaw (1989) proposed the term "intersectionality" to denote how women of color are positioned within different but overlapping structures of domination.

> Consider an analogy to traffic in an intersection, coming and going in all four directions. Discrimination, like traffic through an intersection, may flow in one direction, and it may flow in another. If an accident happens in an intersection, it can be caused by cars traveling from any number of directions and, sometimes, from all of them. Similarly, if a Black woman is harmed because she is in an intersection, her

> injury could result from sex discrimination or race discrimination (…) But it is not always easy to reconstruct an accident: Sometimes the skid marks and the injuries simply indicate that they occurred simultaneously, frustrating efforts to determine which driver caused the harm. (Crenshaw, 1989, p. 149)

The intersection as a concurrence of several "roads" (Crenshaw, 1989, 1995, 1997) stands for cumulating features of discrimination and social exclusion as experienced by individuals and groups. In order to reject the prevailing idea of homogeneous social division, intersectionality posits that each social division intersects with the others. Crossing one social division with another alters the meaning of each division. Since individuals' social positions are experienced simultaneously, social inequality can hardly be well explained by only a single social division. Intersectionality provides an avenue to take a critical view of complex inequality within the interrelationships of social divisions.

According to Crenshaw's analogy of intersectionality, each road or street is a part of social divisions. For example, in my case, my roads would be East Asian, woman, Taoist, Taiwanese, etc. If I were involved in an accident at my intersection (e.g., be subjected to discrimination), the source could come from any of several directions or even multiple directions at the same time, and frequency and severity of collisions (discrimination) could be caused and compounded by any number of factors. Crenshaw's analogy of intersectionality illustrates the insufficiency of one-dimensional or single-axis analysis for understanding the multifaceted disadvantages of marginalized individuals or groups. As Collins argues that "the notion of intersectionality describes micro-level processes - namely, how each individual and group occupies a social position within interlocking structures" (Collins, 1997, p. 74). In this understanding of social life, inequality is constituted by particular situations and specific contexts rather than by identical structures.

The term intersectionality still remains a broad concept but has gained widespread popularity across disciplines and has been taken up in a variety of fields of research, such as criminology (e.g., Bell, 2013; Davis, 2008; Erez, Adelman, & Gregory, 2009), psychology (e.g., Cole, 2009), political science (e.g., Dhamoon, 2011; Hancock, 2007; Simien, 2007), and particularly gender studies and feminist research (e.g., Acker, 2006; Collins, 2000a; Crenshaw, 1989, 1995, 2000; Dill, McLaughlin, & Nieves, 2007; Garry, 2012; Holvino, 2010; Knapp, 2011; Lykke, 2011; McCall, 2005; Nash, 2008; van Amsterdam, 2013; Yuval-Davis, 2011). There are related terms in line with the concept of intersectionality, such as matrix of domination, multiple jeopardy, compound discrimination, multiple disadvantages, intersectional vulnerability, triple marginalization, cumulative discrimination and multidimensional discrimination (Collins, 1990; King, 1988; see also Makkonen, 2002, p. 10). In any case, intersectionality highlights the significance of interconnections and interdependence of all

aspects of the human experience in all places within and across socially constructed categories (Adib & Guerrier, 2003), which moves beyond sameness and difference (Keating, 2009).

Crenshaw (2011), however, reminds us that "intersectionality does not anticipate or call forth a listing of all differences nor does it offer a one-frame-fits-all theorization of how power is dynamically constituted through structures and categories, either separately or constitutively" (p. 232). The main strength of an intersectionality approach is the acknowledgment that power is embedded and intertwined in any socially defined categories. More important, intersectionality applies not simply to members of dominated or marginalized groups but to everyone (Garry, 2012). As Crenshaw argues:

> Intersectionality applies to everyone – no one exists outside of the matrix of power, but the implications of this matrix – when certain features are activated and relevant and when they are not – are contextual. Intersectionality represents a structural and dynamic arrangement; power marks these relationships among and between categories of experience that vary in their complexity. (2011, p. 230)

Moreover, the social divisions should not be ranked to establish relative priority of each single analytical category since the intersections of them jointly reinforce and simultaneously shape individuals' lives (Anthias & Yuval-Davis, 1992; Choo, & Ferree, 2010; Collins, 1993, 2000; Simien, 2007; Zinn & Dill, 1994). Accordingly, gender is simultaneously racialized and classed; race/ethnicity is classed and gendered at the same time; and classes are racialized and gendered all together. Staunæs (2003) suggests that "there is not a predetermined or pre-hierarchical pattern between categories. It is not gender first, then ethnicity, or the reverse sequence, first ethnicity, then gender" (p. 105). In the context of multiple group memberships, the heterogeneity can be found across and within social groups.

Social divisions mutually construct one another and different dimensions of intersections create varied results for different groups or individuals in different contexts. Thus, a good intersectional practice should delve into "relational and reinforcing exclusions and inclusions" (Taylor, 2010, p. 38). Correspondingly, Hancock (2007) presents intersectionality as a paradigm based on three aspects: the dimensions through and in which power operates, the levels where interaction occurs, and the types of privilege and disadvantage that individuals have. Likewise, Stewart and McDermott (2004) posit basic principles of intersectionality: "(a) no social group is homogeneous, (b) people must be located in terms of social structures that capture the power relations implied by those structures, and (c) there are unique, nonadditive effects of identifying with more than one social group" (pp. 531-532).

There is a general consensus about the need for utilizing an intersectionality approach to the study of social inequalities. However, one of the major criticisms surrounding an intersectionality approach is the number and type of categories being without an end or limit which is a weak point like "the Achilles heel of intersectional approaches" (Ludvig, 2006, p. 247). The list of categories might remain unlimited and never be finalized since category boundaries continually shift and new categories emerge. Thus, while some limitations are needed to make the work achievable in a practical sense, how many and which category in the sense of systemic social divisions should be included in an analysis of the intersectionality remain open (Lutz, 2002; Yuval-Davis, 2009). Moreover, Anthias (2013) points out, "social categorisations are not equally positioned or salient at all times. One or other of the divisions does not always matter in particular contexts or some may matter more than others" (p. 14). Therefore, an intersectionality approach should focus on social position as a site where multiple forms of power and hierarchy are enacted rather than on the categories themselves (Choo & Ferree, 2010; Dill & Zambrana, 2009; Staunæs, 2003; see also Yuval-Davis, 2006). Aside from the criticism, intersectionality is still a useful concept to draw attention to the "hidden or marginalized dynamics of power and exclusion across the social terrain" (Crenshaw, 2011, p. 233).

Increasingly scholars from a range of disciplines have employed an intersectionality perspective to study immigrants (see Dill & Zambrana, 2009). For instance, Ludvig (2006) has examined how categories of difference and identity intersect by analyzing a narrative of an immigrant woman in Vienna. Erez, Adelman, and Gregory (2009) have looked into immigrant battered women's experiences in the United States from 35 countries. Essers, Benschop and Doorewaard (2010) have focused on the meanings of femininity for Muslim immigrant businesswomen in the context of entrepreneurship in the Netherlands. Research by Lidola (2011) has explored Brazilian women's experiences of belonging and un-belonging in Berlin. Abbasian and Hellgren (2012) have scrutinized the working and employment conditions of cleaners in Stockholm, with a specific concentration on female and immigrant cleaners. Viruell-Fuentes, Miranda and Abdulrahimet (2012) have reviewed research on immigrant health in terms of race/ethnicity and immigrant status. Farris and de Jong (2013) have investigated discrimination against second-generation immigrant girls in education and employment in Denmark.

Besides the growing recognition and attention in a wide range of disciplines, there has been an increasing interest in integrating the concept of intersectionality to specific fields of immigration research in Finland (e.g., Keskinen & Vuori, 2012; Kynsilehto, 2011; Näre, 2013a). Immigration may result in silencing and further marginalization; particularly immigrant women of color often remain invisible, forgotten, and trapped to limited opportunities.

Intersectionality is a useful conceptual lens for looking at each individual experience in broader contexts. Therefore, an intersectionality perspective can further accommodate my research interest in how the interconnection of gender, class, and race/ethnicity interacts with the Taiwanese women's underprivileged or privileged positions in Finnish society.

## 2.4 Application of the Theory of Practice and Intersectionality

This study draws on Bourdieu's theory of practice through a lens of intersectionality to explore the ways that the highly educated Taiwanese women utilize their cultural capital to respond to their disadvantages associated with race/ethnicity, gender, and class positions in Finnish society. I take into account Bourdieu's concepts of habitus, cultural capital, and field in an effort to get a fuller picture of the highly educated Taiwanese women's social practices through which social inequality may be (re)produced in Finnish society. By drawing on Bourdieu's analogy of a game to concisely address the application of the concepts in this study, a feel or a sense of the game (middle-class habitus) provides each player (the highly educated Taiwanese immigrant) with an intimate understanding of the object of the social game and secure different levels of access to the resources (e.g., credentials, language, social connections) required for the social games that are played out in a given field (the host society). For the purpose of this study, I lean toward defining the host society as a field governed by its own set of social norms and rules in terms of existing power relations that determine what capital is valued and how individuals or groups compete over capital in order to secure advantages. In a field, power relationships between individuals or groups are determined by possession of valuable and legitimate capital; arguably, the chance of upward (or downward) social mobility for immigrants in the integration process largely rely on whether the forms of capital they possess are of value in the host society.

Immigrants can improve employability (e.g., Finnish language proficiency, local educational credentials, work experience) and build a network of contacts over time in the host country; however, it can be enormously challenging and time-consuming. Accordingly, these university-educated Taiwanese women are more likely to rely on their cultural resources rooted in their social origin to negotiate social positions in the host society since their educational attainment is directly related to the amount of cultural capital they possess. Cultural capital has become the new basis of social stratification (Bourdieu & Boltanski, 1978); nevertheless, these Taiwanese immigrants' cultural capital requires conversion with respect to the power of recognition in the process of resettlement in Finnish society. Hence, it is crucial to examine how habitus guides these women to take the possibilities of rational choice and actions against social and institutional

constraints before their cultural capital could be turned into social profits. Through the concept of habitus, this study also explores how these immigrant women (re)locate themselves within or across social classes in response to the existence of disjunctions while facing downward mobility, if any, that do not align with the perception of themselves that they had been nurturing in Taiwan. By taking into consideration the notion of field, this study can explore these highly educated women's struggle between the dominant and the dominated in the context of negotiating the rules of the new social space.

Moreover, immigrant integration involves overlapping social dynamics, encompassing gender, race/ethnicity, class, and other social divisions as well. The simultaneity of race/ethnicity, gender, and class come together at varying intersections to construct a Taiwanese woman's experience in Finnish society. These intersections, some more identifiable or unidentifiable than others, occur differently in different contexts and in complex ways. Based on the social reality, a Taiwanese woman does not live just as a member of the middle- or working-class, or solely as a woman, or merely as an immigrant, or simply as an Asian, but simultaneously as a Taiwanese immigrant woman in all moments of her life in Finland. How immigrants respond to the process of resettlement is fundamentally related to their social positions in the host society. When gender, race/ethnicity and class intersect, the existing power relations within each of these social divisions may shift. I acknowledge that gender, race/ethnicity and class all play roles in how the highly educated Taiwanese women interact with the host society. Thus, Bourdieu's formula for social practice: [(habitus) (capital)] + field = practice (1984, p. 101), the theoretical framework guiding this study, is modified by incorporating an intersectionality perspective, as shown in the following formula:

[(the highly educated Taiwanese women's middle-class habitus) (cultural capital)] + the intersections of gender, race/ethnicity and class in the host society = social actions

## Summary

The concepts of habitus, capital, field and practice illustrate the tendency to reproduce structures and perpetuate inequalities. The integrated complexity of habitus (dispositions), capital (valued resources) and field (social space) produces practice. Habitus is central to understanding individuals' perceptions of their future prospects. Same social position in society leads to the same habitus, which simultaneously reproduces social structures. Social power is maintained by the amount and distribution of capital across fields. Each social

group strategizes the use of available capital, and the chosen strategies rely on what appears to be valued in a given field. Crenshaw's analogy of intersectionality illustrates the insufficiency of one-dimensional or single-axis analysis for understanding the multifaceted advantages of marginalized individuals or groups. The main strength of an intersectionality approach is the acknowledgment that power is embedded and intertwined in any socially constituted categories. Bourdieu's theory of practice and Crenshaw's intersectionality are used in this study to understand the impact of gender, class and racial/ethnic disadvantages on the highly educated Taiwanese women's experiences of resettlement in terms of unequal power relations.

# CHAPTER THREE

## Methodology

This study employed a feminist standpoint epistemology in terms of epistemic commitments and used narrative inquiry with thematic analysis as the methodological strategy. The centrality of this chapter is a discussion of how the methodology used in attaining information relevant to the highly educated Taiwanese women's experiences in the aftermath of immigration to Finland. This chapter outlines the rationale for using a narrative approach in this research context, the key characteristics of this methodology and the specific research design used in relation to the research topic. A critical reflexive awareness of the researcher was included. The issues of ethical considerations and trustworthiness were also addressed.

### 3.1 Feminist Standpoint Epistemology

A feminist standpoint epistemology involves thinking from the perspective of women's experience and identifying the challenges that marginalized women confront in their daily lives. This study is influenced by a feminist standpoint epistemology that acknowledges women's perspective and represents a reconfiguration of social realities (Harding, 2004; Letherby, 2003). By paying close attention to the specificity of women's experiences, a feminist standpoint epistemology lays emphasis on the epistemic saliency of gender and the use of gender as an analytic category, which is often misrepresented as an oversimplification of the heterogeneity of marginalized women (Harding, 1991, 1993; Hartsock, 1998; Henwood & Pidegon, 1995). On the other hand, the standpoint of marginalized groups remains excluded from the standpoint of dominant groups since an epistemic access to scientific discourse is often unavailable for marginalized groups. As a result, knowledge is largely generated and legitimated by homogeneous groups in stratified societies (Henwood & Pidegon, 1995).

A standpoint is a social position from which social reality is perceived. People interpret and experience the world in relation to their social positions. The world is socially constructed in accordance to individual subjectivity, collective action, and reflection on social order. Therefore, a feminist standpoint requires a broad spectrum of experiences related to gender, race/ethnicity, class, and other social divisions to explore how the world is understood. The essential advantage of a feminist standpoint epistemology lies in the logic of discovery rather than of

correction (Hartsock, 1998). A feminist standpoint epistemology highlights the importance of contextually situated experiences in generating new knowledge. Different social positions make different perspectives on how the world is understood. Different social groups have different epistemological standpoints; therefore, all knowledge claims are socially situated (Harding, 1991, 1993).

The voices of marginalized women often remain hidden and unheard; however, it does not automatically indicate that all women from disadvantaged or marginalized groups share common interests or political concerns. The situatedness of experience is always gendered, racialized/ethnicized, classed, etc. As Walby (1997) succinctly indicates, "gender cannot be analyzed outside of ethnic, national, and racial relations, but neither can these latter phenomena be analyzed without gender" (p. 195). The Taiwanese immigrant women's experiences offer a unique perception and provide a better understanding of social realities regarding the intersections of gendered, racialized/ethnicized, and classed position in Finnish society since they are not in the dominant group that establishes the cultural values and social norms.

A feminist standpoint epistemology values the perspectives of marginalized and/or oppressed individuals and looks into the social conditions that shape different perspectives. Listening to immigrant women share their understanding provides an opportunity to not only generate new knowledge to the dominant culture, but also to exceed the limits of what is considered to be legitimate knowledge (see Hennessy, 1993). A feminist standpoint epistemology has influenced my choice of methodology and methods. The following section offers the main justification for the use of narrative inquiry as the most appropriate research approach in line with what a feminist standpoint epistemology supports.

## 3.2 Narrative Approach

Narrative research, through the dynamic and interactive process of telling and listening, is part of the broader practice of qualitative study. Narrative inquiry has been much discussed across disciplines. Nevertheless, for qualitative researchers, an initial problem is the different use of the terms, such as life story, life history, autobiography and biography, and their indistinguishable or interchangeable use since "every term carries a trace of the other terms" (Denzin, 1989, p. 47). It is impossible to define the term; hence, narrative is often employed as an umbrella term that unfolds multidimensions of subjective experiences of individuals within different social contexts (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). Narrative has been variously defined such as story, a way of knowing, or a method of inquiry; however, the most common description and understanding of narrative may be as "story" (Barrett & Stauffer, 2009). Stories can be found in a

variety of sources, for instance, interviews, conversations, written stories, written diaries, video diaries, poems, photographs, songs, comics, advertisements, paintings or drawings (Etherington, 2003). Narrative inquiry is the collection of stories about the participants' lived experiences provided in an interview or a literary work that are retold by the researcher for the purpose of understanding the participants' representations of the world (Bell, 2002; Gomez, 1997; Lieblich, Tuval-Mashiach, & Zilber, 1998).

The foremost value of narrative is its capacity to deal with complex participant-centered issues and further to reveal how individual life is constructed and reconstructed in relation to the dimensions of both particularity and generality (Connelly & Clandinin, 1990; Kramp, 2004; Patton, 1990; White, 1999; Webster & Mertova, 2007). Narrative inquiry recognizes multiple realities by drawing out the complex stories of the participants through multiple dimensions, such as memory and anticipation, interaction between situation and context, personal and social conditions (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000; Clandinin, 2007). Further, Clandinin and colleagues concisely identify the three-dimensional continuum of narrative inquiry, including temporality, sociality and place, in their later work (Connelly & Clandinin, 2006; Clandinin, Pushor, & Orr, 2007). Narrative can go beyond the conventional representation of time and space through a process of meaning finding or meaning making within particular historical, social and cultural circumstances (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000; Gill, 2001; Gudmundsdottir, 1997, 2001). Thus, narrative inquiry, as a tool for transfer of knowledge, enables this study to probe into different contexts in order to uncover the core issues of the experiences.

Narrative inquiry changes the traditional unequal relations between researcher and participant/researched since a narrative approach privileges the storyteller whom is acknowledged as the one who knows and tells. In other words, stories contain knowledge that are acknowledged by the narrators and is expressed through the individual's narrative (see Reinharz, 1992). However, stories do not reflect the actual world because stories are retrospectively constructed. The "truth" of a story is, more often than not, problematic and is to be found somewhere between an individual's experience and the social context where memory is regulated and understood. Reality cannot be seen as really exterior per se since reality is always filtered through a person's perceptions and some value systems (see Mishler, 2004). Therefore, there can be multiple versions of the truth since truth is different for different individuals based on the individual experience perceived by the perceiver (Hertz, 1997; Stanley & Wise, 1993; Temple, 1997).

Most important, a narrative approach tends to value the everyday lives of the participants, for whom experiences are "valid and true" (Stanley & Wise, 1993, p. 114). Accordingly, the term "narrative" in this study is both methodology and

method and literally means the participants' stories collected by life story interviews. A narrative approach offers an opportunity to explore alternative views of the ways in which immigration is understood, enacted, and lived out by these Taiwanese immigrants. Particularly, immigrant and minority women may be subsumed under categories that do not accurately reflect their perspectives and experiences. As McMahon (1995, p. 24) notes "a woman is never only a woman; multiple other social relationships of race, class, ethnicity, or sexuality shape the lived meaning of being female". Likewise, the Taiwanese women in Finland are not simply "immigrants", "women" or "Asians." Rather, they have other interpersonal identities that are also salient to them and impact on their roles since their experiences are linked to structural forces in different contexts. As Erel (2009) suggests,

> Since life-stories do not narrow down lived experience to one single category or event, they offer a privileged vantage point for understanding and theorizing the processual dynamics of migration and the intersectionality of gendered, ethnicized and class structures of power. (Erel, 2009, p 9)

Although a wide range of qualitative research methodologies are available to study immigrant women's experiences, a perceived strength of the narrative approach is its emphasis on the participants engaging in an ongoing process of reflection, construction of narrative accounts, namely stories, and in meaning-making with the researcher (Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). I believe that this narrative study can provide new knowledge grounded in the realities of highly educated immigrant women's experiences rather than speak for them. The distinctive features of narrative inquiry enabled this study to explore the experiences of the immigrant women in their own words and validate their experiences. The value and utility of employing narrative inquiry as a research tool in this study is in line with a feminist standpoint epistemology that acknowledges and gives voice to women's experiences.

## 3.3 Research Design

In all, ten participants were recruited in this research. Data were collected through life-story interviews. Details of the research design are discussed in the following three sections: 1) the participants, 2) data collection, and 3) data analysis.

### 3.3.1 The participants

Qualitative inquiry emphasizes the information-richness of the cases selected rather than the numbers of participants (Patton, 1990; Silverman, 1998).

Because of limited time and access to potential research participants, it is feasible for this narrative study to interview just a handful of richly detailed-accounts of women (Lieblich et al, 1998). The ten Taiwanese women who finally participated in this study were married to native-born white Finns and had immigrated to Finland. All participants agreed with me to use pseudonyms. There were some critical considerations of choosing pseudonym raised. In order to avoid the participants from choosing the same name, they all granted me permission to choose fake-names for them.

At the very beginning of assigning pseudonyms, the participants were simply given Western names since many Westerns find the Chinese names difficult to pronounce and remember. Although some women had taken the surnames of their Finnish husbands after marriage, all of the women in this study still use their typical Chinese/Taiwanese first names in daily life in Finland, which is one of the most identifiable racial/ethnic elements in their immigration lives. Thus, I found that it was important to use pseudonyms associated with their racial/ethnic characteristics. To address this concern, I chose the easy-to-pronounce family names from the most common Chinese/Taiwanese family names, instead of hard-to-pronounce first names, in an effort to ensure confidentiality, retain the participants' racial/ethnic characteristics, and also help the readers to track and relate to the women. Therefore, the ten Taiwanese women listed with assigned pseudonyms, Chen, Lim, Yang, Wu, Liu, Pan, Chang, Lee, Wang and Ho, became the foci of this study. Pseudonyms could help the readers not see these participants' stories as merely research data in a study but, more important, visualize that these Taiwanese women are out there in Finnish society.

At the time of the interviews in 2006, the women interviewed ranged from approximately 35 to 55 years of age, which was rounded off to the nearest age ending in 0 or 5. They have been married for between six to 25 years and lived in Finland for at least five to more than ten years. Moreover, one should note that the length of marriages does not exactly correspond to the length of residency in Finland. Many of these Taiwanese women met their future husbands in Taiwan while their future husbands were international employees, more commonly known as expatriates. Some of them decided to start a family in Finland right after getting married while some of them had lived in other countries owing to their husbands' overseas contract jobs before finally settling down in Finland. For that reason, only the assigned pseudonyms, rounding-off age, and length of residence in Finland are shown in the brackets at the end of each quotation in order to further protect the identity of each participant.

Ten women in total participated in the study, all obtaining a university education before immigrating to Finland. Eight participants were from upper-middle-class families whereas two participants were from working-class families

but had successfully moved up into the middle class through higher-education pathways. They had white-collar professional jobs in Taiwan except for Lim who had been a stay-home mother for more than ten years in different countries straight after she completed her university studies. There was a wide range of occupations represented across the participants, including two schoolteachers, a customer services manager, a restaurant owner/manager, a junior marketing manager, an ICT engineer, a missionary, an accountant and a sales-representative. After immigration, nine out of ten enrolled in Finnish universities or polytechnics (also known as Universities of Applied Sciences; AMK) to redo their education. However, regarding their degree programs in the Finnish tertiary institutions, many women's studies have little to no relevance to their university education and work experience obtained in Taiwan whereas only two women, the ICT engineer and the missionary, further their studies related to the field of their previous studies and professions in Finland. These Taiwanese women with both Taiwanese and Finnish degrees are more educated than the average of Finns.

Noteworthily, only three women used Finnish or Swedish to take local degree studies whereas the other six women took degree programs in English in Finland. Whether they have sufficient Finnish proficiency or not, many of them strategically chose English-taught degree programs in order to prevent low academic performance since they have less Finnish academic vocabulary knowledge than their Finnish peers in Finnish academic settings. Only three women successfully continued or started a career in Finland and they worked in places where English or Chinese was the language of communication. Owing to a shortage of care workers in Finland, five of the women obtained full- or part-time jobs as practical nurses that only required vocational education/training on upper secondary level rather than tertiary/higher education. For instance, one participant had successfully reached a management position at one of most prestigious companies in Taiwan but became a practical nurse providing direct care for disabled elderly in long-term care facility in Finland. She experienced a precipitous fall from middle-class status since her career path shifted from brain/mind power to muscle power. In general, many of these women experienced downward mobility, compared to their socio-economic positions in Taiwan. Thus, the term "middle class" used in this study does not refer to a particular income bracket. Instead, this term refers to the participants who arrived with high educational credentials and who used to be white-collar professionals in their country of origin.

### 3.3.2 Data collection

The bonds of immigranthood assisted me with successfully recruiting participants from my immediate circle in Finland. Prospective participants were recruited through an email letter. Through the mailing list of the Taiwanese in Finland Association, all members (approximately 40 intermarried women) received a letter describing the details and the participant criteria for the study along with my personal contact information (Appendix 1 in English; Appendix 4 in Chinese). After the prospective participants contacted me and expressed their interest, I immediately sent them an overview of the study by email and set up individual interview schedules.

Within one week following confirmation of participation, a detailed explanation of the research process was provided to each participant by email, and all questions were answered to their satisfaction prior to obtaining written informed consent. The letter of information, only in Chinese, included an introduction, the study procedure, risks and benefits of participation, confidentiality and voluntary nature of participation, and my contact information (Appendix 2 in English; Appendix 5 in Chinese). The participant was invited to review the consent form and to sign the form when it was time to conduct the interview. Informed consent forms assured that the participants had the right to withdraw or discontinue participation at any point without penalty and prejudice (Appendix 3 in English; Appendix 6 in Chinese).

Data, the life stories of ten intermarried Taiwanese women, were collected via one-on-one, face-to-face and in-depth interviews in 2006. The life story interview was used in order to give an in-depth understanding of the participants' perspectives and their knowledge of social processes and rules (Bertaux & Kohli, 1984). The life story interview allowed the participants to position themselves as competent social actors in the social world. The interview sites, dates, and times were negotiated and agreed upon with the participants. Most participants preferred that I came to their own homes at times that accommodated their work or after-school childcare arrangements. Each story-telling interview lasted between four and six hours and took place at the participants' homes, except for two interviews conducted at my home. Since I am fluent in both Taiwanese and Mandarin Chinese, I did not have any problems communicating with the participants. In interviews, they were able to freely express themselves in their native language. Each interview was conducted in the woman's first language, Chinese or Taiwanese. Use of the native language allowed the participants to express their feelings and thoughts in a more subtle and nuanced way. The participants were encouraged to set the interview pace and decided whether or not to take breaks during the interview, which created a more participant-centered atmosphere.

Adapting a life story interview protocol used in past studies (McAdams, 1993), I asked each participant to describe the overall trajectory of her immigration life. In line with my commitment to the principles of narrative interviewing, a narrative-inducing question, which would bring out an extensive narration, was posed (see Wengraf, 2001). In order to ensure a professional and pleasant start to the interview, the participants were asked one broad question: "Can you tell me about your immigration experiences in Finland?" I provided attentive listening and sometimes asked questions in an effort to seek clarification where necessary. During the interview related questions on how they coped with difficult things about settling in Finland as well as general probe questions were also asked. Prior to each interview, all participants received and reviewed the informed consent letter/e-mail.

With permission from the women, all interviews were audio-recorded. The participants themselves decided to tell what they thought was important in their lives and about the context in which they lived. I set up the digital voice recorder at the start of each interview as the participant and I usually bonded with light conversation. In the interviews I mainly listened empathically to my participants telling their life stories, but I did participate in the conversation when I was asked questions or felt that I could share some of my experiences and thoughts with them. During interviews, many of them even opened the family albums to "prove" or show me that they had had a very high quality of life in Taiwan. When the participant wanted to add to her contributions of data before and/or after the interview, I always gave notice that I would turn on the digital recorder.

Of significance is that the interviews created a chance for the participants to unfold their feelings and doubts, to retrieve memories of past events, to make sense out of the conflicts and contradictions in their everyday practices, and to anticipate the future. The women told the stories about family, friends, schooling and employment history in Taiwan as well as marriage, childrearing, food, extended family, culture difference, manners, education, learning Finnish and the job searching in Finland. Collectively, these life stories provided a broad spectrum of perspectives and rich insights into the thoughts, attitudes, and values of highly educated Taiwanese immigrants.

I got comprehensively acquainted with the content of the interviews since I transcribed the material myself, which was a useful way to identify the major themes in the interviews. The trust and rapport between the participants and me provided opportunities to clarify issues. In order to avoid misrepresentation and misunderstandings, a copy of the transcript was delivered to the participants by email within a month following the interview. After the participants reviewed the Chinese transcripts, they provided me with additions, corrections, and notations through emails or via the phone. This process was a useful way to increase data reliability. Selected sections were translated from Chinese into English so that I

could use direct quotes from my participants in the text of my writing. During the process of data collection, the participants were allowed to remove, change, or add information to their interview statements and finally to agree that all accounts were well represented.

Two participants, Liu and Lee, returned their transcripts with extensive additional written comments that further elaborated or clarified issues they had mentioned in the interviews, and I included these with their original transcripts. Other participants simply confirmed that they were satisfied with the transcripts. Of importance, no participant removed any content in the transcripts or attempted to change their stories. In the meantime, I kept in contact with my participants as a part of my social life as usual while I continued the ongoing literature review and analyzed the data.

All interviews were audio-recorded and complemented with written notes. Handwritten notes were taken in Chinese throughout the interview session or as soon as I possibly could after the interview. I paid attention to how the participants reacted, what they said and how the participants dealt with the interview experience (see Clandinin & Connelly, 2000). Additionally, the purpose of these notes was not only to record an outline of the topics but also to capture the situations or mannerisms displayed by the participants during interviews. This helped me during the time I was collecting my data and afterward in analyzing the data when I wanted to recall my thoughts about the interviews. Some key segments of the interview were identified for further analysis and thematization in the notes. Moreover, in order to identify and follow my thoughts and where I was heading, I kept a research journal throughout my data collection. My research journal also provided a focal point for reflexivity and all aspects of research methodology. Thus, the journal was reviewed throughout the course of my conducting research.

The nature of the narrative approach helped us to reach a better mutual understanding. My interpretation and understanding of what the participants told me was also facilitated because I already had basic information about their personal backgrounds and vice versa. After the interview finished, Pan said:

> A few years ago, I was invited to take part in a research interview regarding immigrants in Finland. I was more or less afraid to get stereotyped as a traditional East Asian woman who needs to be rescued since I am a housewife; you know this (being full-time housewife) is really unusual in this country. When the researcher asked me questions, I cautiously replied in a deliberately neutral way. Unlike that interview, I felt comfortable with this interview in which I enjoyed sharing my own personal opinions and experiences. More important, it gave me a chance to reorganize myself as to what a woman I was, am, and want to be. (Pan, age 45, in Finland eight years)

A number of women explained that because they had never expressed their feelings and acknowledged their emotions so much after moving to Finland, they felt understood and listened to in interviews (see DeVault, 1990). Lee commented that she had never thought about the dynamics of telling her own story, a situation that allowed her to better know herself. Lee said:

> I've been kind of obsessed with my hardship about figuring out what I should do and what I could do in Finland. We are here only because of our Finnish husbands, aren't we? Supposedly, we should have had happy endings. On the contrary, we got "nightmare beginnings". We didn't even have a chance to enjoy just-married happiness. The pressure of being an immigrant has been haunting me. Learning a new language, looking for a job, redoing education and so on. Besides this interview, I've never had a chance to seriously think of my real self. I was surprised how I could better understand myself now through listening to my own voice (reading the transcripts). It was the first time in my immigration life I actually felt like I had been heard, really understood, like what I had to say totally made sense. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Despite the fact that I explained the nature of the research in the letter, when Wu thought of "research" and "interview", she seemed to envision something formal and rigid. However, Wu asserted that she emotionally benefited from her participation in this research although she held a pessimistic attitude toward the implications of this research, as the following comment illustrated.

> Before the interview, I had been thinking how my life experiences could make contributions to Finnish academia or society. Academia is so serious. Academic things should be something profound and important. You know, I am nobody, just an immigrant and nobody cares. Who will be interested in a bunch of Asian women whining about their lives in Finland? Oh, sorry, don't get me wrong! I don't mean your research is not important. Anyway, after sharing my story with you, at least, I felt GREAT. For the first time in the past years in Finland, I felt I made my voice heard. I felt, you really understood every word I said. I was able to talk about anything from my HEART, as you know, it's really hard when you have to use Finnish. Of course, my husband does try to understand me as much as he can. But you know, he is a Finn after all. He hardly knows anything about the hardship as an immigrant. Through telling my story, the feelings sort of have certain power, which I've been missing really much. As you know, how powerless we've become since the day we became immigrants. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Several women expressed their interests in listening to their own voices (see Rubin & Rubin, 2005). Lim said, "through telling the stories of my own, I am able to closely listen to my own voice. I felt valued. I felt validated in sharing my own story as a woman, a mother and an immigrant."

The life-story interview method raised women's conscious awareness of how they became who they were, as Holstein and Gubrium suggest, "storytellers do not just tell stories; they do things with them" (1995, xvi). Participating in this study and telling their stories had given these immigrant women an opportunity for emotional release. Likewise, Atkinson states, "telling a life story makes the implicit explicit, the hidden seen, the unformed formed, and the confusing clear (1998, p. 7)". Each of the participants held my earning a doctoral degree in high esteem. I felt privileged to intimately scrutinize their private lives, actions, feelings and thoughts. I was fortunate enough to work with each of the participants.

### 3.3.3 Data analysis

There is neither a template nor standard techniques set for narrative inquiry. Narrative research has many forms and uses a variety of analytic practices. Thus, the methods of analysis used by narrative researchers vary distinctly. Riessman (2008) suggests four types of narrative analysis: thematic analysis, structural analysis, dialogic/performance analysis, and visual analysis. Thematic analysis explores what is said in the story whereas structural analysis gives attention to how the story is told. Dialogic/Performance analysis focuses on how the interaction or dialogue between speakers is performed. Visual analysis interprets the storyteller's images conveyed through storytelling. However, these four approaches are not mutually exclusive and the boundaries between them can sometimes be blurred or overlap one another (Riessman, 2008).

This study utilized thematic analysis to analyze the data, stories of ten highly educated Taiwanese women in Finland. Thematic analysis is mainly associated with interpretation of the content of text data by identifying the patterns and creating the themes within the data. A narrative approach with thematic analysis enabled me to highlight the commonalities and uniqueness across data and simultaneously keep the story intact in the coding and interpretation process (see Riessman, 2002). Prior to analysis, the audio-recorded interviews of ten participants were completely transcribed verbatim in Chinese. I read all of the transcribed data and selected out the broad bodies of data that had relevance to my research topic (see Wolcott, 1994). I divided the data into meaningful analytical units in relation to the concepts of habitus, cultural capital and intersectionality which I had studied prior to embarking on the analysis. Thematic analysis highlights the substantial differences and similarities across cases (Braun & Clarke, 2006), which attributes overall explanatory value to the themes rather than reflect the frequency of the themes. In general, analytical procedures introduced by Marshall and Rossman (2011, pp. 209-210) include seven phases: "(1) organizing the data, (2) immersion in the data, (3) generating

categories and themes, (4) coding the data, (5) offering interpretations through analytic memos, (6) searching for alternative understandings, and (7) writing the report or other format for presenting the study." Each phase of data analysis required data reduction and interpretation.

Data analysis commenced during the data collection phase and continued through to completion of the writing phase, which was a continual process. A cyclical approach, iterations analysis (Anfara, Brown, & Mangione, 2002) involved an ongoing review revisiting, re-interpreting and finding deeper meaning in the stories, then re-presenting the data to identify themes and diversity. The iterations facilitated a more intensive interpretation of the complexity within and across stories told by the participants. Through repetitive readings of the transcriptions, I identified general themes, categories, and patterns and came across core ideas and concepts. Categorizing was not merely to label all the parts of the transcripts about a topic, but rather to bring all the parts together so that data could be holistically reviewed and the themes developed.

From a practical point of view, categorizing the data allowed me to make comparisons more effectively and further locate meaningful segments. At the same time, my theoretical preferences directed my search for specific themes in terms of the main research question. During the coding process, I explored the data in search of patterns and themes that revealed meaning. I focused on three particular themes that stood out in the stories: employability, underemployment and mothering. These themes, developed from the data of the narrative, were interdependent and interactive entities. Most important, my research interest focuses on the meaning of what participants said in different contexts rather than on the relative frequency of particular words or occurrence of an event in the stories (see Lareau & Schutz, 1996).

Thematic analysis as a research method is reconcilable with any theoretical framework (Braun & Clarke, 2006). My theoretical framework, combining Bourdieu's theory of practice and a lens of intersectionality of gender, class and race/ethnicity, established a sense of structure to guide this research and determined how I perceived and interpreted my data in relation to thematic analysis. The themes of this study were identified in the process of analyzing the data to explore how the highly educated Taiwanese women negotiate a self-acceptable social position in the Finnish society. Moreover, in an effort to visualize the interpretive analysis, I drew concept maps in order to understand links and relationships between themes across different dimensions of stories, including intrapersonal aspects of stories (the participant's thoughts and feelings), interpersonal aspects of stories (involving other people), cultural aspects of stories (referring to cultural conventions) and structural aspects of stories (social divisions such as class, gender, and race/ethnicity) (Fraser, 2004).

I found concept maps helpful in illustrating the interconnections between and across different themes with an intersectionality perspective while looking for the link between data and Bourdieu's concepts.

Since the very beginning of the research I had decided to work within a narrative approach that allowed the readers to listen to the voices of these Taiwanese women and see different kinds of reality. Moreover, I never intended to speak for the participants although I am also part of the "other" in Finnish society. The participants were invited to speak for themselves meaning that I included verbatim quotes from their stories in my writing. Verbatim quotes from the research participants offer readers a profound understanding of this small ethnic group and provide opportunities for the Taiwanese women to have their own voices heard about immigration lives in Finnish society. The voices of the participants were placed within the research text according to three types of quotes: dialogues or statements of significance, the participants' own words to support a theme, and participants' own words that express multifaceted ideas (Creswell, 1998). Giving the participants a voice by presenting their own words was a way to appreciate the value of what they said, and to reckon their perceptions as valid findings rather than to privilege my voice as the only legitimate interpretation or authentic commentary on the research themes or related issues.

A number of key narratives and verbatim quotes were chosen based on key themes emerging from interviews. In so doing, the readers are able to empathize with the participants' experiences while reading stories presented in the words of the participants. Therefore, I was in favor of displaying long quotations from the participants' narratives because fragments of the participants' words/comments taken out of context may fail to give the whole picture and further lead to misperceptions and misunderstandings. Long quotations as evidence provide the significance of each claim in this study, which enriches and enhances the readability. More important, long quotations from the participants allow the readers to make their own judgments about the consistency of the results in this study. The research findings, including Chapter Four, Chapter Five, Chapter Six and Chapter Seven, are presented with excerpts from the participants' stories alongside my interpretation and references that support my statement. In order to link to the main research question, I classify research findings and discussion as "Portable but barely convertible cultural capital: Finding a job in Finland", "Acquiring cultural capital in a cross-cultural setting", "Womanhood and employment in a cross-cultural context", and "Reproduction of social class and Finnishness."

Although the participants and I, as Chinese native speakers, used the same language in the interviews, all audio-recorded interview data from participants were transcribed verbatim into Chinese before selected verbatim quotes being

translated into English. The quotes selected from the interview transcripts were translated from Chinese to English, which inevitably generated additional challenges such as translation of Chinese idioms or proverbs, and culture-bound words or phrases. Not only are there Chinese words, idioms and proverbs that hardly can be translated literally into English equivalent, there are also Chinese words that may not exist in English. I realized that translation word by word from the participants' spoken narrative to a written form would be a bad practice which may not successfully convey the sense of the original since there were also perceptual information conveyed through non-verbal cues such as tone of voice, body gestures and facial expressions during the interviews. Inevitably, I struggled not only to choose/find the right words to convey what the participants meant but also to make sure that quotes in English would be comprehensible and not lead to misunderstandings. I paid close attention to translation issues.

When quoting from stories told by the participants, all capital letters (CAP) were used to denote emphasis and 3-dot ellipses (…) were used to indicate places where irrelevant words or sentences were left out in the narrative. However, one should note that these Taiwanese women in the interviews sometimes used "you" in the singular person or "we" to indicate "I" when speaking of their own experiences or opinions. While only reading written narrative in the absence of the participants' tone of voice, gestures and facial expressions, the readers may misunderstand or misidentify the meaning, attitudes and feelings revealed by the participants. Hence, it is important to note that the participants noticeably altered their spoken tone and volume of voice in regard to different kinds of subject matter during the interviews. In general, when they talked about mothering/parenting issues, their clear and loud voice and facial expressions (e.g., smile, bright eyes) reflected their confidence and self-assurance. However, when talking about job and employment, in general, many of them spoke softly with a disheartened tone, which indicated their self-doubt and frustration.

## 3.4 Reflexivity

Reflexivity provides a methodologically self-critical account of how the research was done throughout "a turning back on oneself, a process of self-reference" (Davies, 1999, p. 4). A researcher should constantly refer to her/his own experiences which "point to our own subjectivity, acknowledge that it undoubtedly shapes the story we tell, and – most importantly – recognize the fact of the power we wield, the power of interpretation" (Bettie, 2003, pp. 22-23). My positionality had influenced my research interest, the research design, and the choice of methodology. It was important to exercise reflexivity throughout the research process; therefore, in an effort to challenge my own dispositions in a broader social world, the first reflective exercise I engaged in

was to tell about own immigration experiences that led me to undertake this research (see Chapter One).

Telling my own immigration story helped me review what I know and how I came to know it in a process of introspection (see Finlay, 2002). I am also an immigrant and part of the "other" because of my racial/ethnic roots, which made it impossible to entirely remove myself from the social context I investigated during the process of interviewing, transcribing, analyzing data and writing. My understanding of the participants' stories was generated during the act of listening and reading the interview transcripts with reference to my own understanding filtered through my own experiences. As a result, my interpretation may be unavoidably shaped by subjective experience within the discourse, social biases, the rules and values of the field of study. To become a better researcher, the need to constantly reflect on myself was an important means of uncovering new understandings of my take-for-granted view of the social world.

I remained honest, open, sincere and approachable with the participants about my history and own experiences throughout the research and thereafter. Before conducting interviews in 2006, I had known all the participants since I immigrated to Finland in 2002. We had been friends and members of an ethnic minority community in Finland. All interviews were conducted either in the participant's home or my home based on mutual familiarity and trust. Interviews took place in an environment with a very relaxed atmosphere that fostered comfort and informality. Thus, interviews were completed in a relatively more natural and unrestrictive situation, which increased the level of self-disclosure.

Although I started all interviews by asking the participants the same question: "Can you tell me about your immigration experiences in Finland?" nearly all of them began by telling stories about parental aspirations and expectations for their educational attainment, their academic achievements at different stages of schooling, taken-for-granted university education, university ranking system in Taiwan, and their successful careers before moving to Finland. They wanted to underline that they are persons with individual histories and professional skills rather than stereotyped immigrants without appropriate qualification and job skills. For these highly educated immigrants, telling their personal history was an essential way to counter the depersonalized immigration discourses.

The participants strove to formulate clear impressions of themselves as highly educated women from a middle-class background. Therefore, one of the most common questions the participants asked me was which university in Taiwan I had graduated from. The participants who were alumni of the most selective Taiwanese universities still upheld the pride of being the best and the elite as it corresponded with social hierarchy in Taiwan. In consideration of the Taiwanese

concept of saving face, they either said politely “as I know, the reputation of your university has been increasing” or “well, I am not so familiar with universities in the southern part of Taiwan.” In a way, I was relatively inferior to many of the participants in terms of academic capability and achievement in the Taiwanese context.

Several participants openly stated that their main reason for participating in this research study was to help me pursue my doctoral degree rather than to bring or expect any societal changes. Instead of negotiating how the chosen methodology could empower the researched, I accepted the fact that the participants were entirely engaged in the empowerment of what I wanted in the first place. Moreover, the participants regarded me as a student/learner rather than a researcher/knower since PhD students are still classified into the category of students who need to be advised and guided.

In addition, I was defined and located by the participants in the context of their own social world as members of a non-dominant group (see Best, 2003) since some of them regarded me as “an immigrant student” who held a marginalized position and struggle with downward mobility, rather than as “an international student” who would return to her/his home country and have a promising future. However, when two participants excitedly overpraised my effort put forth to become a PhD student (i.e., a successful student in the Taiwanese context) in front of their children, as a matter of fact, I felt extremely embarrassed at that moment. The participants even knew themselves that my ambivalent enthusiasm for PhD studies was due to my reluctance to abandon my hard-earned qualifications obtained in my country of origin.

Furthermore, I was relatively new to Finland, compared to the participants who all had lived in Finland much longer than I had. Some of them, especially those who were mothers already, regarded me as “an inexperienced newcomer” who still had a lot to learn about “surviving” in Finnish society. Since I had been struggling with my own immigration journey, I witnessed a lot of intersectional points between the participants and myself. In some situations, I learned to see my own vulnerability through encountering my participants’ vulnerability. In some way, they wanted to give me advice by sharing their joys, sadness and difficulties in their immigration lives. On the other hand, the participants were not “passive givers of information” (Maynard, 1994, p. 15) and were more likely than me to be “the expert” on some aspects of immigration experience. I regarded them as co-researchers who co-produced knowledge of immigration in this study since narrative research required a lot of trust on both sides of the researcher and the participants. I perceived my role as more like a listener and a learner while conducting the interviews.

The simultaneity of social divisions such as race/ethnicity, gender, class, and age can have an impact on the traditional power relationship in the interview

(Phoenix, 1994). Since I am also an immigrant belonging to the same racial/ethnic group as the one I studied, the participants believed that I was able to "step into the shoes of the persons being studied" (Denzin, 1997, p. 273). Many participants particularly emphasized that they preferred to talk to someone who was able to "empathize with" rather than "sympathize with" their situation (see Kvale, 2007). There were positive dynamic interactions between the participants and me because of our similar backgrounds, which was the greatest strength in this qualitative study rather than a disturbing dilemma concerning closeness/distance between the participants and the researcher.

I was never a complete stranger to the participants, unlike most of researchers who had to initiate and build short-term relationships with participants in terms of the research agenda. On the other hand, I had no doubts about their sincerity and authenticity since our friendships had already developed naturally before I commenced my PhD studies. When establishing rapport serves no purpose other than data collection, the issue of "fake friendships" is raised but usually left undiscussed. There is a tendency toward ethical naivety in "equating the process of 'doing rapport' with trust, and failing to question the insincerity of 'faking friendship'" (Duncombe & Jessop, 2002, p. 110). Once fieldwork/interviewing is finished, fake relationships between the researcher and the researched often end. I, as an ordinary person, still take part in social events with the participants every now and then as long as the mutual agreement of our friendship exists. On the other hand, having social contact with them positively makes me remain cautious on any potential concerns about confidentiality and data protection after fieldwork.

Although researchers may use rapport-building skills to develop a good and comfortable working relationship with the participants, fake friendships or relationship are often formed via "acting on participants' inability to grasp the extent of our data gathering hunger" (Bekin, 2005, p. 8). Yet, one shall never overlook the fact that the participants can exercise their power by determining how much information will be shared with the researcher since they may simultaneously observe the researcher and perceive the interview situation. For instance, one of the participants said,

> If you were a native researcher, I don't think I should talk so much about hardship of being an immigrant in Finland. It's definitely too rude and inconsiderate. You know yourself how much we Taiwanese care about harmony. That's why we almost have no guts to blame racial/ethnic discrimination, even though we are never free from it.

In other words, she may have shared different types of information with me if I had been a Finn. Hence, what the speaker/participant would say is determined in part by whom the listener/researcher is. Moreover, country-specific social expectations and norms play a role in research relationships as Finlay (2002)

argues that the researched and the researcher both "are engaged in an exercise of 'presenting' themselves to each other – and to the wider community which is to receive the research" (p. 223). For example, another participant said,

> If you were a Finn, I certainly wouldn't have talked so much. There is a Finnish saying "helmiä sioille" (cast pearls before swine), you know, Finns are Finns; you can't expect they get the feelings of being an Asian immigrant in this society. I wonder how many Finnish researchers really put some effort into knowing immigrants' culture and beliefs, and their countries of origin before they started to interview immigrants.

Since the participant had experienced and struggled with cultural conflicts and discontinuity in a new country, her concerns about cross-cultural misconceptions or misunderstandings may inhibit her to fully share the information with the native researcher in a face-to-face interview situation. There are always power differentials in the research relationship within broader relations of power beyond the immediate research setting. Tang argues that "the interviewee as well as interviewer's perceptions of social, cultural and personal differences have an important impact on the power dynamics in the interview" (2002, p. 719).

In the interviews we were all speaking Chinese, our mother tongue. One's native language is the best way to talk about feelings, express thoughts and tell stories, which is essential for life-story interview as a method in this study. There was little asymmetrical power relation between the native speaker and the non-native speaker within language hierarchies in this study. Asymmetric relations are mainly due to different positions in social structure. As immigrants, we all shared a common location (a dominated social position) in the host society on the basis of our gender and race/ethnicity. We could easily and naturally communicate on the basis of our similarity; thereby, they felt completely comfortable talking about their thoughts and feelings, including worries, frustration, stress, or anxiety, with an immigrant researcher rather than a researcher for the majority group who often ideologically reflects the standards of the host society.

I never presumed that my insider positionality would necessarily collect "more accurate data" or produce "better knowledge" than would an outsider; however, my insider status may provide the readers more possibilities for accessing different realities. I acknowledged that there are always pros and cons to consider whether the researcher is an insider or outsider. For instance, one could argue the extent to which establishing-rapport can actually compensate for a lack of "insiderness" whereas one could question the extent to which the insider-researcher should maintain the distance from the participants in order not to "contaminate" the validity of the knowledge generated. Reflexivity only brings us reflective understanding of methodological dilemmas in the first place

rather than providing a universal solution for the dilemmas of conducting research (Day, 2012).

Based on scenarios of unequal power, practicing reflexivity is not only to identify the researcher/researched power hierarchy but also to minimize the risk of treating participants as mere objects of study but not as persons. As an immigrant woman, I was similarly positioned to the women I interviewed. However, as a researcher, our relationship was not entirely equal, but mutually respectful, since I had academic responsibilities to interpret their "words" and power to present their stories in my writing (see Almlund, 2013; Reinharz & Chase, 2003). In general, the social status gap between the researched and the researcher in this study was not as large as in many studies. Perceptions of power were minimized because of shared language, gender, culture, race/ethnicity, and immigranthood.

My standpoint and position have been implicated in my own life history, which has influenced what I chose to investigate and the methodological approach I adopted for this study. Reflexivity provides the readers with another means to evaluate rigor of the research process and the reliability of the research results since my values, beliefs, knowledge, and experiences inevitably were represented in my work and influenced the results obtained. There are always limitations of various aspects of practicing reflexivity since the methodology I chose for this study does have its limitations, like any other research methodologies. Therefore, I leave it to the readers to decide if my positionality benefited or hampered me to conduct this study as well as the quality of research results.

## 3.5 Ethical Considerations

Within the context of this study, ethical implications include asking for and receiving consent from each participant for the interviews to be conducted and recorded; consistently assuring and ensuring privacy, and confidentiality to accommodate principles of openness; proceeding through the research process with professionalism; fairly treating every participant and gathered data; and developing an agreement to which both participants and I willingly adhered (Clandinin & Connelly, 1990). I respected and appreciated each of the participants as well as their rich accounts of lived experiences. The participants had the option of withdrawing from the research at any point in time, with or without explanation.

There was a fine line between adequately and honestly addressing those interviewed and simultaneously protecting their confidentiality. The issues relating to confidentiality would be addressed if any concerns were raised because of the small size of the Taiwanese population in Finland. As a member of

the same small community, I was cautious not to reveal any unnecessary personal information during the writing process, although this research was very dependent on a great deal of very personal information. On the other hand, I was also concerned that excluding some may lead to a misrepresentation.

All participants agreed to the use of pseudonyms instead of the participant's real names as a masking technique. In some cases, their family details, such as the age, number and gender of children, were properly changed and the identifiable characteristics were altered in order to maintain the confidentiality of those who participated in this study. Participants strongly sought reassurance that they should be unidentifiable to any readers. Being in the same situation as a highly educated immigrant marrying a Finn, I already had a grasp of some issues and could empathize with their concerns about confidentiality. This study is the result of an enriched experience where the researcher had the privilege of working with ten Taiwanese immigrant women to share some significant concerns of their lives in Finland.

## 3.6 Trustworthiness

In conducting narrative research, the term trustworthiness is used to refer to how the study meets evaluation criteria for rigor in an effort to scrutinize the inquiry for methodological worthiness (Webster & Mertova, 2007). Polkinghorne suggests that reliability is not the stability of the measurement, but rather the trustworthiness of the transcripts (Polkinghorne, 1988). Research rigor refers to the strictness that is used to ensure that each research step in the conduct of the study has been implemented and paid careful attention to detail (Roberts & Taylor, 1998). This research never attempts to discover eternal truth and produce any conclusions of certainty. More important, as a researcher, I prefer "multiple constructed realities" than a "single tangible reality" (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 295), insomuch that every participant has her own perceptions of her personal experiences and for each woman those perceptions constitute reality.

In order to ensure the quality of data collected and validity of inferences, I employed four techniques, including triangulation, member checking, analysis of negative case evidence, and peer debriefing (Creswell, 1998, 2003; Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Maxwell, 1995; Marshall & Rossman, 2011). For the purpose of maintaining data consistency from other sources, the primary means of triangulation occurred through the comparison of the transcriptions from the interviews, email exchanges, my observations, supplementary notes and journal. A secondary means of triangulation came from the pre-existing literature related to the three themes that reiterated many of the statements expressed by the women.

Member checking of verbatim interview transcripts was offered to the participants. Once each transcript was completed and had been closely checked against the audio content for accuracy, I contacted the participant by both phone and email. The participant received the ready transcript (only in Chinese) either by email or in hard copy by postal mail. The participant and I further discussed the points of concern and revised the transcripts if needed. According to Lincoln and Guba, member checking is "the most critical technique for establishing credibility" (1985, p. 314) and for "ruling out the possibility of misinterpretation of the meaning of what they (informants) say and the perspective they have of what is going on" (Maxwell, 2005).

Throughout my data collection and data analysis, I also incorporated peer debriefing. Peer debriefing involved sharing my study of insights, and analyses with similar status peers who were completely outside the context of my study and could independently point out the possible implications in my current research. Usually, I presented my ongoing research at a formal setting such as university courses, research workshops, seminars, or conferences, and received peer feedback from fellow students. Peer debriefing allowed me to engage in discussions about the research methodology and strategies that I used in this study. Negative case evidence occurs when an incongruity is found in the data. I re-examined and analyzed the data from negative cases to determine their impact on the conclusions.

Through the cautious application and review of triangulation, member checking, peer debriefing, and negative case analysis, all possible and potential threats to the credibility and integrity of this study were either removed or minimized. The effectiveness of these techniques has greatly facilitated my effort to convince the readers that my research findings are "worth paying attention to" and "worth taking account of" (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 290). Furthermore, I reviewed my work with my supervisors who were familiar with the content of my study and were well versed in the practice of qualitative research. At every stage of this study, they pointed out probing points and challenged me on numerous occasions to review, rethink, and revise specific sections and paragraphs of this study.

## Summary

This study employed a feminist standpoint epistemology in terms of epistemic commitments and used narrative inquiry with thematic analysis as the methodological strategy. Narrative inquiry allows the Taiwanese women to tell their stories and share their perspectives as visible immigrant women in line with a feminist standpoint epistemology that emphasizes the variety of women's

social location. A narrative approach has a particular value to contribute to acknowledging the intersectional position of the Taiwanese women in Finland, and provides a way to see different truths and distinctive realities but equal validity in order to gain some insight into the known area of immigration research. All life-story interviews were conducted in the participants' first language, Chinese or Taiwanese, since the use of mother tongue maximized the subtlety of the women's narratives and statements. For ethical reasons, the privacy and confidentiality of all ten women, who were voluntary participants in this research, were highly protected. Triangulation, member checking, analysis of negative case evidence, and peer debriefing were employed to ensure the quality of data collected and validity of inferences. The analyses of the transcribed interviews revealed three themes: employability, underemployment and mothering. The readers are able to empathize with the participants' experiences while reading stories in the Taiwanese immigrants' own words. The following chapters present research findings and discussion by examining the stories of the ten women in this study.

# CHAPTER FOUR

## Portable but Barely Convertible Cultural Capital: Finding a Job in Finland

All women in this study are university-educated in Taiwan. They possessed considerable cultural capital when they moved to Finland. They anticipate utilizing their professional knowledge and continue careers in their prior occupations. Nevertheless, their educational credentials and skills are not transferable to the Finnish labor market, despite the fact that many of them have rich work experience prior to immigration. They have difficulty in finding jobs commensurate with their education and work experience. They begin to understand the reality of the immigrant-unfriendly labor market. This chapter focuses on the impact of downward social mobility on these highly educated women who had previously been relatively well off and had higher social status with socio-economically advantaged backgrounds in Taiwan.

### 4.1 My University Education Made My Immigration Life Miserable

Based on the stories told, these Taiwanese women applied for jobs and many of them realized that their hard-earned qualifications and work experiences were not appreciated or were dismissed in the Finnish labor market (see also Ahmad, 2005; Krutova, 2011; Kyhä, 2011). Many told of how they had sent countless job applications, but only a few were acknowledged as having been received and reviewed. Nevertheless, the acknowledgement they usually get is a one-sentence statement of rejection via email. They posit that their job applications got rejected as soon as those in charge of the hiring processing saw their Asian-sounding names on their resumes. Many studies worldwide have confirmed what these Taiwanese women have long thought - job applicants with ethnic-sounding names are less likely to get callbacks for job interviews from recruiters, compared to either their native-born counterparts or immigrants with Western European or Anglo-Saxon sounding names in spite of having the same qualifications and merits (e.g., Arai, Bursell, & Nekby, 2008; Bertrand & Mullainathan, 2004; Bursell, 2007 in the United States; Booth, Leigh, & Varganova, 2010 in Australia; Larja et al., 2012 in Finland; Carlsson, 2010 in Sweden; Kaas & Manger, 2012 in Germany; McGinnity, Nelson, Lunn, & Quinn, 2009 in Ireland; Oreopoulos, 2009; Oreopoulos & Dechief, 2011 in Canada; Wilson, Gahlout, Liu, & Mouly, 2005 in New Zealand). Therefore, the host

country labor market plays a key role in promoting a racial/ethnic categorization and reproducing power relations in society.

Some of these Taiwanese women met their future husbands, who used to be expatriates in Taiwan. Ideally, as Heikkilä suggests, "when an expatriate Finn returns to the country of origin, he/she often brings along a foreign spouse. Therefore, the benefits to the Finnish labor market include not only the returning Finn's own human capital acquired abroad, but also additional resources brought into the country" (2011b, p. 27). However, in practice this is not always the case. Before immigrating to Finland, their prior knowledge about Finland is basically from their Finnish spouses, the host members. In addition to their initial confidence, many of them recalled how their Finnish husbands positively described their advantages. The following are typical statements.

> You speak English fluently and have a university education. Particularly, your mother tongue is Chinese. Nowadays some Finnish companies need employees, like you, who speak Chinese and understand Chinese culture. I think you will find a job soon in Finland. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

> Finland is a quite international country. Especially, Asian people have the reputation for being hard-working. You are highly educated, speak English and have rich work experience. I think you won't have difficulties finding a job in Finland. (Wang, age 35, in Finland five years)

Although these Taiwanese women have native-born husbands, the initial arrival to a new country still brings difficult experiences. Particularly, their family-, professionals- and friends-based social networks or circles by which they used to be surrounded in their everyday lives no longer exist in a new country. With university degrees and rich work experience, they assume applying for a job in Finland should be simple and straightforward. Yet, their credentials and skills are not able to transfer into equal economic power in the Finnish labor market. Thus, their institutionalized cultural capital holds little symbolic value in the Finnish context. When their expectations of the host country are unfulfilled, stressful life events are triggered by the great disappointments.

In modern Taiwanese society, married couples retain their own family names and children usually inherit the father's family name. Some women in this study did not adopt their Finnish husbands' surnames upon marrying; nevertheless, some did it. Interestingly, those women who changed their family names thought that having a Finnish family name would be more accepted in Finnish society and would improve their employability in the local labor market.

> You know, actually I was really surprised that Finnish women are so traditional. How come they (Finnish women) don't want to stop this old-fashioned tradition? (...) However, when my husband asked me if I wanted to adopt his family name, I

> immediately said yes without hesitation. Somehow, I believed that people would perceive my Finnish family name as my commitment to this country. I thought a Finnish family name would make employers favor me. I was so naïve. A Finnish family name doesn't change anything at all. (Chen, age 35, in Finland five years)

Although Wu chose not to adopt her husband's family name, she said:

> Among the intermarried women in the class (Finnish language course), I was the only one who didn't adopt the Finnish surname after getting married. They said having husband's surname might be useful for future employment because it looks "more Finnish" when you have a Finnish surname. All those small talks made me feel uneasy. I panicked and asked our Finnish teacher about adopting my husband's surname. The teacher said it's really unnecessary. Huh, what a relief! Actually I would never want to change my family name. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Additionally, Liu and Lim recalled how their husbands advised them to mention their Taiwanese-Finnish intermarriage in their CVs.

> My husband was really naïve. He told me to mention in my CV that I moved to Finland because I am married to a Finn. I supposed he knew job search strategies much better than I in Finland. So I did it. It's really useless information. He thought he, as a Finn, could make me special in this country. Really ridiculous! (Liu, age 40, in Finland six years)

> My husband said I had to mention my Taiwanese-Finnish intermarriage in the CV, so that there would be a clear connection between Finland and me. Who cares why I have to settle down here (Finland). I have a Finnish husband, so what? Big deal! Well, it doesn't help anyway. No job-interview at all. (Lim, age 40, in Finland five years)

In a way, these Finnish husbands' advice reflects their own attitude toward immigrants. With regard to acceptance of the local labor force, it appears that having a Finnish husband is misrecognized as a form of symbolic value. According to Tuomaala (2010), nearly half of the job opportunities and vacancies in the Finnish labor market are not openly and publicly announced. In other words, the dominant way of recruiting creates a relatively non-transparent or unadvertised job market in which immigrants are further limited to searching all current job openings without any social network, contacts or connections in the Finnish labor market. Thereby, labor force stratification is being maintained by social capital deficit among immigrant groups. These Taiwanese women are disadvantaged in the host country labor market since they have no influential networks which could link them to useful information about job opportunities. Noteworthily, although these Taiwanese women have Finnish husbands and the husbands' extended families, none of those native-born Finnish family members utilize their social and affiliation networks in an effort to widen these women's employment opportunities.

They face barriers to finding jobs commensurate with their skills and work experience, which follows the same global pattern of highly educated immigrants in other countries, such as in Canada (Adamuti-Trache, 2010), Australia (Green et al., 2007), New Zealand (Daldy et al., 2012), Sweden (Andersson et al., 2012) and in other European countries (Aleksynska & Tritah, 2011). During job search, these women struggle to either wait as unemployed for ideal jobs or accept any available offer, including vocational and pre-employment training. The training allowance from the local employment office for jobseekers is conditional on taking vocational training courses or pre-employment position in an effort to increase employment opportunities, which emphasizes immigrants' own responsibility to actively participate in their process of resettlement. For some women in this study, participation in pre-employment training could meet the requirement of Finnish work experience and further create the employment opportunities. However, Chang and Wu recounted how the feelings of exploitation in training position affected them.

> I attended a translation program for immigrants. All people there were well educated and couldn't find a stable job, although some of them spoke many languages, including Finnish. The runner of that course was a local translation company. They offered us internships, kind of gave you chances to be trained. We looked forward to having internships since it would be a good opportunity to establish job search connections. Turned out, this company took advantage of all trainees there. We didn't get paid at all when we were assigned to do some translation jobs in other companies. However, the translation company got paid for our free-labor service. They just took advantage of immigrants who were in desperate situations. While I realized that the company really fooled us, I was so sad and mad. The hurtful feelings were just like the saying: rubbing salt in a wound. (Chang, age 45, in Finland sixteen years)

> It was a two-people company. When they interviewed me, I felt that they needed me. They only accepted me as a pre-employment trainee, but I was really happy. You know, we signed the contract through the employment office; it meant I only got training allowance from the employment office. During the training, they didn't need to pay me anything. I really didn't care how much I got back then. Anyway, a few days later, after I started working, they both were gone for a month vacation. They left me alone in the office to answer the phone calls and e-mails. According to the contract we signed, it's totally illegal. I was really angry and sad. Huh, I even suffered from insomnia for a week. You know, the whole week, I had been thinking how they would react if their own daughters were treated in the same sick way they did to me. Well I couldn't prove that they were just taking advantage of me in order to have a long vacation. But I was so sure they dared to do it only because I am an immigrant. I just kept counting down the days. When the contract ended, they still suggested that I should extend the contract as their free labor. I was so desperate for a job but I couldn't lose my dignity. Well, luckily my husband could afford me to keep my dignity. (laughing) Anyway, I left, of course. And by the way I was so sure they couldn't afford to hire anyone based on those bookkeeping and accounting records I read. You know,

> although in this country nobody values my professional knowledge and skills, I am still a national certified accountant in Taiwan. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Both Chang and Wu vividly recalled how they went through the deceitful job opportunities, which they attributed to being an immigrant. Downward mobility can be accompanied by a sense of shame and powerlessness although they still have a middle-class life style thanks to their spouses' socio-economical status. They are confronted with an incompatibility between middle-class habitus and lower social status (visible immigrant status) in Finnish society. They have different frames of reference from the stereotyped visible immigrants who come from poor countries and are not accustomed to the standard of living in a wealthy and advanced country. Many feel uneasy since the new environments are not consistent with their class-based dispositions and perceptions. Chen and Wu expressed feelings of loss and becoming underachievers with a low level of personal fulfillment.

> I would say most of Taiwanese women who are married to Finns lost a lot since we are well educated and especially Taiwan is quite a wealthy country. Finland offers more opportunities and a better future to those immigrants with low educational attainment. We are not like them (low educated immigrants) from poor countries coming to Finland for a better life. We don't have chances to get what we like to do (jobs), but at least we don't depend on social welfare since our spouses have good income. Most of Taiwanese women in Finland used to be successful career women in Taiwan. I had a great life in Taiwan, for example, really supportive parents, wonderful childhood, a good education, and a bright career. You have seen these (pictures in family albums on the table); supposedly, you can tell what kind of standard of living and a good quality of life I had in Taiwan. I don't have so many options here. Sometimes, it's kind of mental torture. I would never tell my parents what exactly I have been going through in Finland. My parents employ two live-in Philipino maids to take care of my grandparents at home. I really can't imagine how my parents will react if they know I am doing exactly what their maids do. I am sure you understand what I mean. It's never about my dignity and pride. I am not afraid to admit my failure but I can't and don't want to break my parents' hearts. They might misunderstand and think my husband is incapable of taking care of me. You know, this society is not something my husband himself can change overnight. It's not his fault. (Chen, age 35, in Finland five years)

These highly educated Taiwanese women who encounter occupational downgrading from their previous positions in Taiwan are relegated to lower-paying jobs in Finland. Many of them are not white-collar workers in Finland; however, they still lay claim to a middle class identity that is independent of their loss of occupational status or economic resources. They construct their middle-class status by drawing boundaries between themselves and class-disadvantaged immigrants. As they try to avoid being drawn into inferior positions as

"immigrants", they have to prove their middle-class positions. In order to signify their middle-class status, many of the women talked about the care that they intentionally take with their speaking or dress codes in public to differentiate themselves from the immigrant women stereotyped as backward and low educated.

They distinguish themselves by the class distinctions they make (see Bourdieu, 1984) in an attempt to compete for symbolic power at the intersection of race/ethnicity and class. In Chen's excerpt, "we don't depend on social welfare since our spouses have good income" resonates with some of the Taiwanese women's statements. They produce middle-classed identities by differentiating themselves from disadvantaged immigrants. They consider themselves literally "husband-dependent" from a gender perspective rather than so-called "welfare dependent" in accordance with their middle-class sense of identity in a Finnish context.

Moreover, these Taiwanese women are aware that the anti-immigrant advocates have attempted to frame the immigration debate by stereotyping immigrants as welfare recipients since lower labor force participation rate and greater extent of welfare dependency among immigrants have been identified. Koikkalainen et al. (2011) highlight a dilemma immigrants face in Finland: "If you work, you take our jobs; if you do not work, you take advantage of our generous welfare system" (p. 154). Because the common East-West dichotomy depicts the East as backward, in contrast to the wealthy West, these Taiwanese women, to some extent, have a fear of stigma attached to "being a welfare-abuser" associated with their physical cues, which indicates the intersection of class and race/ethnicity (see also Forsander, 2004a).

> In the second year, the teacher said that the municipal employment office wouldn't offer any further courses after the Level-3 Finnish language courses. I totally panicked because I still couldn't understand Finnish well. I told my teacher that my Finnish language skills were not good enough for me to find a job. In the class, a Somali woman, sitting next to me, asked me: "Why do you need to find a job? Why don't you do something else?" I was so SPEECHLESS. That night, I cried out of both anger and frustration because my university education made my immigration life miserable. For the first time in my adult lifetime, I hated myself for being educated, for being so arrogant, and for being away from my home country. If I were just a low educated immigrant, perhaps I would have thankfully worked as a cleaner or janitor and totally enjoyed a new life here (Finland). Huh, you know I was so worried if I would get depressed. Luckily, a few weeks later, I found out I was pregnant and then I started focusing on becoming a mother. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

These highly educated women moved to their husbands' country with gender and class pride since many of them used to be successful career-women in Taiwan, a patriarchal society. However, the longer they suffer from the impact of

unequal life chances in the Finnish labor market, the more they lose their pride. Particularly, the uncertainty leads to anxiety about the future. As a result, for many of the women in this study, their middle-class background becomes a burden since immigration places them on a downward trajectory and leads to a loss of social status and a feeling of failure. When they experience significant socio-cultural disjunction, a mismatch between their middle-class habitus and the lower social standing causes tensions and contradictions, which results in "cleft habitus", as put forth by Bourdieu (2007, p. 100). Hence, downward social mobility leads to a potentially painful process of habitus cleavage. For some of them, cleft habitus is not only between their old and new social locations in a cross-cultural context but also between middle-class home environment and working-class occupations in everyday life. Moreover, as a non-Western immigrant belonging to the dominated group in Finland, they have less power than they had in Taiwan as a member of the dominant group, which does not correspond to their middle-class habitus. They are no longer able to hold the entitlement of the dominant group, nor are they able to completely let it go. Their desirability of a self-acceptable social position is not just determined by what educational qualifications they hold, but also their middle-class consciousness. However, they implicitly or explicitly conform to the dominant discourse on immigration and strive to achieve a positive social identity of a "good-immigrant" along lines of gender, class and race/ethnicity.

## 4.2 Two Success Stories of Converting Cultural Capital into a Career

In the first few years, the Taiwanese women as recent immigrants did not have social connections that could provide a useful start point to facilitate job search in the host society except for Yang, an ICT engineer. Yang continues her career without interruptions when moving to Finland because she had worked in the Finnish branch company in Taiwan before her immigration. She successfully transferred to her company's headquarters in Finland. However, even when English is the official working language, there is still a need for Finnish language skills.

> I got information about the open positions in advance through the company's intranet. From the branch company in Taiwan to the headquarters in Finland, my career hasn't changed. I'm lucky. However, in my case, I would say having "Finnish experience" is much more important than having local education. Although my career is not downward, I don't think I have a chance to move into the management level. Maybe someday I would become senior in my current company. That's all. There is no more career advancement for me in Finland. I know many of you envy me only because I never suffered from unemployment in Finland. Although I had got the current job

> before moving here, you have no idea how hard I have to work to secure this job. I am like any of you; I'm suffering from the immigration, too. I even didn't have time to adjust to life in Finland before entering the workforce. (Yang, age 35, in Finland five years)

Yang has rich "Finnish experience" which she actually obtained in Taiwan. Any forms of capital always require conversion and the process of converting creates the power of recognition between groups (Bourdieu, 1986). Hence, valued cultural capital reflects the values of the dominant groups. Having Finnish experience may denote a cultural fit for the job or possession of specific knowledge. However, the requirement of Finnish experience may also be thinly disguised discrimination against certain immigrant groups. The Finnish labor market is highly gender-segregated. Moreover, Finnish men earn more than Finnish women in almost all occupations, whether male-dominated or not (Jarman, Blackburn, & Racko, 2012; Statistics Finland, 2012). In the interview, Yang stated that she might earn less than her male colleagues but, interestingly, she might earn more than the average Finnish women because of the considerably higher average starting salary. Her job as an ICT engineer is one of the high-wage and male-dominated professions in Finland. Mostly, male-dominated occupations at equivalent qualifications and similar skill levels pay more than female-dominated occupations.

However, working in a male-dominated field such as ICT presents particular challenges for immigrant women's career advancement. When gender and race/ethnicity intersect, Yang faces a double disadvantage from being a visible immigrant woman. She thinks that she has less career development opportunities than equally qualified native-born counterparts, whether men or women. Although Yang has never experienced downward mobility in terms of occupational status and wage level, she still faces a "glass ceiling", preventing her from moving vertically to reach an advanced position at her current job. Her narrative echoes Jaakkola's findings that the Finns are more ready to accept immigrants as co-workers than supervisors (Jaakkola, 2005; see also Raunio, 2003). Furthermore, Yang stated that she feels left out of social interaction and information exchange at her workplace owing to her lack of Finnish language skills (see Habti, 2012).

> Even though we use English as the working language, it's a Finnish company. You know, the information exchange happens more often in an informal way. In the moment when you really need to know, they never speak English, unlike in the meetings. So I was forced to hang out with other Chinese employees. (…) I want to learn the Finnish language but my job is really demanding. As you know, I am also studying at the university (a Master's degree). Although my current job doesn't require Finnish language skills, but just in case, having a local degree should reduce the risk of being laid off. Finns welcome you only when you can work and pay taxes

> but, you know, they still have a you-don't-belong-here attitude. You know, I have to ASSUME that I am more likely to be on the layoff list since I am not a Finn. It's not enough if you are as good as Finns. You have to be better (job performance) than Finns. (Yang, age 35, in Finland five years)

Unlike many other skilled professions, ICT workers are mainly assessed for their technical knowledge and skills rather than academic qualifications. Besides a university education in Taiwan, Yang has a MA degree from the United States of America. However, she still pursues another local degree in Finland in an effort to protect her job and/or prepare for loss of employment based on her perception and awareness of immigrant vulnerability. There is an on-going need to attract skilled workers from abroad in order to cope with the impact of a rapidly aging population, the decline of the working age population, and the retirement wave of the post-war baby-boom generation in Finland (see Davies, Weko, Kim, & Thulstrup, 2009; Forsander, 2000; Forsander, 2004b; Heikkilä, 2011b; Heikkilä & Pikkarainen, 2008; Johansson, 2008; Koskela, 2010; OECD, 2004a; Williams, 2010; Łobodzińska, 2011). However, as Yang stated "Finns welcome you only when you can work and pay taxes but, you know, they still have a you-don't-belong-here attitude", a tension between requiring a diverse labor pool for the economic balance and sustaining racial/ethnic- and national-based solidarity in Finland (see Koskela, 2010; Koikkalainen et al., 2011).

Although the official working language of the company is English, a lack of Finnish language skills not only constrains her other employment opportunities outside the company but also excludes Yang from the social interaction at work (see also Tiilikainen, 2008). Acceptance into social networks is important to long-term career advancement. The intersection of gender and race/ethnicity compounds Yang's experience of marginality since she is a marked outsider in a Finnish male dominated field. She has difficulty to create social connections with her Finnish co-workers regardless of her gender. In order to dilute the negative effects of isolation at the workplace, she appreciates the ethnic subgroup in order to expand her own social network (see Aarnitaival, 2012; Habti, 2012).

Lim who has Taiwanese and British BA degrees had been an expatriate wife for ten years in other countries before she settled in Finland in 2002. She spoke of how her fruitless job search made her choose a substitute position over MBA studies:

> I was offered a 3-month substitute job and got a place for MBA studies at the same time. The helpless and hopeless job search experiences made me immediately take the substitute position, though I always feel I should advance my education. I'm glad I made the right decision. Now it's a permanent position. I think this company is the only and best chance I have because the working language is English. I am sure that even a local MBA degree wouldn't promise me a better position than the current one. (Lim, age 40, in Finland five years)

Lim's comments insinuate that English as the official corporate language provides an alternative solution for overcoming language barriers for highly educated immigrants who have a good command of the English language. Although Finnish language proficiency undoubtedly impacts immigrants' employability in the Finnish labor market, research has confirmed that Finnish language proficiency does not guarantee immigrants future employment or career development (Joronen, 2005). Interestingly, Lim rests all her hopes on a single company using English as the corporate language rather than on the whole Finnish labor force requiring local language proficiency even if she has made an effort to learn Finnish since arrival in Finland. Moreover, for Lim, her economic self-sufficiency is never really a major concern since her husband has been a successful business leader. Rather, working at an international prestigious ICT company is more a way to maintain her middle-class status and to fulfill her gender role in the Finnish context as she said "I don't feel comfortable being a housewife in this country" in the following narrative.

> Job searching in Finland is a really heart-breaking experience. Before I got this job, people comforted me, you know, in a tone implying that why on earth would I want to work in Finland since I have a rich husband, live in a big house, drive a luxury car and so on. Some people even asked me how I could survive without in-house housemaids and nannies, and even my own driver; you know that kind of life style I used to have in Asian countries. Of course, my husband can afford for me to stay at home and just enjoy our wealth. But I am educated and I can work since I don't feel comfortable being a housewife in this country. When I want to work, it's my own choice. I have the right to decide whether I want to work or not no matter how rich my spouse is. I know many of you (Taiwanese) consider me a legend since I didn't have any real work experience. Well, I would say my persistent attitude is the key factor in my case. Just trust yourself. I know it's difficult for immigrants, like us. During the job search, when I had desperate moments, I started thinking about racial/ethnic discrimination. However, I had to push myself to see the brighter side of things. I said to myself that this kind of negative attitude would NEVER HELP or make anything better. POSITIVE attitude is everything. (Lim, age 40, in Finland five years)

Lim managed to get a hard-earned substitute position, which she was able to successfully turn into a permanent position. Among these Taiwanese women, Lim is the only one who never had participated in paid work, i.e., she had no work experience at all, before immigrating to Finland. She married a Finn and became an expatriate wife/mother straight after university graduation. Noteworthily, the case of Lim's experience should not be seen as a "legend"; rather, it exemplifies an educated immigrant's capability for maintaining employment even without a local degree or any paid-work experience, not to mention local experience/Finnish experience. Moreover, Lim highlights her "persistent attitude" toward her employment success, which romanticizes the job

seeker's attitude and overlooks the existing structural and institutional barriers that immigrants face in the Finnish labor market.

Not surprising, after Lim succeeded in finding a job at an international company, she saw her outcome of job-searching through positive lenses and continued to exhibit characteristics of success including motivation, perseverance, and drive to achieve. One should not lose sight of what played a significant role in determining her employment opportunity is a powerful social contact. She has a strong social capital to convert cultural capital into economic capital. As she conceded:

> After two years of Finnish language courses, I sent out almost around 70 copies of my CV per week and got ZERO calls back. Few weeks later, I realized that this (sending job applications) would never work. I immediately started contacting all Finnish friends I met in the past 10 years. Luckily, a friend of mine knew someone, an influential person. I contacted him and he said there was no vacancy. I even offered myself without any payment. Although he said no, I still called him, almost weekly, to see if he could meet me just for a few minutes. Of course, sometimes he neither answered the phone nor called me back. Anyway, he was my ONLY hope. A few months later, he finally offered me a 10-minute interview because someone was going to take maternity leave. I was so lucky. Of course, I got the substitute position. (Lim, age 40, in Finland five years)

Lim even offered "no-payment" in exchange for an opportunity. Immigration-status vulnerabilities weaken Lim's bargaining power. However, the 10-minute meeting opened the door to a career for her. Although command of Finnish is not required at Lim's workplace, the majority of native-born employees' first language is still Finnish. She further explained:

> My Finnish coworkers, of course, speak Finnish. If I don't use Finnish, I immediately become an outsider. I try to speak Finnish with them. But I think I would learn new things faster by using English since my English language skills are much better than Finnish language skills. Speaking Finnish is really demanding. So I usually switch to English as soon as I feel too tired to use Finnish. Besides, English allows me to easily have more social conversations with my co-workers in a relaxed and natural way. You know, I need to build up my own social network, just in case. (Lim, age 40, in Finland five years)

English as the working language can function as an important gateway to a job (see Shumilova et al., 2012); nonetheless, Finland is not an English-speaking country. Even if the language barrier to employment seemingly has been overcome, it may be invoked later, as a perpetual stress and on-going challenge inside and outside the workplace.

## 4.3 The Land of Equal Opportunity Is an Unrealized Dream

For immigrants, local education and credentials signify important cultural capital enabling upward social mobility when other resources are limited or denied. Nine out of the ten women have been redoing their BA and MA education in Finland. Whether they have sufficient Finnish proficiency or not, many of them strategically chose English-taught degree programs in order to prevent low academic performance since they have less Finnish academic vocabulary knowledge than their Finnish peers in Finnish academic settings. Some women even take an additional BA degree at Finnish polytechnics totally unrelated to their previous education and work experience because those programs are offered in English. Despite the fact that they have successfully obtained local education, these Taiwanese women's cultural capital still fails to be traded on equal terms (see Skeggs, 1997). They believe that the Finnish employers generally take little interest in their qualifications and skills because they possess a socially devalued or unvalued status in terms of their racial/ethnic origins. It echoes the findings of Söderqvist (2005) that non-Finnish graduates of Finnish higher education institutes face considerable challenges in finding their first jobs because the job seekers with an immigrant background are devalued by the majority of Finnish employers. In other words, the Finnish degree holders' social background considerably affects the conversion of the institutionalized state of cultural capital alongside other relevant factors, such as Finnish experience, social contacts, or Finnish language proficiency (see also CIMO, 2011; Majakulma, 2011; Shumilova, Cai, & Pekkola, 2012).

In a way, the underutilization of highly educated immigrants' qualifications and skills results in simultaneously "deskilling" immigrants on a personal level and "brain waste" for the host country on a national level in terms of the human resources (Bauder, 2003). These Taiwanese women put a great deal of time, effort and energy into completing Finnish higher education whereas the state invests into human resources by providing free education. It creates a no-win situation when neither immigrants nor the host society succeeds in having economic returns on the investment in higher education. However, the difficulty of transitioning for highly educated immigrants to the labor market is not purely a matter of explaining differences in job search outcomes between employed and unemployed immigrants. Rather, it may be one aspect of multiple intersectionality of unequal power embedded in society. The labor market in the host country intends to maintain the existing power structure and to preserve the social order by deskilling immigrants (Bauder, 2006). The host country labor market functions as a site for legitimizing ingroups and delegitimizing outgroups. Thus, the conversion of cultural capital into economic capital is contingent on relations of power in light of serving the interests of dominant groups.

Liu was forced to abandon her previous credentials and her career in international trade. In order to widen employment opportunities, she found a new avenue through the Finnish educational system. She was a full-time BA degree student in Public Health Nursing at the time of the interview. Even if she is able to take the program in Finnish, she does not expect to get a job as a public nurse. As Liu explained:

> Although I passed the entry test, I know my Finnish language skills are not good enough. Anyway, I believe that my Finnish language skills will improve more or less since the program is taught in Finnish. After my graduation, I think they would just hire me as a practical nurse because of my poor oral skills in Finnish. I need to put my hopes to the lowest. You know, great expectations lead to greater disappointment. I had been thinking about whether I should drop out from this degree program and just take the training program of practical nursing. As I told you earlier, my study life isn't that joyful. Sometimes I wonder if I am wasting my energy and time for a degree, which doesn't promise me a better chance. We Taiwanese value education so much. Learning is absolutely better than doing nothing. So, for me, the decision to continue my studies is much easier than to give up. Besides, that piece of paper (degree) would give me confidence to prove that in this country I am still capable of doing something that some Finns can't achieve. (Liu, age 40, in Finland six years)

Liu takes on a pessimistic attitude by self-selecting herself out of jobs since she does not expect that her career would flourish right from obtaining the degree. However, it also shows how Liu values higher education as cultural capital that would maintain or enhance her social position. In addition to education obtained in the destination country, the type of profession and local language proficiency are still crucial factors in the case of Liu's experience.

Many of them had expected to get some rewards from combining their professional backgrounds and local credentials; however, they became disillusioned. For example, Chang, a former schoolteacher in Taiwan, was frustrated with her local vocational certificates and decided to change her job again. In the beginning she did not understand that the problem was not with her personally, but ingrained in the host society. However, she eventually learned to see how the system works and saw no choice but to adjust her job expectations accordingly. As she said:

> When I had just moved to Finland, I wanted to find a teaching job like the one I had in Taiwan, at least something concerned with teaching. I have a local certification as a school assistant. You know, school assistants are not even required to have a university education here (Finland). However, no school accepts me. (…) I dropped out of the MA degree study from the University of Helsinki and attended different vocational training programs in the past ten years. I took whatever jobs I could find in order to have local work experience. So what? I couldn't find a stable job based on my local certifications. Those efforts I put in just made me realize that it was a waste of

> time. In the future if I need further education, I won't take full-time courses anymore. At the moment I'm attending a practical nursing training program. Currently Finland needs a lot of practical nurses; otherwise, they wouldn't have welcomed immigrants to join if there had been enough Finnish practical nurses. So you know what, you have to find the RIGHT market for immigrants when you want to have a stable job here (Finland). (Chang, age 45, in Finland sixteen years)

During the initial stages of her immigration, Chang's goal and expectation were to work in her original field of work, even at a lower level than her previous job. However, she realized that her education and work experience from her country of origin was useless in helping her attain employment. Her cultural capital was not transferable to the Finnish labor market.

A desire for stability eventually forced Chang to make career compromises; as a result, she took on job training programs and has little career expectations regarding the field or level of the job. As Collins (2000b) argues that "the authority to define societal values is a major instrument of power, elite groups, in exercising power, manipulate ideas" (p. 69). Chang further stated:

> The staff in the municipal employment office also suggested that I could take Hotel and Restaurant training since there are more job vacancies in restaurants and hotels. See, they decide the types of jobs for immigrants. In this country, as an immigrant you get respect when you are a tax-paying worker. You should forget the pride and career ambition! There is no difference between being a janitor and a President in Finland. I am so tired of "what next". You know, in order to better your odds, you have to acquire Finnish experience and if you don't compromise you'll never have local experience and you'll have nothing to put on your resume. I used to believe that "mighty oaks from little acorns grow", that's why I must be proactive and took whatever work I could get. See, my employment history in Finland (Chang showing her resume to the researcher), quite rich, isn't it? Well, let's face it; all of them are just relevant experience for a blue-collar job that offers little advancement opportunities. (Chang, age 45, in Finland sixteen years)

In Finland, it is considerably difficult for immigrants to be employed on the basis of their professional skills and resources without any Finnish work experience because their education and work experience gained abroad are not appreciated (see Ahmad, 2005; Forsander & Alitolppa-Niitamo, 2000; Forsander, 2002a; Kyhä, 2011). However, how can immigrants acquire local experience relevant to their academic qualifications and existing expertise if no local employer in relevant occupation fields is willing to hire them in the first place? What is of greater concern is how to expand and increase access to employment and urgently needed work experience for immigrants instead of justifying a lack of Finnish work experience. Although it is hard to distinguish genuine work requirements from inequality in employment, "Finnish experience" needs to be challenged and questioned since there may be social bias in how the host society

evaluates immigrants' employability and systematically discriminate against various immigrant groups.

Moreover, Chang's prospects for occupational mobility over time seem rather dim since she is aware of the low returns to acquiring the work experience in low-skilled jobs at the bottom of the occupational structure in the Finnish labor market. In other words, an inconsistent low-skilled employment history does not make Chang more "experienced" or employable outside of the blue-collar labor market in spite of her diligence and a willingness to work hard. At the time of the interview, Chang was taking a training program to become a practical nurse. Yet, a few years later, she immediately got into a degree program in nursing (sairaanhoitaja) at a university of applied sciences right after the training ended. As she said in the email, "there's a big difference between having a job where I waste my talent and having a career I would like to be actually dedicated to. Money is never so important to me. I just want to prove that I, as an immigrant, still can do something much better than Finns do." Self-worth can never be disassociated with the job per se. Driven by a desire for a real career, Chang expressed dismay at having to go through again of finding another way to prove that she is qualified for better jobs.

Occupation still corresponds with income level and educational attainment, which combined determine the social class of a person in a society. Social class remains the strongest predictor of educational achievement. However, social class is not only associated with the economic position individuals occupy in a society, but also with values, attitudes, beliefs, past experiences and perceptions of one's social world constituting what Bourdieu terms the habitus (Bourdieu, 1977). Downward social mobility affects Chang not only on an economic level, but also on an emotional level. Participation in paid-jobs is not simply a source of earnings, but also should be a source of fulfillment and life satisfaction. For Chang, education provides opportunities to rectify injustices and inequities in a new country. And yet, underlying this ideal is an institutional reality that is twisted by the intersection of racial/ethnic and class inequalities (see also Ball, 2003). Class-based distinctions have translated into a sense of entitlement among these highly educated Taiwanese women; however, these women also gain an emerging sense of restraint from their experiences of being a visible immigrant in Finnish society. Race/ethnicity may have much more impact than gender and social class on their resettlement in Finland.

Since 1999, the Act on the Integration of Immigrants and Reception of Asylum Seekers (493/1999) obliges the authorities to support immigrants such as language courses and vocational and pre-job trainings for their integration into Finnish society. Immigrants who arrive and enter the population register after 1st May 1997 are eligible for the integration plan according to the Act. After the Act was slightly amended in 2002 and 2006, in order to efficiently reallocate

existing resources, the new Act of the Promotion of Integration (1386/2010) was adopted by Parliament on 30 December 2010 and came into effect on 1 September 2011. According the Act, there are three levels of management: national integration policies, municipal integration programs, and individual responsibility (Ministry of the Interior Finland, 2011a; 2011b).

There have been frequent calls for immigrants to take a more pro-active stance by learning the Finnish or Swedish language and attending pre-employment programs or training in order to participate in the paid work force (see Ministry of the Interior Finland, 2012). In so doing, recent immigrants who have registered as unemployed jobseekers have the right to a 3-year-individual-integration-plan drawn up with the municipal/local employment offices. The individual integration plans include basic language courses, preparatory and/or vocational training programs, pre-employment training programs, work practice programs and so forth. Although integration plans significantly improve immigrant employment outcomes and, hence, decrease welfare dependence (Sarvimäki & Hämäläinen, 2010), it only focuses on binary employment status (employed or unemployed) and completely fails to address the institutional and structural problems of the underemployment, precarious employment and deskilling in highly educated and skilled immigrants. There are realities that are often masked or underplayed in quantitative studies. There is a lack of strategic policy initiatives regarding highly educated immigrants moving from skills mismatch to skills commensurate in Finland since the issue of immigrants' underemployment has not yet gained substantial public attention in Finnish society. There is a need to bring the discourse of deskilling into the immigration policy and social equality.

Several women feel that they are treated differently since their qualifications are belittled and their skills and capabilities are underestimated (see also Koskela, 2010; Kyhä, 2011). To illustrate her point, Pan shared her experience at the municipal employment office:

> If I were a native-born Finn, would I be treated in the same way? I was really pissed when the staff at the employment office asked me why I didn't want to take MAVA programs (vocational basic education preparatory course for immigrants). All I needed was to advance my Finnish language skills. I have a university education already. Having a language problem doesn't mean that I have no knowledge of mathematics, natural sciences, civic skills, etc. It seems to me, they never take my educational or professional background seriously although they did ask for the official copies of my certificates of degree. Anyway, later my husband paid my tuition for the advanced language courses at the university language center and Summer University. (Pan, age 45, in Finland eight years)

According to most of the participants, the services provided by the municipal employment office are not useful in helping them find jobs commensurate with

their qualifications and work experience (see Saarinen & Mehtonen, 2012), but channel them to fill the labor shortage (see also Antikainen, 2010). The importance of language skills and the host-country-specific human capital are significantly taken into account in the implementation of the Act of the Promotion of Integration (1386/2010) in Finland (Sarvimäki & Hämäläinen, 2010). The municipal employment office tends to steer immigrants, regardless of their prior educational attainment and qualifications, into the lower echelons of the Finnish labor market (see also Forsander, 2007 in Finland; see also Ng, 1996 in Canada). Arguably, it is legitimate to relocate immigrants to supply a shortage of workers in the low-skilled sector by depicting immigrants as lacking in qualifications, language proficiency or Finnish experience. In other words, the municipal employment office, as a public-sector organization representing the interests of the general public and Finnish government agenda, may serve the state's interests rather than immigrants' interests in light of helping maintain the existing social order.

For these Taiwanese women, the municipal employment office supposedly should help them overcome barriers to entry to the Finnish labor market rather than works in favor of the state through (re)producing a labor market stratified by gender and race/ethnicity. Wu's statement exemplifies feelings of disappointment:

> Just like many other Finnish women, I stayed at home and took care of my small child and my husband was the main breadwinner. However, as soon as the parental leave officially ended, my social status changed. When my son started going to daycare at age of three, my husband urged me to visit the local employment office to register as a jobseeker. I really hate that idea. It's like they put a negative label on me. I know I wouldn't get any substantial help from the municipal employment office. I mean getting a job in my profession based on my qualifications. I've been there MANY times and I know how it works. So I really don't see the point to visit the local employment office to register as a jobseeker. What for? I am not interested in those pre-employment training programs at all since I don't want to become a waitress or a care worker. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

For many of the women in this study, finding a job is important and a priority particularly in their early settlement period in a new country. Their life histories and personal dispositions have shaped their career aspirations for a new life in Finland. However, the main reason as to why finding employment is a priority is for the preservation of self-esteem and gaining social acceptance rather than for income for survival. Some women chose jobs for which they are overqualified in an effort to gain "Finnish work experience" and avoid unemployment. Having a tax-paying job is important both for the individual and for society in terms of full citizenship in Finnish society since unemployment may lead to social exclusion, social isolation and stigmatization (see also Antikainen, 2010; Pehkonen, 2006).

Contacts beyond the immediate and everyday circles of family and friends are also important information sources to search for jobs. But as newly arrived immigrants, these women had limited access to useful connections that were able to offer any especially new or significant employment information. Thus, ethnic affiliation can be an asset in providing employment information and job opportunities for immigrants (see also Ahmad, 2005, 2011; Katila & Wahlbeck, 2011; Ooka & Wellman, 2006). On the other hand, immigrants may be trapped in a vicious circle of ghettoizing racial/ethnic labor when immigrants are not included in the mainstream labor market and become marginalized from mainstream society. Likewise, Ho who is a qualified priest in Finland only could find a part-time job at a Chinese-speaking church in the metropolitan area since the church cannot afford to hire a full-time priest. Her Taiwanese background and mother tongue, rather than her fluency in both the Swedish and Finnish languages, have facilitated her working in a Chinese ethnic community. She, however, has to sacrifice part of her family life because the 400-kilometer distance between her working place and residence. Ho said in the interview, "people often think I have advantages of getting jobs since I speak both Swedish and Finnish fluently thanks to my Swedish-speaking husband. In fact, my Swedish and Finnish language skills have not privileged my job search so far".

For these Taiwanese women, Finland is a contradictory country, a country of greater equality than Taiwan, but also a country of racial/ethnic inequities, which fundamentally contests the visions of what an egalitarian country looks like. Finland, like other Nordic countries, has been relatively successful in reducing class inequality by distributing income rather evenly, which is reflected in Finland's relatively low Gini coefficient, a standard measure of income inequality (OECD, 2008). In spite of the image of equal society and women-friendly welfare state, occupational segregation by sex/gender and the difference of the valued masculine and devalued feminine in the Finnish labor market have decreased over the past decades but there is still room for improvement (European Commission, 2008, 2009, 2012; Jarman, Blackburn, & Racko, 2012; Rantalaiho & Heiskanen, 1997; Korvajärvi, 2010). Many Finnish women are employed on fixed term or atypical contracts rather than tenure or permanent contracts (Lehto, Lyly-Yrjänäinen, & Sutela, 2005; OECD, 2011; see also Salmi, 2004, p. 117). Even highly educated Finnish women face gender disadvantage at the workplace (Nieminen, 2009). When gender intersects with race/ethnicity, the division among women became ever more magnified. In this regard, these highly educated Taiwanese women are much more likely to be severely disadvantaged in the Finnish labor market concerning the intersection of gender and race/ethnicity.

Tertiary level qualifications have increased women's opportunities for employment. However, despite a higher percentage of women than men having a

tertiary education in Finland (OECD, 2013), Finnish women's employment wages are still lower than those of similarly qualified men. Women receive less economic returns on investment in higher education than men in Finland (see Kivinen & Nurmi, 2009). Finnish women's pay, on average, was only 84.2% of the men's salary in 2012 (Statistics Finland, 2012). Similarly, in Taiwan the gender pay gap stood at around 16.6% in 2012 (DGBAS, 2013); however, the gender pay gap is significantly smaller among university degree holders, that is, the returns for a university education are higher for women than for men in Taiwan (Tsai & Yu, 2011). Unsurprisingly, many of these university-educated women in the interviews specifically highlight their educational and career achievements in Taiwan in order to claim that the status of highly educated women in the labor market in a patriarchal society is not necessarily worse than that of women in an egalitarian society.

Although equity and/or gender equality has become a claimed trademark of Finnish society with low socioeconomic-inequality and high social-mobility, it barely changes visible immigrants' marginal social positions. Many of the women in this study benefit little from the ethos of equality in Finnish society, as Silius and Tuori (2004) stress that unequal power relations and structures, more than the usual, are disguised by ideologically and practically gender neutralization.

> My husband and parents-in-law used to enjoy bragging about the equal social system which makes everyone have the same chances to do what they can in Finland. In the first few years, this national image motivated me really much; you know, I thought I would have the same chances. Later, I started having doubts about whether I didn't try enough or I was just a loser. The Nordic pride, everybody-is-equal, misled me that it's my own fault since I couldn't succeed in an EGALITARIAN country. You know, I have dual nationality. My parents-in-law even believed that my Finnish nationality would help me to find a good job since I finally and officially became a Finn. So naïve! They don't understand the difficulties for an Asian immigrant to start a new life in Finland. Anyway, perhaps after they witnessed my immigration life, they've realized that equality may only exist among white Finns. Maybe they are too embarrassed to admit it; (laughing) anyway, I am glad they no longer talk about the equity in front of me. You know, that kind of privileged voices, really annoying. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Wu clearly indentifies the disjuncture between beliefs that Finland is an egalitarian country, and practices that are experienced by immigrants. If only she tries harder, then she may have the same chances like any Finns do. Successful integration seems to be the responsibility of the individual immigrant, i.e., within each immigrant's control. However, seeing herself as an individual, not as a representative of her visible immigrant background, has become more and more difficult when her career ambition and motivation had started fading

away, and her faith in egalitarianism had been severely weakened. Wu questions the reputation of Finland's equality which may downplay the economic and social inequalities in certain immigrant groups. As Mazur (2002) points out, "in many Western European countries, when notions of equality are articulated in public debates and in formal policy statements, whether the policies are employment-oriented or more broadly based, equality is often assumed to be sex-based rather than based on equality between different racial or ethnic groups" (p. 29). As long as public and academic discourse are not willing enough to engage in debates on racial/ethnic inequality, white privilege and power would remain unmarked and unaddressed in Finnish society.

Despite Finns' preoccupation with a fairly strong egalitarian ethos, the avoidance of racial/ethnic issues in Finnish society leads to denial and racial/ethnic blindness to preserve white comfort and white privilege. Ignoring the power and status differentials based on race/ethnicity reproduces and exacerbates existing inequalities. Likewise, Puuronen (2011) argues that racial/ethnic hierarchy exists in Finnish society although there is a tendency for Finns to downplay racial/ethnic discrimination and simply avoid the issue of race/ethnicity-based inequality (also see Rastas, 2009). Internalization of such equality beliefs lead many of the women in this study to pressure themselves to live up to such expectations. These Taiwanese women disappointedly describe their post-immigration years as a process of coming to terms with the reality of "racialized/ethnicized egalitarianism". It is not only that they overestimate the expected return of higher education in relation to their middle-class habitus but also that they greatly underestimate the degree to which race/ethnicity does play a role in determining job placement and career opportunities in an egalitarian country such as Finland.

## Summary

Many of the women in this study face overwhelmingly downward mobility since they have difficult to find jobs commensurate with their qualifications and work experience. There is a disjuncture between beliefs that Finland is portrayed as an egalitarian country, and practices that are experienced by these Taiwanese women. Most of them cannot find jobs in their respective fields since their academic success is not transferable into similar jobs in Finnish society. Having a native-born spouse offers little benefit in job search, despite the fact that they have a direct connection to Finnish society. The common pattern of downward mobility for first generation educated immigrants is repeated for these Taiwanese immigrant women in Finland. These Taiwanese women see a lack of language skills or local educational credentials as temporary barriers to be

overcome. Even those who work in English speaking environments find themselves excluded from the social environments where co-workers speak Finnish. They struggle to be in charge of their own lives and employment by learning languages and obtaining local educational credentials. Their sense of who they are has been adjusted from being professional educated women to immigrants without the valued cultural capital. Their middle-class identities contradict their immigrant social status, in particular vocational downward mobility, which are not consistent with their dispositions and leads to a potentially painful process of cleft habitus. Education and language do not simply reflect the capacity of these highly educated immigrants to integrate into the Finnish labor market. Although integration plans significantly improve immigrant employment outcomes, it overlooks the institutional and structural problems of the underemployment and deskilling of highly educated and skilled immigrants.

# CHAPTER FIVE

## Acquiring Cultural Capital in a Cross-Cultural Setting

Language proficiency has been taken as a good indicator of immigrant integration. Settlement in Finland, which is officially a bilingual country, requires immigrants to have Finnish or Swedish language skills since these are the primary languages of economic, social, cultural, and educational life. When these Taiwanese women realized that their non-Finnish qualifications and work experience are not valued and rewarded, they embrace a pragmatic strategy by redoing tertiary education and learning the destination language. They take responsibility to obtain the necessary Finnish qualifications and language proficiency in order to successfully integrate into the Finnish labor market. This chapter turns to the possibility of acquiring more valued capital by learning the Finnish language and pursuing local degrees.

### 5.1 Learning the Finnish Language

Further complicating the integration of the Taiwanese women is the Finnish language, which becomes one of the crucial issues they must negotiate. The significance of destination language skills in the process of integration is affirmed by scholars and even by immigrants themselves (Clarke, 2005; Chiswick & Miller, 2007; Forsander & Raunio, 2005; Heikkilä, 2005; Jasinskaja-Lahti, 2008; Tubergen & Kalmijn, 2005). According to the Act of the Promotion of Integration (1386/2010), the Finnish Government has recognized the importance of Finnish language competence. Newcomers/newly arrived immigrants who are registered as unemployed job seekers and entitled to the integration plan which must be drawn up within three years after their arrival. In so doing, immigrants have the right to apply through the local authorities for language courses based on their integration plans.

Depending on the family formation reason for immigration to Finland, the challenges facing the Taiwanese women who want to learn Finnish are varied and differ from one another in response to life-cycle stages. Some women actually are no longer eligible for the integration plan after they finished their degree studies or when their small child could be placed in daycare. Moreover, the full-time intensive Finnish language courses for immigrants, basically offered at the daytime and on weekdays, are inaccessible to women who have primary childcare responsibilities along with the absence of their own parents' support. Although parents-in-law who are retired can be also a source of

childcare support, according to some women in this study, the amount of childcare assistance from their parents-in-law is usually for a few hours per week only during their husbands' long business trips outside of Finland. At different stages of their lives, there are factors impinging on their process of acquiring Finnish language proficiency, such as 3.5 to 4 years full-time degree studies with instruction entirely in English, the time interval between immigration and the new baby's arrival, home care for small child, or other commitments.

For example, Lee immediately enrolled in a bachelor-level degree program with instruction entirely in English at a university of applied sciences (AMK) when her child started going to daycare. After the completion of her studies, she realized that she needs Finnish language skills in order to find a job. Because she has been in Finland too long, she is not eligible for the integration plan for newly arrived immigrants. Lee completed a few months of intensive language study at Helsingin seudun kesäyliopisto (Helsinki Summer University) and soon started working as a care worker at a nursing home for adults with developmental disabilities. However, the length of time Lee took to study the Finnish language is certainly not enough to reach full proficiency (see Chapter Six, p. 114). Thus, it is worth noting that length of residence in Finland should not serve as the single predictor of the participants' Finnish language proficiency since length of residence does not correspond directly to the duration/length of time spent learning the Finnish language.

Among the women interviewed, two of them took the degree programs in English right after their arrival. At that time, they were unaware of the necessity of learning Finnish because they lived in the Helsinki metropolitan area where many native-born Finns speak English. They both did not perceive their lack of Finnish language proficiency as a barrier but embraced higher education as a means of rebuilding a career in Finland. Gaining a local education represents a career investment; however, Finnish language competence is still needed in order for these women to get the jobs they are educated for (Krutova, 2011; Laine & Kujanpää, 2008). Wu, with a MA degree from another Nordic country, recalled the staff of the municipal employment office commenting about her higher education attainment and English language skills which could mislead the staff to put her into the low priority queue for Finnish language courses.

> There was a LONG queue to get in the Finnish language courses. I was really shocked when I was told that it would take a long time to queue for a place particularly because of my English language skills and high level of education. I totally couldn't accept the staff's explanation "you have more chances to get employed since you are highly educated and speak English". How many Finnish companies' working language is English? Will Nokia hire all of highly educated immigrants? It's really absurd. If I had gotten a job with my English language skills, I wouldn't have bothered visiting the municipal employment office. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Some of the women were able to enroll in the free Finnish courses provided by the municipal employment office. Some women paid themselves for the Finnish courses instead of being on a waiting list since the availability and the efficiency of language courses did not match their needs. All women in this study had taken Finnish courses for about two years. However, the written Finnish (yleiskieli/ kirjakieli) that they have learned in class is more or less different from the colloquial Finnish (puhekieli) which Finns use in everyday life and in most informal situations.

> Colloquial Finnish is very much different from the Finnish I've learned in classes. It is really dispiriting. I sometimes a bit regret putting too much effort into written Finnish instead of colloquial Finnish. Those language certifications are completely useless for job search since I couldn't respond to Finns' talking so well in the first three years. But when I think of my Thai friend's situation, I think standard written Finnish is also quite important. She doesn't speak English at all; however, she learned to speak Finnish really fast. Unfortunately, she is kind of illiterate since she barely can read and write in Finnish. For her, written Finnish is like another language. So I would say standard written Finnish and colloquial Finnish should be taught to immigrants at the same time. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

The objective of literacy training for adult immigrants to learn basic oral and written Finnish or Swedish language skills is to be able to use the language within most practical daily life situations; thereby, words such as "everyday situations", "everyday life situations", "everyday interaction situations", "natural contexts" are repeated frequently in the National Core Curriculum for Literacy Training for Adult Migrants 2012, which is developed and recommended by the Finnish National Board of Education (Opetushallitus, 2012). Without incorporating the comprehension of colloquial Finnish into the teaching-learning process or the curriculum, the Finnish literacy training is principally reserved for formal, usually written, standard Finnish skills. In so doing, colloquial Finnish is still alien to new learners. The difference between the written Finnish and the colloquial Finnish creates significant disconnect between the linguistic knowledge and communication capabilities. Although participation in language courses enable immigrants to comprehend a conversation in Finnish in some social settings, it is not efficient enough to develop immigrants' vocationally oriented Finnish language skills, including skills of listening comprehension and oral communication.

> My mother-in-law was curious about my Finnish textbook and skimmed through it. There was only a small table on a page about "puhekieli" in the book. You know, it's about Minä/Mä, Sinä/Sä and so on. She said "oh, no. They shouldn't teach immigrants bad Finnish". What's so wrong to learn the way they speak every day? Without colloquial Finnish skills, I was just like the deaf in the first few years. Those slang and colloquial terms that Finns use in everyday speech almost disappear in the

> language courses. I seldom had problem understanding my Finnish language teachers' talking, but out of the classroom, I just couldn't follow those "real conversations" among Finns. (Wang, age 35, in Finland five years)

Many of the women recalled that they had difficulty responding appropriately in unfamiliar situations that obviously took place outside of the classroom in the first few years. They learn Finnish grammar in isolation and words, phrases and sentences in a more formal and polite way (see Pöyhönen, Tarnanen, Kyllönen, Vehviläinen, & Rynkänen, 2009). However, face-to-face verbal communication in real time to a real listener rarely follows formal written Finnish rules. As a result, they have difficulties understanding natives' "bad Finnish/colloquial Finnish" while they only learn "good Finnish/standard Finnish" in the early period of their immigration. The limited knowledge of colloquial Finnish should be taken into consideration as a lack of cultural linguistic competence. In order to narrow down the gap between colloquial and standard Finnish, the most recent study conducted by Peltola and Ahonen (2012) has developed a Double Subtitling (DS) approach by adding both colloquial and standard Finnish to a language video. The results of the study showed that DS improves learners' comprehension in colloquial Finnish. However, until similar learning materials are available for self-study, new adult learners just have to struggle with colloquial Finnish, as Liu's Finnish teachers suggest "don't worry about colloquial Finnish, it'll come naturally in some years".

In addition, they dispel the common stereotype or myth that "you have the advantage of learning Finnish or Swedish since your husband is a Finn." The Finnish husbands have knowledge about knowing the Finnish or Swedish language and how to use the language, but may lack knowledge about how to teach the language. For example, the women's husbands often respond about their language questions by saying "I don't know why. That's the way we use it. You should ask your Finnish teacher or look it up in the dictionary". Thus, for these intermarried couples, it can take some time to switch from English, their first common language, to Finnish as their communication language at home. Contrary to what could be expected, having native Finnish husbands does not necessarily mean better Finnish language skills. Consequently, Finnish language skills play a more important role in facilitating integration into Finnish society than intermarriage itself (see Jääskeläinen, 2003).

Many of these highly educated women did feel ashamed and uncomfortable to speak Finnish before they have sufficient vocabulary to respond and express themselves simply with some circumlocutions on topics relating to meaningful interactions between people. Literacy, which includes different types of communication skills and competencies in many areas of social life, is one of the important distinguishing marks of the educated person in terms of social class.

For instance, higher levels of literacy often translate into higher earnings potential and greater competition for social status. For these women, poor and inadequate communication skills are associated with class-related stigma. It appears that these highly educated Taiwanese women are anxious about negative social evaluations. Race/ethnicity and gender often can be identified on sight, even if people might sometimes find themselves confused or mistaken, class operates quite differently. For these Taiwanese women, the intersection of race/ethnicity and gender can be made relevant at any moment in Finnish society, a white-dominated society. Some women also told of instances when they could not understand right away what was being said because they were not yet accustomed to the Finnish way of speaking and particularly to colloquial language. They are alarmed that Finns would attribute this difficulty to the wrong perception that they might be incompetent or unintelligent. During such instances, they usually immediately switch to the English language, which represents their well-educated background. They view good communication skills as a primary source for positioning themselves in a higher status within their social space. In other words, for them, good language skills to express themselves fluently are very important for assessing people's level of educational attainment and how good or wise a person is.

Through the public discourse, the visible immigrant identifications most readily available to these Taiwanese women would be poor, lower educated, or lower class. Since they perceive immigrants as having a lower social status than visitors in Finnish society, they strategically avoid being labeled as the "others" by using English in order that they may be identified not only as visitors but also educated people. This finding is consistent with Leinonen's research (2012a) showing that Americans in Finland resist being categorized as "immigrant" by identifying themselves as expatriates or Americans living in Finland since their perceptions of "immigrant" in a Finnish context refers to lower class, inferior and racialized/ethnicized immigrant groups (see also Koskela, 2011). Moreover, Americans' use of American English denotes the discourse of internationalization rather than of immigration in Finland.

Thus, using English makes it possible for these Taiwanese women in daily life to pretend to be visiting foreigners in an effort to hide their immigrant background (see also Leinonen, 2012b). However, when they seek employment, their visible racial/ethnic cues become salient and a point of differentiation in a Finnish context. The comments below illustrates how Wu senses that the attitudes of people change when she uses English and her identity and self-esteem can shift according to the situation, which is connected to her language choice.

> I often fear not being understood and not being able to respond correctly in public. When I know something more than I can express in the Finnish language, it's like I was relegated to the illiterate who come from an undeveloped country. You know, feelings of self-doubt usually arise when I speak Finnish. Besides, I feel that when speaking English, I am treated as a foreigner; when speaking Finnish, I am treated as an immigrant. Finns are friendlier to "foreigners" than "immigrants". Somehow foreigners are allowed to know nothing and welcome to ask for help; on the contrary, immigrants are expected to speak Finnish well. Foreigners are guests and immigrants are intruders. At shops, basically in public, I prefer to speak English. You know, speaking English makes a big difference to my self-confidence. I want to represent myself as a well-educated person. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Wu's narrative sheds light on how the intersections of identities may be constructed and deployed. Her statement not only echoes Leinonen's findings (2011, 2012a) but also supports Koskela's (2011) argument, Finns' attitude toward immigrants is biased in favor of certain nationalities. In the Finnish context, "foreigners" are usually referred to as Westerners (see Haikkola, 2011). In other words, the term "immigrant" carries relatively negative connotations in Finnish society (Huttunen, 2009), which may further reinforce power differential along racial/ethnic and gender lines. For Wu, the racial/ethnic boundaries between visible immigrants and Finns are unlikely to be blurred; however, she attempts to draw the class boundaries for the purpose of downplaying her racial/ethnic immigrant background. In other words, for a visible immigrant, a good command of English can bring social acceptability and social distinction as a marker of social class. Wu's comment captures a prevailing sentiment in line with other Taiwanese women concerning the inferior position assigned to the category of immigrants, indicating the intersection of class with race/ethnicity. As Haikkola (2011) argues, "transnational identity construction is an exercise that does not lead to transgressive identities but to local struggles for a positive identity" (p. 164).

All the participants suggest that in the first few years their inefficiency in becoming fluent in Finnish socially discredited them, which was experienced as shame and embarrassment. No one likes to appear unwise and uneducated; moreover, the situation could be magnified since many of the Taiwanese women in this study still pride themselves on receiving an elite university education in Taiwan. For them, the use of the Finnish language illustrates the primacy in the complex interplay between language, agency, and social relationships. Immigrants' sense of acceptance is greatly affected by the quality of interaction with native-born Finns (Pehkonen, 2006; Habti, 2012). Immigrants are usually seen as either a threat to native-born workers or a burden on the Finnish welfare system (see Pitkänen, 2005). Although the attitudes of Finns toward immigrants have improved after the recession (Jaakkola, 2005; 2009), Finns are still cautious with regard to immigrants (Haavisto, 2012). To understand the position

of immigrants in the Finnish labor market, one cannot ignore immigrant-host power relations in host society and common people's perceptions of the immigrants.

## 5.2 Pursuing Local Degrees

Owing to the loss of the expected utility values from their previous education and working experience, the Taiwanese women have a high incentive to invest in local education, namely institutionalized cultural capital. By all accounts, studying in the host country leads to additional cultural capital including professional, language and cultural skills (See also Friedberg, 2000; Tiilikainen, 2008). These university-educated Taiwanese women have been actively engaged in redoing their higher education by virtue of the assumption that their efforts to improve their employability should be able to overpower ascribed characteristics such as being foreign-born women or racial/ethnic members in a merit-based society. Throughout the interviews, these Taiwanese women vividly spoke of their educational achievement in Taiwan and identified the Confucian culture that encourages education and self-improvement. For them, entry into elite universities, as one of critical turning points, represents not only personal achievement and bright future career development but also family glory and honor. Their educational privilege is an integral part of Taiwanese middle-class families and a medium to fulfill parental expectations. With their successful period of education in the past still lingering in their memory, it is not surprising that they espouse readily higher education values.

These highly educated Taiwanese women from a middle-class background work toward reinforcing the idea that education is the key to social mobility, which is illustrative of their own class-based desires and outlook in Finnish society. Although they themselves have experienced devaluation and denigration of their prior education and existing credentials, ironically educational achievements still enable them to build a positive "can do" sense of confidence and remain hopeful that they could retain middle-class positions. To a large extent, they are responsive to the Confucian pro-education values and their middle-class dispositions toward education, which can be identified as embodied habitus. To them it meant going back to an arena in which they feel confident and self-assured of its outcome and development.

These Taiwanese women, who already have a university degree before moving to Finland, enter Finnish higher education to acquire more institutionalized forms of cultural capital in the hope of being rewarded following graduation. Similarly, Canadian research shows that immigrants who have completed university education in their countries of origin tend to pursue further education in Canada (Adamuti-Trache & Sweet, 2010; Adamuti-Trache,

2011; Green & Green, 1999). Although these university-educated women are able to get into a Finnish university or a university of applied sciences (polytechnics; AMK), they find that the rules and norms for being a good student that they are accustomed to in some aspects are misfits in a Finnish learning setting. Liu described her study experiences about different structure of school life at a Finnish polytechnic.

> I tried to transfer from my current Finnish program to an English-instructed program at another polytechnic last year (2005) because I longed for a joyful study. (…) I don't speak Finnish well because I am a foreigner not because I am uneducated or illiterate. In Finland, if you don't speak up, nobody would help you. My teachers and classmates definitely notice that I am way too quiet. We Taiwanese are really conservative in schools, perhaps in a humble and really serious way. We are taught to bring our thinking into line with that of others. We don't easily express our thoughts and opinion in class because we seriously CARE how teachers and classmates receive our answers. (…) I feel so stressed that I don't contribute to the teamwork and class discussions enough. It's very difficult for me to establish personal connections with any Finnish peers. The classroom cultures between Taiwanese schools and Finnish schools are really different. Speaking Finnish really makes me feel stupid and inferior. I have stopped expecting any friendly support from my class peers. My class peers look down on my knowledge and ignore my opinions in the group discussions because of my poor oral Finnish language skills. I've learned to keep my mouth shut during my studies. At least, I am still allowed and able to control "my own silence". Being invisible is much better than being ignored. (Liu, age 40, in Finland six years)

Learning and living in a language that is not a mother tongue is never easy for adult immigrants as long as the majority only sees immigrants' Finnish language proficiency as necessary requirements rather than social disadvantages. For Liu, the difficulties speaking and expressing her thoughts clearly is due not only to the fact that Finnish is her second language, it also is a reflection of the different values that Confucian culture has taught her about self-presentation in a learning setting. She is not just kept outside by a language barrier but by incompatibility between the two learning cultures. In a Confucian heritage culture context, students are not encouraged to speak out, criticize and comment in front of the whole class (see Barron & Arcodia, 2002). According to Subramaniam (2008), Asian students prefer not to stand out by expressing their personal views or raising questions in the interest of maintaining a sense of harmony; correspondingly, they highly expect teachers to pass on knowledge, evaluate, and monitor their learning progress. Moreover, Tran (2013) argues, students from the Confucian heritage culture hold a different perspective on the appropriateness of learning behaviors in a formal setting, which has been incorrectly identified as Asian student passivity or passive-receptive style of learning through a euro/ethnocentric lens.

Taiwan, an extremely collectivist society, emphasizes interdependence and interpersonal harmony (Hofstede & Hofstede, 2005; Hofstede, 2001; Kwan, Bond, & Singelis, 1997). Being modest, humble and self-effacing is socially creditable whereas wasting other study peers' time in class by expressing one's own opinions may be seen as being arrogant, disrespectful, and selfish (Bond, 1996; Tsui, 1996). Students' quietness, obedience, selflessness, and devotion, which are seen as courtesy in a Confucian society, may exacerbate interpersonal difficulties and result in hesitations and the fear of public speaking in a cross-cultural context (see Ladd & Ruby, 1999). For Liu, speaking up in class requires not only a shift into the second language but also explicit negotiation of cultural differences. In addition to the sense of shame, Liu feels socially marginalized as a cultural outsider in the classroom and insecure about having no networks of support, which has a debilitating effect on her studies and leads to the unpleasant learning experience.

While Liu realizes that her tacit knowledge is undervalued, she adopts silence and self-isolation as strategies to protect herself from the shameful and hurting experience (see Lamont & Lareau, 1988). There are additional reasons for Liu feeling silenced. It is not just her own language proficiency that determines how much she is able to communicate in Finnish. Lindermann (2002) suggests that when immigrants are perceived as a subordinate group, then native speakers tend to neglect the immigrants' knowledge of the language or the subject matter. Hence, owing to Liu's difficulty in expressing what she knows in Finnish, her comments might be ignored because her speech might not clearly reflect her intentions or intellectual capability. For Liu, Finnish proficiency links to appropriate forms of social interaction and respectability (see Skeggs, 1997). Thus, a lack of good language proficiency is associated with ignorance and stigma in terms of illiteracy. She feels that she has been treated as an incompetent person and dismissed as unworthy of interaction by the fluent speakers of Finnish (see Bourdieu, 1991).

Unlike Liu's struggles with the Finnish language in her studies, other women who strategically chose English-taught degree programs experience little linguistic disadvantage since the Finnish students and teachers are non-native speakers of English. However, for these Taiwanese women, Finnish tertiary institutions still can more or less represent an unfamiliar environment that is a cultural and social world set apart from that of their previous learning experiences. They have to strive to gain recognition as legitimate members in Finnish educational settings since they still experience feelings of marginalization and alienation. There is a relative lack of support for these women to ease the transition into their new learning environment. Some of their cultural predispositions are described in ways that put them in a position of conflict with the Finnish educational contexts.

> I was the only East Asian student in the class. I studied really hard to have good performances so that the Finns would not look down on Asian people. During my studies, I had difficulty doing self-evaluations. In the first semester, I never wrote any performance self-reviews to the final papers. Nobody told me the importance of self-evaluation and how to do it. Since we Taiwanese value group interests over individual interests, the "self" is not important at all. In the same class, there should be a "Big we" rather than "Small me". That is why we (Taiwanese) take harmony so seriously. It's difficult for us to change. As you know, it is really inappropriate in our culture to highlight the good side of personal work. To me, it is much easier to criticize what I need to improve than to praise what I have done. We (Taiwanese) focus on improving our weakness rather than admiring our strength. Finnish teachers have almost no knowledge of Asian culture. It seems to me they are not interested in knowing and learning anything from foreign students. But I wanted to get the degree; of course, I had to follow Finnish rules. Well, it's really annoying because sometimes I didn't realize soon enough I wasn't doing it in a "right" way but in a totally Taiwanese way. Although it's a little lonely, but at least in general I did quite well in my studies. You know, they (Finns) are not aware of their own cultural ignorance. We are outsiders, and of course, we have to learn their ways to get things done. But this doesn't actually help their understanding of us. So, it would be much nicer if Finnish teachers could upgrade their knowledge of teaching foreign/international students, particularly those from non-Western countries. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

These Taiwanese women have had a university education in Taiwan; thus, they likely bring certain expectations in regards to pedagogy that might run counter to those of Finnish teachers in the Finnish educational settings. Despite being successful learners in their home country, they still have to adapt to the Finnish learning environment. Thereby, many of the women in the interviews reported that during their studies they felt marginalized because the Finnish higher educational environment is much more culturally homogeneous than expected. Unlike the domestic students, the foreign students may feel like "a fish out of water" resulting from the differences between the institutional habitus and the habitus of foreign students (see Weissmann, 2013). Institutional habitus is mediated through an institution where institutional culture reproduces particular cultural capital (Reay, Crozier & Clayton, 2009; 2010; Reay, David, & Ball, 2001).

Lee recalled that to some extent she did not fit in since her learning environment by and large adhered to an ethnocentric and monocultural orientation. However, she adapted to meet the requirements of the new educational environment, despite the fact that she needed additional support to enhance the learning experience. Lee's adaptability ensured the success of continuity in learning (see Chuang, 2012) although the experience left her more or less feeling lonely. Lee's narratives raise some questions concerning the responsibility of the Finnish tertiary institutions in the international student learning process. For Lee, her school is not adequate in acknowledging the

diverse learning needs of foreign students. The Finnish teachers and the Finnish students remain oblivious to cultural sensitivities and the relative importance of cultural competence, the significance of understanding and working within Finnish culture paradigms without ignoring or devaluing the foreign students' or immigrant students' culture. Consistently, Bennett (1986, 1993) argues that intercultural sensitivity must be learned because it "is not natural. It is not part of our primate past, nor has it characterized most of human history" (1986, p. 27). Similarly, Wang described a lack of a supportive environment for learning and the peer relationships, which are strongly promoted in campus life at Taiwanese universities.

> University students are still group-oriented in Taiwan. We were taught that classmates show the mutual concern of the students in the same class/group, just like in the same boat. We share and help one another because we are classmates. Finnish students in higher education institutions don't have the perception of being classmates. At the beginning of my first year, I did expect so much that my Finnish classmates could be supportive peers. Later, I realized that classmates are like strangers who just take the same course. I especially hate teamwork and peer evaluations. It misrepresents what a team should feel like. They (Finns) couldn't understand that my quietness was actually kind of showing respect. I agreed what they suggested by nodding my head since I didn't think I had better ideas. I was quiet because I valued and appreciated their opinions that were actually better than mine. Guess what? They were really cruel to me. My Finnish teammates gave me really lousy evaluations. I was really sad and shocked. I attended every meeting and always fully cooperated with them. I always did whatever they said. How could they still think I made few teamwork contributions? They knew I am not a Finn. Why didn't they try to figure out my silent response to the classroom or team discussion could be caused by the educational values and cultural beliefs I had received in my home country? I felt totally insulted and humiliated by the evaluations. I told our teacher I would like to redo the project by myself to prove how seriously I took my studies. Apparently, she didn't understand my point at all. She just kept explaining that I didn't fail and I would get the course credits. She even didn't try to figure out why I'd rather to redo it by myself. Maybe she just simply thought I totally overreacted. (Wang, age 35, in Finland five years)

Wang described being hurt and very disappointed by the poor peer relationships in a Finnish learning setting. This is a common perception among other participants who reported that their studies in the Finnish tertiary institutions are quite lonely without their own circles although they managed to successfully obtain their degrees (see also Kashima & Loh, 2006). These Taiwanese women also expected that building a good relationship with native-born peers would facilitate the acculturation process in their studies in order to bridge the gap in the different cultural backgrounds and pedagogical expectations. In the interviews the women frequently discussed peer relationships and roles of

teachers both in Taiwanese and Finnish contexts. The problem of peer relationships bothers these women a great deal, since it is difficult for them not to care about relationships with peers around them. Some knowledge obtained in their country of origin is still part of their fundamental knowledge about learning even in a cross-cultural setting, frustrating for these Taiwanese women and their Finnish teachers alike.

Many of them precisely mention, "learning by making mistakes" is the only method to gain the learning skills that they do not possess despite that they clearly know that those mistakes are not mistakes in the Taiwanese context. Although these women used to be academically excellent in Taiwan and are devoted to their studies in Finland, changing academic circumstances and different academic expectations result in cross-cultural misunderstandings and conflicts. Much of the Finnish formal educational system is rooted in the Nordic and Continental belief system; hence, the educational philosophies in Finland may not be representative of those in Confucian-influenced countries. For instance, these Taiwanese women are not familiar with some Finnish school culture values, such as self-expression, self-directed support and self-evaluation. Internationalization has become a prominent key issue in higher education discourse, which should also mean working on the content and quality of the internationalization of curricula rather than just numbers of international student mobility and enrollment. As Judkins and LaHurd (1999) argue, "if we see higher education as a place merely to assimilate students into a traditional culture or knowledge base, we may not be adequately preparing them for personal or professional success in a culturally pluralistic society" (p. 787).

Throughout the interviews, some of them, particularly as the alumni of Taiwanese elite universities, strongly emphasize their universities' reputation or rankings in Taiwan. The longstanding reputations of the highly selective universities in Taiwan are singled out for their high levels of employment. In other words, an elite university education is also highly valued by Taiwanese employers. Moreover, elite universities tend to have strong alumni networks and build professional networks with trusted peers, which provides their graduates social capital to enhance their subsequent employment opportunities (see Hall, 2011). Degrees from the most selective universities, a form of institutionalized cultural capital that facilitates the reproduction of the social structure, had ensured these Taiwanese women's smooth transition into the higher paying sector of the labor force in Taiwan.

Having a local tertiary degree is seen as the most important step to get out of the low-skilled sectors. Finnish tertiary education is viewed as a site not only to acquire dominant cultural capital but also to increase their social capital that might help activate their cultural capital. They are aware of the importance of social capital such as personal contacts and social connections in facilitating job

seeking. When they entered Finnish tertiary institutions, they initially anticipated positive social interactions and good relationships with study peers who may share the same professional field in the future. Unlike the predominance of collectivist values in Taiwanese educational settings, the individualistic values favored by Finns impede these Taiwanese women from building up social networks (see Hofstede, 2001). They have difficulty in developing meaningful school-based peer relationships and to some extent suffer from social alienation in Finnish educational settings. Although their academic competence enables them to acquire dominant cultural capital (Finnish tertiary education), they unfortunately fail to build up useful social contacts or networks as social capital that may contribute to their transition to job searches.

## Summary

Length of residence that does not correspond directly to the duration/length of time spent learning the Finnish language should not serve as a single predictor of the participants' Finnish language proficiency. Without incorporating the comprehension of colloquial Finnish into the teaching-learning process or the curriculum, Finnish literacy training is principally reserved for formal, usually written, standard Finnish skills; as a result, the women experience difficulties understanding colloquial Finnish in the early period of their immigration. However, standard Finnish skills efficiently enable them to read and write before they manage to speak Finnish fluently. Moreover, their English language skills help them cope with and reduce their stress of otherness when they seek to distance themselves from the stigmatizing label. Finnish tertiary institutions still represent an unfamiliar environment, which is a cultural and social world set apart from that of their previous learning experiences. There is a relative lack of support for these women to ease the transition into their new learning environment since their tertiary institutions are not adequate in acknowledging the diverse learning needs of international students or immigrant students. Nevertheless, their approaches to learning are not culturally bound since they are willing to adapt to Finnish school cultures in order to fulfill the requirements in the new educational environment. They experience some hardships building positive relationships with Finnish peers although they are aware of the significance of building their social networks as a source of job leads in the host labor market. They are able to acquire dominant cultural capital but unable to cultivate social capital within a formal institutional setting. The change from being privileged in Taiwan to being disadvantaged in Finland affects these highly educated women not only on an economic level, but also on an emotional level. These women's common solution lies in funneling energy into either improving

Finnish language skills or obtaining more tertiary education, which however still does not offer a promising future.

# CHAPTER SIX

## Womanhood and Employment in a Cross-Cultural Context

Immigrating to Finland brings a variety of changes to these Taiwanese women's lives and has major significance for individual expectations and experiences shaped by the social and cultural contexts in which the women live their lives. Survival in Finnish society requires these women shifting and negotiating their perceptions of womanhood that fits in with Finnish standards of acceptable female roles. These Taiwanese women navigate their way between considering public discourses on immigrants and compromising their job choices. Some women are channeled into direct-care work as practical nurses in long-term care facilities; however, they make compromises and work as practical nurses by reason of the availability of alternative employment opportunities, rather than the prospect of entering a heavily feminized occupation. This chapter explores transformation of gender roles in a cross-cultural context.

### 6.1 Womanhood in a Patriarchal Society

China and Taiwan have been separated for more than half a century; however, traditional Confucian gender and family ideology exert a large influence on Taiwan whereas Confucianism was strongly condemned and Confucian tradition was denounced during the Cultural Revolution (1966-1976) in China. Taiwanese society has been greatly influenced by the teachings of Confucianism, which emphasizes the importance of extended families, interdependence in relationships, and the importance of maintaining harmony. Individuals' primary sense of self derives from internalizing the expectations of their social roles governed by the Five Relations: father-son (the relation of filial piety); sovereign-people (the relation of righteousness); husband-wife (the relation of chaste conduct); elder-younger (the relation of age order); and senior friend-junior friend (the relation of integrity) (Chang & Holt, 1991; Copper, 1999; Chen, 2000; Fan, 2000; Slote & De Vos, 1998). Three out of the five hierarchical relationships occur within the family, i.e., father-son, husband-wife, and elder-younger, as family-centered beliefs embedded within patrilineal family structures and practices. The rules of one's relationships with the family members shall be similarly applicable to the rules of one's relationships with other members in society based on the hierarchy of generation-age-gender. A well-ordered family is thus the microcosm and the basic unit of sociopolitical

order. The relationships among family members are guided and regulated by generation, age, and gender hierarchy, which reinforces male authority and patrilineal customs (Chan, 2004; Hwang, 1985, 1988; Pek & Leong, 2003; Zhang, Lin, Nonaka, & Beom, 2005). Family members know specifically where they stand in the family by referring to this order: to whom each owes respect and obedience.

Roles and responsibilities of family members, such as women's roles, are basically defined within the context of a paternalistic and patriarchal system in Taiwan (Chen, 2000; Chiang, 2000). Daughters and/or daughters-in-law also have filial responsibility toward their own parents and/or parents-in-law. Honor, power, and authority are accorded to women when they become mothers and/or mothers-in-law. A woman has authority that comes with a position in the family from one role to another in the course of lifetime. When a woman enters into old age, her authority begins to equal that of her husband in the Confucian tradition. Therefore, the hierarchy of generation-age-gender defines an individual's status, role, privileges, duties, and liabilities within the family order accordingly. As shown in the comments below, Pan recalled her cultural disorientation complicated by the cultural dissonance.

> Although it's quite lonely to be an immigrant here, at least I can take full control in my marriage without so much interference of parents-in-law. It's really hard to unlearn what you've learned. More or less, I can't help being Taiwanese, you know they are still my parents-in-law and I am a Taiwanese after all. For instance, Finns just call their parents-in-law by their first names. It's a really disrespectful and unacceptable manner (in Taiwan). I was really hurt when she (mother-in-law) said to me, "you can call me by my first name. I am not your mother, I feel awkward when you call me mother. We Finns don't have that kind power hierarchy in the family. In Finland, everyone is equal". I would have talked back to her if she were not my mother-in-law. You know, I as a daughter-in-law still try to show some respect to her on behalf of my husband. It seems to me either she thinks that our culture is inferior or she doesn't consider me as a family member. Anyway, fine, I can just use her first name since I don't feel like calling her mother anymore. What's so bad when we Taiwanese use respectful titles for elders and seniors that honor their life experiences? Do you think it would be possible for me to teach my daughter the way we (Taiwanese) respect our older siblings, parents, grandparents, teachers, or just a random old person walking down the street in this country? (Pan laughing) … My mother-in-law sometimes mentions that it's my responsibility to speak Chinese to my daughter. She thinks that my family would be more multicultural if my daughter can speak Chinese. She hasn't tried to understand or appreciate my culture. But she just criticizes me that I don't speak Chinese to my child. (Pan, age 45, in Finland eight years)

Pan reflects that her Taiwanese cultural practices are constructed as the problematic in the Finnish context while the culture of the host society is used as the standard for understanding or measuring "other" cultures. The multicultural

politics in the Finnish context presents a country's achievement of gender equality by representing the Finns as advanced and the Others as backward (Tuori, 2009). Through the lens of Westerns, the image of women is often constructed with a biased and tendentious argument that Eastern societies are oppressive to women and therefore they are uncivilized despite the fact that women in Western societies may be still in relatively marginalized and subordinate positions (Roces & Edwards, 2000; Dossa, 2002). As long as cross-cultural practice is closely associated with power relations among dominate groups and dominated groups, the same pattern of cultural marginalization that these Taiwanese women experienced in Finnish school settings may be thereby perpetuated in intercultural family relationships. In interviews, these women provided a lot of comparisons and descriptions about the Taiwanese culture and the Finnish culture. They consider culture as a set of values and beliefs on a country-by-country basis. However, at some point, Lee still remains loyal to some Taiwanese culture values and practices. As she elaborated her point:

> The longer I live here (Finland), the better I realize culturally and socially "good or bad" and "right or wrong" are defined by the majority cultural group, Finns in this case. For example, premarital sex is still socially and culturally discouraged in Taiwan. However, in Finland, when being in a committed and serious relationship, premarital sex is like a must-do thing. No matter how much I disagree with it (premarital sex), it would be unrealistic if I dare to expect my daughter to behave like Taiwanese. (…) It's not about which one is right or wrong. It's about where you are and who you want to be. Be Taiwanese or Finnish! Anyway, my point is that as long as you live here, you have to learn to accept something that is unacceptable in your own culture. Social norms are not universal. It's country-based. We currently live here although we don't need to change ourselves to please Finns, you know, when you have children, you will be willing to do anything in order to give them a better future in this country. You know, my husband and daughter don't consider me as a Finn but, at least, they never think I act like an ignorant immigrant. It's not only about knowing something different, but also about doing/practicing under the right circumstances. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Individuals must know the rules and logic of operation of the particular field since each field has its own set of customs, norms and values (Bourdieu, 1990; Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992). Lee conceded that there are things in Finnish society that are not looked upon favorably by Taiwanese. However, Lee has learned to "agree to disagree" with regard to various norms on behalf of her child, despite that she personally disagrees with some aspects of cultural practices in Finnish society.

According to traditional Confucianism, each person should fulfill his/her own role by knowing his or her place in the social order. In the home, the traditional female role is to be an obedient daughter, faithful wife, devoted daughter-in-law

and self-sacrificing mother. By fulfilling gender roles, parents are good role models, and descendants meet family expectations to become respectable individuals in society (Chan, 2004). Family and gender ideology in Taiwan has changed significantly during the period of industrialization since education has proved to be an important factor influencing gender ideology in Taiwan (see Chen, 2000; Farris, Lee, & Rubinstein, 2004; Ho, Chen, & Kung, 2008; Hu & Kamo, 2007; Jao & Li, 2012; Lu & Kao, 2002; Tsai, 2004;Yi & Chien, 2001).

Gender differences dominate family life in modern Taiwan since husbands are still more committed to the worker role preoccupied with providing financial support for the family, whereas wives are more devoted to the parental role (Lu, 2000; Lee, 2013). As a result, Confucianism continuously accounts for gender inequality in Taiwanese society (see Chiang, 2000). In the following narrative, Liu commented that in the old times a lack of education opportunities restricted women to the private sphere.

> As you know, our Confucius family system is really unfair to married women (in Taiwan). Once women are married, they might have to move into the home of their parents-in-law, to be under their authority and to serve the interests of the new family. This system sucks! Fortunately, nowadays many women are able to stand up for themselves by negotiating the future living arrangement before getting married. You know, we highly educated women have our own thinking. The life style of last generation is totally different from ours. This annoying old-fashioned system could carry on so long only because back then women had little education and had to rely on their husbands and parents-in-law. When I was young, I always said to myself I would NEVER marry a guy requiring me to live with his parents. Besides, I notice that only highly educated career women have the privilege to refuse their traditional gender role in the family. Ironically, I was really happy for my parents when my brother married a woman who is willing to live with my parents. I know it's selfish. If you have any brothers, surely you understand what I mean, don't you? (Liu, age 40, in Finland six years)

A great shift toward gender equality in Taiwanese society has involved the formation of class-consciousness, as Liu said, "only highly educated career women have the privilege to refuse their traditional gender role in the family." In contemporary Taiwanese society, practicing filial piety is considerably more flexible than in the past; co-residence is not the necessary way or a feasible and affordable way to fulfill the obligations of filial piety, depending on the circumstances such as urbanization and job opportunities (see Chu, Xie, & Yu, 2011; Tsai, Chen, & Tsai, 2008). Unsurprisingly, full-time working married women with more education are less likely to live with parents-in-law (Weinstein, Sun, Chang, & Freedman, 1994). In order to grasp the real significance of the above Liu's statement and the following Wang's narrative, the paternalistic living arrangement needs to be briefly introduced.

The paternalistic living arrangement, as the ideal realization of filial piety, is still common in Taiwan although the percentage of elders co-residing with married children, exclusively with at least one of married sons, has decreased over the past few decades (Chang, 1994; Chu, Xie, & Yu, 2011; Tseng, Chang, & Chen, 2006). Co-residence with married daughters is uncommon in Taiwanese society (Knodel & Ofstedal, 2002; Lee, Parish, & Willis, 1994). Marriage is a pivotal event in the life of a family. Traditionally, a wife has to reside with her husband and his family, particularly when the husband is the only son or usually the firstborn son in the family; therefore, post-marital residence in Taiwan still considerably retains the traditional pattern of patrilocal coresidence/ paternalistic living arrangement, that is a stem-family form in which the married couple live with one of their married son, daughter-in-law, and even (un)married grandchildren.

Based on the patriarchal concept of filial norms, sons are required to carry the major responsibility for parental support. Married sons are expected to provide financial aid to elderly parents in need and daughters-in-law provide assistance with basic care and general activities of daily living whereas married daughters are more likely to give emotional support (Lin et al, 2003; Lin & Yi, 2011). Families with more than one son usually span several households; parents just live with one of married sons, usually the firstborn son. In 2009, 53% of people age 55-64 lived in two-generation households and 38% of people aged 65 and over lived in three-generation households with a stem-family structure (Taiwan's Ministry of the Interior statistics, 2010). Therefore, Taiwan has the highest rate of co-residence and the highest degree of intergenerational support exchanges, in comparison with Japan, Korea and China (Yang, 2010).

Likewise, Wang recalled in her upbringing how she had witnessed the intergenerational resistance to traditional gender role and gendered obligations in the family hierarchy in a complicated Confucian system and cultural value.

> As you know, in general, living in a nursing home or an elderly center is extremely shameful for Taiwanese elderly who have children. Without a filial son who is willing to live with you, it means your parenting completely failed, which makes them (parents) "lose face". It's an issue related to loss of face. It's not merely whether Taiwanese elderly are dependent or not. My father is the firstborn son in the family. Of course, it's his duty/obligation to live with my grandparents. Since my brother is the firstborn grandson in the family, as you know, he has permanent responsibility to care for my grandparents and parents. My grandparents were always there when I was little. They are such a big part of my wonderful childhood. When my grandfather become too weak to move, my grandmother couldn't take care of him alone during the daytime. My father immediately hired a live-in Philipino caregiver; anyway, my grandmother was not so satisfied and accused my mother of neglecting her duties of filial piety as the daughter-in-law of the firstborn son. Come on, my mother is a university teacher. My father himself never wants my mom to quit her job and become

> a housewife even though my father has a high income (an architect who runs his own company). Perhaps because of my father's achievements, my grandma doesn't need to appreciate my mother's achievements. My grandmother still expects my mother to do "what she's supposed to do as a daughter-in-law" after work. My grandma is an old and traditional woman who enjoys talking about how much she had devoted herself to serving and pleasing her parents-in-law since the day she married my grandpa. She is really traditional. For example, she strongly believed that my degree from an elite university would widen and better my marriage market. For her, a good marriage should be the highest priority for a woman. In contrast, my mother always says that only a good university education advances a woman's social status by having a respectable job and then her familial status definitely improves. So my mother has fully supported me whatever I wanted to do. I love my grandma but I know she more or less tries to override my mother's preferences. No wonder in Taiwanese TV dramas a mother-in-law is still portrayed as a control freak or a bad person. (Wang, age 35, in Finland five years)

Like other women interviewed, not only had Wang been working before her immigrating to Finland but she was also raised in families where her mother had full-time paid employment. As Reay (2004) suggests, habitus is not just about the body in the structure but the structure in the body. Achievements from paid employment and the socioeconomic consequences have become habitus particularly to these Taiwanese women. Wang's awareness of her mother's aspirations for a university education and high-status jobs leads to the conclusion that the developing dispositions have been inculcated further down the family. The importance of higher education allows women to gain financial and ideological alterations of traditional gender roles within both the public and domestic spheres through participation in the labor market. Moreover, economic and social status enhancement allows women to question Confucian gender ideologies in the social norms and "outsource" their traditional gender roles to others, usually to more vulnerable women (see Lan, 2008). Wang's accounts demonstrate how women's educational aspirations and achievements may eliminate patriarchal gender roles, which indicates the intersection of gender and class in terms of habitus. In other words, her habitus is both gendered and classed. Wang went on to articulate:

> When my mother found out I was dating a Finn, she was really happy for me. She said to me that "great, if someday you end up marrying him, then you would be totally immune to the daughter-in-law's burden. Nordic countries are known for their welfare states which provide free child- and elderly care. Women can fully devote themselves to their careers. You are always so talented. Living in Finland, I am sure you can always do whatever you like". Well, my mother was both right and wrong. In Taiwan, it's common to hear daughters-in-law complain about their parents-in-law, particular about mothers-in-law; however, they (daughters-in-law) seldom mention that they usually get immediate financial assistance, household support and free childcare from parents-in-law. For example, most of my wonderful childhood memories are actually

about being with my grandparents since my parents both work. Although my parents have good income, the luxury house we've lived in is from my grandparents. You've seen that in my family albums, you know, it (house) is right in the city center. My grandmother always brags that the value of the house is ten times my mother's lifelong income. (Wang, age 35, in Finland five years)

Wang's mother assumed that Finland would provide an entirely new avenue to women's emancipation from the Confucian gendered family obligations for caring for others. The impression is not only fuelled by the aspiration to the well-known Nordic welfare model but also by the desire to break the boundaries of traditional gender roles. Many of the women in this study express their negative views on the traditional intergenerational living arrangement in Taiwan. However, only Wang further illustrates the pros (familial support) and cons (familial tension) of the paternalistic living arrangement.

## 6.2 Immigranthood in an Egalitarian Society

In the interviews, many of the women expressed their viewpoints on participation in paid work as the fulfillment of personal, educational and social expectations. They want to prove their worth by contributing to the host society through participation in paid work. Women's respectability in subjective representation of their identities always emerges in relation to a social system in which what is considered appropriate and acceptable female roles and behavior based on social norms and moral codes (Skeggs, 1997). Respectability may refer to one's social position since respectability can be seen as a form of social distinction. Thus, the pressure of what many Taiwanese women in this study called "being-a-good-immigrant" is played out in the performance of respectability even if some of the Finnish husbands' income would make it affordable for them to stay at home as housewives. Furthermore, the perception of good immigrants with tax-paying jobs is supported by Finns' more favorable attitudes toward labor immigrants than toward refugees and immigrants moving to Finland for other reasons (Jaakkola, 2005). Liu recalled when she just moved to Finland:

I had been working for so long in Taiwan. It would be nice to have a break. After moving to Finland, at the very beginning, I thought I would stay home as a housewife for a while. I brought a lot of housekeeping and cooking books with me. And I was so ready to learn the Finnish language and get to know Finnish culture. You know, the ideal "home sweet home". Anyway, surprisingly, my husband hurried me to find a job. My parents-in-law told me that in Finland WOMEN HAVE TO WORK; otherwise they are good-for-nothing. They also said that women stay at home only for little kids. Since I have no kid to look after, apparently I had no acceptable reasons to stay at home. So I immediately started looking for a job. My husband's sister and my parents-

> in-law thought I would find a job soon based on my rich work experience and university education. But it didn't go well. Finally my husband realized that it wasn't easy for an immigrant to get a job even though I had rich experiences in the field of international trade. Then he accepted that I stayed at home as a housewife if I liked. However, I started attending Finnish language courses and of course studied really hard. And then, I got a study place at my current school (BA degree in Public Health Nursing, AMK). (Liu, age 40, in Finland six years)

In Finland, the male provider model has been abandoned by adopting the principle of universal social rights as the basis of the welfare state since the late 1940s (see (Rissanen, 2000; Takala, 1992). Thus, the "housewife" status characterizing other Nordic and most other Western countries is not openly acknowledged or socially accepted in Finland (Melkas & Anker, 1998). The family structure is based on the dual-income model with employment not only gaining economic value but also having social validity (Kortteinen & Tuomikoski, 1998; Anttonen, 1998; Forsberg, 2005; Kuronen, 2001). Accordingly, the mainstream discourse tends to represent Finnish women as educated rather than uneducated, as mother rather than childless, in paid-employment rather than as a homemaker, and of middle or working class rather than upper class (Lempiäinen, 2002).

Pan, throughout her immigration, never gets a self-acceptable position in the Finnish labor market, and therefore perceives "being full-time mother" as a kind of liberation from her disadvantaged situation in the Finnish labor market since she can afford to be a stay-at-home parent. Her Finnish husband, however, can provide for a sufficient volume of economic capital to retain her middle-class life. Pan takes wealth as a means to overcome her immigrant-status vulnerabilities.

> My husband has business trips outside Finland really often. He really appreciates that my daughter always has me there since he is so busy. Of course I have to do almost everything by myself except earning money. I don't see any problem since he has a high salary and has been advancing his career. As a wife, I am really proud and definitely entitled to SHARE his achievements. I hope Finnish women won't get jealous after they hear my story. (Pan and the researcher both laughing) Well, when I was still ambitious to be a career woman, I did try a couple of part-time jobs that I would never take in Taiwan. You know, that kind jobs requiring little schooling. (Pan, age 45, in Finland eight years)

Pan, a successful manager in the hospitality industry in Taiwan, took on part-time work as a kitchen helper in restaurants and catering companies to gain Finnish work experience. However, a fear of appearing to have a lower social status associated with low education and poverty that prevents Pan from accepting underemployment and leads her instead to seek to consolidate the role of the wife and mother ascribed to her by traditional gender ideology in the Taiwanese context (see Lee, 2013). More important, Pan's marriage provides an

opportunity to participate in an informal economy where she has access to use her husband's income, which in turn enables Pan to completely withdraw from the labor market in response to her fruitless job-hunting in a new country.

Reverting back to the private sphere offers Pan some room to negotiate her identity as a form of resistance to downward mobility in a particular social context. However, the gender division of labor in the family perpetuates the traditional gender norms, male income-earners and female homemakers. In a way, immigrant women's vulnerabilities may entrench traditional gender roles. Likewise, Chen, working as a practical nurse in a nursing home, explained her strategy for balancing the disempowerment inherent in her immigrant status after losing the motivation to fully stay in the labor market.

> We Asian women are usually stereotyped as being submissive, unassertive, and dependent, unlike so-called tough and independent Finnish women. Unfortunately, I am kind of going to end up fitting the stereotypes because I chose to have a better quality of life by relying more on my husband. Nowadays I only take part-time jobs. I don't need to please anyone! You know, I have no expectations and won't get disappointed. I don't need to deal with any annoying coworkers. I am much happier. Since my husband has a secure income, it doesn't change my life whether I have an income or not. Immigration life has shaped me from a modern career Taiwanese woman into a dependant Asian woman. I know, some might think I just try to rationalize my laziness and weakness. Well, whatever, I don't care. Being a practical nurse is a dead-end job anyway. I was so tired of receiving little recognition. At least, my husband really appreciates how I take care of our household work. I always get positive feedback from him although I make little economic contribution. (Chen, age 35, in Finland five years)

Chen provides important insights into institutional discrimination as an important factor producing and perpetuating inequality in the Finnish labor market. She has been falling further away from her original field when faced with scant prospects of upward mobility out of a dead-end job. Many of them encounter a "sticky floor" (Laabs, 1993) rather than a "glass ceiling". Because the "sticky floor" prevents them from moving out of the bottom of the occupational ladder, they never have a chance to experience a "glass ceiling". These highly educated Taiwanese women experience not only downward mobility but also blocked mobility at the bottom end of the Finnish labor market.

Chen made the decision to reduce her commitment to full-time paid work. Inequality in employment opportunities pulls her toward less involvement in labor force participation while pushing her husband toward stronger work participation. Nevertheless, she is also aware of her reinforcing the racialized/ethnicized gender stereotypes, which indicates that boundaries of race/ethnicity are negotiated through intersection of gender and class. Consequently, she may be subsumed under a category that would not accurately

reflect her perspective and experience. As Riaño argues, "we need to question the problematic idea, often contended in European integration debates, that sees unequal gender relations among migrant families as supposedly resulting from their 'backward' ethnic values" (2011, p. 280) which misleads or detracts from the actual issues. Thereby, Chen defends herself against the notion of woman-friendliness in Finland in order to underscore her immigrant-status vulnerabilities.

Arising from the need to be treated equally and fairly, Chen believes that the private sphere, home/family, provides more egalitarian relations and can function as a shelter and site for resistance against inequality in the Finnish labor market. Chen's decision echoes the findings of a recent study in the American context that the Korean full-time housewives have uncritical romanticized views of immigration since they never experience racial/ethnic discrimination and unfair treatment of the host labor market in the United States, which are rooted in their middle-class privilege (Lim, 2012). Similarly, Takeda's (2012) study has shown that intermarried Japanese women see participation in paid jobs as disempowerment when they can choose to be stay-at-home housewives/mothers in Australia. However, one should not conclude that the university-educated Taiwanese women in this study prefer to stay at home rather than to work if they can afford to stay at home. It would be more accurate to say that what they strive to do is to buffer the discrimination-related stress in the Finnish labor market when they can depend on their husbands financially.

Similarly, in Finland when dual-income couples have to cope with work-family conflict situations, the most common practical solution is that the one, typically the woman/mother, earns less in the family withdraws temporarily from the labor market (see Korkeamäki & Kyyrä, 2005). In general, economic inequality, either in the formal or informal sector, rationalizes that having a stable and loving home adequately compensate or honor women for their sacrifice within a broader context. Although the norm for married women in Finland is to work outside the home, taking deskilled and low-status jobs instead of having a career does not bring these educated Taiwanese women a sense of fulfillment. The Finnish culture with respect to gender equality is often seen as relatively unproblematic or less problematic than other cultures (see Korvajärvi, 2010; Lempiäinen, 2002; Lappalainen, 2002), which conceals gender differences that do exist in Finnish society. Survival in Finnish society for these Asian women requires developing a respectability that fits in with Finnish standards of an acceptable female role (see Skeggs, 1997).

In Finnish society, a strong value is also placed on gender equality in parenting and family policy (Forsberg, 2005; Kuronen, 2001; Pylkkänen, 1999); nevertheless, motherhood and responsibility for the family have belonged and

still belong to the everyday lives of many women (see Gordon, 1990; Perälä-Littunen, 2007). Conflict between family and work responsibilities often causes stress in postmodern women's lives (see Kinnunen & Mauno, 1998). Although the gender gap in childcare has been shrinking over time, men are slowly increasing their participation and engagement in childcare, but the increase in men's childcare efforts are disproportionately less than women's increases in hours of paid labor (Davis & Greenstein, 2004; Shelton & John, 1996). Finnish mothers have been active participants in the labor market whereas Finnish fathers have tended to be more actively involved in parenting and caregiving (Autto, 2007). Nonetheless, the research done in the Finnish context reveals a paradox: even if fathers are encouraged to engage in parenting, scientists and professionals still tend to emphasize the primary role of mothers in the care of children (Kuronen, 1999; 2001; Vuori, 2001). Thus, the Finnish professional experts and the cultural expectations of parenting seem to contradict the gender equality embodied in legislation in Finland (Anttonen, 1998; Kuronen, 2001; Perälä-Littunen, 2004; 2007; Vuori, 2001). As Lee said:

> When my daughter was three years old, I immediately wanted to apply full-time daycare for her. It's really important that she learns to socialize with other children. I know it's an important process in child development. Guess what? My husband questioned me why I wanted to send my kid to daycare since I didn't have a job. I was really angry. I know he didn't mean I was a lazy mother. Though, it's just like he implied day-care services were only for career women. I felt really insulted! I want to work but just seemingly this country doesn't need me. Well, I know it's not fair to say this way. Jobs are out there but the jobs you can get, you know, are usually for low-educated immigrants. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

The Finnish welfare system has been described as "woman-friendly state" referring to the facts that women as mothers are financially supported by the state, and a large number of women are employed in public services sector (Kuronen, 1999, p. 18). Accordingly, the roots of the woman-friendly welfare lie in maternalism with a strong commitment to gender equality in Finland (Nätkin, 1997). Public daycare provision is planned on the basis of the dual-earner family model (see also Autto, 2007; Anttonen, 1994; Kröger, Anttonen, & Sipilä, 2003). Finnish parents have a subjective right to municipal day care until the child goes to school. Parents have the right to be on care leave from work until the child turns three, and to work part-time until the child turns ten years old.

However, parental leaves are mainly taken by mothers, which is due to income disparity between mothers and fathers (see Korkeamäki & Kyyrä, 2005; Lammi-Taskula, 2004; Salmi, 2006). In other words, usually mothers who earn less tend to temporarily withdraw from the labor market. The decrease in family income is the main reason for fathers' low take-up rate of parental leave. Owing

to low compensation rate of earnings related benefits, the number of fathers choosing to share the parental leave is fairly low in Finland, compared to other Nordic countries (Haataja & Mattila-Wiro, 2006). Lee went on explaining her decision to return to further education right after her maternity leave was finished.

> After my child started going to daycare, I immediately got into the Degree Program in Nursing (instruction in English). Starting out in the care field is more promising because Finland has shortages in this field. I don't mind living on the salary of my husband since he has a high income. However, you know, parents are the first role models for their children. I want my child to look up to me. You know, being a degree student is still the same no-income position but different social status than an unemployed mother. My child surely can learn something positive from my attitude more than my social status. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Unemployed women are usually associated with low educational attainment, incompetency, and low social status. Lee intentionally distinguished herself from any socially undesirable qualities associated with unemployment. Additionally, her dignity is also directly tied to the provision of a positive role-model image for her child. As she points out that parents serve as role models not only through direct interactions with their children, but through the examples they set with their attitude and behavior within the family and in the outside world. A new study has verified that children's future career aspirations are not just a reflection of parenting practices but rather signify how the habitus is constantly forming and shaping, which indicates children's agency in their preference of occupational types in light of family experience (Pimlott-Wilson, 2011). For these Taiwanese mothers, being-a-good-immigrant is not just about personal fulfillment; rather, it also involves parenting obligations and family responsibility to their children. Similarly, Ho said:

> In Taiwan although being a housewife is an unpaid job, the Taiwanese recognize it as a tough and respectful job. In Finnish society, if you stay at home without a young child, nobody would think you are a full-time homemaker but an unemployed person. In general, I am sure that having an unemployed mother has a negative effect on a child's self-esteem in this society. Although my job is unstable, at least, I am being a positive role model to my children. It's just like one of the most common comments on parenting in Taiwan: when the above behave wrongly, the below will do the same (Fish begins to stink at the head). (Ho, age 55, in Finland thirteen years)

Ho also sees in her moral reasoning an obligation to engage in paid work to provide a role model for her children. This parent-role-modeling, then, is a kind of capital in the form of accumulated labor. In Bourdieu's term, it can be seen as embodied capital added to the individual or family through labor. Many Taiwanese mothers, except for Pan (discussed in the next paragraph), address

that being a positive role model for their children is the essential reason for the importance of acquiring employment, despite the social downward mobility.

Paid employment of married females solidly contributes to welfare state development and gender equality in Finland (Anttonen & Sipilä, 2000). Finnish women, including mothers, in the paid workforce is considered a social norm (see, Autto, 2007; Julkunen, 1995; Rantalaiho, 1997) since the stay-at-home mother ideology has been replaced by the idea of both parents working (Nousiainen, 2000, p. 9). On the contrary, Pan expressed a sense of absolute commitment to a particular form of mothering, her beliefs about being a full-time mother and the benefits of a privileged lifestyle.

> However, after having my child, well, my career choice has been to be a full-time mother. In a funny way, I feel I am lucky actually. In Taiwan, nowadays some career women are faced with a painful choice whether to continue working or become full-time moms since schools in Taiwan are so demanding and competitive. They are like: burning the candle at both ends. They quit their jobs usually because they want to supervise their children's education. Children's future is more important than their own careers. Well, I had no career since that day I moved to Finland. As the old Chinese saying goes: if you GAIN something, you have to LOSE something else. Well said! Being a mother is relatively easy in this society. Comprehensive schools in Finland are so EASYGOING. Finnish pupils have so little homework and so few tests, compared to students in Taiwan. I really enjoy being a full-time mother even though this kind social role is not appreciated in Finnish society. Parenting school-age children is not just about signing them up for activities or afterschool clubs; the most important is about inculcating good study habits and attitudes. I am investing for my child's future. It's my current career. (Pan, age 45, in Finland eight years)

Pan seems satisfied and happy while she has learned to indentify herself as actively a devoted mother rather than an unemployed immigrant. Like other Taiwanese mothers in this study, Pan reported in detail and repeatedly how getting a good education for her child has been a top mothering priority. Pan exchanges her non-career structured work to symbolic capital based on her husband's career-structured work and to sustain her middle-class identity by making sure her child would have a good education and bright future. Cultural capital is primarily transmitted within the family and its accumulation depends heavily on the family's "usable time (particularly in the form of mother's free time)" (Bourdieu, 1986, p. 253). The family continues to play an important role in the reproduction and legitimation of social class and class inequalities (Crompton, 2006). As Bourdieu argues, the "best hidden and socially most determinant educational investment, namely, the domestic transmission of cultural capital" (1986, p. 244).

Throughout Pan's interview, she refers to herself as being a full-time mother as her career, which is constructed as a product of struggles over the legitimate

social position. Despite her career discontinuities, the notion of "double burden" (also known as the "double shift") makes her appreciate her performance in the wife-mother role. Equally entering paid employment does not relieve women of their familial roles but at the expense of taking on a second shift (Hochschild, 2003; Hochschild, 1989; Williams, 2000) since women still retain primary responsibility for childcare or household duties (see Aalto & Varjonen, 2012; Känsälä, 2012; Kyrönlampi-Kylmänen & Määttä, 2012; Lainiala, 2010; Pääkkönen & Hanifi, 2011).

On the contrary, Yang successfully continues her career as an ICT engineer; however, she still experiences a downward shift with regard to many aspects of her class status. In the interview, she stated that she often has a feeling of degradation embedded in her social life outside of work because of her racial/ethnic visibility in Finnish society. Yang has a professional white-collar job; however, she still feels that her social status frequently translates into the lower status of "immigrant" (see also Habti, 2012). Furthermore, because her father was a military judge, she was used to drawing status distinctions in terms of class boundaries in Taiwanese society. For Yang, working outside the home is identified as a joyful choice rather than a survival necessity. Yang frames her internal struggles between career and domesticity in terms of class and gender.

> In Taiwan, some women have to work only because their spouses make low-income which is not enough for family. But for some women, for instance, my mother and many of my old coworkers, working is kind of their HOBBIES, which give them satisfaction and widen their social circle as well as they can earn money based on their education. Besides, their income is kind of their own pocket money since men are supposed to make payments for the family. In Taiwan, at least being a housewife is a luxury option for married women. But here (in Finland) there is no so-called housewife. No choice. I have stopped dreaming of being a housewife. (...) I have to work and after work I also have to do household chores and so on. Being a woman in this country is actually more stressful than in Taiwan. (Yang, age 35, in Finland five years)

In Taiwan, women tend to marry up into a higher socioeconomic group; on the other hand, men tend to marry down into a lower socioeconomic group. Because of the persistent trend of hypergamy among Taiwanese women, socioeconomic status of husbands is usually taken into account in determining class identification of wives in Taiwan (Kuan, 2006), which reflects and sustains socially endorsed views of gender role, i.e., husbands are still perceived as be the primary financial provider to families in Taiwanese society. Moreover, in a Confucian society, relational hierarchy is maintained by obligations within relationships in a mutually supportive and harmonious manner, which has good intentions but undoubtedly reinforce benevolent sexism (see Lee, Pratto, & Li, 2007). According to the survey on the situation of Taiwanese women in 2011,

approximately 80 percent of women in dual-income households shared their income and expenses despite that men continue to attach significance to the role of the primary financial providers for the families; however, the great majority of the employed married women who did not share their income on account of their husbands' higher income appeared to be high-achieving women with higher levels of education at the top of the income ladder (Taiwan's Ministry of the Interior statistics, 2012). Thus, benevolent sexism, perpetuating social inequality tied to gender and class, is intimately connected with the Confucian precepts of patriarchal hierarchy and is still widely accepted in a marriage where the husband serves as the provider. Consistently, in the narrative above, Yang said "men are supposed to make payments for the family", which supports traditional male earners' behaviors and roles through benevolent sexism.

Yang, one of a few in this study, has successfully and smoothly integrated into the Finnish labor market since the professional skills that she possesses are immediately transferable across countries and her work experience is fully recognized. Noteworthily, Yang made a reluctant choice to give up on being a housewife in an effort to meet gendered norms in the Finnish context. She constitutes her identities in delineation from the host country contrary to her self-interested motivations. From Yang's point of view, she has no choice but to participate in paid work, which is perceived as being below her class status based on her natal family background. As Skeggs points out, choice is "a particularly middle-class way of operating in the world, dependent on access to resources" and a sense of entitlement (2004, p.139).

Moreover, Yang's excerpts demonstrate the ambivalence about gender equality based on perceived relative social positioning in the Taiwanese context. Yang has a clear perception of the social ladder and defines herself above all in relation to her upper-middle-class background. Her upper-middle-class background always underpins her expectations and experiences of immigration life. Not surprisingly, she is not in favor of gender equality in Finnish society because she has misrecognized benevolent sexism as "female privilege" in Taiwanese society. The idea of gender equality is thus used to argue the privilege Yang has lost in Finland although the privilege, as a matter of fact, is class-privilege derived from her natal family. For Yang, the notion of the stay-at-home-housewife is premised on particular groups of privileged women, indicating the intersection of gender and class. She exemplified the different meaning of work between middle- and working-class women. In Taiwan, married women's choices regarding combining wifehood and/or motherhood with paid work reveal inequalities and privileges experienced by different women dependant on their social class. Middle-class women have the privilege of acting in their individual self-interest thanks to the family's social status and high household income.

In Taiwan, there are two types of female life course based on women's educational levels. Highly educated women tend to continue working, after marriage and childbirth, until retirement age, while less educated women are more likely to leave the workforce to raise their children (Jao & Li, 2012; Lin, 2011). The number of dual-income families accounted for 49% in 2010 since it is still not uncommon that males are primary, or sole, income-earner in the family in Taiwan (DGBAS, 2011). The employment rates of married women vary significantly by educational background in Taiwan. In 2011, the female labor force participation rate was only 49.78% in the Taiwanese labor market (DGBAS, 2012) whereas in Finland the female labor force participation rate in the population of working age (15-64) was 69.3% (Tilastokeskus, 2012). Finnish women generally work full-time; unlike many women in some other European countries often work part-time (see Korvajärvi, 2010; Rantalaiho, 1997).

According to the Ministry of the Interior Finland, successful integration is politically defined as ensuring that immigrants can contribute to Finnish society in the same way as other Finnish citizens do (Ministry of the Interior Finland, 2012). Thus, the status quo, women's full-time participation in the labor market, translates into the expectations which Finns place on immigrant women (see Forsander, 2003). These Taiwanese women perceive that the public discourse in Finland gives no socially approved opportunity for married women to be more family-oriented and less work-oriented. Clearly their positioning within the mainstream discourse, gender specific, influences their choices to attempt to behave as ideal immigrants.

## 6.3 Underemployed in Care Jobs as a Practical Nurse

These Taiwanese women's work experiences are limited to Taiwan, the country where they grew up and where they obtained their educational credentials. They used to believe that they could "hit the ground running" in the Finnish labor market once they learn Finnish/Swedish and obtain local degrees. It soon becomes clear to these Taiwanese women that their educational credentials, professional skills, and work experience are devalued, in addition to lower-than-expected returns on their Finnish language proficiency. Like many other immigrants, these highly educated Taiwanese women fail to find jobs in their original area of expertise. Half of them redesign their career path in order to make their social status as acceptable as possible despite the inconsistencies between high levels of education and working-class occupational prestige (see also Heikkilä, 2005; Koskela, 2010; Kyhä, 2011). Existing literature has pointed toward the trends in underemployment of skilled immigrants this study echoes the same unfortunate scenario.

The reality is that these Taiwanese women's decisions result in a series of unsatisfactory trade offs. They accept employment for which they are overqualified. They are highly educated but in caring occupations outside of their previous training and formal qualifications. Finland's population is ageing and this is setting the course for a major expansion of public and private sectors in arranging elderly care. Some women in this study have realized that the relatively barrier-free way to get a stable job from the limited opportunities is to work as a practical nurse in the care field to fill a growing labor shortage (see also Antikainen, 2010). Practical nurses with an immigrant background are more likely to work as direct care workers in long term care facilities such as nursing homes for elderly or disabled people. Although working in the care sector is increasingly identified as a field for female foreign and immigrant labor, an immigrant background automatically makes Finnish employers suspicious of the job applicant's language skills, ability to do the job, and work ethics (see Näre, 2013b; Huttunen, 2004; Heikkilä, 2005). Wang recalled:

> A friend of mine, a Finn, recommended me to apply for apprenticeship training at an elderly centre where she worked. The manager immediately rejected my application without meeting me because she was concerned about my Finnish proficiency. Then my friend showed her my transcripts. All courses were taught in FINNISH. All of my courses got 5s, the BEST grade. Then the manager said that Finnish elderly preferred Finnish practical nurses because they don't trust immigrants. (Wang, age 35, in Finland five years)

Employers may reject an applicant with an immigrant background out of language skill concerns while their implicit biases, the preferential hiring based on different national origins or racial/ethnic groups, actually may drive their decision making. According to Łobodzińska (2011), "current Finnish immigration policy creates an image of an immigrant actively participating in the labour market, fluent in the Finnish language, highly skilled, eager to integrate with the local community, and constantly developing new skills" (p. 53). However, Wang's statement shows that successful integration is not just determined by the pro-active actions immigrants take and the capital (education and language) they possess.

Immigrant integration, a dynamic and two-way process, needs both immigrants and the receiving society to work together based on mutual responsibility. Institutionalized discrimination or racial/ethnic inequality in the Finnish labor market cannot be eradicated by simply asking immigrants to take a proactive stance to social responsibility while society overall takes a passive or even defensive stance to certain immigrant groups. As Olakivi (2013) argues, "they all counted on and placed responsibility upon (individual) employees… As a consequence, fighting against discrimination became recognized as an affair

that by large depends on individual qualities rather than structural or organisational factors" (p. 97).

Up until now, Finnish society and academic scholars have not paid enough attention to the debate over educating Finnish employers not to overlook the available pool of skilled immigrants for mutual interest of Finland and immigrant population. Moreover, Wang points out another factor that contributes to the difficulty immigrants experience in acquiring employment. Employers may be cautious of causing resentment among the clients and other employees by hiring immigrants and therefore opt for hiring non-immigrant workers instead. Wang went on telling her experience:

> Guess what happened then? Some elderly at the centre went to ask the manager why she didn't hire me. Finally, the manager decided to see me out of curiosity. When she saw me, she immediately recognized me. During weekends, I sometimes drop by the elderly centre and have a chat with those elderly. Then finally I got the apprenticeship training. Anyway, I have proved that she (the manager) was so wrong. Those elderly like me very much. They appreciate the way I respect them and take good care of them. This kind of job would never be my first choice, if I had better options. But it's not so bad actually! We Taiwanese are taught to respect the elders. I am so honored to earn the trust from them (Finnish elders). When I look at them, I always recall some wonderful memories of my childhood with my grandparents. At the same time, I also feel happy for my parents who still live with their son, daughter-in-law and grandchildren. You know, they (Finnish elders) are really lonely and have almost no visitors. Well, I know, it's not a big deal for Finns. Anyway, I believe that good deeds (taking care of elders) would bring rewards even though this job is not really my dream job. (Wang, age 35, in Finland five years)

Wang's example shows the importance of not only having some cultural capital but also social capital like the trusted connections to the local labor market. Because of the influence of Confucianism, Taiwanese society stresses respect for age and seniority in a sincere manner. Interestingly, respect for the elderly, one of key traditional values in Taiwanese society, facilitates Wang's job satisfaction when considering job characteristics rather than her career interests. Caring for the elderly should be more than paid-labor; it is also about family love, the nature of filial obligation, personal morals, and social norms in the Taiwanese context. However, the connection between caring labor and gendered labor has remained deeply embedded in political-economic systems in Finland (e.g., Eräsaari, 2006). Although the health care field in the Finnish labor market has opened up work opportunities to immigrant women, employers' attitude toward immigrants still appears to be evidence of employment constraint (see Näre, 2013b).

Non-native speaker status can result in being marginalized in the everyday life of the workplace. A few women in this study claim that their inadequate

Finnish oral fluency, rather than job performance, became a reason for failing to get permanent jobs in the early period of participating in paid work. Lee, working as a practical nurse at a nursing home for adults with developmental disabilities, recounted that her supervisor/co-worker often picks on her language skills. Thus, she senses that she is regarded as having a lower aptitude and holding a passive attitude toward her job.

> My co-worker, kind of my supervisor in the same team, always emphasizes my lack of GOOD Finnish language skills. I don't know if she tries to encourage or humiliate me. One time, she interrupted my conversation with my client's mother and warned me that I shouldn't speak English if I really want to improve my occupational capabilities. I was really angry but I didn't say anything. Although it wasn't my fault at all, I chose not to ruin the workplace harmony. You know, that client's mother herself always wants to speak English no matter how much I tried to speak to her in Finnish. So far, I haven't made any mistake of taking care of my clients. My Finnish speaking skills have nothing to do with my ability to feed and bathe my clients, and even to change their diapers. My clients' parents often give me really positive feedback. But why is my co-worker so picky about my Finnish language skills? I don't know if I am too sensitive or she actually enjoys overpowering me. She speaks Finnish better than me only because she is a Finn. It doesn't mean she is more capable than me. She really makes me feel that I am never good enough for this SIMPLE job. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

The excerpt above signifies that immigrants' language proficiency serves to highlight rather than reduce the barriers to the labor force integration. Noticeably, the judgments made on Lee are based solely on language proficiency without taking job skills and performance into account. When it comes to job performance assessment, there is a tendency that it becomes an evaluation of the person rather than the person's job. Moreover, Lee's working experience brings up the issue that members of dominated group in the host country may pursue the strategy of establishing their superiority over even more disadvantaged immigrants since every individual is "being oppressed and oppressor" simultaneously (Collins, 1993, p. 28).

Racial/ethnic discrimination is hard to be identified when it occurs in indirect or subtle ways. These Taiwanese women are aware of being judged unfairly and sometimes more severely than native-born counterparts at their workplace (see also Skeggs, 1997). However, they fear losing their jobs and getting a bad reputation for being difficult to work with. Moreover, they are also aware that they eventually need satisfactory references from their coworkers/ supervisors as job-reference givers in their current jobs to help secure future employment. As a result, they choose not to stand up for themselves or just resign because of stress caused by the unfairness or negative feedback at work. In the labor force, only that which is measured is valued, and only that which is valued gets measured. Language proficiency can be misused as a legitimate

excuse for devaluing immigrants' employability, which is seen as a barrier to immigrants' employment or job search. Therefore, employers who hold prejudices might use the unnecessary requirement of language skills to rationally justify the refusal to hire immigrant workers in a subtle and insidious way.

In nearly all cases, the perception that they believe they are still partially responsibility for not being able to get a better job is embedded within the participants' accounts of not-good-enough language skills although they have put a lot of effort into Finnish language learning and made much progress (see also Janhonen- Abruquah, 2010; Kyhä, 2011). It increases and reinforces the stigmatization of immigrants' employability by normalizing or rationalized inequity. Stigmatization, an interactive social process, therefore occurs when a host society passes negative evaluation, for example a lack of language proficiency, toward immigrants because of specific characteristics. Immigrants might confusingly perceive this negative evaluation as a result of some personal shortcoming. Likewise, many of the women in this study tend to rationalize their lack of better employment opportunities or career progression by frustratingly rating their Finnish language skills as "probably-not-good-enough" or "never-good-enough".

Like many other participants, Chen who successfully reached a managerial position in Taiwan, has been forced to change her career path and worked outside her existing expertise. She has a similar experience with her Finnish language skills at workplace. The necessity of good Finnish language proficiency is overemphasized at her workplace since her duties and responsibilities as a direct-care worker are more likely to be routine manual tasks. Her lack of sufficient oral skills in Finnish prevents her from securing a stable job but not from doing her job.

> When I asked for a permanent contract, they immediately questioned my Finnish language skills. I thought my lack of fluent Finnish language skills should be perfectly understandable since I am an immigrant. Why on earth do I need to speak Finnish fluently? To whom? I am a practical nurse not a Finnish language teacher. Most of my clients could barely talk. Most of my co-workers were not interested in talking to me. I really don't see the point to have good Finnish language skills at my workplace. I was so tired of getting disappointed again and again. Somehow, no matter how hard I tried, my employment situation went nowhere. I had been physically and emotionally exhausted. Then, one day I said to myself "okay, I surrender! This is not an immigrant-friendly country. Enough is enough. It's not my fault." Don't you think it's quite ironic? I live in one of the most women-friendly countries; as an immigrant woman, however, I obviously have much less life chances in Finland. But in Taiwan's patriarchal society, as a highly educated woman, I was surely able to compete with those arrogant Taiwanese men. See, it's really tricky, isn't it? (Chen, age 35, in Finland five years)

The narratives above illustrate a cross-cultural intersectionality of different social locations in which the experience of privilege or marginalization may be reinforced across countries (Purkayastha, 2012). Chen situates herself in the different contexts and makes the comparison of distinctive forms of complexity and social inequality. Gender does not exist in a vacuum but simultaneously exists in relation to other social markers such as class and race/ethnicity in the different contexts (hooks, 1984; Joseph, 1981). Chen identifies the structural privilege derived on the basis of her middle-class status in Taiwan; on the other hand, she recognizes the structural disadvantage associated with her immigrant background in Finland. Moreover, studies have confirmed that there are more racial/ethnic discrimination cases than gender discrimination ones in the Finnish labor market (e.g., Aalto, Larja, & Liebkind, 2010; Larja et al., 2012). The prevailing Finnish ideology of gender equality may offer limited benefits in social mobility to visible immigrant women who encounter not only the gender disadvantages but also the racial/ethnic disadvantages in the Finnish labor market.

In the face of their downward mobility, these Taiwanese women long accustomed to feeling capable and in control find themselves disempowered and unable to actualize their career aspirations. It is not that these Taiwanese women look down on blue-collar workers or jobs, but their underemployment generates feelings of relative deprivation and powerlessness for the first time in their lives (see Feldman, Leana, & Bolino, 2002). Underemployment brings on feelings of failure and inferiority in the context of downward mobility. When Lee could not find a job in her area of expertise, she chose to settle for a job outside her trained field. However, Lee is hardly enthusiastic about her work.

> It took me a while to really get used to my job duties. I just couldn't stop feeling inferior. Perhaps I'm a loser. I never forget that day when that big guy, one of my clients, was playing with his own feces on the floor. He threw his feces right on my face while I was trying to clean up the mess. In that evening, I complained to my husband about what happened at workplace. He tried to comfort me and said things like "you're doing a respectable job." I don't know why, anyway, I burst into tears and yelled "I wonder how many university-educated Finns would like to do this kind respectable job when there are still other options available to them! I welcome you to join me." You know, I used to believe and even encouraged my students (in Taiwan) that all jobs are respectable as long as you do it with pride. I feel ashamed of myself whenever I recall that. Well, back then I was a teacher who enjoyed relatively high income and social status (in Taiwan). But now in here (Finland) I am a care worker at a caring center for disable adults. This kind job doesn't need a university education at all although they pay me based on my local AMK degree. I told my parents I am a "nurse." I can't tell them what exactly I do at work. I don't want to make my parents sad and disappointed. I've decided to apply for a MBA degree program. I will be a full-time student again. Since my husband can afford me not to work, why do I push myself to do something I don't enjoy? It's impossible for me to have a career here. At

> least, studying is much better than just staying at home. Upgrading my degree is sort of a personal achievement. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Little hope for career progress and inner frustrations have reduced Lee's incentives to stay in the Finnish labor market. Because underemployment generates a loss of personal and professional dignity, Lee desires to rebuild a sense of competence that she used to have in Taiwan. It is easy for Lee to leave her job since she just settled for a job that might never maximize or further any employment potentials. For Lee, meaningful employment is central to her social status rather than as a means to earn money to survive in Finland. Since her husband can afford her to live at an easier pace, she is privileged to pursue further education and merely cultivates her interest. More important, academic achievement is Lee's method of redeeming her self-esteem and self-worth although she has experienced that local credentials unlikely guarantee any substantial return.

However, a year and a half later, Lee became an expatriate wife who accompanies her husband on an expat assignment abroad after she had strongly encouraged her husband to take an overseas job outside Finland. Lee explained:

> All I tried so hard but still failed to have was a job that is commensurate with my qualifications and skills. This has been the most frustrating experience of my immigration life so far. Anyway, I am done. As a matter of expedience, our household income surely increases a lot because of the expatriate compensation package, tax benefit and Asian countries' relatively low cost of living. Of course, eventually we will have to move back to Finland; perhaps when my child reaches the age of 7th grade. Yläaste (the upper level of the comprehensive school) is quite crucial stage of schooling. I kind of know that there might be not much difference in my employment choices here (in Finland) or somewhere else (outside Finland). At least, becoming an expat-wife is a great way of getting away from my misery here (in Finland) for a while. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Wage labor supposes to give individuals opportunities to achieve economic independence; however, these Taiwanese women's remaining subordination in the Finnish labor market, more or less, has increased their economic dependence on their Finnish spouses (see Heikkilä, 2011a). Noteworthily, it is not the case in this study that every native-born husband is able to be the provider of the family when the immigrant wife struggles to rebuild her life in a new country. Only half of the participants, including Chen, Lim, Lee, Pan and Wu, verify that they can afford to live on husbands' incomes in Finland. In contrast, two women, Chang and Liu, have coped with their long-term unemployed husbands both of whom used to be successful businessmen but unfortunately fail to recover from job losses. For these two Taiwanese women, what makes an already difficult situation even worse is that Liu's husband suffers from severe depression and

refuses any professional treatment; Chang's husband has been addicted to alcohol for many years.

In terms of symbolic meaning, employment fulfills the need for relatedness and makes individuals gain a sense of belonging and social acceptance in society (see Vähätalo, 1998). These Taiwanese women are constantly involved in regulating their overall self-perceptions and feelings of self-worth to the host society. Research has shown that unemployed individuals have fewer social relations, lower levels of life satisfaction and more health issues than employed individuals do (Heponiemi et al., 2008; Perttilä, 2012; Viinamäki, Koskela, & Niskanen, 1996; see also Vähätalo, 1998). Moreover, Jasinskaja-Lahti, Liebkind and Perhoniemi (2007) conclude that employment status and tolerance for cultural diversity in the workplace directly promote immigrants' subjective wellbeing and their perceptions of self-control over life in the host society. However, underemployment also plays a significant role in the perception of occupational stress, job satisfaction, work-related attitudes, and psychological wellbeing (Anderson & Winefield, 2011; Jones-Johnson & Johnson, 1991).

Finland has a longstanding reputation as a women-friendly society and an egalitarian country. However, a women-friendly society underpinned by racial/ethnic distinctions alters the course of these Taiwanese women's lives. Liu, a student at the time of the interview, takes weekend jobs at an elderly nursing home.

> You know, some of my friends and old co-workers in Taiwan sometimes complain to me about their parents-in-law even though most of them have Philipino helpers who actually do the child- and elderly-care jobs. I am really sick of their talking about Nordic-paradise-for-women. They envy me that I don't have daughter-in-law's duties in Finland. Well, I had to admit that I used to be as naïve as they are before I moved to Finland. There are always caring jobs needed to be done no matter in which country you live. You know, either you do it by yourself or someone else does. They (caring jobs) are women's jobs. Yeah, indeed I don't need to take care of my parents-in-law but I work as an elder caregiver and I am actually taking care of other people's old parents. All of my co-workers are somebody's daughter, somebody's mother, or somebody's daughter-in-law. Sometimes, I wonder if it's so-called karma. I still end up being a caregiver in a gender-equal country. Ironically, I am more like a woman in Finland than in Taiwan since now I am a professional caregiver. I would like to do something else, if I had better options. I am a woman but it doesn't mean I am good at doing "women's jobs" (using air quotes with her fingers). Don't get me wrong; I don't hate this job. (Liu, age 40, in Finland six years)

Traditional gender roles and stereotypical images regarding the place of women in society can influence the type of work for which immigrant women labor is recruited. The Nordic welfare model has strived to minimize gender differences in the labor force participation by providing day-care for children, parental leave

for parents, and care for elderly people (Heiskanen & Räsänen, 1997). The paid labor has replaced the previously unpaid responsibilities of women in the social reproduction of daily and family life in Finland. Although Finland has made great strides toward occupational equality, the traditional gender division of labor is to some degree unlikely to change. Furthermore, it has been identified as a Nordic paradox or welfare state paradox that welfare state policies contribute to gender segregated job structures by broadly recruiting women to public sector service jobs, whereas the objective of gender equality policies is to equalize the gender division of labor (Ellingsæter, 2013; Kautto, Fritzell, Hvinden, Kvist, & Uusitalo, 2001; see also Lister, 2009). The supposedly gender-neutral policies are actually gendered in effect. Women and men circulate differently in an unevenly nationalized economy.

Liu provides insights into the gender-blindness of care paid-work in the Finnish context, as she points out, "there are always caring jobs needed to be done no matter in which country you live... They (caring jobs) are 'women's jobs.'" For Liu, her job, caring for the elderly, is not just another paid job; rather, it is deeply embedded in a gender regime (see Anthias & Lazaridis, 2000; Kovalainen, 2004). Women-dominated fields, such as education, healthcare and social work, are usually heavily regulated by the state. For instance, nursing in Finland is a typical female-dominated field. Of nurses employed in nursing only 5.6% were male in 2010. However, as the job duties of the male nurses are somewhat different from those of female nurses, many male nurses work in the first-aid department or psychiatric hospitals (Tilastokeskus, 2004; 2011), which still reflects the differences in the roles of gender in the healthcare workplace.

Liu's statement addresses the most critical issues in public discourse about care giving work since the caring professions are largely feminized domains in the Finnish labor market. In other words, women are still the primary caregivers of children, the elderly and those with disabilities despite that they get paid, which still has negative implications for women's position in the gender segregated work and the value of their labor (see Dejardin, 2008). Many women basically still do so-called women's jobs, which used to be done in the private sphere without official payment. While Finnish women have strengthened their agency by shifting from the private sphere to the public sphere, women still play a role in reinforcing the gender roles for the nation's solidity. The persistence of gender segregation in occupations and gender pay gap affect all women across race/ethnicity and class in Finland. Visible immigrant women might experience a double disadvantage of race/ethnicity and gender in the Finnish labor market.

Liu raises the issue of the re-definition of gendered capacities and gender-bound caring work. She connects structural disadvantageous complications of the traditional Taiwanese gender position in the family with the disadvantageous complications of immigrants' social status in the Finnish labor market, either

unpaid in the private sphere or paid in the public sphere. She remarks that gender relations are reproduced in the professional as well as in the informal-familial field over the life course. Her job makes her realize that her gender role is strongly situated in the context of structural mobility in a new country. Her work choice merely explains her job opportunities rather than her fulfillment. Like other women, Liu is not entirely free to choose to engage in a gendered profession since she is aware of her lack of control over the career path.

Likewise, Wang provides insight into the complexity of gender segregated and racialized/ethnicized labor market in Finland.

> In Finland, indeed I don't need to take care of my parents-in-law but as an immigrant I have much less life chances. Well, parents-in-law will die anyway but my chances of getting a job that meet my interest and education probably go nowhere for the rest of my life here (Finland). You know, only one side of a story never gives the full picture of reality. Finns tend to assume that Finnish welfare state provides immigrants with a good life that they would never have in their home countries. To some degree, they (Finns) think that living in Finland is like an undeserved and unearned gift for immigrants. They have no idea how hard immigrants have to work to maintain a normal quality of life in this society. Many of my co-workers are immigrant women. I wonder how many of them work as carers only because they don't have other choices. (Wang, age 35, in Finland five years)

Wang predicts that she would be unable to extricate herself from the current position she has been ghettoized into. In order to gain Finnish work experience, she is willing to accept low-skill jobs. However, low-skill jobs do not seem to function as a stepping-stone to better jobs. For those who become practical nurses, they just move from one low-end job to another although they have less trouble finding a job as a direct care worker in nursing homes. Additionally, Wang points out that in her workplace there is not just a gender division of labor but also racial/ethnic division of labor (see Nordberg, 2012). The division of care work based on gender and class occurs locally, nationally and globally since women continue to take disproportionate responsibility for care work both in the informal sector of the family and in the formal sector of the care economy (Daly, 2001; Folbre, 2004; Reay, 2005). It is important not to lose sight of the fact that immigrant women are channeled to fill vacancies in the care sector in the Finnish labor market related to the intersection of gender and race/ethnicity (see Forsander, 2007; Nieminen, 2011; Nordberg, 2012). While gender-based segregation in jobs and economic sectors still affects Finnish women, the effect in immigrant women is much more severe than in Finnish women because Finnish women have a more equal access to jobs than visible immigrants do.

Although the Finnish Government has developed and implemented state policies to promote immigrant integration in social, political and economic contexts, there has been not enough attention paid to specific issues affecting

female immigrants (European Network of Migrant Women and European Women's Lobby, 2012). Immigration is not a gender-neutral experience; however, a singular focus on gender is unlikely to fully understand how other social aspects of identity such as race/ethnicity or class shape immigrant women's experiences. When these Taiwanese women fight for full social and economic equality, the challenges they face engage the complicated spheres of power relation within the intersection of gender and race/ethnicity. For women who work as practical nurses in this study, immigranthood and gender equality are incompatible since their ghettoized status is further complicated by a gendered and racialized/ethnicized labor market.

## Summary

These Taiwanese women perceive that the public discourse in Finland gives no socially approved opportunity for married women to be more family-oriented and less work-oriented. Clearly the position of these immigrant women within the mainstream discourse influences their choices to adopt the host society's gender roles in an attempt to be actively responsible immigrants. However, inequality in the labor market undermines these women's bargaining power. These highly educated Taiwanese women give up their dreams about careers matching with their qualifications and instead settle for less skilled jobs further away from their original professions. Because of the job availability and gender-stereotype, half of them are employed as practical nurses in long-term care, regardless of whether they work full time or part time; they are ghettoized in a gendered occupation and provide the least skilled direct care. Immigranthood and gender equality are incompatible since these women's power is largely in the hands of the locals. For a few women, the private sphere, home/family, provides more egalitarian relations and, more important, functions as a site for resistance against structural inequality. Their process of integration being tied in with class, gender and race/ethnicity is concerned with the power struggle they confront in the Finnish context.

# CHAPTER SEVEN

## Reproduction of Social Class and Finnishness

Education and how it is deployed and used are the central concerns of these highly educated Taiwanese women in relation to their middle-class habitus. The power of habitus also becomes apparent in a review of the trajectory of their lives in Finland. Since they still believe education is the key component to improving one's social status, in a way, they have been transforming from being vulnerable immigrants to active middle-class reproducers. Social structures such as racial/ethnic hierarchy and class status have great impact on the ways these women become mothers and their view of responsibilities toward their children in the Finnish context. This chapter turns to examine their attempt to transmit social status to their children through mothering practices.

### 7.1 Investing in Children's Schooling

Mothers' involvement in their children's education are strongly associated to socio-cultural norms and prescriptions, gender roles, and gendered power relations in society (e.g., Brantlinger, 2003; Chao, 1996; Hochschild, 1989, 2003; Hoover-Dempsey, Bassler & Burow, 1995; Hossain & Anziano, 2008; Huntsinger & Jose, 2009; Hsu, Zhang, Kwok, & Li, 2011; Reay, 1998a, 1998b, 1998c; Yamamoto, 2013). A recent study of Taiwanese parental involvement in adolescent academic achievement has found that the level of a mother's involvement with her child's career plans, communicating with the child, overseeing the child's academic progress, and actively participating in school activities, are identified as strong predictors of the adolescent's academic achievement (Hsu, Zhang, Kwok, & Li, 2011). Likewise, preparing children with better learning skills and environment is rooted in these Taiwanese women's conceptions of mothering practices. Because they believe that they can exert positive influence over the children's learning, they act to exert effort through their involvement in children's learning (see Chao, 1996). Wu explained why she chose a Montessori day care center for her child.

> I read a lot about Montessori methodology and materials on Internet. The daycare was not in our district. It took a 30-minute bus ride. It was only three hours for my kid in the morning. In order to save time, you know, it was really time-consuming if I had to go there twice in three hours. After taking him to daycare, I just went to a Café near there. I read books and waited for the picking-up. As long as I never complained about how troublesome it was, my husband didn't mind at all. Well, compared to "Mencius'

> Mother, Three Moves", what I did for my son was no big deal at all. Though, up until now, my husband still thinks all Finnish daycare centers are just alike. I immediately noticed that my son was doing much better in a Montessori setting. I was so impressed. When my son attended an ordinary daycare center near our place during the previous year, he cried during nights and got upset really much. He learned to stay calm and get focused (in the Montessor daycare). I am so glad I chose that daycare for him. I think his school-readiness was totally improved. That's why nowadays he does so well at school. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Nearly all mothers in this study particularly identify the legend of "Mencius' Mother, Three Moves" when they exemplify the vital role of mothers in children's academic achievement. Mencius's mother moved three times in search of a better learning environment in a decent neighborhood on behalf of Mencius, a Chinese Confucian philosopher and scholar. For more than 2000 years, this has been commonly presented as one of the most successful mothering practices in Chinese-speaking society. All mothers in this study chose a mainstream school environment (Finnish- or Swedish-speaking schools) for their mixed heritage children in order for the children to become native Finns. According to recent research on school choice, Finnish parents largely trust the quality of Finnish comprehensive schools; therefore, a local school in the neighborhood is still the most common school choice (Klemelä, Tuittu, Virta, & Rinne, 2011; Komulainen, 2012; Poikolainen, 2012; Räty, 2012). Lim provided insight for her school choice.

> Before we moved back to Finland, my children only went to English-speaking international schools in Asian countries. So their English language skills were much better than Chinese and Finnish back then. We moved to Finland in 2002 because I thought that our school-age children needed a long-standing learning environment and long-lasting friends. When looking for schools for them, we (she and her husband) were thinking about a bilingual school where English and Finnish are both instructional languages. However, I changed my mind. I wanted my children to be well prepared for their future in Finland; therefore, they should be brought up as Finns. And a year later they transferred to normal groups from the preparatory group for the Finnish language in a local comprehensive school. I think I made a good decision about the school choice. All their good friends are from the same school and our good neighborhood. (Lim, age 40, in Finland five years)

In Lim's accounts, she described her satisfaction with the school choice she had made. Overall Lim sees her children's futures as tied to Finland; her perception of her children's identities justified her decision to choose a mainstream school for her children (see also Warinowski, 2012). All the Taiwanese women in this study are proud of having sent their children to mainstream schools in their local neighborhoods in order to gain access to dominant cultural capital, which reflects their desire to restore their marginalized status in Finnish society. Cultural codes are learned through socialization; therefore, systematic exposure

to the particular social environment can enhance "particular groups to practice primitive accumulation of cultural capital" (Bourdieu, 1977, p. 187).

These Taiwanese mothers uphold almost no Taiwanese cultural traditions or customs in the family, except that they sometimes attend the Chinese New Year gathering arranged by the Taipei Representative Office in Helsinki. Rather, they keep up with Finnish family customs pertaining to religious or cultural celebrations, for example, children's baptism, choosing Godparents, celebrating name days, Christian holidays, etc. so that their children would not feel left out of peer groups or different from other Finnish children. Likewise, Räsänen (2002) argues that many immigrants lose their cultural heritage and abandon their traditions in order to succeed in the mainstream culture.

Additionally, they also believe that developing social relationships and networks with Finnish peers in schools would bring their children valuable social capital in the future. In their role as mothers, they have the great potential to ensure that their children's "access to the dominant class is decided" (Bourdieu, 1984, pp. 154-5) while mothering practices become a site for the exercise of symbolic power. In light of cultural capital transformation, Taiwanese women's own cultural capital endows them with the knowledge that parent involvement is very important to ensure their children's educational progression and success. For instance, education still affects Ho's sense of identity and practices of mothering.

> In the 80s, in my generation, only "the best of the best ones" has a university education in Taiwan. I have quite rich learning experiences and skills both in Taiwan and Finland. I might not speak Finnish and Swedish perfectly but I still have very good knowledge in some aspects. I put a lot of effort into enhancing my children's learning abilities. I am never tired of telling my children that well-paid and high-status jobs require at least a university education. I trust Finnish teachers and the schooling system here (Finland). I am sure you know the PISA glory but still, only some Finns are able to get into universities. So I have to oversee my children's studies. You know, no education, then consequently no job. How can you be proud of living on social welfare if you are able to do something? Do you know that the Finnish Roma/Gypsies are not so interested in education? They don't care what Finns think about them. They (the Finnish Roma) have successfully preserved their customs and identities; but does it raise their social status in this society? (Ho, age 55, in Finland thirteen years)

Ho clings to middle-class identity in terms of higher education as a hedge against racial/ethnic identity since she sees little advantage to stressing her Taiwanese identity in Finnish society. Moreover, the implication in Ho's statement is that the Finnish Romas are predisposed to be prejudiced, which reflects the ethnic differentials in education in Finnish society despite the fact that Finland has been the top-performing European nation in the Program for International

Student Assessment (PISA) results (Reinikainen, 2012). In Finland, the historical tendency of the Roma population's exclusion from the educational system and the paid labor force is due to family and cultural characteristics, prejudice, and discrimination (Kopsa-Schön, 1996; Lähteenmäki-Smith & Salminen, 2011). All of the Taiwanese mothers, as visible immigrants, want their biracial/biethnic children to grow up as the members of the host society without being discriminated against. Ironically, Ho actually absorbs a negative stereotype about the Finnish Romas and reinforces the prevailing social attitudes toward the Finnish Romas by using racial/ethnic difference as a clued for the class difference.

Ho's comment on the relationship between education and intergenerational social mobility resonates with some other Taiwanese women in this study. For instance, Lee who used to be a schoolteacher in Taiwan compares situation of the Finnish Romas with the Taiwanese aboriginal people in relation to parents' attitudes toward their children's education, as she articulated,

> Their parents (the Finnish Romas) perhaps are like many Taiwanese aboriginal parents who don't see the importance of having a good education. Some Taiwanese don't know the disadvantage faced by aboriginal people in a Han Chinese-dominant society, so they (Han Chinese/Taiwanese) feel unfair or envious of aboriginal students' entitlement to gain extra 25% scores in the examination of high school and university entrance. That's why I totally support an Affirmative Action policy for aboriginal people in Taiwan's education system that helps disadvantaged children get a chance through education when their parents usually place a low priority on the value of an education. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

While the education system functions as a meritocratic screening system to maintain the status quo, the educational credentials holders in dominant positions are able to legitimize and reinforce social inequalities (Bourdieu, 1974). Not accounting for social, economic, and cultural factors of the larger society, social position is rationalized as the outcome of hard work and effort. In the interviews, all mothers express a sense of apprehension and a heightened awareness of what could lie ahead for their children without a higher-education degree (see Reay, 2000). They possess a strong sense of security in validating their privilege and sustaining their middle-class positions handed down through the generations since having a higher education is regarded as a family tradition and expectation, not an exception.

All mothers interviewed are trustful of Finnish teachers and education system (see Sahlberg, 2011). Education is seen as the key route to future economic success for their children, and their middle-class optimism toward Finnish society leads them to believe that there will be higher returns on educational attainment. They are devoted to home-based parental involvement, such as

overseeing homework assignments and monitoring children's progress, as well as school-based parental involvement, such as attending PTA meetings and school events. These Taiwanese mothers talk extensively about how their backgrounds and experiences lay the important foundation that provides them with the confidence of being involved in their children's schooling (Reay, 1999). As Bourdieu argues, "the family plays a decisive role in the maintenance of the social order, through social as well as biological reproduction, i.e., reproduction of the structure of the social space and social conditions. It is one of the key sites of the accumulation of capital in its different forms and its transmission between the generations"(1996, p. 23).

The class-based cultural capital transformed by these Taiwanese women in the form of their high expectations, material availability and Finnish cultural values have affected their children's educational development. Chang elaborated on her successful mothering practices.

> Both my daughters are straight-10 students. It's not common, you know. They always think their good academic standings have nothing to do with me! You know, they sometimes say I am not a Finn, so that I don't know Finnish school stuff. They even teach me what they learned about Finnish society in school. It's really funny. I am never worried about their schooling issues as long as they know the responsibility for their own learning. Anyway, they just don't know how much effort I put into cultivating their talents since they were little. I have been preparing them for a better future, they just don't know yet. You know that I used to be a teacher. I have my own way to monitor my kids' school experiences in detail. I am sure some day they will realize they are really lucky to have a mother like me. Just like me, I am full of gratitude whenever I recall how my wonderful university-educated father inspired and motivated me to study. (Chang, age 45, in Finland sixteen years)

Chang's own educational aspiration associates with the family history since the importance of education is passed down through generations (see also Dumais, 2002; Reay, 1998c, 2000; Ruohola, 2012). Parents' educational level is a substantial determinant of students' educational aspiration and academic achievement in Taiwan (Hung, 2007; Kan & Tsai, 2005; Tsai, Liu, Chou, & Grossman, 2011). In the Finnish context, similarly, parental expectations of education and perceptions of their children's academic competence are associated with parents' education level (Kärkkäinen, Räty, & Kasanen, 2009; Räty, Kasanen, & Kärkkäinen, 2006; see also Räty, Komulainen, & Hirva, 2012). On the other hand, lower-class habitus can perpetuate self-conceptions of low status and low expectation in education; for example, uneducated immigrant parents are most likely to identify their children's 9-year comprehensive education completion as a significant achievement (Kuusela et al., 2008). As Räty and Kasanen (2013) state that parents' perceptions of their children's'

academic competencies "seem to manifest the symbolic hierarchies pertaining to gender and social position" (p.1117).

Because of the continuity of habitus, habitus transcends multiple generations by merging the past, present, and future in a given field. Chang's own habitus plays an essential role in her practice of mothering, as Dumais suggests "the major effects of class differences in cultural capital and habitus should be apparent in children at a very young age, since they are part of the primary socialization experience (2006, p. 84)". Her narrative clearly indicates that the key component of intergenerational class reproduction is that habitus influences early cultural socialization practices and also supports moving through the educational ladder (see Bodovski, 2013). Those who begin with more cultural capital, accumulate cultural capital more efficiently than do those from a lower class.

Nearly half of participants' parents have college or university degrees and thus economic as well as cultural capital. This fact has led them to successfully get into higher education in the Taiwanese context and further to trust the Finnish educational system to such an extent that all Taiwanese mothers interviewed chose the local comprehensive schools for their children. The dispositions of these Taiwanese women show familiarity with and inside knowledge of the contemporary educational system. These Taiwanese mothers have a "feel for the game" and an understanding of what a good education can bring for their children in the future (see also Archer, 2010). Their practices of mothering based on middle-class habitus reproduce class boundaries, as Feinstein, Duckworth, and Sabates (2004) point out, "the intergenerational transmission of educational success is a key driver of the persistence of social class differences and a barrier to equality of opportunity" (p. iii). Likewise, Lee described an incident where she had to question her enthusiasm and motivation for teaching her daughter mental calculation.

> I had taken courses in abacus & mental arithmetic in my school days in Taiwan. I know it's not a big deal in Taiwan. However, I really benefited from learning that. You know, it is not just about mental calculation. It enhances concentration, sharpens memory, improves confidence in Math, etc. So I taught basic mental arithmetic, really basic stuff, to my daughter for a few years. Actually, she enjoyed it really much. Guess what? One time she got a bad grade on her math test although the answers were totally right. My daughter didn't write down whole calculation process because she answered some questions by using mental calculation. Her teacher said it couldn't prove she really learned how to calculate. You don't know how frustrated I was. I was really worried if the teacher suspected my daughter cheated on the test. What can I do? I bet a few Finns (Finnish students) train or know abacus & mental arithmetic. My intention was to help my child to get ahead. This kind skill is not applicable to the Finnish schooling system. What a pity! So, we just stopped doing the training. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Taiwanese parents believe that if their children are to perform well academically and socially in school, they need to start early (Hsieh, 2004; Jose, Huntsinger, Huntsinger, & Liaw, 2000). On the contrary, Finnish parents favor self-sufficiency and language skills but place little value on pre-academic skills (Kupiainen, Hautamäki, & Karjalainen, 2009; Ojala, 2000). In Taiwan, nearly 60 percent of the elementary school students aged 7-12 years take part in organized extracurricular activities after school since parents put a strong emphasis on extracurricular activities for the purpose of enhancing their children's academic achievement. Abacus and mental arithmetic training has been one of the most favorite extracurricular activities in which parents enroll their children in Taiwan (Jai & Kuo, 2012; Lin, 2009). The skill of abacus and mental arithmetic that Lee transmitted to her child is actually the product of her participation in extracurricular activities during her school days. The engagement in extracurricular activities at home makes her child become acquainted with the cultural cues in a formal school setting and also leads to the development of knowledge or skills, which both in turn enables her to succeed in school (see also Silinskas et al., 2010). Although Lee's cultural capital facilitated her practices of mothering, simultaneously it risks disapproval from those in positions of power.

There is a great degree of differences between involving parents in schooling and engaging parents in learning. Parents' participation in school activities and events has a vital social and community function; however, the active engagement of parents in learning at home is most likely to have a positive difference in children's school outcomes (Harris & Goodall, 2008). All of the interviewees' children are involved in many family literacy activities at home like intentionally teaching learning-skills through hobbies, watching educational DVD programs and encouraging diverse extracurricular activities, which aim to build cultural capital and create successful learners.

## 7.2 Middle-Class Social Reproduction Embedded in Mothering Practices

Mothering is identified as a field by these Taiwanese mothers, according to Wacquant's definition of field, a "space of conflict and competition, an analogy with a battlefield" (Bourdieu & Wacquant, 1992, p. 17). Thus, some teaching and learning activities have taken place in the home, especially in early years. The logic of mothering has been shaped in part by middle-class habitus, based on their personal, historical trajectory that begins in their natal families in Taiwan and continues into their immediate families in Finland. Similarly, Wu also believes that extracurricular activities give her child the opportunity to develop talents (see also Pulkkinen, 2012).

> Just like any other mother, I read a lot of parenting books and bought early-child education toys. I regularly borrow children's music CDs, books and DVDs from the local library in order to assist my child in learning. (…) I've used music to stimulate my child's cognitive development because I play the piano. As I told you earlier, because my parents are both music teachers, I have played the piano since the age of five. I was told I was an amazing and astonishing piano talent in my childhood. I attended tons of piano competitions in my school days. I even represented my schools in the citywide and nationwide competitions. In order to successfully get into an elite university, I had to choose my major in Accounting since I didn't do so well in the university entrance exam and I was not so interested in becoming a professional pianist anyway. But playing piano is still my favorite hobby. Based on my own experience, I believe that children can learn better through music than through almost any other medium. Besides, it's fun, isn't it? I think that I, as a mother, am my child's first teacher. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Wu's narrative signifies that habitus is not merely learned by daily life experience, but rather is passed down over generations within families through the process of enculturation and socialization. Research shows that middle- and upper-class families engage in a process of "concerted cultivation" designed to foster their children's talents and skills by spending a great deal of resources and choosing the outside school activities and other extracurricular activities for their children (Lareau, 2003; see also Jackson & Marsden, 1962). Furthermore, these Taiwanese women's beliefs in their mothering practices echo Bourdieu's argument, "ability or talent is itself the product of an investment of time and cultural capital" (1986, p. 244). In the interviews, they all spoke of their particular support and appropriate nurturance of children's developmental and intellectual pursuits and toward expectations for school success, which indicates that class-based practices of mothering reproduces pre-existing class arrangements (see Vincent, 2010).

Family background is crucial to the patterning of students' achievement since parents from higher social classes have more cultural capital than do parents from lower social classes (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977; Lareau & Weininger, 2008). Wu's narrative exemplifies how parents' cultural capital provides advantages for their children in extracurricular activities. Not only that, their cultural capital also enables them to fulfill the role of children's home-instructor (see Huntsinger, Jose, Larson, Krieg, & Shaligram, 2000). These Taiwanese mothers intentionally perform maternal tutoring that is a type of outside school learning in terms of informal education. They actually generate cultural capital by arranging activities at home to reinforce children's learning.

In Taiwan, parents take education extremely seriously and are concerned that their children would fall behind if they do not have a good preschool education. Therefore when parents choose to send their children to preschool, the future benefit for the child often overrides the instant benefit for the parents (Hou,

2002). For Taiwanese parents, their children's education always comes first; hence, children's academic performance at school often reflects parents' contributions to children's learning. According to Tsai (2004), more than 80% of Taiwanese families expect their children, regardless of gender, to obtain at least a university or higher education. Research has shown that parents in Taiwan value cognitive development over social, physical, and emotional development (Roopnarine, Shin, Jung, & Hossain, 2003). As long as academic success remains the most efficient route to a good job and high social status in society, these Taiwanese mothers believe that only higher education enables their children to achieve a higher social status in Finnish society. They actively engage in socializing their children into a sense of entitlement to educational and occupational success. As Ho said:

> I hope I would inspire them to have the desire for a university education. I help them with their homework and make sure of their progress. Going to the library is one of our regular family activities. When they were little, no matter how busy I was, I never stopped reading books to them, such as biographies of successful and famous people. Those inspirational success stories prove that you have to pay a price to win and you have to pay a price to get to the point where success is possible. (…) I have compromised by abandoning some good Taiwanese cultural and family values because those values are not appreciated here. However, the value of education is definitely something I would never give up. I want my children to become well educated Finns. (Ho, age 55, in Finland thirteen years)

When individuals move into different fields, changes compel habitus to readjust. This is because the value of capital depends on the given field (Bourdieu, 1986). Ho's practices of mothering reproduce not only her class identity but also reinforce the norms and values operating in Finnish society. All women in this study suggest that the most of the Taiwanese traditions they learned are not valid in Finnish society. However, these Taiwanese mothers all place high value on education, which is shaped not only by the legacy of Confucian ideas but also by their belief in meritocracy: that is, a modern educational system promotes social mobility. Credentials issued by the formal education system are essential requirement for entry into the new forms of career-structured employment in contemporary societies.

According to Lareau (1989, 2003, 2011), educational systems help to reproduce and legitimate existing social relations in students because students whose families inculcate them with cultural capital that is in tune with the class biased curricular and pedagogical practices are more advantaged and successful than those whose families do not (see also Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977; Crompton, 2006; Glover & Stover, 2011; Jackson & Marsden, 1962; Lee & Bowen, 2006; Mehan, Villanuave, Hubbard, & Lintz, 1996; McLaren, 1998; Power, Edwards, Whitty, & Wigfall, 2003; Weis, 2010). In a way, the educational

knowledge, including curriculum, pedagogy, evaluation, and management practices, tend to intensify initial differences (Thomson, 2002). Likewise, these Taiwanese mothers have cultural and material resources to ensure their children's school progress. For example, Wu deliberately took the chance to inspire her child:

> I've been telling my son about your coming to interview me. It's really thrilling. He has been asking questions about university life, university degree, PhD degree, etc. I know you definitely think it's way too early, at his age, to talk about university life. But I am so glad that because of you, he got curious about going to university. (…) Of course, PTA meetings are must-go stuffs. It is common sense, isn't? When parents actively get involved in their children's schooling, it is not just good for children but also a kind of encouragement for teachers. If you don't care about your children's education, why should teachers care? (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Apparently, Wu has a great sense of the parental pedagogical requirements that the modern school system places upon parents (see Grant & Ray, 2010; Hornby, 2011; Sormunen, Tossavainen, & Turunen, 2011; Turnbull, Turnbull, Erwin, Soodak, & Shogren, 2011; Vesikansa, 2009). She positively responds to the PTA meetings; like other mothers, she also points out that she would never hesitate to contact her child's teacher or addressing problems in her child's school if necessary (see Lareau, 2003; 2008). The middle-class parents who have a privileged position usually convey a sense of confidence, certainty and legitimacy while deal with their children's school issues (Lareau, 2008; Reay, 1998c; 1999). International research has shown that immigrant parents are less likely to engage with their children's teachers or be active in schools (Heckmann, 2008); on the contrary, these highly educated Taiwanese mothers never fear the Finnish school system because they know how schools work and what education entails in contemporary society.

The relationship between home and school is one of the strongest indicators of children's academic success (Parator, 2002). Parental involvement, both in and out of school, is one of the most powerful supports for children's learning and development. For these Taiwanese mothers, the active participation in PTA meetings and school events plays a reciprocal role in the process of helping their children to become successful learners (see also Räty, Kasanen, & Laine, 2009; Räty, Ruokolainen, & Kasanen, 2012). Compared to fathers, mothers are often "hooked into the life of the school" (Graue, 1993, p. 474) and play an active role in parental involvement in the educational process (Ball, 2011; Chiang, Huang, & Lin, 2005; Hsu et al., 2011). Griffith and Smith (2005) point out that all mothers' work not only contributes to the individual child but the functioning of the school. As Nogueira (2010) argues, the role of family in education is "co-

producer of educational reality and - indirectly - of public educational policies" (pp. 261-262).

Moreover, the mothering is the process of cultural reproduction shaped by racialized/ethnicized, gendered, and classed ideologies of power (Reay, 1998a; 1998b; 1998c). Mothering practices that crosses gender and class lines may contribute directly to the functioning of the social reproduction as an engine of inequality. As Holloway and Pimlott-Wilson (2013) argue that parental involvement as mothers' fourth shift not only increases mothers' workloads along with the existing demands of paid work, household labor, and their own education/training, but also further widen social inequalities in education in terms of family background. The following narrative perfectly illustrates Lee's practices of mothering in accordance with an argument that children's education is often perceived as the mother's responsibility as the increasing demands placed on families by schools.

> I never miss any school events and meetings. My husband once complained I was totally over-dressed for a PTA meeting. It's always better to be over-dressed than under-dressed. I want my kid's teacher to know that I take the meeting really seriously. (…) You know, my kid made good grades and never had any behavior problem in school. In Taiwan, Taiwanese teachers and parents would absolutely praise my effort and commitment, you know, to successful parenting/mothering; therefore my child can do so well. But here (in Finland), they probably give more credit to the high quality of Finnish schooling. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Mothers automatically have to shoulder parental responsibility in giving thought, time, effort, and resources to children's education at school and at home in order to meet expectations of normative conceptions of the ideal parent in the discourse of partnership between teachers/schools and parents (Griffith & Smith, 2005; Holloway & Pimlott-Wilson, 2013; Reay, 1998c). These Taiwanese mothers are active in instilling a "cognitive habitus" (Nash, 2005) in their children, such as a love of learning and high aspirations for university education (see Tynkkynen, Tolvanen, & Salmela-Aro, 2012). Moreover, for Lee, dress code is a crucial marker of social difference which generates the symbolic distinctions of cultural capital (see Bourdieu, 1984). As Skeggs (1997) argues that the relations of race/ethnicity, class, and gender become a matter of bodily style and performance of respectability, which is embodied and practiced in the physical body as a site of drawing distinctions. Lee further explained:

> I think Finns indulge in the PISA miracles too much. Come on, do you really buy that "no kids left behind"? I do appreciate the education system in Finland; I really mean it. But after all, not everyone is able to enter tertiary education even though they always claim those kids who go to ammattikoulu/vocational schools know what they want and proudly make their own school choice. I wonder if they (Finns) also think I

> joyfully make my own job choice. Like I had a choice. Anyway, that's why I have to make sure my child take academic achievement seriously although Finnish primary schools don't encourage any competition. (Lee, age 40, in Finland eight years)

In Finland, "parents trust teachers as professionals who know what is best for their children" since the Finnish schooling system is known for well-trained teachers (Sahlberg, 2007, p. 155; see also Niemi, Kallioniemi, & Toom, 2012). The Finnish education system functions as a path to equality along with ethos of "education for all" (Kupiainen, Hautamäki & Karjalainen, 2009; OECD, 2004b; Niemi, 2012; Sahlberg, 2011), as Fladmoe (2012) notes, "Finns are most inclined to believe that the education system takes good care of all children" compared to other Nordic countries (p. 50). However, Lee's statements bring up the conventional view that vocational education is inferior to academic education and is simply for students with low academic achievement.

Like other mothers in this study, Lee verifies that the hierarchy of academic achievement would be a determinant of social hierarchies regarding to her child's future (see Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977). According to Jæger (2009, p. 1945), the vocational track, which is "cultural capital light", leads to relatively low-status occupations; on the other hand, the academic track, which is "cultural capital heavy", offers strong path to higher education/tertiary education and then high-status occupations (see also Ainsworth & Roscigno, 2005). Education as a site of social reproduction may conceal the reality of underlying inequalities as long as meritocracy is the primary form of administration in which students advance based on their academic achievement.

According to the latest PISA results, Finland had the least variation in educational outcomes between schools among the OECD countries (Sulkunen et al., 2010), considerably indicating the achievement of educational equality at the basic education level. However, parental socioeconomic status and educational level are still crucial predictors of child's academic success not only at general upper secondary education level but also at higher education level (tertiary education) in Finland (Koulutuksellisen tasa-arvon toimenpideohjelman työryhmä, 2012; see also Nori, 2011). Consistently, recent research on the intergenerational transmission of economic status in Finland has confirmed that the privilege of higher income families evidently affects the earnings of the next generation in terms of the components of human capital and the returns to parental investments in years of schooling (Lucas & Kerr, 2012). Additionally, Chan and Boliver (2012) have identified evidence of grandparent-effect in social mobility over three generations in Finland. Socioeconomic status does persist substantially across generations, which is considerably greater than was previously thought to be the case in Finland. Children's academic achievement is actually related to family background and parental input. Unsurprisingly,

parents' socioeconomic status is a leading cause of educational differences between immigrant children and the majority (Kilpi-Jakonen 2011, 2012).

The school system based on the notion of intelligence is still expected to determine differences among individuals and to place individuals into so-called appropriate positions in society (Antikainen, 1998; Kasanen & Räty, 2008; Snellman & Räty, 1992), which sustains a system of stratification by a hierarchy of socioeconomically determined classes. As Bourdieu and Boltanski point out that "the education market has become one of the most important loci of class struggle" (cited in Ball & Vincent, 2001, p.188). The Taiwanese mothers' high aspirations for their children's education come from their own middle-class habitus. For these Taiwanese mothers, their initial goal of climbing the economic ladder in the Finnish labor market to regain their middle-class status has become an effort to prevent the next generation from slipping down the social ladder in Finnish society.

## 7.3 Espousing Finnishness to Gain Dominant Group Privilege

English had been the intermarried couples' language of communication since they met. When these Taiwanese women acquire a certain level of local language skills, some of them try as much as possible not to use English at home after having children; however, some of them are still accustomed to using English and Finnish mixed together when they converse with their husbands. Two families became monolingual since the Taiwanese mothers do not speak Chinese with their children. These two mothers are not only concerned about their own language skills but also the importance of parental literacy; in so doing, they speak only Finnish or Swedish with their children in order to improve their own language skills. Pan rationalized her choice of languages as follows:

> People, including my husband, blame me for not speaking Chinese with my daughter. My husband and parents-in-law think I have responsibility for my daughter's Chinese skills. Then I wonder who is responsible for my slow improvement in Finnish? People keep implying that I am depriving my daughter of learning the Chinese language. It makes me feel as if I am a BAD mother, as if I am an ignorant mother who doesn't know the benefits of being bilingual. The Chinese language is written with symbols, which require learning to draw/write every different character word by word. Unlike Finnish that is a very phonetic language, which has just 29 alphabet letters. (…) My daughter doesn't need Chinese for a better life in FINLAND. What's so bad when a Finn doesn't speak Chinese here (Finland)? But I need Finnish language skills to get a job, to oversee my child's homework, and to know what happens in this country. (Pan, age 45, in Finland eight years)

Immigrant parents play a key role in preserving heritage languages (e.g., Wu, 2005). Yet Pan is clearly aware of the options she has and the possible consequences of these options. When she invests in her Finnish language skills by stopping to speak Chinese with her child, she does so with the understanding that she needs Finnish language skills to enable her support her daughter's educational journeys. For Pan, her Finnish proficiency is primarily seen as an idea of literacy as power, in which literacy is associated with parenting capabilities and successful mothering practices. As Smythe (2006) suggests, the discourses of domestic pedagogy normalize the ideal of the good mother in terms of children's literacy acquisition and academic success. However, Pan, an immigrant mother, is expected to contribute to her daughter's Chinese skills. She alludes to the fact she has been stigmatized by gendered expectations in terms of being an unselfish mother without any personal needs.

A dominant discourse of motherhood in Western society tends to present motherhood as "good mother" who is self-sacrificing, committed to the care of others and "not a subject with her own needs and interests" (Bassin, Honey, & Kaplan, 1994, p. 2; see also Brown, Small, & Lumley, 1997; Heys, 1996; Lupton, 2000; McMahon, 1995). The mainstream parenting belief system is formed and created by the dominant white, middle-class parents, professional experts, academic researchers and policy makers rather than by working-class families or minority ethnic groups (Collins, 1994; Woollett & Nicholson, 1998). Thus, immigrant mothers may be viewed as being culturally deficient in the language of the host country and the knowledge needed to help their children's education, and thus unable to fulfill the idealized view of the role of mother that mainstream society prescribes for women. These Taiwanese women, the primary caregivers of their children, are expected to be their children's Chinese language teachers. The discourse of raising bilingual children appears to be exacerbating and reproducing the language disadvantages of these Taiwanese women's situation. Although Chang intends to maintain her children's Chinese skills, she contends that the majority has romanticized bilingualism or multilingualism.

> Before I moved to Finland. My husband told me "some Finnish companies need employees, like you, who speak Chinese and understand Chinese culture. You speak English and have a university education and rich work experience. You can find a job soon in Finland". I've lived in Finland for longer than ten years. Chinese and English language skills never help me get a real job. Although I speak Finnish well and have a Finnish degree, I only get a low-skilled and low-paid job. Based on my own experience in Finland, being an Asian immigrant is never a plus even if you can speak many different languages, including the Finnish language. Being a member of the majority is surely an unearned advantage even though you are just monolingual. I think people overestimate the benefits of being bilingual or multilingual in Finnish society. Both of my daughters speak Chinese, not so fluently. However, they can't read anything in Chinese. Are they bilingual? Bringing up children bilingually is not easy when you are

> alone without Chinese-speaking relatives and community. Anyway, bilingualism promises nothing, but a university education at least will secure something more or less. (Chang, age 45, in Finland sixteen years)

Since the local languages are valued more than other languages, two Taiwanese mothers, Pan and Ho, chose monolingual parenting over bilingual parenting in order to better their own Finnish or Swedish skills as a tool for economic and social empowerment. Finland has two official languages, Finnish and Swedish, the latter spoken as a mother tongue by about 5.4% of the people (Statistics Finland, 2011). Ho, marrying a Swedish-speaking Finn, elaborates on the necessity of her language proficiency in both the Swedish and Finnish languages.

> Soon after we settled down, I started studying at a Swedish-speaking university. I needed to improve my Swedish skills as soon as possible. So I only speak Swedish to my children. My kids don't speak Chinese at all. My husband thinks I made a BIG mistake not to speak Chinese to them. However, their lack of Chinese language skills has no impact on their lives in Finland at all. On the other hand, I would never find any job without good language skills (Swedish and Finnish). (Ho, age 55, in Finland thirteen years)

Ho considers that she made a rational choice not to speak Chinese to her children in order to advance her Swedish skills on account of job opportunities. Among other mothers, Lim, Wu, Chang and Lee acknowledge the importance for their children to maintain continuously their bilingual ability, however, merely with instrumental motivation. In other words, the children are only expected to gain actual Chinese language skills rather than to acquire Taiwanese cultural values and beliefs.

These Taiwanese women see their national identities disappear into the broad category of being a visible immigrant among others although the visible immigrant category is comprised of highly heterogeneous groups. They become visible immigrants and they note that being an immigrant is a label and a liability. They believe that their children's mixed-heritage would make them more identifiable as native-born Finns, which can alter the boundaries that define "immigrant" and "non-immigrant". Therefore, Taiwanese women try to pave the way for their children to be accepted by the majority population. All these mothers' children have ordinary Finnish names. Having Finnish names seems to mean the assertion of the Finnish identity with which the power of dominant groups would be endowed. Chang related the decision for the choice of her children's names to her earlier experiences sending countless CVs to potential employers without getting any interviews.

> I adopted my husband family name and I thought a Finnish family name would be an advantage in job seeking. Well, a Finnish family name doesn't make me a Finn since

> my first name is still so foreign. Although I never know if my foreign name does devalue my CV, the fact was I never got any job interview by sending my CV. (…) Of course, my children's full names are absolutely Finnish names. Let's think of how many application forms my children will have to submit in their lives in this country. A full Finnish name may not make their CVs outstanding, but at least they would be treated equally. (…) I fully support my children in order to build up their own social networks by arranging parties and signing them up for extracurricular activities. I think having their friends is really important for children's future. You know, social networking can be a crucial part of job search or career building. After arriving in Finland as a newcomer, I immediately experienced the difficulties in finding a job related to the previous work experience and education, I realized that I have no useful social networks at all in Finland. My social and professional contacts, such as friends from the same high school and university, my old coworkers, and even my good reputation (at work), are all left in Taiwan. (Chang, age 45, in Finland sixteen years)

How individuals acquire and utilize different forms of capital depends on their socioeconomic situations and their perceptions of the situation as well as different kinds of social constraints. Chang's own experience permeates her attitudes and desires in relation to her children's future. Furthermore, the experience of inequity largely affects the practices of these Taiwanese women's mothering. These mothers chose not to place much significance on their own ethnic or cultural background while raising children. It is not that they do not know that their children might not be recognized as white Finns owing to being biracial/biethnic, but they think of their children as different from other Asian immigrant children and more like their Finnish peers. Their mothering reflects the ongoing influence of Finnishness as social advantage in Finnish society.

Their children all attend mainstream schools as residents of the affluent Finnish neighborhoods and participate in extracurricular activities with their Finnish peers almost without being involved socially with any non-Finnish peers. These Taiwanese mothers are constantly engaged in minimizing racial/ethnic boundaries in terms of the power of Finnishness. Similarly, Wu sees her son's mixed heritage as a chance to move up the racial/ethnic ladder in Finnish society.

> Finland is such a white-dominated society. I try not to bring up the issue of race/ethnicity although I know there is always something about that more or less. I did my best to learn Finnish and even have a local degree. I still can't compete with locals fairly since I am always "different" from Finns; you see the point, don't you? Well, my son looks much more Finnish than Asian because of his biracial/biethnic heritage. I want him totally to be a Finn. I don't want him to be different. So why bother to pass on our Taiwanese cultural values to a Finnish kid? Finnish is my kid's mother tongue. He is a Finn after all. I speak Chinese to him only because he would have an advantage over his counterparts in the global labor market. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Wu's institutional cultural capital (university degree) and embodied cultural capital (pre-existing knowledge of, beliefs about and aspirations for university) have qualified her to further obtain a Finnish degree. However, her immigrant background has an impact on the conversion of institutional cultural capital to economic capital in the Finnish labor market (see also CIMO, 2011; Majakulma, 2011; Shumilova, Cai, & Pekkola, 2012). Consequently, Wu believes that Finnishness would guarantee her child access to the opportunities within the host society and intergenerational upward social mobility. Her comments reveal not only her conviction and determination to provide her child with a fully Finnish identity by downplaying the Taiwanese heritage cultures and identities but also her understanding of the racial/ethnic hierarchy in Finnish society.

The racial/ethnic hierarchy prevails in Finland since certain immigrant groups in terms of race/ethnicity are the most undervalued and positioned at the bottom of the social hierarchy in Finnish society (see Jasinskaja-Lahti et al., 2002; Koskela, 2011; Koikkalainen et al., 2011; Talib, 2002). Based on surveys on majority attitudes (Jaakkola, 2005, 2009), the ethnic hierarchy among immigrants in Finland splits along two axes: cultural familiarity/proximity and educational/employment status. The highly skilled Western immigrants are placed on top; on the other hand, the unskilled and low educated humanitarian immigrants from the Global South are at the bottom of the ethnic hierarchy. Finns favor immigrants who are similar to Finns along with cultural, religious and racial/ethnic lines, that is, those coming from the Nordic or Anglo-Saxon countries (Hautaniemi, 2004; Heikkilä, 2005; Jaakkola, 2005). Noteworthily, Russians, regardless of racial/ethnic appearance, are also marginalized and otherized in Finnish society (e.g., Jasinskaja-Lahti & Liebkind, 1997; Jasinskaja-Lahti et al., 2002; Liebkind et al., 2004; Mannila & Reuter, 2009; Raittila, 2004a, 2004b; Saarinen, 2007). Thus, for non-Western immigrants, immigrant status is a potential stigma that has significant consequences for their available life chances in Finland.

Because the existence of Finns' national identity is strongly intertwined with race/ethnicity, any individual without parents of native Finnish backgrounds are excluded from being a Finn (Lepola, 2000). In the interviews, all these Taiwanese women claim that their physical characteristics are too different for them to be treated as Finns in daily interactions. Moreover, attention in the public debate has not been paid enough to the issue of racial/ethnic inequality in Finnish society (see Puuronen, 2011; Rastas, 2009). It is understandable that these Taiwanese women feel disempowered to tackle the issue of race/ethnicity. According to Bourdieu's notion of social space, the Taiwanese women are aware of their relative positions from the perspective of racial/ethnic stratification in Finnish society. Thus, they tend to highlight their children's Finnishness by locating their children's identity with that "they are Finnish kids". As a result, the

children's bicultural and biracial background does not provide them with additional possibilities for cultural and ethnic identification. For these Taiwanese women, there is no need to retain undesired differentness, i.e., the Taiwanese cultural heritage for their "Finnish children." They selectively adopt new values and priorities for their children because they are afraid that the struggles around belonging might lie ahead for their children.

Although Finland's population also comprises people from different minority groups, such as the Finland-Swedes, the Tatars, the indigenous Sami, and the Russians, Finland is a relatively homogeneous country in terms of immigration and race/ethnicity compared to other European countries (see Pentikäinen & Hiltunen, 1995; Raento & Husso, 2002). Whiteness in constructions of Finnish nationhood has been achieved by the idea of racial/ethnic hierarchy (see also Lepola, 2000; Saukkonen, 1999; Lempiäinen, 2002; Urponen, 2010). For instance, concerning the racial/ethnic status of the Finns in the United States in the 1970s, providing all necessary comments and data to attest Finns' Whiteness had been given the highest priority by the Finnish-American members of the curriculum committee of the Minneapolis public schools, as Michael Karni noted "the first order of business was to include data which would prove that Finns are White" (cited in Kivisto & Leinonen, 2011). Dutton (2008) argues that the historically racial/ethnic ambiguity in Finland is based on a noticeable binary opposition between being civilized Europeans and being uncivilized Mongolians. Furthermore, Anttonen (2005) notes that the emphasis on the Westernness reflects on Finland's current position in the European Union in terms of how the Finns wish to be perceived. Whiteness, the ideology of white supremacy, carries symbolic privilege to whites. Therefore, "Westernness" and "Europeanness" are not only described in terms of cultural similarities, but also in terms of the racial/ethnic categories.

For some people, religious identity and cultural identity are interwoven. Among the ten women interviewed, two of them are Christians while the others are either Buddhists or Taoists. However, nearly all these Taiwanese women's children are members of the Lutheran Church. Wu, a Buddhist, discussed her instrumental view on church as additional key place where her child can be socialized into "Finnish values" rather than religious values, which is one of the most striking illustrations of Finnishization in the practices of mothering.

> I am a Buddhist. However, I insisted that my child join the church so that he could learn some something in Sunday school that I am never able to teach him. Finland is a Christian country; some Finnish festivals and holidays are strongly related to Christian religion. Since Christian traditions are a part of Finnish culture, my son should have certain Christian knowledge in order to be like others (native-born Finns). For me, there is a clear contrast between the teachings of Buddhism and those of Christianity. I think Buddhism is in many points incompatible with Christianity.

> There will be another benefit to my child because of his church membership. He will be given religious education in the comprehensive and high schools, you know, just like most of Finnish kids. But, somehow, I hope he won't become a real Christian. However, I still prefer that he can do whatever the majority does. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Religion as an agent of socialization has played a significant role in embodying the moral principle in society. Wu remains faithful to her own religious affiliation; however, she believes that her son's following a mainstream religion would offer him a better fit in Finnish society. Historically Finnishness links to a communitarian basis from the unification of the state and the Lutheran church tradition (Anttonen, 1998, p. 357). In Finland, Lutheranism and humanism are deeply intertwined both in private and public spheres. In 2011, 77.2% of the total population were registered as members of the main state church, the Evangelical Lutheran Church of Finland (Suomen evankelis-luterilainen kirkko, 2012). Although nearly a third of Finns believe in God of Christianity (Kääriäinen, Niemelä, & Ketola, 2005), membership in the Lutheran Church is taken as constituting the way of life in Finnish society (Riitaoja, Poulter, & Kuusisto, 2010), which is literally called "tapakristitty/Christian by habit" regardless of their relations to religious orientations. Moreover, schooling is shaped by social, historical and cultural contexts. Therefore, Lutheran or Christian traditions are still emphasized and defined as Finnish cultural sources for students in the National Core Curriculum (the National Board of Education in Finland, 2004). Wu went on expressing her concerns about her child's racial/ethnic identification in a Finnish context.

> At one school event, the teacher and other parents were as nice as usual, I had great conversations with some parents; however, one of them friendlily mentioned something like: Asian kids look just smarter. Huh, for me it's not a compliment at all. My son is a totally FINN. He is just like any other Finnish children even though he has a mixed-racial/ethnic looking. See, even my son, so native, is still seen as an Asian. They see you as DIFFERENT, and of course they treat you DIFFERENTLY. Really frustrating issue! In schools, you have an equal chance, you know, just make an effort, and then you will get good grades as reward. It's always a fair game. But when it's about the future (employment), it's another thing. You never know if you are treated as fairly as Finns when you are indentified as an Asian or immigrant in Finland. (Wu, age 40, in Finland eight years)

Wu is able to socialize with native Finnish parents and confidently attends school activities without feeling intimidated. However, she is astounded and feels insecure when her child may be singled out as different because of his partially physical markers of being Asian. As Rantala (2011) suggests, "when white Finnishness is represented as a norm the images are strengthening the representations of others, non-white people as abnormal. The invisibility of non-

whiteness is strengthening the impression that non-white [people] do not exist and do not belong to Finnish society" (p. 5). Therefore, being a white Finn connects an individual to Finnish society without having to explain, define, or defend one's national identity.

In the interviews, the tone and tenor of these women's voice show an ever-present apprehension that their Finnish children might be identified as a "non-Finnish child" or an "immigrant child". In other words, self-recognition is not enough despite that these Taiwanese mothers raise and define their children as Finns if the vast majority of the population in Finnish society does not acknowledge their Finnish children's identity (see Varjonen, Arnold, & Jasinskaja-Lahti, 2013). Wu's empirically based commentary on the disadvantages of being an Asian immigrant offers legitimacy to her suggestion that race/ethnicity matters in white Finnish society. Being different is not just the opposite of being the same as everyone else; but also a power relation shaped by domination in terms of race/ethnicity.

## 7.4 Taiwanese Mothers Raising Finnish Children

These Taiwanese mothers adopt the existing racial/ethnic hierarchy in which immigrants are the "other" in the eyes of the Finns, and attempt to reproduce this hierarchical schema in the next generation. The deeply felt sense of immigrant-class vulnerability in Finnish society comes from seeing themselves through locals' eyes, which subsequently jolts them into an awareness of their racialized/ethnicized status. Finding themselves in the minority calls forth a racial/ethnic identity and reflects the fundamental disempowerment for what it means to be an Asian immigrant. They chose the dominant culture for their children, although contrary to contemporary thinking about the positive consequences of biculturalism, which does make sense since these mothers espouse Finnishness that certainly advantage their children. In other words, it is not that these Taiwanese mothers slavishly follow the Finnish norms but the Finnish norms provide what they have sought (i.e., privilege). Lim further clarified her own thoughts:

> Perhaps you, as an academic researcher, believe in something like multicultural ideology. No offense, but you don't have children yet. When you become a mother and still live in Finland, I am so sure you wouldn't put your children's future at risk. You know, my sister, a university teacher (in Taiwan), thinks my parenting totally FAILS since my children are so Finnish. Again, no offense, but scholars always criticize common people's beliefs and behavior from their ivory tower. They usually just know theories but not the trivia of the real world at all. You know, easier said than done. (Lim, age 40, in Finland five years)

Although Lim interpreters and negotiates various norms in order to provide the best for her children, her comments reveal power relations between groups rather than merely cultural differences. For many of the women in this study, biculturalism is not an ideal goal for the transmission of culture across generations but rather involves many uneasy decisions, power relations, and a wide range of conflicts in their everyday lives. In their view, biculturalism or multiculturalism neither changes their social status nor replaces their racial/ethnic hierarchy in Finnish society. Likewise, Ho considered biculturalism or multiculturalism as another kind of illusion in a homogeneous country like Finland.

> No matter how long I've lived in Finland and how much I understand the cultural difference between Taiwan and Finland, I still get confused now and then because of the cultural disconnect and culture shock. As a mother, I really don't see the point to pass on something alien or exotic to my children. I've been criticized for being a narrow minded-mother. Guess what? Those people who criticized me almost have no knowledge of Taiwanese culture and Confucian society. Besides, they overestimate the advantages for having a bi- or multicultural identity in this homogeneous white nation. It's just like icing on the cake for Finns, but not for immigrants like us. (Ho, age 55, in Finland thirteen years)

These data illustrate how the line drawn in the struggle for equality varies over the boundaries of race/ethnicity. At play is the presumption that the only way to gain equality is via assimilation to the Finnish mainstream. This construction obscures social inequality when these Taiwanese mothers see a necessity comply with Finnish social norms and value by distancing theirs children from Taiwanese cultural heritage in order to be accepted as dominant group members. For these Taiwanese mothers, mothering is a dynamic process of intersection and combination of "our" and "their" cultures and values, a result of negotiation, bargaining and even compromise. Throughout social positions and power relation, they realized that Finnishness affects both themselves and their children, but the effects are different. Finnishness causes disadvantageous consequences for these Taiwanese mothers particularly in the labor market, but secures and maintains the privilege for the latter.

They cannot afford to jeopardize their children's life chances by instilling unconvertible cultural capital to their children since their children need to posses the "right" dispositions and capital that can privilege them in Finnish society. Another key piece of the different social ethos described by Pan is the ethic of filial piety in a Confucian society.

> Filial piety is encouraged and praised by Taiwanese society; but filial piety is not even a virtue in Finland. Many Westerns mistakenly think our filial behavior or filial relations are kind of passive or dependent nonsense. Taiwanese are taught that filial

> piety is the root of all ethics. Schools and municipalities give Filial Piety rewards to students and citizens. It's a great honor. (...) The interdependence in parent-child relationships is a cycle of reciprocity. Unlike the Taiwanese, the Finns are taught to become independent and to be aware of their own rights. Finnish children are encouraged to exercise their own rights as a citizen, whereas Taiwanese children MUST fulfill their obligations as a family member. (Pan, age 45, in Finland eight years)

Filial piety, the central value of Confucian familism, is the ideal of the parent-child relationship. Filial piety not only emphasizes parents' authority but also interdependence of the generations and obligations of family members based on the collective interest of the family (Knapp, 2005; Tsai, Chen, & Tsai, 2008; Slot & De vos, 1998; Yeh & Bedford, 2003). Filial piety reflects an individual's morality, i.e., the trustworthiness given to a corresponding individual (Hwang, 1998; Lee & Tan, 2012). Moreover, Confucian philosophy and values continues to influence the Taiwanese schooling system (Hadley, 2003; Liang, 2000; Miller, Wiley, Fung, & Liang, 1997). Because families and society place the high value on education, academic achievement is regarded as the essential socialization goal along with respecting parents and honoring the family in terms of filial piety (Chow, 2007; Ho, 1994, 1996; Zhang & Carrasquillo, 1995). Children's school performance links to strong traditional filial piety obligations and family expectations (Chen & Ho, 2012; Watkins, 2000; Watkins & Biggs, 2001). Unsurprisingly, nearly all the participants in the interviews spoke of their school days and particularly underscored that their academic achievement reflected on the identity of being a filial child in a Taiwanese context.

No matter what effort Pan makes to re-locate cultural and social values from her original society into the host society, these familiar values must be selected, negotiated and even abandoned to some extent. When she sees the dominant values as cultural capital, she tries to modify herself to be consistent with the Finnish norms. She further explained why her child might not benefit from cultural practices and values that deviate from the Finnish social norm.

> Different societies have different social norms and different criteria for good citizens. My child, just like other Finnish kids, attends the mainstream school. Finnish schooling surely Finnishizes pupils by teaching Finnish values. Of course, I shouldn't instill UNAPPRECIATED values in my child. As the old saying goes: "One man's medicine is another man's poison". I think it's just so true for the extremely cultural differences between Taiwan and Finland. (Pan, age 45, in Finland eight years)

Pan's statement indicates that school reproduces society while society is reproduced in schools. The most obvious way in which Finnishness is (re)produces is through the Finnish education system. As Pan points out, "Finnish schooling surely Finnishizes pupils by teaching Finnish values"; schools

endorse and reinforce dominant ideologies provided by dominant groups that in practice sustain and reproduce existing power relations (see Tolonen, 1999). The degree to which the student fits dominant notions of schooling substantially influences the success and failure of the student in obtaining the values, dispositions and cultural capital recognized by the school (Lareau, 2011; Lareau & Horvat, 1999).

For instance, some research in a Finnish context has suggested that immigrant students face the challenge of mismatches between aspects of the student's home culture and the school culture (Alitolppa-Niitamo, 2004; Hautaniemi, 2004). According to Holm and Londen (2010), in the Finnish schooling context cultural diversity merely focuses on heritage language and religious diversity for immigrant and minority groups. Moreover, the diversity of the immigrant student populations is still neglected in a "one-size-fits-all" misconception. When it comes to multicultural education, only immigrant students are the target group, instead of an education that addresses all students. Multicultural education should be not merely to organize education for immigrants, but for all (see also Dervin, Paatela-Nieminen, Kuoppala, & Riitaoja, 2012; Graeffe & Lestinen, 2011; Nieto, 2000). However, Finnish teachers by and large overlook immigrant students' native culture while they have to commit to maintaining equality by treating all students the same in order to avoid discriminating against any group (Miettinen & Pitkänen, 1999).

Schools and teachers often claim to have a value-neutral stance in terms of so-called neutrality in their teaching in order to deposit neutral knowledge into students (Räsänen, 2009, p. 6; Tomperi, Vuorikoski, & Kiilakoski, 2005, p. 16). Nonetheless, schools may unconsciously perpetuate or potentially exacerbate existing biases by causing prejudices, discrimination and negative stereotypes (Räsänen, 2009). For example, the National Curriculum Guidelines on Early Childhood Education and Care places an emphasis on the importance of Finnish culture in early childhood learning and early education (Lappalainen, 2006). Finnish education has carried the process of establishing an independent sovereign state and also consolidated national self-esteem based on the notion of one nation with one common culture and language (see Gordon, Holland, & Lahelma, 2000; Kyrö & Nyyssölä, 2006; Räty, 2002).

Pedagogy is always context-dependent and value-laden, connected with the specific cultural values and the dominant ideology suited to society (Ellsworth, 1997). Through public education, Finnish students are expected to become capable and ideal citizens by carrying on Finnishness embedded in every teaching practice (Antikainen, Rinne, & Koski, 2006; Gordon et al., 2000; Tolonen, 1999). When the dominant culture is reproduced in the schools, the culture of dominated groups is relegated to a marginalized position in society. These Taiwanese women are aware that schools promote dominant forms of

cultural capital "which at every moment, exists in an 'embodied state'" (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 133). They want their children to represent themselves in ways that adhere to the dominant culture to socially fit in, which is contrary to the findings of an earlier study that Somali parents are concerned about their children's Westernization by Finnish schools (Alitolppa-Niitamo, 2002). These Taiwanese mothers struggle to choose "right" values in order to increase their children's social recognition in Finnish society.

In the following narrative, Lim described her perceptions of parenting in a cross-cultural context.

> In our culture, we are taught to improve on our weaknesses constantly; therefore, we Taiwanese sometimes underestimate ourselves. In contrast, Finnish individualism values individual good characters really much. They are encouraged to develop their natural talents. (…) Sometimes I can't help being a strict mother. My husband reminds me now and then that there is no unquestioned parental authority in Finland. Indeed, I had lived in five countries before moving to Finland. Every country has different parenting culture. Finnish parenting style is not necessary better than Taiwanese one. Since we decided to settle down in Finland. Of course, we should learn to do what Finns usually do. It is just like the saying: "When in Rome, do as the Romans do." So, when my kids asked what their nationality and ethnicity were, I never hesitated to answer, "you are Finns". I don't want them to get confused about their identity. (Lim, age 40, in Finland five years)

As Bourdieu suggests that all dominated groups are "always subject to the domination of the dominant cultural arbitarary" (Bourdieu & Passeron, 1977, P. 23). To some extent, Lim is aware that some of Taiwanese cultural values are contradictory to that of the society where she is currently situated. She would rather choose to follow the Finnish societal norms in order to maximize her children's benefits, even if she does not entirely agree with them.

Taiwanese families still hold Confucian family values with regard to the importance of emotional connections and reciprocal support among the members of the extended family (Chuang, 2005; Tsai & Yi, 1997). For instance, Ho asked her son to do his grandparents' lawn in summer and to clean the snow off the sidewalks in winter out of respect for the elderly in the sense of caring for family members. Because her son always accepted payment from his grandparents, she tried to explain to him that it should be a family duty rather than a paid job. However, her parents-in-law, husband and son all asserted that "people get paid for doing any jobs in Finland. Our government takes care of elderly. Families don't do that in Finland." The right of elderly to receive care from the public authorities is written in the constitution of Finland (Finnish constitution, section 19). On the contrary, the role of filial piety in caring for aging parents or grandparents is still normative and required in Taiwanese society (Yeh, 1997). The elderly, whether institutionalized or not in Taiwan, are

entitled to receive maintenance and support from the lineal relatives by blood or the spouse according to Article 1118 of Family of Civil Code (Law & Regulations ROC, 2012). Thus, As Ho pointed out:

> So it's not up to me if I want or not to pass on Taiwanese culture and tradition to my children since most of our values and manners just don't fit well in Finnish society. You know, even my 9-year-old daughter knows that she will and wants to move out to live with her future boyfriend when she is old enough to be considered an adult. We haven't talked about this issue yet but she has learned from others (Finns). As you know, premarital cohabitation is legal and totally socially and culturally accepted here (Finland). But it's still something discreditable in Taiwanese society. Probably, I would be considered a totally failure as a mother and my daughter would be considered promiscuous in Taiwan. Anyway, some of our criteria for being a good child don't work here at all. Then, of course, some of our criteria for being a good student are not appreciated or encouraged in Finnish schooling system. They (Ho's children) are Finnish children. They should follow the local social norms rather than the foreign ones from another country. (Ho, age 55, in Finland thirteen years)

Ho perceives Finnish culture as a set of clearly prescribed practices that she wants her children to follow. Ho's conceptions of raising children have been influenced more by the fluid nature of mainstream culture and less by the desire to retain her own cultural values and traditions. In the same way, Chang gave an example of the reality of cultural differences, rather than an ideal of cultural diversity.

> You know, to be understood and to understand is not just about language issues but also about cultural values. For example, last winter we spent two weeks visiting my parents. My parents, my brother and sister-in-law were proudly praising my nephew's good teacher. My brother got a phone call from the teacher telling that a couple of times she saw my nephew and a bunch of students hanging around in a shopping mall during weekends. She expressed her concern that my nephew shouldn't waste his weekends doing something like that but study at home more in order to be well prepared for the forthcoming university entrance examination. My nephew, of course, felt embarrassed although he always gets good grades. For my parents, brother and sister-in-law, it's a great honor and privilege because the teacher takes my nephew's future very seriously. Guess What!!! My younger daughter said something like "It's really none of her (the teacher's) business. She was way out of line." And my older daughter added "What a weird teacher! I would definitely say to her: GET A LIFE." No matter how I explained the role of teachers in Taiwan to my daughters, they just couldn't get it. They are Finns after all. They (parents, brother and sister-in-law) were really shocked and worried that my daughters would be a bad influence on my nephew. (With a deep sigh) I was the only one who completely understood both sides. This is an excellent example of why I think our way (Taiwanese culture and values) would never work in Finnish society. That's why I am so tired of hearing about multiculturalism or cultural diversity. (Chang, age 45, in Finland sixteen years)

As Yosso argues that "traditional interpretations of cultural capital" is a deficit lens that devalues other non-dominant cultures by only acknowledging dominant culture as cultural capital (2005, p. 69). Those, for example immigrants, who do not or cannot comply with social norms, may be at the risk of being excluded and marginalized. The cultural difference leads these Taiwanese mothers to avoid bringing their own cultural heritage into the practices of mothering. For these women, Taiwanese and Finnish cultures are in many ways incompatible with each other; as a result, it is difficult to find a harmonious solution. Cultural value conflicts never occur in a vacuum but plays out in everyday life, such as what values or priorities take precedent in mothering. They consider their children as native-born Finns; therefore, they configure their mothering as cultural capital transmission in which to engage in reproducing the dominant culture since Finnishness as social advantage can increase their children's legitimate claim for membership in the white mainstream Finnish society.

## Summary

These Taiwanese women perceive Finnish society as stratified by race/ethnicity. Their sense of vulnerability in immigranthood is due to an awareness of their racialized/ethnicized ethnic status. They adopt the existing racial/ethnic hierarchy in which visible immigrants are the "other" in the eyes of the Finns, and attempt to reproduce this hierarchical schema in the next generation. They tend to highlight their children's Finnishness; as a result, they do not perceive that the bicultural and biracial/biethnic background can provide their children with additional possibilities for cultural and ethnic identification and belonging. Highly educated Taiwanese women in this study are dependent on their cultural capital and class habitus to acquire more capital and to guarantee the success of their children. They become conscious of the potential value of their cultural capital and begin to believe even more in the worth of their children's education, which plays a key role in transmitting their class status to the next generation. A distinctive gendered activity, mothering, in effect, makes these Taiwanese women responsible for the work that ensures that their children inherit the middle-class consciousness and reproduce the social status.

# CHAPTER EIGHT

## Conclusions and Suggestions for Future Research

### 8.1 Conclusions

This study draws on Bourdieu's theory of practice but with a lens of intersectionality to explore the ways that the Taiwanese women utilize their cultural capital to respond to their disadvantages associated with race/ethnicity, gender, and class positions in Finnish society. "How do highly educated Taiwanese women acquire, transfer and transform their cultural capital to seek a self-acceptable social position in Finnish society?" is the main research question to which this study aims to answer.

These university-educated Taiwanese women see higher education as a route to advance social mobility in the host society, which is the legacy of their class of origin. They have strived to do their best by acquiring more cultural capital from Finnish higher education institutions and learning the local languages. Noteworthily, even after they have learned the Finnish language and obtained local degrees, many of them are unable to find a job commensurate with their local degrees. The convertibility of cultural capital is considerably intricate for these Taiwanese women to achieve in the Finnish labor market. As one of the participants repeatedly states, "I am capable of learning and willing to do anything to meet the requirements of a desirable job. But the most difficult barrier to overcome is that I can't change who I am since race/ethnicity matters in this country." Deskilling of skilled immigrant labor represents institutionalized racial/ethnic inequality in the distribution of socioeconomic rewards since research evidence has been pointing to that direction.

In this study, all women's accounts testify that middle-class habitus has a heavy bearing on educational, professional, and social success. Although their middle-class habitus enables them to utilize their existing capital to accumulate more cultural capital, it does not shape the rules of the field, i.e., the social hierarchies based on race/ethnicity. The conversion of cultural capital into economic capital is contingent on relations of power in light of serving the interests of dominant groups. The Finnish labor market plays a key role in promoting a racial/ethnic categorization and (re)producing power relations. Despite the weak link between cultural capital and employment outcomes, many of them have had no choice but to stay optimistic for – Luck is when preparation meets opportunity – by improving their never-good-enough Finnish language skills and acquiring more education or training, as part of an endeavor to reverse

the "temporary" downward mobility. Their determination is admirable since several of them have attempted to enter the labor market for many years. They perceive that the public discourse in Finland gives no socially approved opportunity for married women to be more family-oriented and less work-oriented, which influences their choices to adopt the new gender roles in an attempt to be actively responsible immigrants.

They fail to find jobs at their desired level or in areas relevant to their expertise; therefore, they give up their dreams about the continuity of their careers and settle instead for less skilled jobs. Some women are channeled into feminized occupations as direct-care workers. Making compromises to become practical nurses is due to a lack of alternative employment opportunities, rather than the prospect of entering a heavily feminized occupation. Although these Taiwanese women get involved in paid-work, they are trapped in low paying jobs with poor prospects. Underemployment helps them to retain a sense of "being-a-good-immigrant" identity and gain mainstream respectability, but provides little benefit of expanding their social capital such as social networks and useful contacts beyond their current positions to find opportunities for upward mobility. Finnish society provides these highly educated Taiwanese women with little opportunity to subvert gender roles; on the other hand, they face new forms of social inequality. The intersection of being a visible immigrant and a woman create a unique point of inequity at the lower echelon of racialized/ethnicized and gendered labor market.

They find their middle-class identities contradict their immigrant status and the sense of who they are has been adjusted from being educated professionals to the immigrant lower class. A sense of incongruity in their social identity leads to a potentially painful process of cleft habitus. They have to balance these contradictory aspects of their lives by negotiating a self-acceptable social position in Finnish society. Downward social mobility and a lack of professional fulfillment serve as a catalyst for turning to the male breadwinner model in order to overcome their vulnerability in the Finnish labor market. For a few women, the private sphere, home/family, provides more egalitarian relations and, more important, functions as a means of resistance to social injustice. Nevertheless, they still seek to avoid any of the situations that might be mistakenly construed as either a lack of active immigrants' resilience or an increased stereotype to vulnerable Asian women.

Among the mothers, although some of them are not able to get a satisfactory job matching their qualifications, they claim that the disappointment, more or less, have been compensated by preparing their children for the future. These Taiwanese women are confined to a marginal role in the Finnish labor market; on the other hand, their middle-class privilege is identified in their parental involvement in children's education. Education and how it is deployed and used

are the central concerns of these women in relation to middle-class habitus because "the practices produced by the habitus [are] the strategy-generating principle enabling agents to cope with unforeseen and ever-changing situations" (Bourdieu, 1977, p. 72). Their middle-class habitus enables them to transform their cultural capital into mothering practices. While education is the key component to improving one's social status, their mothering serves one purpose, namely to prepare their children for higher education that would secure their children's future socioeconomic status in nothing less than the middle class.

They raise their children simply as Finnish children by distancing their Taiwanese cultural heritage and espousing Finnishness. Finnishness creates social norms according to which all gender, sexuality, family, and labor are guided, regulated, and maintained in Finnish society. Thus, Finnishness has the utmost capacity to determine the legitimation of each member's capital and creates social boundaries which either promote or limit access to social mobility, as Skeggs notes that "legitimation is the key mechanism in the conversion [of capital] to power…Capital has to be regarded as legitimate… before its value is realizable" (2004, p. 17). For these Taiwanese mothers, a social position within Finnish society is not just reflected in academic credentials, occupational selection, standard of living, and income levels. In order to help their children gain social acceptance, they need to take on and reproduce the norms, values and interests of dominant groups through their mothering. Their mothering is influenced not only by their middle-class habitus but also by the racial/ethnic hierarchy that exists in Finnish society.

For Bourdieu, women in social space are not "capital-accumulating subjects" but "capital bearing objects" whose value increases to the primary groups to which they belong (e.g., the family) (Lovell, 2000, p. 20). However, the women in this study are both "capital-accumulating subjects" and "capital bearing objects" since they not just serve the interest of their spouses and children but also utilize their class-based privilege to contribute to the reproduction of existing social hierarchy. The way in which gender and race/ethnicity intersect with class is both social and deeply personal; what occurs to these Taiwanese immigrants affects not only economies and society but also individuals and families. The findings suggest that these Taiwanese women's habitus and cultural capital make a significant contribution to intergenerational reproduction of social class through their mothering independent of their downward occupational mobility in Finnish society. Thus, these highly educated Taiwanese women's social status do not simply involve a downward social move, but creates a ripple effect on reconfigurations of class, race/ethnicity and gender relations in different social settings.

## 8.2 Suggestions for Future Research

I acknowledge that I have only constructed and presented one of many possible truths relative to individual perceptions of reality about the Taiwanese women's experiences in Finland. Therefore, there are certain significant methodological and theoretical implications of the current research findings for future research. Integrating Bourdieu's theory of practice into an intersectionality perspective provides a promising and innovative theoretical framework for immigration research, whereas social divisions could blend into one another rather than be rigidly distinct. However, this research is rather to provide context specific detailed information about individual experiences of a relatively small number of immigrant women. The results of this study may reflect the unique concerns, interests, and perspectives of this particular group. The findings may not speak to the experiences of other immigrant groups. Hopefully scholars will employ an intersectionality perspective and include different immigrant communities for future research since there are many other immigration issues and topics within wider structural context that could benefit from using an intersectional analysis.

There has not been enough research on language learning for adult immigrants in Finland. In order to develop more effective work-focused language training and teaching practices for adult immigrants, there are many interesting research topics about Finnish/Swedish language teaching and learning for academics to delve into in future studies. For instance, further studies about language pedagogy and agenda for adult immigrants engaged in learning Finnish/Swedish would make contributions to Finnish language learners and educators. Another possible future exploration that was not addressed in this study is the voices of mixed-heritage children growing up in Finnish society. In addition, it would be interesting to conduct a similar study specifically designed to examine how Asian immigrant men marrying Finnish women repudiate their marginal manhood and cross-racial/ethnic fatherhood in the Finnish context.

# REFERENCES


Aalto, K., & Varjonen, J. (2012). Ajankäytön rytmit arjen kuvaajana. Teoksessa M. Lammi, M. Pantzar, & T. Koivunen (toim.), *Arjen kartat ja rytmit: Kuluttajatutkimuskeskuksen vuosikirja 2012* (s. 35-63). Helsinki: Kuluttajatutkimuskeskus.

Aalto, M., Larja, L., & Liebkind, K. (2010). *Syrjintä työhönottotilanteissa-tutkimuskatsaus*. Publication 16/2010. Helsinki: Työ- ja elinkeinoministeriö.

Aaltonen, M., Joronen, M., & Villa, S. (2009). *Syrjintä Suomessa 2008*. Helsinki: Ihmisoikeusliitto.

Aarnitaival, S. (2012). *Maahanmuuttajanaiset työelämätietoa etsimässä. Tutkimus kotoutumisen tietokäytännöistä*. Väitöskirja: Tampereen yliopisto.

Abbasian, S., & Hellgren, C. (2012). Working conditions for female and immigrant cleaners in Stockholm county – an intersectional approach. *Nordic journal of working life studies, 2* (3), 161-181.

Acker, J. (2006). Inequality regimes: Gender, class and race in organizations. *Gender and Society*, *20*, 441-464.

Adamuti-Trache, M. (2010). *Is the glass half empty or half full? Obstacles and opportunities that highly educated immigrants encounter in the segmented Canadian labor market*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of British Columbia, Vancouver. Retrieved from https://circle.ubc.ca/handle/2429/19775

Adamuti-Trache, M. (2011). First 4 years in Canada: Post-secondary education pathways of highly-educated immigrants. *Journal of International Migration and Integration, 12* (1), 61-82.

Adamuti-Trache, M. (2013). Language acquisition among adult immigrants in Canada: The effect of pre-migration language capital. *Adult Education Quarterly, 63*(2), 103-126.

Adamuti-Trache, M., & Sweet, R. (2010). Adult immigrants' participation in Canadian education and training. *Canadian Journal for the Study of Adult Education, 22*(2), 1-26.

Adib, A., & Guerrier, Y. (2003). The interlocking of gender with nationality, race, ethnicity and class: The narratives of women in hotel work. *Gender, Work and Organization, 10*(4), 413-432.

Adkins, L. (2004). Reflexivity: Freedom or habit of gender?. *The Sociological Review, 52*(s2), 191-210.

Ahmad, A. (2005). *Getting a job in Finland: The social networks of immigrants from the Indian subcontinent in the Helsinki metropolitan labor market*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of Helsinki, Helsinki.

Ahmad, A. (2011). Connecting with work. *European Societies, 13*(5), 687-712.

Ainsworth, J., & Roscigno, V. (2005). Stratification, school-work linkages and vocational Education. *Social Forces, 84*(1), 257-284.

Aleksynska, M., & Tritah, A. (2011). *Occupation-education mismatch of immigrant workers in Europe: Context and policies*. CEPII Working Papers 2011-16, Paris: CEPII research center.

Alitolppa-Niitamo, A. (2002). The generation in-between: Somali youth and schooling in metropolitan Helsinki. *Intercultural education*, *13*(3), 275-290.

Alitolppa-Niitamo, A. (2004). *The icebrakers. Somali-speaking youth in metropolitan Helsinki with a focus on the context of formal education*. The Family Federation of Finland [Väestöliitto], The Population Research Institute, D 42/2004. Helsinki: Hakapaino.

Almlund, P. (2013). The unequal power relation in the final interpretation. *Qualitative Studies, 4*(1), 39-55.

Anderson, S., & Winefield, A. (2011). The impact of underemployment on psychological health, physical health and work attitudes. In D. Maynard & D. Feldman (Eds.), *Underemployment: Psychological, economic, and social challenges* (pp. 165-185). New York, NY: Springer.

Andersson Joona, P., Datta Gupta, N., & Wadensjö, E. (2012). *Overeducation among Immigrants in Sweden: Incidence, wage effects and state-dependence*. SULCIS Working Papers 2012:2. Stockholm University, Stockholm.

Anfara, V., Brown, K., & Mangione, T. (2002). Qualitative analysis on stage: Making the research process more public. *Educational Researcher, 31*(7), 28-38.

Anthias, F. (1998). Rethinking social divisions: Some notes towards a theoretical framework. *Sociological Review, 46*(3), 506-535.

Anthias, F. (2002). Where do I belong? Narrating collective identity and translocational positionality. *Ethnicities, 2*(4), 491-515.

Anthias, F. (2013). Intersectional what? Social divisions, intersectionality and levels of analysis. *Ethnicities, 13*(1), 3-19.

Anthias, F., & Lazaridis, G. (Eds). (2000). *Gender and migration in Southern Europe: Women on the move*. Oxford: Berg.

Anthias, F., & Yuval-Davis, N. (1983). Contextualising feminism: Ethnic, gender and class divisions. *Feminist Review, 15*, 62-75.

Anthias, F., & Yuval-Davis, N. (1992). *Racialised boundaries: Race, nation, gender, colour and class and the anti-racist struggle*. London: Routledge.

Antikainen, A. (1998). *Kasvatus, elämänkulku ja yhteiskunta*. Porvoo: WSOY.

Antikainen, A., Rinne, R., & Koski, L. (2006). *Kasvatussosiologia*. Helsinki: WSOY.

Antikainen, M. (2010). *Matkalla suomalaiseksi ja hoiva-alan ammattilaiseksi?: Venäläis- ja virolaistaustaisten naisten ja suomalaisuuden kohtaamiset kuulumista rakentamassa*. Väitöskirja: Helsingin yliopisto.

Anttonen, A., & Sipilä, J. (2000). *Suomalaista sosiaalipolitiikkaa*. Tampere: Vastapaino.

Anttonen, A. (1994). Hyvinvointivaltion naisystävälliset kasvot. Teoksessa A. Anttonen, L. Henriksson & R. Nätkin (toim.), *Naisten hyvinvontivaltio* (s. 203-226). Tampere:Vastapaino.

Anttonen, A. (1998). Vocabularies of citizenship and gender: Finland. *Critical Social Policy, 18*(3), 355-373.

Anttonen, A. (2003). Lastenhoidon kaksi maailmaa. Teoksessa H. Forsberg & R. Nätkin (toim.), *Perhe murroksessa. Kriittisen perhetutkimuksen jäljillä* (s. 159-185). Helsinki: Gaudeamus.

Anttonen, P. (2005). *Tradition through modernity: Postmodernism and the nation-state in folklore scholarship*. Helsinki: Finnish Literature Society.

Arai, M., Bursell, M., & Nekby, L. (2008). *Between meritocracy and ethnic discrimination: The gender difference*. SULCIS Working Paper 2008:2. Stockholm University, Stockholm.

Archer, L. (2010). 'We raised it with the Head': The educational practices of minority ethnic, middle-class families. *British Journal of Sociology of Education, 31*(4), 449-469.

Atkinson, R. (1998). *The life story interview*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Autto, J. (2007). Äitiyden muuttuva asema hyvinvointivaltion kansalaisuuden määrittelyissä. *Sosiologia, 44*(3), 204-217.

Aycan, Z., & Berry, J. (1996). Impact of employment related experiences in immigrants' psychological wellbeing and adaptation to Canada. *Canadian Journal of Behavioural Science, 28*, 240-251.

Ball, S. (2003). The risks of social reproduction: The middle class and education markets. *London Review of Education*, *1*(3), 163-175.

Ball, S. (2011). Social class, families and the politics of educational advantage: The work of Dennis Marsden. *British Journal of Sociology of Education, 32*(6), 957-965.

Ball, S., & Vincent, C. (2001). New class relations in education: The strategies of the 'fearful' middle classes. In J. Demaine (Ed.), *Sociology of Education Today* (pp. 180-195). Basingstoke: Palgrave.

Barrett, M., & Stauffer, S. (2009). Narrative inquiry: From story to method. In M. Barrett & S. Stauffer (Eds.), *Narrative inquiry in music education: Troubling certainty* (pp. 7-17). Dordrecht, The Netherlands: Springer.

Barron, P., & Arcodia, C. (2002). Linking learning style preferences and ethnicity: International students studying hospitality and tourism management in Australia. *Journal of Hospitality, Leisure, Sport &Tourism Education, 1*(2), 15-27.

Bassin, D., Honey, M., & Kaplan, M. (1994). Introduction. In D. Bassin, M. Honey & M. Kaplan (Eds.), *Representations of motherhood* (pp.1-25). New Haven, CT: Yale University.

Bauder, H. (2003). "Brain abuse," or the devaluation of immigrant labour in Canada. *Antipode, 35*,699-717.

Bauder, H. (2005). Habitus, rules of the labour market and employment strategies of immigrants in Vancouver, Canada. *Social & Cultural Geography, 6,* 81-97.

Bauder, H. (2006). *Labor Movement. How Migration Regulates Labor Markets*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Bekin, C. (2005). *Research ethics and fieldwork at new consumption communities*. Paper presented at the 4th International Critical Management Studies Conference. University of Cambridge. 4-6.7.2005, UK.

Bell, J. (2002). Narrative inquiry: More than just telling stories. *TESOL Quarterly, 36*(2), 207-213.

Bell, K. (2013). Young adult offending: Intersectionality of gender and race. *Critical Criminology, 21*(1), 103-212.

Bennett, M. (1986). A developmental approach to training for intercultural sensitivity. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations, 10*(2), 179-195.

Bennett, M. (1993). Toward a developmental model of intercultural sensitivity. In R. Paige (Ed.), *Education for the intercultural experience* (pp. 21-71). Yarmouth, ME: Intercultural Press.

Bennett, T., Emmison, M., & Frow, J. (1999). *Accounting for tastes: Australian everyday cultures*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Bertaux, D., & Kohli, M. (1984). The life story approach: A continental view. *Annual Review of Sociology, 10*, 215-237.

Bertrand, M., & Mullainathan, S. (2004). Are Emily and Greg more employable than Lakisha and Jamal? A field experiment on labor market discrimination. *American Economic Review, 94*(4), 991-1013.

Best, A. (2003). Doing race in the context of feminist interviewing: Constructing whiteness through talk. *Qualitative Inquiry, 9*(6), 895-914.

Bettie, J. (2003). *Women without class: Girls, race, and identity*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Bodovski, K. (2013). Adolescents' emerging habitus: The role of early parental expectations and practices. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, (ahead-of-print), 1-24.

Bond, M. (1996). Chinese values. In M. Bond (Ed.), *The handbook of Chinese psychology* (pp. 208-226). Hong Kong: Oxford University Press.

Booth, A., Leigh, A., & Varganova, E. (2010). *Does racial and ethnic discrimination vary across minority groups? Evidence from a field experiment*. CEPR Discussion Papers 7913. Centre for Economic Policy Research, London.

Bourdieu P. (2002). Habitus. In J. Hillier & E. Rooksby (Eds.), *Habitus: A sense of place* (pp. 27-34). Aldershot: Ashgate.

Bourdieu, P. (1973). Cultural reproduction and social reproduction. In R. Brown (Ed.), *Knowledge, education, and cultural change: Papers in the sociology of education* (pp. 71-112). London, UK: Tavistock.

Bourdieu, P. (1974). The school as a conservative force: Scholastic and cultural inequalities. In J. Eggleston (Ed.), *Contemporary research in the sociology of education* (pp. 32-46). London: Methuen.

Bourdieu, P. (1977). *Outline of a theory of practice* (R. Nice, Trans.). London: Cambridge University Press. (Original work published 1972).

Bourdieu, P. (1984). *Distinction: A social critique of the judgement of taste* (R. Nice, Trans.). Cambridge: Harvard University Press. (Original work published 1979).

Bourdieu, P. (1985). The social space and the genesis of groups. *Theory and Society, 14*, 723-744.

Bourdieu, P. (1986). The forms of capital. In J. Richardson (Ed.), *Handbook of Theory and Research for the Sociology of* Education (pp. 241-258). New York: Greenwood.

Bourdieu, P. (1987). What makes a social class? On the theoretical and practical existence of groups. *Berkeley Journal of Sociology 32*, 1-17.

Bourdieu, P. (1990). *The logic of practice*. Standford: Standford University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1994). *In other words: Essays towards a reflexive sociology* (M.Adamson, Trans.). Cambridge: Polity. (Original work published 1987).

Bourdieu, P. (1996). On the family as a realised category. *Theory, Culture and Society, 13*(3), 19-26.

Bourdieu, P. (1997). The forms of capital. In A. Halsey, H. Lauder, P. Brown & A. Wells (Eds.), *Education: Culture, economy and society* (pp. 46-58). Oxford/New York: Oxford University Press.

Bourdieu, P. (1998). *Practical reason: On the theory of action*. Cambridge: Polity Press.

Bourdieu, P. (2007). *Sketch for a self-analysis*. Chicago, IL: University of Chicago Press.

Bourdieu, P., & Boltanski, L. (1978). Changes in social structure and changes in demand for education. In S. Ginger & M. Archer (Eds.), *Contemporary Europe: Social structures and cultural patterns* (pp.197-227). London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Bourdieu, P., & Passeron, J. (1977). *Reproduction in education, society and culture*. Beverly Hills: Sage.

Bourdieu, P., & Wacquant, L. (1989). Towards a reflexive sociology: A workshop with Pierre Bourdieu. *Sociological Theory, 7*(1), 26-63.

Bourdieu, P., & Wacquant, L. (1992). *An Invitation to reflexive sociology*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Brah, A., & Phoenix, A. (2004). Ain't I a woman? Revisiting intersectionality. *Journal of International Women's Studies, 5*(3), 75-86.

Brantlinger, E., (2003). *Dividing classes: How the middle class negotiates and rationalizes school advantage*. London and New York: RoutledgeFalmer.

Braun, M., Lewin-Epstein, N., Stier, H., & Baumgärtner, M. (2008). Perceived equity in the gendered division of household labor. *Journal of Marriage and Family, 70*(5), 1145-1156.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology, 3*(2), 77-101.

Brodman S., & Polaveja J. (2011). Immigrants in Denmark: Access to employment, class attainment and earnings in a high-skilled economy. *International Migration, 49*(1), 58-90.

Brown, S., Small, R., & Lumley, J. (1997). Being a 'good mother', *Journal of Reproductive and Infant Psychology, 15*, 185-200.

Bursell, M. (2007). *What's in a name? A field experiment test for the existence of ethnic discrimination in the hiring process*. SULCIS Working Papers 2007:7, Stockholm University, Stockholm.

Carlsson, M. (2010). Experimental evidence of discrimination in the hiring of first-and second-generation immigrants. *Labour, 24*(3), 263-278.

Chan, S. (2004). The personal is political: Confucianism and liberal feminism. In D. Bell & H. Chaihark (Eds.), *The politics of affective relations: East Asia and beyond* (pp. 96-117). New York: Lexington Books.

Chan, T., & Boliver, V. (2012). *Social mobility over three generations in Finland: A critique*. Sociology Working Papers 2012-02, Department of Sociology. Oxford: University of Oxford.

Chang, H., & Holt, G. (1991). More than relationship: Chinese interaction and the principle of kuan-hsi. *Communication Quarterly, 39*(3), 251-271.

Chang, Y. (1994). Family studies in Taiwan: From the household to family relations. *Journal of Community Development, 68*, 35-40. (in Chinese)

Chao, R. (1996). Chinese and European American mothers' beliefs about the role of parenting in children's school success. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 27*(4), 403-423.

Chao, X. (2013). Class Habitus: Middle-class Chinese immigrant parents' investment in their newcomer adolescents' L2 acquisition and social integration. *Anthropology & Education Quarterly, 44*(1), 58-74.

Chen, F. (2000). *Working women and state policies in Taiwan: A study in political economy*. New York: Palgrave.

Chen, W., & Ho, H. (2012). The relation between perceived parental involvement and academic achievement: The roles of Taiwanese students' academic beliefs and filial piety. *International Journal of Psychology, 47*(4), 315-324

Chiang, L. (2000). Women in Taiwan: Linking economic prosperity and women's progress. In L. Edwards & M. Roces (Eds.), *Women in Asia: Tradition, modernity and globalization* (pp. 223-246). Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan.

Chiang, M., Huang, E., & Lin, C. (2005). The gender differences of parents' involvement in elementary school: The example of Kaohsiung. *Research on Education and Society, 8*(1), 81-114.

Chiswick, B., & Miller, P. (2007). *Modeling immigrants' language skills*. IZA Discussion Papers 2974, Institute for the Study of Labour (IZA). Retrieved from http://ideas.repec.org/p/iza/izadps/dp2974.html

Choo, H., & Ferree, M. (2010). Practicing intersectionality in sociological research: A critical analysis of inclusions, interactions, and institutions in the study of inequalities. *Sociological Theory, 28*(2), 129-149.

Chou, R., & Feagin, J. (2010). The myth of the model minority: Asian Americans facing racism. Boulder, CO: Paradigm.

Chow, S. (2007). The impact of filial piety and parental involvement on academic achievement motivation in Chinese secondary school students. *Asian Journal of Counselling, 14*(1-2), 91-124.

Chu, C., Xie, Y., & Yu, R. (2011). Coresidence with elderly parents: A comparative study of Southeast China and Taiwan. *Journal of Marriage, 73*(1),120-135.

Chuang, S. (2012). Different instructional preferences between Western and Far East Asian adult learners: A case study of graduate students in the USA. *Instructional Science, 40*(3), 477-492.

Chuang, Y. (2005). Effects of interaction pattern on family harmony and well-being: test of interpersonal theory, relational-models theory, and Confucian ethics. *Asian Journal of Social Psychology, 8,* 272-91.

CIMO. (2011). *Finland does well in international student barometer.* Retrieved from http://www.cimo.fi/news/other_current_issues/finland_does_well_in_isb

Clandinin, D. (2007). *Handbook of narrative inquiry: Mapping a methodology*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Clandinin, D., & Connelly, F. (2000). *Narrative inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research.* San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.

Clandinin, D., Pushor, D., & Orr, A. (2007). Navigating sites for narrative inquiry. *Journal of Teacher Education, 58*(1), 21-35.

Clarke, K. (ed). (2005). *Problematics of well-being: Experiences and expectations of migrants and new Finns in the Finnish welfare state*. Tampere: University of Tampere Department of Social Policy and Social Work.

Cole, E. (2009). Intersectionality and research in psychology. *American Psychologist, 63*, 170-180.

Collins, P. (1990). *Black feminist thought: Knowledge, consciousness, and the politics of empowerment.* Boston: UnwinHyman.

Collins, P. (1993). Toward a new vision: Race, class and gender as categories of analysis and connection. *Race, Sex & Class, 1*(1), 25-45.

Collins, P. (1994). Shifting the center: Race, class, and feminist theorizing about motherhood. In E. Glenn, G. Chang & L. Forcey (Eds.), *Mothering: Ideology, experience, and agency* (pp. 45-65). New York: Routledge.

Collins, P. (1997). On West and Fenstermaker's "Doing Difference", in M. Walsh (Ed.), *Women, men and gender: Ongoing debates* (pp. 73-75). New Haven & London: Yale University Press.

Collins, P. (2000a). It's all in the family: Intersections of gender, race, and nation. In U. Narayan & S. Harding (Eds.), *Decentering the center: Philosophy for a multicultural, postcolonial and feminist world* (pp. 156-176). Bloomington: Indiana University Press.

Collins, P. (2000b). *Black Feminist Thought*. New York: Routledge.

Connelly, F., & Clandinin, D. (2006). Narrative inquiry. In J. Green, G. Camilli & P. Elmore (Eds.), *Handbook of complementary methods in education research* (pp. 477-487). Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.

Copper, J. (1999). *Taiwan: Nation-State or Province?* (3rd eds). Boulder, CO: Westview.

Crenshaw, K. (1989). Demarginalizing the intersection of race and sex: A Black feminist critique of antidiscrimination doctrine, feminist theory and antiracist politics. *University of Chicago Legal Forum, 1989*, 139-168.

Crenshaw, K. (1995). Mapping the margins: Intersectionality, identity politics, and violence against women of color. In K. Crenshaw, N. Gotanda, G. Peller & K. Thomas (Eds.), *Critical race theory: The key writings that formed the movement* (pp. 357-384). New York: The New Press.

Crenshaw, K. (1997). Intersectionality and identity politics: Learning from violence against women of color. In M. Shanley & U. Narayan (Eds.), *Reconstructing political theory: Feminist perspectives* (pp. 178-193). Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Crenshaw, K. (2000). *Gender-Related aspects of race discrimination*. Paper presented at UN Expert Group Meeting on Gender and Racial Discrimination. 21-24.11.2000, Zagreb ,Croatia.

Crenshaw, K. (2011). Postscript. In H. Lutz, M. Herrera Vivar & L. Supic (Eds.), *Framing Intersectionality: Debates on a multi-faceted concept in gender studies* (pp. 221-233). Farnham: Ashgate.

Creswell, J. (1998). Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five traditions. Thousand. Oaks, CA: Sage.

Creswell, J. (2003). *Research design: Qualitative, quantitative, and mixed methods approaches* (2nd. ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Crompton, R. (2006). Class and family. *Sociological review, 54* (4), 658-677.

Daldy, B., Poot, J., & Roskruge, M. (2012). *Immigrant integration and workplace discrimination in New Zealand*. Paper presented at Economic Impacts of Immigration and Population Diversity International Workshop. 11-13.04.2012, University of Waikato, Hamilton.

Daly, M. (2001). *Care work: The quest for security*. Geneva: International Labour Office.

Davies, C. (1999). *Reflexive ethnography: A guide to researching selves and others*. London & New York: Routledge.

Davies, J., Weko, T., Kim, L., & Thulstrup, E. (2009). *OECD Reviews of tertiary education: Finland*. France: OECD Publishing.

Davis, K. (2008). Intersectionality as buzzword: A sociology of science perspective on what makes a feminist theory successful. *Feminist Theory, 9* (1), 67-85.

Davis, S., & Greenstein, T. (2004). Cross-National variation in the division of household labor. *Journal of Marriage and Family, 66,*1260-1271.

Day, S. (2012). A reflexive lens: Exploring dilemmas of qualitative methodology through the concept of reflexivity. *Qualitative Sociology Review, 8*(1), 60-85.

Denzin, N. (1989). *Interpretive Biography*. Illinois: Sage

Denzin, N. (1997). *Interpretive ethnography: Ethnographic practices for the 21st century*. London: Sage.

Dervin, F., Paatela-Nieminen, M., Kuoppala, K., & Riitaoja, A. (2012). Multicultural education in Finland: Renewed intercultural competences to the rescue? *International Journal of Multicultural Education, 14*(3). Retrieved from http://ijme-journal.org/index.php/ijme/article/view/564/784

DeVault, M. (1990). Talking and listening from women's standpoint: Feminist strategies from interviewing and analysis. *Social Problems*, *37*(1), 96-116.

DGBAS. (2011). *Social Indicators 2010*. Directorate-General of Budget, accounting and statistics, Executive Yuan, R.O.C (Taiwan). Taipei: Executive Yuan.

DGBAS. (2012). *Report on the manpower utilization survey 2011*. Directorate-General of Budget, accounting and statistics, Executive Yuan, R.O.C (Taiwan). Taipei: Executive Yuan.

DGBAS. (2013). *Report on employment and salary 2012*. Directorate-General of Budget, accounting and statistics, Executive Yuan, R.O.C (Taiwan). Taipei: Executive Yuan.

Dhamoon, R. (2011). Considerations on mainstreaming intersectionality. *Political Research Quarterly, 64*(1), 230-243.

Dill, B., & Zambrana, R., (Eds.). (2009). *Emerging intersections: Race, class, and gender in theory, policy, and practice*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press.

Dill, B., McLaughlin, A., & Nieves, A. (2007). Future directions of feminist research: Intersectionality. In S. Hesse-Biber (Ed.), *Handbook of feminist research: Theory and praxis* (pp. 629-637). Sage Publications.

Dossa, P. (2002). *Modernization and global restructuring of women's work: Border-crossing stories of Iranian women*. Metropolis Working Paper Series, no. 02-09. Vancouver, Vancouver Centre of Excellence, RUM. Retrieved from http://www.canada.metropolis.neti.

Dumais, S. (2002). Cultural capital, gender, and school success: The role of habitus. *Sociology of Education, 75*(1), 44-68.

Dumais, S. (2006). Early childhood cultural capital, parental Habitus, and teachers' perceptions. *Poetics, 34*,83-107.

Duncombe, J., & Jessop, J. (2002). "Doing rapport" and the ethics of "faking friendship". In M. Mauthner, M. Birch, J. Jessop & T. Miller (Eds.), *Ethics in qualitative research* (pp.107-122). London: Sage Publications.

Dutton, E. (2008). Battling to be European: Myth and the Finnish race debate. *Antrocom, 4*(2), 171-179.

Ehrenreich, B., & Hochschild, A. (2003). Introduction. In B. Ehrenreich & A. Hochschild (Eds.), *Global Woman. Nannies, Maids and Sex Workers in the New Economy* (pp. 1-14). London: Granta Books.

Ellingsæter, A. (2013). Scandinavian welfare states and gender (de)segregation: Recent trends and processes. *Economic and Industrial Democracy, 34*(3), 501-518.

Ellsworth, E. (1997). *Teaching positions: Difference, pedagogy, and the power of address*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Emirbayer, M., & Johnson, V. (2008). Bourdieu and organizational analysis. *Theory and Society, 37*(1), 1-44.

Erel, U. (2009). *Migrant women transforming citizenship: Life-stories from Britain and Germany*. Farnham: Ashgate.

Erel, U. (2010). Migrating cultural capital: Bourdieu in migration studies. *Sociology, 44*(4), 642-660.

Erel, U., Haritaworn, J., Rodríguez, E., & Klesse, C. (2010). On the depoliticisation of Intersectionality talk: Conceptualising multiple oppressions in critical sexuality studies. In Y. Taylor, S., Hines & M. Casey (Eds.), *Theorizing intersectionality and sexuality* (pp. 56-77). Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

Erez, E., Adelman, M., & Gregory, C. (2009). Intersections of immigration and domestic violence voices of battered immigrant women. *Feminist Criminology, 4*(1), 32-56.

Eräsaari, L. (2006). New Public Management on julkisen sektorin vääryyksien isä. Teoksessa T. Helne & M. Laatu (toim.), *Vääryyskirja* (s. 87-101). Helsinki: Kela.

Essers, C., Benschop, Y., & Doorewaard, H. (2010). Female ethnicity: Understanding Muslim immigrant businesswomen in the Netherlands. *Gender, Work & Organization, 17*(3), 320-339.

Etherington, K. (Ed.). (2003). *Trauma, the body and transformation: A Narrative inquiry*. London: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

European Commission. (2008). *Equality between women and men*. Brussels: Commission of the European Communities.

European Commission. (2009). *Gender segregation in the labour market: Root causes, implications and policy responses in the EU*. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union.

European Commission. (2012). Commission staff working document. Progress on equality between women and men in 2011. Brussels: Commission of the European Communities.

European Network of Migrant Women and European Women's Lobby. (2012). *Equal Rights. Equal Voices. Migrant women's integration in the labour market in six European cities: A comparative approach*. Retrieved from http://www.womenlobby.org/spip.php?article3343

Fan, Y. (2000). A classification of Chinese culture. *Cross Cultural Management: An International Journal, 7*(2), 3-10.

Fang, T., Samnani, A., Novicevic, M., & Bing, M. (2012). *Liability-of-foreignness effects on job success of immigrant job seekers*. IZA Discussion Paper No. 6742. Retrieved from http://ssrn.com/abstract=2119049

Farris, C., Lee, A., & Rubinstein, M. (Eds.). (2004). *Women in the new Taiwan. Gender roles and gender consciousness in a changing society*. New York: State University of New York Press.

Farris, S., & de Jong, S. (2013). Discontinuous intersections: Second-generation immigrant girls in transition from school to work. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, DOI: 10.1080/01419870.2013.774033

Feinstein, L., Duckworth, K., & Sabates, R. (2004). *A model of the inter-generational transmission of educational success (Vol. 10)*. Centre for Research on the Wider Benefits of Learning, Institute of Education, University of London.

Feldman, D., Leana, C., & Bolino, M. (2002). Underemployment and relative deprivation among re-employed executives. *Journal of Occupational and Organizational Psychology, 75*(4), 453-471.

Ferree, M. (2011). The discursive politics of feminist intersectionality. In H. Lutz, M. Herrera Vivar & L. Supic (Eds.), *Framing intersectionality: Debates on a multi-faceted concept in gender studies* (pp. 55-68). Farnham: Ashgate.

Finlay, L. (2002). Negotiating the swamp: The opportunity and challenge of reflexivity in research practice. *Qualitative Research, 2*(2), 209-230.

FINLEX. (2012). *Yhdenvertaisuuslaki (21/2004)*. Retrieved from http://www.finlex.fi/fi/laki/smur/2004/20040021

Fladmoe, A. (2012). Mass political polarization and attitudes towards education as part of the welfare state in Norway, Sweden and Finland. *Journal of European Social Policy, 22*(1), 45-62.

Folbre, N. (2004). A theory of the misallocation of time. In N. Folbre & M. Bittman (Eds.), *Family time: The social organisation of care* (pp. 7-24). New York: Routledge.

Forsander, A. (2000). Työvoiman tarve ja maahanmuuttopolitiikka – onko maahanmuuttajien osaaminen vastaus työvoiman kysyntään? Teoksessa M. Trux (toim.), *Aukeavat ovet – kulttuurien moninaisuus Suomen elinkeinoelämässä* (s. 143-202). Suomen itsenäisyyden juhlarahaston Sitran julkaisusarja (Sitra 238). Helsinki:WSOY.

Forsander, A. (2002a). *Luottamuksen ehdot: Maahanmuuttajat 1990-luvun suomalaisilla työmarkkinoilla*. Väestöntutkimuslaitoksen julkaisusarja D 39/2002. Helsinki: Väestöliitto.

Forsander, A. (2002b). Glocalizing capital and labor – old structures, new challenges. In A. Forsander (Ed.), *Immigration and economy in the globalization process: The case of Finland* (pp. 81-118). Helsinki: Sitra.

Forsander, A. (2003). Insiders or outsiders within? Immigrants in the Finnish labour market. *Yearbook of Population Research in Finland, 39*, 55-72.

Forsander, A. (2004a). *Labour market integration in the Nordic welfare state – does work make you into a real Finn?* Paper presented at the 13th Nordic Mifration Conference, The Academy of Migration Studies in Denmark. Retrieved from http://www.amiddk/ocs/viewabstract.php?id=140&cf=1

Forsander, A. (2004b). Maahanmuuton merkitys väestönkehityksen kannalta. Teoksessa M. Kautto (toim.), *Väestönkehitykseen vaikuttaminen – tulisiko syntyvyyttä ja maahanmuuttoa lisätä?*(s. 59-107). Tulevaisuusselonteon liiteraportti 2. Helsinki:Valtioneuvoston kanslia.

Forsander, A. (2007). Kotoutuminen sukupuolittuneille työmarkkinoille? Maahanmuuttajien työmarkkina-asema yli vuosikymmen Suomeen muuton jälkeen. Teoksessa T. Martikainen & M. Tiilikainen (toim.), *Maahanmuuttajanaiset: Kotoutuminen, perhe ja työ* (s. 312-334). Helsinki:Väestöliitto.

Forsander, A., & Alitolppa-Niitamo, A. (2000). *Maahanmuuttajien työllistyminen ja työhallinto – keitä, miten ja minne*. Työhallinon julkaisu 242. Helsinki: Työministriö.

Forsander, A., & Ekholm, E. (2001). Etniset ryhmät Suomessa. Teoksessa A. Forsander, E. Ekholm, P. Hautaniemi, A. Ali, A. Alitolppa-Niitamo, E. Kyntäjä & N. Quoc Cuong (toim.), *Monietnisyys ja työ* (s. 83-160). Helsinki: Palmenia.

Forsander, A., & Raunio, M. (2005). Globalisoituvat työmarkkinat – asiantuntijamaahanmuuttajat Suomessa. Teoksessa P. Pitkänen (toim.), *Kulttuurien välinen työ* (s. 26-53). Helsinki: Edita.

Forsander, A., Salmenhaara, P., Melegh, A., & Kondrateva, E. (2008). Economy, ethnicity and international migration: The comparison of Finland, Hungary and Russia. *Yearbook of population research in Finland, 43*, 85-114.

Forsberg, H. (2005). Finland's families. In B. Adams & J. Trost (Eds.), *Handbook of world families* (pp. 262-282). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Fraser, H. (2004). Doing narrative research analysing personal stories line by line. *Qualitative Social Work*, 3(2), 179-201.

Friedberg, R. (2000). You can't take it with you? Immigrant assimilation and the portability of human capital. *Journal of Labor Economics,18*(2), 221-251.

Fuchs, C. (2003). Some implications of Pierre Bourdieu's works for a theory of social self-organization. *European Journal of Social Theory, 6*(4), 387-408.

Gaddis, S. (2013). The influence of habitus in the relationship between cultural capital and academic achievement. *Social science research, 42*(1), 1-13.

Garry, A. (2012). Who is included? Intersectionality, metaphors and the multiplicity of gender. In A. Superson & S. Crasnow (Eds.), *Out from the shadows: Analytical feminist contributions to traditional philosophy* (pp. 493-531). New York: Oxford University.

Gill, P. (2001). Narrative inquiry: Designing the processes, pathways and patterns of change. *Systems Research and Behavioural Science, 18*(4), 335-344.

Girard, E., & Bauder, H. (2007). Assimilation and exclusion of foreign trained engineers in Canada: Inside a professional regulatory organization. *Antipode, 39*(5), 35-53.

Glover, C., & Stover, K. (2011). Starting with young learners: Using critical literacy to contest power and privilege in educational settings. In G. Wiggan (Ed.), *Power, privilege, and education: Pedagogy, curriculum, and student outcomes* (pp. 9-28). Publisher: Nova Science Pub Inc.

Gomez, M. (1997). Definition of narrative inquiry. In C. Grant & G. Ladson-Billings (Eds.). *Dictionary of multicultural education* (p. 35). New York, NY: The Oryx Press.

Gordon, T. (1990). *Feminist mothers.* London: Macmillan.

Gordon, T., Holland, J., & Lahelma, E. (2000). *Making spaces: Citizenship and difference in schools*. New York: St. Martin's Press.

Graeffe, L., & Lestinen, L. (2011). Towards multicultural education in Finland In J. Spinthourakis, J. Lalor & W. Berg (Eds.), *Cultural diversity in the classroom: A European comparison* (pp. 109-128). Wiesbaden: VS Verlag für Sozialwissenschaften.

Grant, K., & Ray, J. (2010). *Home, school, and community collaboration: Culturally responsive family involvement*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage Publications.

Graue, M. (1993). Social networks and home-school relations. *Educational Policy, 7*(4), 466-490.

Green, A., & Green, D. (1999). The economic goals of Canada's immigration policy. *Canadian Public Policy, 25,* 425-451.

Green, C., Kler, P., & Leeves, G. (2007). Immigrant overeducation: Evidence from recent arrivals to Australia. *Economics of Education Review, 26*(4), 420-432.

Griffith, A., & Smith, D. (2005). *Mothering for schooling*. New York: Routledge Falmer.

Gudmundsdottir, S. (1997). Introduction to the theme issue of "narrative perspectives on research on teaching and teacher education." *Teaching and Teacher Education, 13*(1), 1-3.

Gudmundsdottir, S. (2001). Narrative research on school practice. In V. Richardson (Ed.), *Fourth handbook for research on teaching* (pp. 226-240). New York: MacMillan.

Haataja, A. & Mattila-Wiro, P. (2006). *Impact of alternative benefit levels and parental choices on the parents' income. Microsimulation approach on the Finnish parental leave.* Discussion Papers 399. Helsinki:VATT.

Haavisto, I. (2012). Ovi raottuu - suomalaisten maahanmuuttoasenteet 2012. Helsinki: EVA.

Habti, D. (2012). *Highly skilled mobility and migration from MENA region to Finland: A socio-analytical approach*. Unpublished doctoral Dissertation. University of Eastern Finland, Joensuu, Kuopio, & Savonlinna.

Hadley, K. (2003). Children's word play: Resisting and accommodating Confucian values in a Taiwanese Kindergarten classroom. *Sociology of Education, 76*, 193-208.

Haikkola, L. (2011). Transnational and local negotiations of identity: Experiences from second-generation young people in Finland. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research, 1*(3), 156-165.

Hall, S. (2011). Educational ties, social capital and the translocal (re)production of MBA alumni networks. *Global Networks, 11*(1), 118-138.

Hainmueller, J., & Hiscox, M. (2007). Educated preferences: Explaining attitudes toward immigration in Europe. *International Organization, 61*(2), 399-442

Hancock, A. (2007). When multiplication doesn't equal quick addition: Examining intersectionality as a research paradigm. *Perspectives in Politics, 5,* 63-79.

Harding, S. (1991). *Whose science? Whose knowledge? Thinking about women's Lives*. New York: Cornell University Press.

Harding, S. (1993). Rethinking standpoint epistemology: What is 'strong objectivity'? In L. Alcoff & E. Potter (Eds.), *Feminist epistemologies* (pp. 49-82). New York: Routledge.

Harding, S. (2004). Introduction: Standpoint theory as a site of political, philosophic, and scientific debate. In S. Harding (Ed.), *The feminist standpoint theory reader: Intellectual and political controversies* (pp. 1-16). New York: Routledge.

Harris, A., & Goodall, J. (2008). Do parents know they matter? Engaging all parents in learning. *Educational Research, 50*(3), 277-289.

Hartikainen, M. (2006). *Thaimaalaisten naisten kokemuksia parisuhdeväkivallasta ja avunsaamisesta Suomessa*. Helsinki: Ensi- ja turvakotien liitto ry.

Hartsock, N. (1998). *The feminist standpoint revisited and other essays*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Hatch, J. (2002). *Doing qualitative research in education settings*. Albany NY: State University of New York Press.

Hausmann, R., Tyson, L., & Zahidi, S. (2012). *The global gender gap report 2012. World Economic Forum*. Retrieved from http://www.weforum.org/issues/global-gender-gap

Hautaniemi, P. (2004). *Pojat! Somalipoikien kiistanalainen nuoruus Suomessa*. Helsinki: Nuorisotutkimusverkosto.

Hays, S. (1996). *The cultural contradictions of motherhood*. New Haven, CT: Yale University Press.

Heckmann, F. (2008). *Education and migration: Strategies for integrating migrant children in European schools and societies*. Brussels: Commission of the European Communities. Retrieved from http://www.nesse.fr/nesse/activities/reports/activities/reports/education-and-migration-pdf

Heikkilä, E. (2005). Mobile vulnerabilities: Perspectives on the vulnerabilities of immigrants in the Finnish labour market. *Population, Space and Place,11*, 485-497.

Heikkilä, E. (2011a). Multicultural marriages and their dynamics in Finland. In E. Heikkilä & Y. Brenda (Eds.), *International marriages in the time of globalization* (pp. 89-102). New York: Nova Science Publishers, Inc.

Heikkilä, E. (2011b). Finns abroad- the profile of emigrants and their thoughts about returning to Finland. In E. Heikkilä & S. Koikkalainen (Eds.), *Finns abroad- new forms of mobility and migration*. Migration Studies C 21. Turku: Institute of Migration.

Heikkilä, E. (toim.). (2008). *Monikulttuuriset avioliitot sillanrakentajina. Vuoden 2007 seminaariraportti*. Siirtolaisuusinstituutti, Web Reports 32. Turku: Siirtolaisinstituutti.

Heikkilä, E. (2012). *Labour market participation of immigrants in Finland and its regions*. Paper presented at the European Social Science History Conference 11-14.4.2012. Glasgow, Scotland, UK.

Heikkilä, E., & Pikkarainen, M. (2008). *Väestön ja työvoiman kansainvälistyminen nyt ja tulevaisuudessa*. Turku:Siirtolaisuusinstituutti.

Heiskanen, T., & Räsänen, L. (1997). Changing gendered practices. In L. Rantalaiho & T. Heiskanen (Eds.), *Gendered practices in working life*. London and New York: Macmillan Press Ltd.

Hennessy, R. (1993). Women's lives/feminist knowledge: Feminist standpoint as ideology critique. *Hypatia, 8*(1), 14-34.

Henwood, K., & Pidgeon, N. (1995). Remaking the link: Qualitative research and feminist standpoint theory. *Feminism & Psychology, 5*, 7-30.

Heponiemi, T., Wahlström, M., Elovainio, M., Sinervo, T., Aalto, A., & Keskimäki, I. (2008). *Katsaus työttömyyden ja terveyden välisiin yhteyksiin*. Helsinki: Työ- ja elinkeinoministeriö.

Hertz, R. (Ed.). (1997). *Reflexivity and voice*. London: Sage.

Ho, D. (1994). Filial piety, authoritarian moralism, and cognitive conservatism in Chinese societies. *Genetic, Social, and General Psychology Monographs, 120*(3), 347-365.

Ho, D. (1996). Filial piety and its psychological consequences. In M. H. Bond (Ed.), *The handbook of Chinese psychology* (pp. 155-165). Hong Kong: Oxford University Press.

Ho, H., Chen, W., & Kung, H. (2008). Taiwan. In I. Epstein (General Ed.) & J. Pattanaik (Section Ed.), *The Greenwood encyclopedia of children's issues worldwide: Asia and Oceania* (pp. 439-464). Westport, CT: Greenwood Press.

Hochschild, A. (1989). *The second shift*. New York: Viking.

Hochschild, A. (2003). *The commercialization of intimate life: Notes from home and work*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Hofstede, G., & Hofstede, G. (2005). *Cultures and organizations - software of the mind* (2 ed.). New York: McGraw-Hill.

Hofstede, G. (2001). *Culture's consequences: Comparing values, behaviors, institutions, and organizations across nations* (2nd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Holloway, S., & Pimlott-Wilson, H. (2013). Parental involvement in children's learning: Mothers' fourth shift, social class, and the growth of state intervention in family life. *The Canadian Geographer/Le Géographe canadien, 57*(2),1-10.

Holm, G., & Londen, M. (2010). The discourse on multicultural education in Finland: Education for whom? *Intercultural Education, 21*(2), 107-120.

Holstein, J., & Gubrium. J. (2000). *The self we live by: Narrative identity in a postmodern world*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Holvino, E. (2010). Intersections: The simultaneity of race, gender and class in organization studies. *Gender, Work and Organization, 17*(3), 248-77.

hooks, b. (1981). *Ain't I a woman. Black women and feminism*. Boston: South End Press.

hooks, b. (1984). *Feminist theory: From margin to center*. Cambridge: South End Press.

hooks, b. (1992). *Black looks: Race and representation*. Boston: South End Press.

Hoover-Dempsey, K., Bassler, O., & Burow, R. (1995). Parent involvement in elementary children's homework: Parameters of reported strategy and practice. *Elementary School Journal, 95,* 435-450.

Hornby, G. (2011). *Parental involvement in childhood education: Building effective school-family partnerships*. New York: Springer.

Hossain, Z., & Anziano, M. C. (2008). Mothers' and fathers' involvement with school-age children's care and academic activities in Navajo Indian families. *Cultural Diversity and Ethnic Minority Psychology, 14*(2), 109-117.

Hou, S. (2002). *The study of school effectiveness, parental expectancy and involvement in elementary schooling*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. National Taiwan Normal University, Taipei. In Chinese.

Hsieh, M. (2004). Teaching practices in Taiwan's education for young children: Complexity and ambiguity of developmentally appropriate practices and/ or developmentally inappropriate practices. *Contemporary Issues in Early Childhood*, *5*(3), 309-329.

Hsu, H., Zhang, D., Kwok, O., & Li, Y. (2011). Distinguishing the influences of father and mother's involvement on adolescent academic achievement: Analyses of Taiwan education panel survey data. *Journal of Early Adolescence, 31*, 694-714.

Hu, C., & Kamo, Y. (2007). The division of household labor in Taiwan. *Journal of Comparative Family Studies, 38*(1),105-124.

Huddleston, T., Niessen, J., Chaoimh, E., & White, E. (2011). *Migrant integration policy index III*. Brussels: British Council and Migration Policy Group.

Hung, C. (2007). Family, schools and Taiwanese children's outcomes. *Educational Research, 49*(2), 115-125.

Huntsinger, C., & Jose, P. (2009). Parental involvement in children's schooling: Different meanings in different cultures. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 24*(4), 398-410.

Huntsinger, C., Jose, P., Larson, S., Krieg, D., & Shaligram, C. (2000). Mathematics, vocabulary, and reading development in Chinese American and European American children over the primary school years. *Journal of Educational Psychology, 92*(4), 745-760.

Hurtado, P. (2010). Assessing the use of Bourdieu's key concepts in the strategy-as-practice field. *Competitiveness Review An International Business Journal, 20*(1), 52-61.

Huttunen, L. (2004). Kasvoton ulkomaalainen ja kokonainen ihminen. Marginalisoiva kategorisointi ja maahanmuuttajien vastastrategiat. Teoksessa A. Jokinen, L. Huttunen & A. Kulmala (toim.), *Puhua vastaan ja vaieta. Neuvottelu kulttuurisista marginaaleista* (s. 134-154). Tampere: Gaudeamus.

Huttunen, L. (2009). Mikä ihmeen maahanmuuttaja?. Teoksessa S. Keskinen, A. Rastas & S. Tuori (toim.), *En ole rasisti mutta... Maahanmuutosta, monikulttuurisuudesta ja kritiikistä* (s. 117-122). Tampere: Vastapaino.

Hwang, K. (1985). Face and favor: The Chinese power games. *American Journal of Sociology*, 92(4), 994-974.

Hwang, K. (1988). *Confucianism and East Asian modernization*. Taipei: Liwen Publishing. (in Chinese)

Hwang, K. (1998). Two moralities: Reinterpreting the finding of empirical research on moral reasoning in Taiwan. *Asian Journal of Social Psychology, 1*(3), 211-238.

Jaakkola, M. (2005). *Suomalaisten Suhtautuminen Maahanmuuttajiin Vuosina 1987-2003*, Työpoliittinen Tutkimus 286. Helsinki: Työministeriö.

Jaakkola, M. (2009). *Maahanmuuttajat suomalaisten näkökulmasta. Asennemuutokset 1987-2007.* Tutkimuksia 2009/1. Helsinki: Helsingin kaupungin tietokeskus.

Jaakkola, M., & Reuter, A. (2007). Maahanmuuttajanaiset entisen Neuvostoliiton alueelta: Resurssit ja sijoittuminen työmarkkinoille. Teoksessa T. Martikainen & M. Tiilikainen (toim.), *Maahanmuuttajanaiset: Kotoutuminen, perhe ja työ* (s. 335-358). Helsinki:Väestöliitto.

Jackson, B., & Marsden, D. (1962). *Education and the working class*. London: Routledge and Kegan.

Jai, B., & Kuo, C. (2012). The class-reproduction phenomena of the cram school activities among Taiwanese children at the primary school level. *Zhishan General Education, 12*, 3-28. (in Chinese)

Janhonen-Abruquah, H. (2010). *Gone with the wind? Immigrant women and transnational everyday life in Finland*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of Helsinki, Finland.

Jao, Y., & Li, J. (2012). Trends in the employment of married mothers of preschool-aged children in Taiwan. *Chinese Sociology & Anthropology, 44*(4), 5-26.

Jarman, J., Blackburn, R., & Racko, G. (2012). The dimensions of occupational gender segregation in industrial countries. *Sociology, 46*(6), 1003-1019.

Jasinskaja-Lahti, I. (2008). Long-term immigrant adaptation: Eight-year follow-up study among immigrants from Russia and Estonia living in Finland. *International Journal of Psychology, 43*(1), 6-18.

Jasinskaja-Lahti, I., & Liebkind, K. (1997). *Maahanmuuttajien sopeutuminen pääkaupunkiseudulla. Sosiaalipsykologinen näkökulma*. Helsinki: Helsingin kaupungin tietokeskus.

Jasinskaja-Lahti, I., Liebkind, K., & Perhoniemi, R. (2007). Perceived ethnic discrimination at work and well-being of immigrants in Finland: The moderating role of employment status and work-specific group-level control beliefs. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations, 31*(2), 223-242.

Jasinskaja-Lahti, I., Liebkind, K., & Vesala, T. (2002). *Rasismi ja syrjintä Suomessa. Maahanmuuttajien kokemuksia*. Helsinki: Gaudeamus.

Johansson, E. (2008). *Does Finland suffer from brain drain?* Discussion papers 1153. Helsinki: ETLA.

Jones-Johnson, G. & Johnson, W. (1991). Subjective underemployment and psychological stress: the role of perceived social and supervisor support. *Journal of Social Psychology*, 132, 11-21.

Joronen, M., & Salonen, A. (2006). Rasismi ja etninen syrjintä - ajatuksia ja tekoja. Teoksessa A. Salonen & S. Villa (toim.), *Rasismi ja etninen syrjintä Suomessa 2005* (s.15-73). Helsinki: Ihmisoikeusliitto.

Joronen, T. (2005). Työ on kahden kauppa – maahanmuuttajien työmarkkina – aseman ongelmia. Teoksessa S. Paananen (toim.), *Maahanmuuttajien elämää Suomessa* (s. 59-82). Tilastokeskus, Helsinki.

Jose, P., Huntsinger, C., Huntsinger, P., & Liaw, F. (2000). Parental values and practices relevant to young children's social development in Taiwan and the United States. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 31*(6), 677-702.

Judkins, B., & LaHurd, R. (1999). Building community from diversity. *American Behavioral Scientist, 42*(5), 786-799.

Julkunen, R. (1995). Työssäkäyvän äidin julkiset ja yksityiset suhteet. Teoksessa L. Eräsaari, R. Julkunen & H. Silius (toim.), *Naiset yksityisen ja julkisen rajalla* (s. 88-107). Tampere: Vastapaino.

Jæger, M. (2009). Equal access but unequal outcomes: Cultural capital and educational choice in a meritocratic society. *Social Forces, 87*(4), 1943-1971.

Jääskeläinen, A. (2003). Intermarriage and segmented integration into Finnish society: Immigrant women from the former Soviet Union. *Yearbook of Population Research in Finland. 39*, 33-54.

Kaas, L., & Manger, C. (2012). Ethnic discrimination in Germany's labour market: A field experiment. *German Economic Review, 13*,1-20.

Kan, K., & Tsai, W. (2005). Parenting practices and children's education outcomes. *Economics of Education Review, 24*(1), 29-43.

Kangasniemi, M., & Kauhanen, M. (2013). *Characteristics and labour market performance of the new member state immigrants in Finland, Germany, the Netherlands and the United Kingdom after the enlargement of 2004*. Discussion Paper No. 2013-02. Norface Research Programme on Migration, Department of Economics, University College London.

Kasanen, K., & Räty, H. (2008). Do the very best you can: The third-grade class test. *Social Psychology of Education, 11*, 193-208.

Kashima, E., & Loh, E. (2006). International students' acculturation: Effects of international, conational, and local ties and need for closure. *International Journal of Intercultural Relations, 30*(4), 471-485.

Katila, S., & Wahlbeck, Ö. (2011). The role of (transnational) social capital in the start-up processes of immigrant businesses: The case of Chinese and Turkish restaurant businesses in Finland. *International Small Business Journal, 30*(3), 294-309.

Kautto, M, Fritzell, J., Hvinden, B., Kvist, J. & Uusitalo, H. (Eds.). (2001). *Nordic Welfare States in the European Context*, London: Routledge.

Keating, A. (2009). From intersections to interconnections: Lessons for transformation from The Bridge Called My Back: Radical Writings by Women of Color. In M. Berger & K. Guidroz (Eds.), *The intersectional approach* (pp. 81-99). Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press.

Keski-Nisula, K. (2007). *Maahanmuuttajien integraatio Turun työmarkkinoille: Työllisty- neiden näkökulma*. Turku: Turun yliopiston maantieteen laitos.

Keskinen, S. & Vuori, J. (2012). Erot, kuuluminen ja osallisuus hyvinvointiyhteiskunnassa. Teoksessa S. Keskinen, J. Vuori & A. Hirsiaho (toim.), *Monikulttuurisuuden sukupuoli: Kansalaisuus ja erot hyvinvointiyhteiskunnassa* (s. 7-35). Tampere: Tampere University Press.

Kilpi-Jakonen, E. (2011). Continuation to upper secondary education in Finland: Children of immigrants and the majority compared. *Acta Sociologica, 54*(1), 77-106.

Kilpi-Jakonen, E. (2012). Does Finnish educational equality extend to children of immigrants? Examining national origin, gender and the relative importance of parental resources. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research, 2*(2), 167-181.

King, D. (1988). Multiple jeopardy, multiple consciousness: The context of a black feminist ideology. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society, 14*, 42-72.

Kinnunen, U., & Mauno, S. (1998). Antecedents and outcomes of work-family conflict among employed women and men in Finland. *Human Relations, 51*(2), 157-177.

Kivinen, O., & Nurmi, J. (2009). Sukupuolten keskinäissuhteet korkeakoulutuksessa ja työmarkkinoilla – eurooppalainen vertailu. *Yhteiskuntapolitiikka, 74*(2), 149-157.

Kivisto, P., & Leinonen, J. (2011). Representing race: Ongoing uncertainties about Finnish American racial identity. *Journal of American Ethnic History, 31*(1), 11-33.

Klemelä, K., Tuittu, A., Virta, A., & Rinne, R. (toim.). (2011). *Monikulttuurinen koulu oppilaiden, vanhempien, opettajien ja rehtoreiden kokemana*. Turku: Turun yliopiston kasvatustieteiden tiedekunta.

Knapp, G. (2011). Intersectional invisibility: Inquiries into a concept of intersectionality studies. In H. Lutz, M. Herrera Vivar & L. Supic (Eds.), *Framing intersectionality: Debates on a multi-faceted concept in gender studies* (pp. 187-206). Farnham: Ashgate.

Knapp, K. (2005). *Selfless offspring: Filial children and social order in Medieval China*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press.

Knodel, J., & Ofstedal, M. (2002). Patterns and determinants of living arrangements. In A. Hermalin (Ed.), *The well-being of the elderly in Asia: A four-country comparative study* (pp. 143-184). Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Koikkalainen, S. (2011). *Free movement in Europe: Past and present. Migration information source*. Washington, DC: Migration Policy Institute. Retrieved from http://www.migrationinformation.org/Feature/display.cfm?ID=836

Koikkalainen, S., Tammilehto, T., Kangas, O., Katisko, M., Koskinen, S., & Suikkanen, A. (2011). Welfare or work: Migrants' selective integration in Finland. In E. Carmel, A. Cerami & T. Papadopoulos (Eds.), *Migration and welfare in the new Europe: Social protection and the challenges of integration* (pp. 143-158). Bristol: Policy Press.

Komulainen, S. (2012). 'White flight' in Finland? A qualitative study on Finnish-born families' housing and school choices in Turku. *Finnish Yearbook of Population Research XLVII,* 51-64.

Kopsa-Schön, T. (1996). *Kulttuuri-identiteetin jäljillä. Suomen romanien kulttuuriidentiteetistä 1980-luvun alussa*. Helsinki: Suomalaisen Kirjallisuuden Seura.161

Korkeamäki, O., & Kyyrä, T. (2005). *The gender wage gap and sex segregation in Finland***.** Finnish Economic Papers 2/2005. Helsinki: Government Institute for Economic Research (VATT). Retrieved from http://www.taloustieteellinenyhdistys.fi/images/stories/fep/fep22005_korkeamaki.pdf

Kortteinen, M., & Tuomikoski, H. (1998). *Työtön. Tutkimus pitkäaikaistyöttömien selviytymisestä.* Helsinki:Tammi.

Korvajärvi, P. (2010). Sukupuolistunut ja sukupuolistava työ. Teoksessa T. Saresma, L. Rossi & T. Juvonen (toim.), *Käsikirja sukupuoleen* (s. 183-196). Tampere: Vastapaino.

Koskela, K. (2010). New explorations in Finnish migration studies: The emerging case of the skilled migrants. *Emigrinter, 5*, 57-67. Retrieved from http://www.mshs.univ-poitiers.fr/migrinter/e-migrinter/201005/e-igrinter2010_05_057.pdf.

Koskela, K. (2011). *Identity negotiations and the "migrant elite": Experiences of highly-skilled migrants in Finland.* Paper presented at the post-graduate seminar, Department of Social Studies, Helsinki. Research synopsis for the EDMIDI Summer Programme 27.06.2010-09.07.2010. University of Southern Denmark, Odense.

Koulutuksellisen tasa-arvon toimenpideohjelman työryhmä. (2012). *Ehdotus valtioneuvoston strategiaksi koulutuksellisen tasa-arvon edistämiseksi.* Opetus- ja kulttuuriministeriön työryhmämuistioita ja selvityksiä 2012: 28. Helsinki: Opetus- ja kulttuuriministeriö.

Kovalainen, A. (2004). Hyvinvointipalvelujen markkinoituminen ja sukupuolisopimuksen muutos. Teoksessa L. Henriksson & S. Wrede (toim.), *Hyvinvointityön ammatit* (s.187-209). Helsinki: Gaudeamus.

Kraaykamp, G., & Van Eijck, K. (2010). The intergenerational reproduction of cultural capital: A threefold perspective. *Social Forces, 89*(1), 209-231.

Krais, B. (2006). Gender, sociological theory and Bourdieu's sociology of practice. Theory. *Culture & Society, 23*(6), 119-34.

Kramp, M. (2004). Exploring life and experience through narrative inquiry. In K. Marrais & S. Lapan (Eds.), *Foundations for research: Methods in education and the social sciences* (pp.103-121). Mahwah, NJ: Erlbaum.

Krutova, O. (2011). Initial labour integration of Russian-speaking students in Finland. *Siirtolaisuus-Migration, 38*(4), 3-12.

Kröger, T., Anttonen, A., & Sipilä, J. (2003). Social care in Finland: Stronger and weaker forms of universalism. In A. Anttonen, J. Baldock & J. Sipilä (Eds.), *The young, the old and the state: Social care systems in five industrial nations* (pp. 25-54). Edward Elger: Cheltenham.

Kuan, P. (2006). Class identification in Taiwan: A latent class analysis. *Taiwanese Journal of Sociology, 37*, 169-206.

Kupiainen, S., Hautamäki, J., & Karjalainen, T. (2009). *The Finnish education system and PISA. Helsinki: Ministry of Education*. Retrieved from http://www.pisa2006.helsinki.fi/files/The_Finnish_education_system_and_PISA.pdf

Kuronen, M. (1999). *The social organisation of motherhood – Advice giving in maternity and child health care in Scotland and Finland*. Unpublished Doctoral Thesis, University of Stirling.

Kuronen, M. (2001). Motherhood in family context – comparing professional practices in maternity and child care in Finland and Scotland. In I. Söderling (Ed.), *Yearbook of Population Research in Finland XXXVII 2001* (pp. 5-22). Helsinki: The Population Research Institute.

Kuusela, J., Etelälahti, A., Hagman, Å., Hievanen, R., Karppinen, K., Nissilä, L. Rönnberg, U., & Siniharju, M. (2008). *Maahanmuuttajaoppilaat ja koulutus – tutkimus oppimistuloksista, koulutusvalinnoista ja työllistymisestä*. *Opetushallitus*. Helsinki: Edita.

Kvale, S. (2007). *Doing Interviews*. London: Sage.

Kwan, V., Bond, M., & Singelis, T. (1997). Pancultural explanations for life satisfaction: Adding relationship harmony to self-esteem. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 73,*1038–1051.

Kyhä, H. (2011). *Koulutetut maahanmuuttajat työmarkkinoilla. Tutkimus korkeakoulututkinnon suorittaneiden maahanmuuttajien työllistymisestä ja työurien alusta Suomessa*. Väitöskirja. Turun yliopisto,Turku.

Kynsilehto, A. (2011). *Moniäänisyyden politiikka. Kohtaamisia pohjois-afrikkalaisten naisten kanssa Ranskassa*. Väitöskirja. Tampereen yliopisto, Tampere.

Kyrö, M., & Nyyssölä, K. (2006). Attitudes towards education in Finland and other Nordic countries. *European Journal of Education, 41*, 59-70.

Kyrönlampi-Kylmänen, T., & Määttä, K. (2012). Children's and parent's experiences on everyday life and home/work balance in Finland. *International Journal of Child, Youth and Family Studies, 3*(1), 46-64.

Känsälä, M. (2012). *Työura ja parisuhde – erilliset yhdessä? Työn ja muun elämän yhteensovittaminen kahden uran pariskunnilla.* Väitöskirja: Turun yliopisto.

Kärkkäinen, R., Räty, H., & Kasanen, K. (2009). Parents' perceptions of their child's resilience and competence. *European Journal of Psychology of Education*, 24, 405-419.

Kääriäinen, K., Niemelä, K., & Ketola, K. (2005). *Religion in Finland: Decline, change and transformation of Finnish religiousity*. Tampere: Church Research Institute.

Laabs, J. (1993). The sticky floor beneath the glass ceiling. *Personnel Journal, 72*(5), 35-39.

Ladd, P., & Ruby, R. (1999). Learning style and adjustment issues of international students. *Journal of Education for Business, 74*(6), 363-367.

Laine, L., & Kujanpää, A. (2008). *Ulkomaalainen työntekijä työnantajan silmin*. Opinnäytetyö, Turun Ammattikorkeakoulu.

Lainiala, L. (2010). *Perhepolitiikan uudet tuulet – Perheen paluu.* Perhebarometri 2010. Väestöntutkimuslaitos. Katsauksia E 39/2010. Helsinki: Väestöliitto.

Lainiala, L., & Säävälä, M. (2012). *Rakkautta, rikkautta ja ristiriitoja. Suomalaisten solmimat kaksikulttuuriset avioliitot. Perhebarometri 2012.* Helsinki: Väestöliitto.

Lammi-Taskula, J. (2004). Äidit työmarkkinoilla – kahden kerroksen väkeä? *Yhteiskuntapolitiikka, 69*(2), 202-206.

Lamont, M., & Lareau, A. (1988). Cultural capital: Allusions, gaps and glissandos in recent theoretical developments. *Sociological Theory, 6*(2): 153-168.

Lan, P. (2008). Migrant women's bodies as boundary markers: Reproductive crisis and sexual control in the new ethnic frontiers of Taiwan. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society, 33*, 833-861.

Lanzieri, G. (2012). Merging populations. A look at marriages with foreign-born persons in European countries. *Statistics in focus 29/2012.* Retrieved from http://epp.eurostat.ec.europa.eu/portal/page/portal/product_details/publication?p_product_code=KS-SF-12-029

Lappalainen, S. (2002). Eskarissa eurokuntoon – esiopetus (suomalais) kansallisena projektina. Teoksessa T. Gordon, K. Komulainen & K. Lempiäinen (toim.), *Suomineitonen hei! Kansallisuuden sukupuoli* (s. 230-245). Tampere: Vastapaino.

Lappalainen, S. (2006). Kansallisuus, Etnisyys ja Sukupuoli Lasten Välisissä Suhteissa ja Esiopetuksen Käytännöissä. Helsinki: Yliopistopaino.

Lareau, A. (1989). *Home advantage: Social class and parental intervention in elementary education*. New York: Falmer Press.

Lareau, A. (2003). *Unequal childhoods: Class, race, and family life*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Lareau, A. (2008). Watching, waiting and deciding when to intervene: Race, class and the transmission of advantage. In L. Weis (Ed.), *The way class works* (pp.117-133). New York: Routledge.

Lareau, A. (2011). *Unequal childhoods: Class, race, and family life, second edition with an update a decade later*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

Lareau, A., & Horvat, E. (1999). Moments of social inclusion and exclusion. Race, class, and cultural capital on family-school Relationships. *Sociology of Education, 72*(1), 37-53.

Lareau, A., & Shutz, J. (1996). *Journeys through ethnography: Realistic accounts of fieldwork*. Boulder, CO: Westview Press.

Lareau, A., & Weininger, E. (2003). Cultural capital in education research: A critical assessment. *Theory and Society, 32*(5/6), 567-606.

Lareau, A., & Weininger, E. (2008). Class and the transition to adulthood. In A. Lareau & D. Conley (Eds.), *Social class: How does it work* (pp. 118-151). New York: Russell Sage Foundation.

Larja, L., Warius, J., Sundbäck, L., Liebkind, K., Kandolin, I., & Jasinskaja-Lahti, I. (2012). *Discrimination in the Finnish Labor Market: An overview and a field experiment on recruitment*. Helsinki: Ministry of Employment and the Economy.

Law & Regulations ROC. (2012). *Law and regulations database ROC (Taiwan).* Retrieved from http://law.moj.gov.tw/

Lee, I. (2013). Perceptions of success and life satisfaction: A gender examination in Taiwan. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology, 43*, 446-455.

Lee, I., & Tan, J. (2012). Filial ethics and judgments of filial behaviour in Taiwan and the United States. *International Journal of Psychology, 47*(3), 161-168.

Lee, I., Pratto, F., & Li, M. (2007). Social relationships and sexism in the United States and Taiwan. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 38*(5), 595-612.

Lee, J., & Bowen, N. (2006). Parent involvement, cultural capital, and the achievement gap among elementary school children. *American Educational Research Journal, 43*(2), 193-218.

Lee, Y, Parish, W., & Willis, R. (1994). Sons, daughters, and intergenerational support in Taiwan. *American Journal of Sociology, 99*,1010-1041.

Lehto, A., Lyly-Yrjänäinen M., & Sutela, H. (2005). *Pysyvän työn toivossa. Määräaikaisten työsuhteiden käytöstä ja kokemisesta*. Työpoliittinen tutkimus 291. Helsinki: Hakapaino.

Leinonen, J. (2011). *Elite migration, transnational families, and the nation state: international marriages between Finns and Americans across the Atlantic in the twentieth century*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of Minnesota, Minnesota.

Leinonen, J. (2012a). Invisible immigrants, visible expats? Americans in Finnish discourses on immigration and internationalization. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research, 2*(3), 213-223.

Leinonen, J. (2012b). Money is not everything and that's the bottom line: Family ties in transatlantic elite migrations. *Social Science History, 36*(2), 243-268.

Lempiäinen, K. (2002). Kansallisuuden tekeminen ja toisto. Teoksessa T. Gordon, K. Komulainen & K. Lempiäinen (toim.), *Suomineitonen hei! Kansallisuuden sukupuoli* (s. 19-36). Tampere: Vastapaino.

Leopold, L. & Shavit, Y. (2013). Cultural capital does not travel well: Immigrant, natives and achievement in Israeli schools. *European Sociological Review*, *29*(3), 450-463.

Lepola, O. (2000). *Ulkomaalaisesta suomenmaalaiseksi. Monikulttuurisuus, kansalaisuus ja suomalaisuus 1990-luvun maahanmuuttopoliittisessa keskustelussa*. Helsinki: SKS.

Letherby, G. (2003). *Feminist research in theory and practice*. Philadelphia, PA: Open University Press.

Liang, C. (2000). *Play in a working-class preschool.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign.

Lidola, M. (2011). Appropriating "die Brasilianerin". Negotiating belonging and unbelonging in everyday practice in Berlin. *Zeitschrift für Ethnologie, 136*(2), 379-400.

Liebkind, K., Mannila, S., Jasinskaja-Lahti, I., Jaakkola, M., Kyntäjä, E. & Reuter, A. (2004). *Venäläinen, virolainen, suomalainen. Kolmen maahanmuuttajaryhmän kotoutuminen Suomeen*. Helsinki: Gaudamus.

Lieblich, A., Tuval-Mashiach, R., & Zilber, T. (1998). *Narrative research: Reading, analysis and interpretation*. Thousand Oaks CA: SAGE Publications.

Lim, M. (2012). Being a Korean studying Koreans in an American school: Reflections on culture, power, and ideology. *The Qualitative Report, 17*(18), 1-15.

Lin, I., Goldman, N., Weinstein, M., Lin, Y., Gorrindo, T., & Seeman, T. (2003). Gender differences in adult children's support of their parents in Taiwan. *Journal of Marriage and Family, 65*(1), 184-200.

Lin, J., & Yi, C. (2011). Filial norms and intergenerational support to aging parents in China and Taiwan. *International Journal of Social Welfare, 20*(s1), S109-S120.

Lin, M. (2011). Women's aspirations for graduate education in Taiwan. *International Journal of Educational Development, 31*(5), 515-523.

Lin, P. (2009). Empirical study of the relationships between talent classes and learning achievement: A cultural capital perspective. *Formosan Education & Society, 17*, 111-134. (in Chinese).

Lincoln, Y., & Guba, E. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage Publications.

Lindermann, S. (2002). Listening with an attitude: A model of native-speaker comprehension of non-native speakers in the United States. *Language in Society, 31*,419-41.

Lister, R. (2009). A Nordic nirvana? Gender, citizenship, and social justice in the Nordic welfare states. *Social Politics: International Studies in Gender, State and Society, 16*(2), 242-278.

Łobodzińska, A. (2011). Immigrants and immigration policy in ageing Finland. *Bulletin of Geography: Socio-economic Series, 8*(15), 43-55.

Lovell, T. (2000). Thinking Feminism with and against Bourdieu. *Feminist Theory, 1*(1), 11-32.

Lu, L. (2000). Gender and conjugal differences in happiness. *The Journal of Social Psychology, 140*(1), 132-141.

Lu, L., & Kao, S. (2002). Traditional and modern characteristics across the generations: Similarities and discrepancies. *The Journal of Social Psychology, 142*(1), 45-59.

Lucas, R., & Kerr, S. (2012). Intergenerational income immobility in Finland: Contrasting roles for parental earnings and family income. *Journal of Population Economics*, 1-38.

Ludvig, A. (2006). Differences between women? Intersecting voices in a female narrative. *European Journal of Women's Studies, 13*(3), 245-258.

Lumio, M. (2011). *Hymyn takana – Thaimaalaiset maahanmuuttajat, viranomaiset ja kotoutuminen*. Tampere: Tampereen yliopistopaino Oy.

Lupton, D. (2000). A love/hate relationship: The ideals and experiences of first-time mothers. *Journal of Sociology*, 36, 50-63.

Lykke, N. (2011). Intersectional analysis: Black box or useful critical feminist thinking technology? In H. Lutz, M. Herrera Vivar & L. Supic (Eds.), *Framing intersectionality: Debates on a multi-faceted concept in gender studies* (pp. 207-220). Farnham: Ashgate.

Lähteenmäki-Smith, K., & Salminen, V. (2011). *Promoting social inclusion of Roma: A study of national policies.* Retrieved from http://www.peer-review-social-inclusion.eu/network-of-independent-experts/2011/promoting-the-social-inclusion-of-roma

Macbeth, D. (2001). On "Reflexivity" in qualitative research: Two readings, and a third. *Qualitative Inquiry, 7*(1), 35-68.

Majakulma, A. (2011). Enhancing the employability of international graduates during education – A case study based on Finnish universities of applied sciences. *Ammattikasvatuksen aikakauskirja,* 2, 44-49.

Makkonen T. (2002). *Multiple, compound and intersectional discrimination: Bringing the experiences of the most marginalized to the fore.* Institute for Human Rights, Åbo Akademi University. Retrieved from http://www.abo.fi/instut/imr/norfa/timo.pdf

Mannila, S., & Reuter, A. (2009). Social exclusion risks and their accumulation among Russian-speaking, ethnically Finnish and Estonian immigrants to Finland. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 35*(6), 939-956.

Manninen, M. (2001). *Katsaus kotoutumistutkimukseen*. Maahanmuuttoasiaa nro 5. Helsinki: Työministeriö.

Marshall, C., & Rossman, G. (2011). *Designing qualitative research* (5th ed.). London: Sage.

Mazur, A. (2002). *Theorizing feminist policy*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

McAdams, D. (1993). *The stories we live by: Personal myths and the making of the self*. New York: Morrow.

McCall, L. (1992). Does genderfit? Bourdieu, feminism, and conceptions of social order. *Theory and Society, 21*(6), 837-867.

McCall, L. (2005). The complexity of intersectionality. *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 30,1771-1800.

McGinnity, F., Nelson, J., Lunn, P., & Quinn, E. (2009). *Discrimination in Recruitment: Evidence from a Field Experiment*. Dublin: Equality Authority/ESRI.

McLaren, P. (1998). *Life in schools. An introduction to critical pedagogy in the foundations of education*. New York: Longman.

McMahon, M. (1995). *Engendering motherhood: Identity and self-transformation in women's lives*. New York: The Guildford Press.

McNay, L. (1999). Gender, habitus and the field. *Theory, Culture & Society, 16*(1), 95-117.

McNay, L. (2000). *Gender and agency: Reconfiguring the subject in feminist and social theory*. Malden, Massachusetts: Blackwell.

Mehan, H., Villanuave, I., Hubbard, L., & Lintz, A. (1996). *Constructing school success: The consequences of untracking low-achieving students*. New York and Cambridge: UK Cambridge University Press.

Melkas, H., & Anker, R. (1998). *Gender equality and occupational segregation in Nordic labour markets*. Geneva: International Labour Office (ILO).

Miettinen, M., & Pitkänen, P. (1999). *Opettaja kulttuurien leikkauspisteessä. Opettajien käsitykset työstä maahanmuuttajien kanssa*. Opetushallitus, Helsinki.

Miller, P., Wiley, A., Fung, H., & Liang, C. (1997). Personal storytelling as a medium of socialization in Chinese and American families. *Child Development, 68,* 557-568.

Ministry of the Interior Finland (2012). *The home page of the Ministry*. Retrieved from http://www.intermin.fi/intermin/home.nsf/pages/C8D43A3

Ministry of the Interior Finland. (2011a). *Uusi kotoutumislaki voimaan - Suomeen muuton alkuvaiheen ohjausta parannetaan*. Retrieved from http://www.intermin.fi/intermin/bulletin.nsf/PFBD/E5757D505C2B5BC1C22578FE00374C6E

Ministry of the Interior Finland. (2011b). *Kotoutumislaki (1386/2010) uudistuu 1.9.2011 alkaen*. Retrieved from http://www.alipi.fi/tiedostot/Paula%20Kuusipalo%20-%20kotoutumislaki(1).pdf

Mishler, E. (2004). Historians of the self: Restorying lives, revising identities. *Research in Human Development, 1*(1-2), 101-121.

Mohanty, C. (1988). Under western eyes: Feminist scholarship and colonial discourses. *Feminist Review, 30*(6), 1-88.

Moi, T. (1991). Appropriating Bourdieu: Feminist theory and Pierre Bourdieu's sociology of culture. *New Literary History, 22*, 1017-1049.

Nash, J. (2008). Re-thinking intersectionality. *Feminist Review, 89*(1), 1-15.

Nash, R. (2005). Cognitive habitus and collective intelligence: Concepts for the explanation of inequality of educational opportunity. *Journal of Education Policy, 20*(1), 3-21.

Ng, R. (1996). *The politics of community services: Immigrant women, class and state*. Halifax: Fernwood Publishing.

Nielsen, C. (2011). Immigrant over-education: Evidence from Denmark. *Journal of Population Economics, 24*(2), 499-520.

Niemi, H. (2012). The societal factors contributing to education and schooling in Finland. In H. Niemi, A. Kallioniemi & A. Toom (Eds.), *The miracle of education: The principles and practices of teaching and learning in Finnish schools* (pp. 19-38). Rotterdam: Sense.

Niemi, H., Kallioniemi, A., & Toom, A. (Eds.). (2012). *The miracle of education: The principles and practices of teaching and learning in Finnish Schools*. Rotterdam: Sense.

Nieminen, S. (2011). *Kuulumisen politiikkaa: Maahanmuuttajasairaanhoitajat, ammattikuntaan sisäänpääsy ja toimijuuden ehdot*. Väitöskirja: Tampereen yliopisto.

Nieminen, T. (2009). *Gender equality barometer 2008*. Publications of the Ministry of Social Affairs and Health (2009:2). Helsinki: University Printing House.

Nieto, S. (2000). *Affirming diversity: The sociopolitical context of multicultural education* (3rd ed.). New York: Longman.

Nogueira, M. (2010). A revisited theme - middle classes and the School. In M. Apple, S. Ball & L. Gandin (Eds.), *The Routledge international handbook of the sociology of education* (pp. 253-263). Oxon, U.K: Routledge.

Nordberg, C. (2012). Localising global care work: A discourse on migrant care workers in the Nordic welfare regime. In G. Boucher & G. Annette (Eds.), *Transnationalism in the Global City* (pp. 63-78). University of Deusto, (EDMIDI).

Nori, H. (2011). *Keille yliopiston portit avautuvat? Tutkimus suomalaisiin yliopistoihin ja eri tieteenaloille valikoitumisesta 2000-luvun alussa*. Väitöskirja:Turun yliopisto.

Nousiainen, K. (2000). Women and work in today's Nordic countries – Introducing the themes. In L. Kalliomaa-Puha (Ed.), *Perspectives on equality – work, women and family in the Nordic countries and EU* (pp. 9-39). Copenhagen: Nordic Council of Ministers.

Nowicka, M. (2013). Positioning strategies of Polish entrepreneurs in Germany: Transnationalizing Bourdieu's notion of capital. *International Sociology, 28*(1), 29-47.

Näre, L. (2013a). Migrancy, gender and social class in domestic labour and social care in Italy: An intersectional analysis of demand. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 39*(4), 601-623.

Näre, L. (2013b). Ideal workers and suspects. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research, 3*(2), 72-81.

Nätkin, R. (1997). *Kamppailu suomalaisesta äitiydestä. Maternalismi, väestöpolitiikka ja naisten kertomukset*. Tampere: Gaudeamus.

OECD. (2004a). *Ageing and employment policies: Finland*. Paris: OECD Publishing.

OECD. (2004b). *Learning for tomorrow's world: First results from PISA 2003*. Paris: OECD Publishing.

OECD. (2008). *Growing unequal? Income distribution in OECD countries*. Paris: OECD Publishing.

OECD. (2011). *Doing better for families*. Paris: OECD Publishing.

OECD. (2013). *Education at a Glance 2013: OECD indicators*. Paris: OECD Publishing.

Oinonen, L. (1999). *Vietnamilaisia, suomalaisia vai suomenvietnamilaisia? Pääkaupun- kiseudun vietnamilaisten etnisyys ja identiteetti 1990-luvulla*. Helsinki:Väestöliitto.

Ojala, M. (2000). Parent and teacher expectations for developing young children: A crosscultural comparison between Ireland and Finland. *European early Childhood Education research Journal, 8*, 39-61.

Olakivi, A. (2013). "In case you can speak Finnish, there's no problem." Reconstructing problematic identity-positions in migrant care workers' organizational discourse. *Nordic Journal of Migration Research, 3*(2), 91-99.

Oliver, C., & O'Reilly, K. (2010). A Bourdieusian analysis of class and migration: Habitus and the individualising process. *Sociology, 44*(1), 49-66.

Ooka, E., & Wellman, B. (2006). Does social capital pay off more within or between groups? Analysing job searches in five Toronto ethnic groups. In E. Fong (Ed.), *Inside the Mosaic* (pp. 199-226). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.

Opetushallitus. (2012). *Aikuisten maahanmuuttajien luku- ja kirjoitustaidon koulutuksen opetussuunnitelman perusteet 2012*. Helsinki: Edita Prima Oy.

Oreopoulos, P. (2009). *Why do skilled immigrants struggle in the labor market? A field experiment with sixty thousand résumés*. Working Paper no. 09-03. Vancouver: Metropolis British Columbia.

Oreopoulos, P., & Dechief, D. (2011). *Why do some employers prefer to interview Matthew, but not Samir? New evidence from Toronto, Montreal, and Vancouver*. Metropolis British Columbia Working Paper Series No. 11-13. Vancouver: Metropolis British Columbia. Retrieved from http://mbc.metropolis.net/assets/uploads/files/wp/2011/WP11-13.pdf

Paananen, S. (1999). *Suomalaisuuden armoilla: Ulkomaalaisten työnhakijoiden luokittelu*. Tilastokeskuksen tutkimuksia 228. Helsinki: Tilastokeskus.

Patton, M. (1990). *Qualitative evaluation and research methods* (2nd ed.). Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Pehkonen, A. (2006). Immigrants' paths to employment in Finland. *Yearbook of Population Research in Finland. 42*, 113-128.

Pek, J., & Leong, F. (2003). Sex-related self-concepts, cognitive styles and cultural of traditionality-modernity as predictors of general and domain-specific sexism. *Asian Journal of Social Psychology, 6*, 31-49.

Peltola, K., & Ahonen, L. (2012). *Double subtitling – key to even out differences between colloquial language and standard language*. Paper presented at the 5th edition of the ICT for Language Learning Conference. 15-16.11.2012. Florence, Italy.

Pentikäinen, J., & Hiltunen, M. (Eds.). (1995). *Cultural minorities in Finland: An overview towards cultural policy*. Publication No 66. Helsinki: The Finnish National Commission for Unesco.

Perhoniemi, R., & Jasinskaja-Lahti, I. (2006). *Maahanmuuttajien kotoutuminen pääkaupunkiseudulla. Seurantatutkimus vuosilta 1997-2004*. Tutkimuksia, 2006:2. Helsinki: Helsingin kaupungin tietokeskus.

Perttilä, R. (2012). *Social capital, coping and information behaviour of long-term unemployed people in Finland*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. Åbo Akademi, Turku.

Perälä-Littunen, S. (2004). *Cultural images of a good mother and a good father in three generations*. Jyväskylä Studies in Education, Psychology and Social Research 239. University of Jyväskylä, Jyväskylä.

Perälä-Littunen, S. (2007). Gender equality or primacy of the mother? Ambivalent descriptions of good parents. *Journal of Marriage and Family, 69* (2), 341-351.

Phoenix, A. (1994). Practising feminist research: The intersection of gender and 'race' in the research process. In M. Maynard & J. Purvis (Eds.), *Researching Women's Lives from a Feminist Perspective* (pp. 49-71). London: Taylor & Francis.

Pimlott-Wilson, H. (2011). The role of familial habitus in shaping children's views of their future employment. *Children's Geographies, 9*(1), 111-118.

Pincus, F. (1996). Discrimination comes in many forms: Individual, institutional, and structural. *American Behavioral Scientist, 40*, 186-194.

Pitkänen, P. (toim.). (2005). *Kulttuurien välinen työ*. Helsinki: Edita.

Pitkänen, P., & Kouki, S. (2002). Meeting foreign cultures: A survey of the attitudes of Finnish authorities towards immigrants and immigration. *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies, 28*(1), 103-118.

Poikolainen, J. (*2012*). A case study of parents school choice strategies in a Finnish urban context. *European Educational Research Journal, 11*(1), 127-144.

Polkinghorne, D. (1988). *Narrative knowing and the human sciences*. Albany, NY: SUNY Press.

Power, S., Edwards, T., Whitty, G., & Wigfall, V. (2003). *Education and the middle class*. Buckingham: Open University Press.

Pulkkinen, L. (2012). The integrated school day: Improving the educational offering of schools in Finland. In C. Clouder, B. Heys, M. Matthes & P. Sullivan (Eds.), *Improving the quality of childhood in Europe 2012* (pp. 40-67). Brighton, England: European Council for Steiner Waldorf Education.

Purkayastha, B. (2012). Intersectionality in a transnational world. *Gender & Society*. *26*, 55-66.

Puuronen, V. (2011). *Rasistinen Suomi*. Helsinki: Gaudeamus.

Pylkkänen, A. (1999). Finnish understandings of equality. In P. Lipponen & P. Setälä (Eds.), *Women in Finland* (pp. 24-38). Helsinki: Otava.

Pääkkönen, H., & Hanifi, R. (2011). *Ajankäytön muutokset 2000-luvulla. Elinolot 2011*. Helsinki: Tilastokeskus.

Pöllänen, P. (2007). Työllistymisen mahdollisuudet ja työn merkitys venäjänkielisille maahanmuuttajanaisille Pohjois-Karjalassa. Teoksessa T. Martikainen & M. Tiilikainen (toim.), *Maahanmuuttajanaiset: Kotoutuminen, perhe ja työ* (s. 359-378). Helsinki: Väestöliitto.

Pöyhönen, S., Tarnanen, M., Kyllönen, T., Vehviläinen, E., & Rynkänen, T. (2009). *Kielikoulutus maahanmuuttajien kotoutumiskoulutuksessa. Tavoitteet, toteutus ja hallinnollinen yhteistyö*. Jyväskylän yliopisto. Soveltavan kielentutkimuksen keskus. Jyväskylä.

Raento, P., & Husso, K. (2002). Cultural diversity in Finland. *Fennia, 180*, 151-164.

Raittila, P. (2004a). Representations of otherness in Finnish culture: Media images of Russians and Estonians. In K. Riegert (Ed.), *News of the Other. Tracing identity in Scandinavian constructions of the Eastern Baltic Sea region* (pp. 151-166). Göteborg: Nordicom.

Raittila, P. (2004b). *Venäläiset ja virolaiset suomalaisten toisina: Tapaustutkimuksia ja analyysimenetelmien kehittelyä*. Väitöskirja: Tampereen yliopisto.

Rantala, M. (2011). *Selling Finnishness – National constructions of Whiteness in Finnish TV advertisements.* Paper presented at the 1st Conference: Images of Whiteness - Exploring Critical Issues. 12-14.7. 2011,UK.

Rantalaiho, L. (1997). Contextualizing gender. In L. Rantalaiho & T. Heiskanen (Eds.), *Gendered Practices in Working Life* (pp. 16-30). London: Macmillan.

Rantalaiho, L., & Heiskanen, T. (Eds.). (1997). *Gendered Practices in Working Life*. London: Macmillan.

Rastas, A. (2004). Am I still White? Dealing with the colour trouble. *Balayi: Culture, Law and Colonialism, 6*, 94-106. Retrieved from http://acta.uta.fi/pdf/Rastas_A2.pdf

Rastas, A. (2009). Rasism in the everyday life of Finnish children with transnational roots. *Barn, 19*(1), 29-43.

Raunio, M. (2003). *Should I stay or should I go? The images and realities of foreign top professionals in Finnish working and urban environment*. English Summary. Research unit for urban and regional development studies, Sente-working papers 6/2003. Tampere: University of Tampere.

Raunio, M., & Sotarauta, M. (2005). *Highly skilled labor force in the global field of choices: Case Finland*. Paper presented at Oxford Round Table "Adapting to Globalization in the 21st Century". St. Antony's College. University of Oxford, England. 31.7- 5.8. 2005, UK.

Reay, D. (1998a). Cultural reproduction: Mothers' involvement in their children's primary schooling. In M. Grenfell & D. James (Eds.), *Bourdieu and Education: Acts of practical theory* (pp.55-70). London: Falmer Press.

Reay, D. (1998b). Engendered social reproduction: Mothers in the educational marketplace. *British Journal of Sociology of Education, 19*(2), 195-209.

Reay, D. (1998c). *Class Work: Mothers' involvement in their children's primary schooling*. London: UCL Press.

Reay, D. (1999). Linguistic capital and home-school relationship: Mothers' interactions with their children's primary teachers. *Acta Sociologica, 42*(2), 159-168.

Reay, D. (2000). A useful extension of Bourdieu's conceptual framework: Emotional capital as a way of understanding mothers' involvement in their children's education. *Sociological Review, 48*(4), 568-585.

Reay, D. (2004). It's all becoming habitus: Beyond the habitual use of habitus in educational research. *British Journal of Sociology of Education, 25*, 431-444.

Reay, D. (2005). Doing the dirty work of social class? Mothers' work in support of their children's schooling. In M. Glucksmann, L. Pettinger, J. Parry & R. Taylor (Eds.), *A New Sociology of Work* (pp. 104-118). London: Blackwell.

Reay, D., Crozier, G., & Clayton, J. (2009). 'Strangers in paradise?' Working-class students in elite universities. *Sociology, 43*(6), 1103-1121.

Reay, D., Crozier, G., & Clayton, J. (2010). 'Fitting in' or 'standing out': Working-class students in UK higher education, *British Educational Research Journal, 36*(1), 107-124.

Reay, D., David, M., & Ball, S. (2005). *Degrees of choice: Social class, race and gender in higher education*. London: Trentham Books.

Reay, D., David, M., & Ball, S. (2001). Making a difference? Institutional habituses and higher education choice. *Sociological Research Online 5(4)*. Retrieved from http:www.socresonline.org.uk [accessed 21/12/2005].

Reinharz, S. (1992). *Feminist methods in social research*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Reinharz, S., & Chase, S. (2003). Interviewing women. In J. Holstein & J. Gubrium (Eds.), *Inside interviewing* (pp. 73-90). Thousand Oaks, London & New Delhi: Sage.

Reinikainen, P. (2012). Amazing PISA results in Finnish comprehensive schools. In H. Niemi, A. Toom & A. Kallioniemi (Eds.), *Miracle of education: The principles and practices of teaching and Learning in Finnish schools* (pp. 3-18). Rotterdam: Sense.

Reitz, J. (2001). Immigrant success in the knowledge economy: Institutional change and the immigrant experiences in Canada: 1970-1995. *Journal of Social, 57*, 579-613.

Reuter, A., & Kyntäjä, E. (2006). Kansainvälinen avioliitto ja stigma. Teoksessa T. Martikainen (toimi.), *Ylirajainen kulttuuri. Etnisyys Suomessa 2000-luvulla* (s. 104-125). Helsinki: SKS.

Riaño, Y. (2011). He's the Swiss citizen, i'm the foreign spouse: Transnational marriages and the impact of family-related migration policies on social integration and gender relations. In A. Kraler, E. Kofman, M. Kohli & C. Schmoll (Eds.), *Gender, generations, and the family in international migration* (pp. 265-283). Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press.

Riaño, Y., & Baghdadi, N. (2007). Understanding the labour market participation of skilled immigrant women in Switzerland: The interplay of class, ethnicity and gender. *International Migration and Integration, 8*, 163-83.

Riessman, C. (2005). Narrative analysis. In N. Kelly, C. Horrocks, K. Milnes, B. Roberts & D. Robinson (Eds.), *Narrative, memory, and everyday life* (pp. 1-7). Huddersfield, UK: University of Huddersfield.

Riessman, C. (2008). Narrative methods for the human sciences. London: Sage.

Riitaoja, A., Poulter, S., & Kuusisto, A. (2010). Worldviews and multicultural education in the Finnish context- a critical philosophical approach to theory and practices. *Finnish Journal of Ethnicity and Migration, 5*(3), 87-95.

Rissanen, T. (2000). *Naisten Ansiotyömallin muotoutuminen. Työnteon, toimeentulon ja lasten hoidon järjestäminen Suomessa 1920-1980-luvuilla*. Pro gradu -tutkielma: Tampereen yliopisto.

Roces, M., & Edwards, L. (2000). Contesting gender narratives, 1970-2000. In L. Edwards & M. Roces (Eds.), *Women in Asia: Tradition, modernity and globalization* (pp. 1-15). Ann Arbor, MI: The University of Michigan.

Roopnarine, J., Shin, M., Jung, K., & Hossain, Z. (2003). Play and early development and education: The instantiation of parental belief systems. In O. Saracho & B. Spodek (Eds.), *Contemporary perspectives on Play in Early Childhood Education* (pp. 115-132). Greenwich, CT: Information Age Publishing.

Rubin, H., & Rubin, I. (2005). *Qualitative Interviewing: The art of hearing data* (2 ed.). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Ruohola, S. (2012). *Äidiltä tyttärelle. Koulutuskulttuurisia siirtymiä neljässä sukupolvessa*. Väitöskirja: Turun yliopisto.

Räsänen, R. (2002). Interkulttuurisen pedagogiikan olemusta etsimässä. Teoksessa R. Räsänen, K. Jokikokko, M. Järvelä & T. Lamminmäki-Kärkkäinen (toim.), *Interkulttuurinen opettajankoulutus: Utopiasta todellisuudeksi toimintatutkimuksen avulla* (s. 97-113). Oulu: Oulu University Press. Retrieved from http://herkules.oulu.fi/isbn9514268075/isbn9514268075.pdf

Räsänen, R. (2009). Monikulttuurisuus ja kansainvälistyminen koulun ja opettajan haasteena. Teoksessa J. Jokisalo & R. Simola (toim.), *Monikulttuurisuus Luokanopettajankoulutuksessa: Monialaisten opintojen läpäisevä luonne* (s. 1-20). Joensuu: Joensuun yliopisto.

Räty, H. (2012). Intention in school choice among Finnish parents. *Educational Studies, 38*, 1-4.

Räty, H., & Kasanen, K. (2013). Parents' perceptions of their child's academic competencies construe their educational reality: Findings from a 9-year longitudinal study. *Journal of Applied Social Psychology, 43*, 1110-1119.

Räty, H., Kasanen, K., & Kärkkäinen, R. (2006). School subjects as social categorizations. *Social Psychology of Education, 9*, 5-25.

Räty, H., Kasanen, K., & Laine, N. (2009). Parents' participation in their child's schooling. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research, 53*(3), 277-293.

Räty, H., Komulainen, K., & Hirva, L. (2012). Social representations of educability in Finland: 20 years of continuity and change. *Social Psychology of Education, 15*(3), 395-409.

Räty, H., Ruokolainen, S., & Kasanen, K. (2012). We the parents were actually more nervous about the change – how parents experience their child's schooling in upper primary school. *Scandinavian Journal of Educational Research, 56*(3), 229-241.

Räty, M. (2002). *Maahanmuuttaja asiakkaana*. Helsinki: Tammi.

Saarinen, A. (2007). Venäläiset maahanmuuttajat "naisystävällisessä" Pohjolassa: Kansalaisuus ja stigmatisoitunut identiteetti. Teoksessa T. Martikainen & M. Tiilikainen (toim.), *Maahanmuuttajanaiset: Kotoutuminen, perhe ja työ* (s. 125-174). Helsinki:Väestöliitto.

Saarinen, A., & Mehtonen, S. (2012). Immigration policies in Finland: Economic marginalisation and the residence-based welfare regime's support for humanitarian migrants. In S. Morano-Foadi & M. Malena (Eds.), *Integration for Third-country nationals in the European Union: The equality challenge* (pp. 185-208). Cheltenham: Edward Elgar Publishing Limited.

Sahlberg, P. (2007). Education policies for raising student learning: The Finnish approach. *Journal of Education Policy, 22*(2), 147-171.

Sahlberg, P. (2011). *Finnish lessons: What can the world learn from educational change in Finland*. New York, NY: Teachers College, Columbia University.

Salmenhaara, P. (2008). From horizontal to vertical divides: Immigrants' employment in Finland in the 1990s. *Finnish Journal of Ethnicity and Migration,* 3(1), 13-20.

Salmi, M. (2004). Arkielämä tutkimuksen lähtökohtana. Teoksessa M. Salmi & J. Lammi-Taskula (toim.), *Puhelin, mummo vai joustava työaika? Työn ja perheen yhdistämisen arkea* (s.11-28). Helsinki: Stakes.

Salmi, M. (2006). Parental choice and the passion for equality in Finland. In A. Ellingsæter & A. Leira (Eds.), *Politicising parenthood in Scandinavia gender relations in welfare states* (pp. 145-170). Bristol: Policy Press.

Sarvimäki, M. (2011). Assimilation to a welfare state: Labor market performance and use of social benefits by immigrants to Finland. *The Scandinavian Journal of Economics,113*(3), 665-688.

Sarvimäki, M., & Hämäläinen, K. (2010). *Assimilating Immigrants: The Impact of an Integration Program*. HECER Discussion Paper 306. Helsinki Center of Economic Research (HECER), Helsinki.

Saukkonen, P. (1999). *Suomi, Alankomaat ja kansallisvaltion identiteettipolitiikka. Tutkimus kansallisen identiteetin poliittisuudesta, empiirinen sovellutus suomalaisiin ja hollantilaisiin teksteihin*. Helsinki: SKS.

Shelton, B., & John, D. (1996). The division of household labor. *Annual Review of Sociology, 22*, 299-322.

Shumilova, Y., Cai, Y., & Pekkola, E. (2012). *Employability of international graduates educated in Finnish higher education institutions*. VALOA-project, Career Services, University of Helsinki.

Sidanius, J., Pratto, F., van Laar, C., & Levin, S. (2004). Social dominance theory: Its agenda and method. *Political Psychology, 25*, 845-880.

Silinskas, G., Parrila, R., Lerkkanen, M., Poikkeus, A., Niemi, P., & Nurmi, J. (2010). Mothers' reading-related activities at home and learning to read during kindergarten. *European Journal of Psychology of Education, 25*(2), 243-264.

Silius, H., & Tuori, S. (2004). Gender-neutral Finland? Women's studies students as gender experts in Finland. In G. Griffin (Ed.), *Employment, Equal Opportunities and Women's Studies: Women's Experiences in Seven European Countries* (pp. 163-186). Königstein/Taunus: Ulrike Helmer Verlag.

Silverman, D. (1998). *Qualitative research: Theory, method and practice*. London, Sage.

Silverman, D. (2006). *Interpreting qualitative data*. London: Sage.

Simien, E. (2007). Doing intersectionality research: From conceptual issues to practical examples. *Politics & Gender, 3*(2), 264-271.

Sirkkilä, H. (2005). *Elättäjyyttä vai erotiikkaa : Miten suomalaiset miehet legitimoivat parisuhteensa thaimaalaisen naisen kanssa?* Jyväskylä Studies in Education, Psychology and Social Research. Jyväskylä: Jyväskylän yliopisto.

Skeggs, B. (1997). *Formations of class and gender: Becoming respectable*. London: Sage.

Skeggs, B. (2004). *Class, self, culture*. London: Routledge.

Slot, W., & De vos, G. (Eds.) (1998). *Confucianism and the Family*. Albany: State University of New York Press.

Smythe, S. (2006). *The good mother: A critical discourse analysis of literacy advice to mothers in the 20th century*. Unpublished doctoral dissertation. University of British Columbia, Vancouver.

Snellman, L., & Räty, H. (1992). Intelligence at school: Social psychological analysis of a multifaced concept. *Nordisk Pedagogik, 2*, 89-95.

Sobrun-Maharaj A., Rossen, F., & Kim, S. (2011). *Work experiences of Asian immigrants : Impact on family wellbeing*. Report (New Zealand. Families Commission), no. 5/11. Wellington, N.Z.: Families Commission.

Sormunen, M., Tossavainen, K., & Turunen, H. (2011). Home-School collaboration in the view of gourth grade pupils, parents, teachers, and principals in the Finnish education system. *The School Community Journal, 21*(2), 185-211.

Spoonley, P., & Meares, C. (2009). *Chinese businesses and the transformation of Auckland. Asia New Zealand Foundation, Wellington.* Retrieved from http://newsettlers.massey.ac.nz/publications_pdfs/Chinese%20Businesses%20in%20Auckland.pdf

Stanley, L., & Wise, S. (1993). *Breaking out again: Feminist ontology and epistemology*. London: Routledge.

Statistics Finland. (2011). *Population Structure 2011. Population according to language 1980-2011.* Retrieved from: http://www.stat.fi/til/vaerak/2011/vaerak_2011_2012-03-16_tau_001_en.html

Statistics Finland. (2012). *StatFin database* [Finnish version]. Retrieved from http://pxweb2.stat.fi/database/StatFin/databasetree_fi.asp

Staunæs, D. (2003). Where have all the subjects gone? Bringing together the concepts of intersectionality and subjectification. *NORA: Nordic Journal of Women's Studies, 11*(2), 101-110.

Stewart, A., & McDermott, C. (2004). Gender in psychology. *Annual Review of Psychology, 55*, 519-544.

Subramaniam, G. (2008). Confronting Asian concerns in engaging learners to online education. *International Education Studies, 1*(4), 10-18.

Sulkunen, S., Välijärvi, J., Arffman, I., Harju-Luukkainen, H., Kupari, P., Nissinen, K., Puhakka, E., & Reinikainen, P. (2010). *PISA 2009 Ensituloksia*. Opetus- ja kulttuuriministeriön julkaisuja, 2010: 21. Helsinki: Opetus- ja kulttuuriministeriö.

Suomen evankelis-luterilainen kirkko. (2012). *Kirkko numeroina.* Retrieved from http://evl.fi/EVLfi.nsf/Documents/68ED832793E78AF5C22575EF003AD029?OpenDocument&lang=FI

Sutela, H. (2005). Maahanmuuttajat palkkatyössä. Teoksessa S. Paananen (toim.), *Maahanmuuttajien elämää Suomessa* (s. 83-109). Helsinki: Tilastokeskus.

SVT. (2012). *Ulkomaalaiset ja siirtolaisuus 2011. Väestö 2012.* Helsinki: Tilastokeskus.

Swartz, D. (1997). *Culture and power: The sociology of Pierre Bourdieu*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Swartz, D. (2008). Bringing Bourdieu's master concepts into organizational Analysis. *Theory and Society, 37*(1), 53-63.

Söderqvist, M. (2005). *Ulkomaalaiset työnantajan silmin – "se on niinku tyyppi, tyyppi ja osaaminen, ei se tutkinto, ei".* Helsinki: Helia.

Taiwan's Ministry of the Interior of statistics. (2010). *The living conditions of elderly people in 2009*. (in Chinese)

Taiwan's Ministry of the Interior statistics. (2012). *The situation of Taiwanese women in 2011*. (in Chinese)

Takala, P. (1992). Kohti postmodernia perhettä- perhepolitiikan muuttuvat käsitykset. Teoksessa O. Riihinen (toim.), *Sosiaalipolitiikka 2017. Näkökulmia suomalaisen yhteiskunnan kehitykseen ja tulevaisuuteen* (s. 577-600). Juva: WSOY.

Takeda, A. (2012). Critical reflections: Interpretation and analysis of japanese women's settlement experiences. *The Qualitative Report, 17*(19), 1-15. Retrieved from http://www.nova.edu/ssss/QR/QR17/takeda.pdf

Talib, M. (2002). *Monikulttuurinen koulu: Haaste ja mahdollisuus*. Helsinki: Kirjapaja.

Tang, N. (2002). Interviewer and interviewee relationships between women. *Sociology, 36*(3), 703-721.

Tanttu, J. (2009). *Selvitys vähemmistövaltuutetulle: Venäjänkielisenä Suomessa 2008*. Helsinki: Edita.

Taylor, Y. (2010). Complexities and complications: Intersections of class and sexuality. In Y. Taylor, S., Hines & M. Casey (Eds.), *Theorizing intersectionality and sexuality* (pp. 37-55). Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan.

The Finnish National Board of Education. (2004). *Perusopetuksen opetussuunnitelman perusteet 2004*. Retrieved from http://www02.oph.fi/ops/perusopetus/pops_web.pdf

Thomson, P. (2002). *Schooling the rustbelt kids. Making the difference in changing times*. Sydney: Allen & Unwin.

Thorne, S., Reimer Kirkham, S., & O'Flynn-Magee, K. (2004). The analytic challenge in interpretive description. *International Journal of Qualitative Methods, 3*(1). Article 1. Retrieved [INSERT DATE] from http://www.ualberta.ca/~iiqm/backissues/3_1/ html/thorneetal.html

Tiilikainen, M. (2008). *Menestyvät maahanmuuttajanaiset*. Helsinki: Väestöliitto.

Tilastokeskus. (2011). *Taulukot tilastossa: Palkkarakenne 2010*. Helsinki: Tilastokeskus.

Tilastokeskus. (2012). *Työvoimatutkimuksen keskeisimmät tunnusluvut sukupuolen mukaan 2011/08 - 2012/08*. Helsinki: Tilastokeskus.

Tilastokeskus. (2004). *Työvoimatutkimuksen aineistot vuosilta 2001-2003*. Helsinki: Tilastokeskus.

Tolonen, T. (toim.). (1999). *Suomalainen koulu ja kulttuuri*. Tampere: Vastapaino.

Tomperi, T., Vuorkikoski, M., & Kiilakoski, T. (2005). Kenen kasvatus? Teoksessa T. Kiilakoski, T. Tomperi & M. Vuorikoski (toim.), *Kenen kasvatus. Kriittinen pedagogiikka ja toisinkasvatuksen mahdollisuus* (s.7-28). Tampere: Vastapaino.

Tran, T. (2013). Is the learning approach of students from the Confucian heritage culture problematic?. *Educational Research for Policy and Practice, 12*(1), 57-65.

Trlin, A., Henderson, A., & North, N. (2004). Skilled Chinese and Indian immigrant workers. In P. Spoonley, A. Dupuis & A. De Bruin (Eds.), *Work and working in twenty-first century New Zealand* (pp. 205-219). Palmerston North, New Zealand: Dunmore Press.

Tsai, H., Chen, M., & Tsai, Y. (2008). Perceptions of filial piety among Taiwanese university students. *Journal of Advanced Nursing, 63*(3), 284-290.

Tsai, S. (2004). Effects of higher education expansion on inequality of educational opportunity. *Taiwanese Sociology, 7*, 47-88 (in Chinese).

Tsai, S., & Yu, X. (2011). Heterogeneity in returns to college education: Selection bias in contemporary Taiwan. *Social Science Research, 40*(3), 796-810.

Tsai, W., Liu, J., Chou, S., & Grossman, M. (2011). *Intergeneration transfer of human capital: Results from a natural experiment in Taiwan*. NBER Working Papers 16876. National Bureau of Economic Research, Inc.

Tsai, Y., & Yi, C. (1997). Persistence and change of the Chinese family value: The Taiwanese case. In L. Chang, Y. Lu & F. Wang (Eds.), *Taiwanese society in 1990s*: *Taiwan social change survey* (pp. 123-169). Taipei: Institute of Sociology, Academia Sinica. (in Chinese)

Tseng, L., Chang, C., & Chen, S. (2006). An analysis on the living arrangement choices of the elderly: A discussion on intergenerational relationships. *Journal of Housing Studies, 15*(2), 45-64. (in Chinese)

Tsui, A. (1996). Reticence and anxiety in second language teaching. In K. Bailey & D. Nunan (Eds.), *Voices from the language classroom* (pp. 145-167). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Tubergen, F., & Kalmijn, M. (2005). Destination-Language proficiency in cross-national perspective: A study of immigrant groups in nine western countries. *American Journal of Sociology, 110*(5), 1412-1457.

Tuomaala, M. (2010). *Työvoiman hankinta toimipaikoissa vuonna 2009. TEM-analyyseja 22/2010, Työ- ja elinkeinoministeriö*. Retrieved from http://www.tem.fi/files/26994/Tyovoiman_hankinta_toimipaikoissa_vuonna_2009.pdf

Tuori, S. (2009). *The politics of multicultural encounters. Feminist postcolonial perspectives*. Turku: Åbo Akademi University Press.

Turnbull, A., Turnbull, H., Erwin, E., Soodak, L., & Shogren, K. (2011). *Families, professionals and exceptionality*. Boston: Pearson.

Tynkkynen, L., Tolvanen, A., & Salmela-Aro, K (2012). Trajectories of educational expectations from adolescence to young adulthood in Finland. *Developmental Psychology, 48*(6), 1674-1685.

Urponen, M. (2010). *Ylirajaisia suhteita: Helsingin olympialaiset, Armi Kuusela ja ylikansallinen historia*. Väitöskirja. Helsingin yliopisto, Helsinki.

Valtonen, K. (2001). Cracking monopoly: Immigrants and employment in Finland. *Journal of ethnic and migration studies, 27*(3), 421-438.

Valtonen, K. (2004). From the margin to the Mainstream: Conceptualizing refugee settlement processes. *Journal of Refugee Studies,17*(1), 70-96.

van Amsterdam, N. (2013). Big fat inequalities, thin privilege: An intersectional perspective on 'body size'. *European Journal of Women's Studies, 20*(2), 155-169.

Varjonen, S., Arnold, L., & Jasinskaja-Lahti, I. (2013). 'We're Finns here, and Russians there': A longitudinal study on ethnic identity construction in the context of ethnic migration. *Discourse & Society, 24*(1), 110-134.

Vehviläinen, J. (1998). 2000-luvun koululaisgalleria – ammattikouluttamattomat nuoret yhteiskunnan ja vanhempien huolenaiheen. *Nuorisotutkimus, 16*(2), 32-41.

Vesikansa, S. (2009). *Kuka kasvattaa, kuka opettaa? Genealoginen tutkimus perheen ja koulun välisen kasvatusvastuun politiikasta*. Väitöskirja. Helsingin yliopisto, Helsinki.

Viinamäki, H., Koskela, K., & Niskanen, L. (1996). Rapidly declining mental wellbeing during unemployment. *European Journal of Psychiatry, 10*(4), 215-221.

Vincent, C. (2010). The sociology of mothering. In M. Apple, S. Ball & L. Gandin (Eds.), *The Routledge international handbook of the sociology of education* (pp. 109-120). Oxon, U.K: Routledge.

Viruell-Fuentes, E., Miranda P., & Abdulrahimet, S. (2012). More than culture: Structural racism, intersectionality theory, and immigrant health. *Social Science & Medicine, 75*(12), 2099-2106.

Vuori, J. (2001). *Äidit, isät ja ammattilaiset. Sukupuoli, toisto ja muunnelmat asiantuntijoiden kirjoituksissa*. Tampereen Yliopistopaino.

Vähätalo, K. (1998). *Työttömyys ja suomalainen yhteiskunta*. Helsinki: Gaudeamus.

Väänänen, A., Toivanen, M., Aalto, A., Bergbom, B., Härkäpää, K., Jaakko-la, M., Koponen, P., Koskinen, S., Kuusio, H., Lindström, K., Malin, M., Makkula, H., Mertaniemi, R., Peltola, U., Seppälä, U., Tiitinen, E., Var-tia-Väänänen, M., Vuorenpää, M., Vuorento, M., & Wahlbeck, K. (2009). *Esiselvitysraportti. Maahanmuuttajien integroituminen suomalaiseen yhteiskuntaan elämän eri osa-alueilla. Sektoritutkimuksen neuvottelukunta*. Helsinki: Opetusministeriö.

Wahlbeck, Ö. (2007). Work in the kebab economy: A study of the ethnic economy of Turkish immigrants in Finland. *Ethnicities, 7*(4), 543-563.

Wahlbeck, Ö. (2008). Entrepreneurship as social status: Turkish immigrants' experiences of self-employment in Finland. *Migration Letters, 5*(1), 53-62.

Walby, S. (1997). *Gender transformations*. London: Routledge.

Wald, S., & Fang, T. (2008). Overeducated immigrants in the Canadian labour market: Evidence from the workplace and employee survey. *Canadian Public Policy, 34*(4), 457-480.

Wan, G. (2001). The learning experience of Chinese students in American universities: A cross-cultural perspective. *College Student Journal, 35*(1), 28-44.

Warinowski, A. (2012). *Maailmalle yhtenä, takaisin toisena? Suomalaisten ekspatriaattiperheiden lapset kulttuurisissa siirtymissä*. Siirtolaisuusinstituuttin tutkimuksia A 42, Turku: Painosalama.

Watkins, D. (2000). Learning and teaching: A cross-cultural perspective. *School Leadership & Management, 20*(2), 161-173.

Watkins, D., & Biggs, J. (2001). The paradox of the Chinese learner and beyond. In D. Watkins & J. Biggs (Eds.), *Teaching the Chinese learner: Psychological and pedagogical perspectives* (pp. 3-23). Hong Kong/Melbourne: Comparative Education Research Centre/Australian Council for Educational Research.

Webb, J., Schirato, T., & Danaher, G. (2002). *Understanding Bourdieu*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.

Webster, L., & Mertova, P. (2007). *Using narrative inquiry as a research method*. New York: Routledge, Taylor & Francis.

Weinstein, M., Sun, T., Chang, M., & Freedman, R. (1994). Co-residence and other ties linking couples and their parents. In A. Thornton & H. Lin (Eds.), *Social change and the family in Taiwan* (pp. 305-334). Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.

Weis, L. (2010). Social class and schooling. In M. Apple, S. Ball & L. Gandin (Eds.), *The Routledge international handbook of the sociology of education* (pp. 414-423). Oxon, U.K: Routledge.

Weissmann, E. (2013). Excluded from the institutional habitus: The joint student experience. *Journal of Further and Higher Education, 37*(2), 261-279.

Wengraf, T. (2001). *Qualitative research interviewing: Biographic narrative and semi-structured methods*. London: SAGE publications.

White, J. (1999). *Taking language seriously: The narrative foundations of public administration research*. Washington, DC: Georgetown University Press.

Williams, G. (2010). *The knowledge economy, language and culture*. Bristol: Multilingual Matters.

Williams, J. (2000). *Unbending Gender: Why family and work conflict and what to do about it*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Wilson, M., Gahlout, P., Liu, L., & Mouly, S. (2005). A rose by any other name: The effect of ethnicity and name on access to employment. *University of Auckland Business Review, 7*, 65-72.

Winter-Ebmer, R. (1994). Motivation for migration and economic success. *Journal of Economic Psychology,12,* 269-284.

Wolcott, H. (1994). *Transforming qualitative data: Description, analysis, and interpretation*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Woollett, A., & Nicholson, P. (1998). The social construction of motherhood and fatherhood. In C. Niven & A. Walker (Eds.), *Current issues in infancy and parenthood* (Vol. 3, pp. 1-15). Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann.

Wrede, S., & Nordberg, C. (toim.). (2010). *Vieraita työssä. Työelämän etnistyvä eriarvoisuus*. Helsinki: Palmenia.

Wu, C. (2005). Attitude and behavior toward bilingualism for Chinese parents and children. In J. Cohen, K. McAlister, K. Rolstad & J. MacSwan (Eds.), *ISB4: Proceedings of the 4th international symposium on Bilingualism* (pp. 2385-2394). Somerville, MA: Cascadilla Press.

Yamamoto, Y. (2013). Social class and Japanese mothers' support for young children's education: A qualitative study. *Journal of Early Childhood Research*. Published online before print May 31, 2013, doi: 10.1177/1476718X13482303

Yang, J. (2010). *Parent-child dynamics and family solidarity: A comparative study of East Asian societies.* Paper presented at the 2010 Annual Meeting of PAA (Population Association of America) Session 108: Household Structure and Intergenerational Relationships in Historical and Comparative Perspective. 15-17.04.2010, Texas, USA.

Yeh, K. (1997). Changes in the Taiwan people's concept of filial piety. In L. Chang, Y. Lu & F. Wang (Eds.), *Taiwanese society in 1990s* (pp. 171-214). Taipei, Taiwan: Institute of Sociology, Academia Sinica (in Chinese).

Yeh, K., & Bedford, O. (2003). A test of the dual filial piety model. *Asian Journal of Social Psychology, 6*, 215-228.

Yi, C., & Chien, W. (2001). The continual employment patterns of married women in Taiwan: A compromise between family and work. *Taiwanese Sociology, 1*, 149-82. (in Chinese)

Yoon, T., Kim, K., & Eom, H. (2011). The border-crossing of habitus: Media consumption, motives, and reading strategies among Asian immigrant women in South Korea. *Media, Culture & Society, 33*(3), 415-431.

Yosso, T. (2005). Whose culture has capital? A critical race theory discussion of community cultural wealth. *Race, Ethnicity and Education, 8* (1), 69-91.

Yuval-Davis, N. (2006). Intersectionality and feminist politics. *European Journal of Women's Studies, 13*, 193-209.

Yuval-Davis, N. (2009). Intersectionality and feminist politics. In M. Berger & K. Guidroz (Eds.), *The intersectional approach: Transforming the academy through race, class & gender* (pp. 25-43). Chapel Hill, NC: The University of North Carolina Press.

Yuval-Davis, N. (2011). Beyond the recognition and re-distribution dichotomy: Intersectionality as stratification. In H. Lutz, M. Herrera Vivar & L. Supic (Eds.), *Framing Intersectionality: Debates on a Multi-faceted Concept in Gender Studies* (pp. 155-170). Farnham: Ashgate.

Zhang, S., & Carrasquillo, A. (1995). Chinese parents' influence on academic performance. *New York State Association for Bilingual Education Journal, 10*, 46-53.

Zhang, Y., Lin, M., Nonaka, A., & Beom, K. (2005). Harmony, hierarchy, and conservatism: A crosscultural comparison of Confucian values in China, Korea, Japan, and Taiwan. *Communication Research Report, 22,* 107-115.

Zinn, M., & Dill, B. (1994). *Women of color in U.S. society*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press.

# APPENDICES

***Appendix 1***

***Recruiting Research Participants***

Dear Taiwanese, Good Day!

In 2005, I started my PhD studies in Department of Education at University of Helsinki. I am conducting a research study to explore immigration experiences of the Taiwanese women who identify as immigrants living in Finland. For the time being, title of study is "Immigration Experiences of Taiwanese Women in Finland", which may be modified in the future. The purpose of this study is mainly to understand how the Taiwanese women utilize their educational qualifications and professional skills to integrate into the host society. I am, from the bottom of my heart, inviting your participation, which will involve telling your own immigration story in a one-to-one interview situation. Let's hope that the results of my study would bring some benefits to the host society.

The participant needs to meet the following requirement: You are a Taiwanese woman who is married to a Finn and live in Finland. The interview place, date, and time will be agreed upon with you. However, all of the interviews need to be conducted by the end of year 2006, according to my study plan.

If you are interested in voluntarily participating in this research study, please do not hesitate to contact me (either email or phone call). As soon as you confirm your interest, you will receive an information letter concerning more details about participating in my study. Thank you very much and with my best wishes. The following information is provided for your convenience.

PhD student: Chia-Chien Chang
Email: chia-chien.chang@helsinki.fi
TEL: 0408478XXX

***Appendix 2***

***Information Letter***

First of all, I appreciate your help in supporting this study. For the time being, title of my study is "Immigration Experiences of Taiwanese Women in Finland", which might be modified in the future. The life-story interview will be used in a one-to-one interview situation. The purpose of this study is mainly to understand how the Taiwanese women utilize their educational qualifications and professional skills to integrate into the host society. I believe the results of the study can benefit the field of immigration studies in the host society. It is a great honor and privilege to have you in my study. Thank you very much for taking part in this study.

You can choose the interview time and place according to your own schedule. You are welcome to have the interview in my home if you wish. Interview language is mainly Chinese, Taiwanese as well if you wish. You are invited to tell your own story in your own words based on your own experiences of rebuilding a life in Finland. You will be asked one question: "Can you tell me about your immigration experiences in Finland?" Basically, there is no set of questions and answers in the interview. You can fully decide what and how much you want to share with me. During the interview, I will take some notes and all interviews need to be audio-recorded by a digital voice recorder. If the interview place is your home, I would like to take some photos of your place. A copy of the transcript will be delivered to you by email, or a printed version of the transcript if you wish, within a month following the interview. In order to avoid misrepresentation and misunderstandings, you will be invited to review the Chinese transcripts and to provide me with additions and corrections through email or on phone.

The use of pseudonyms (pseudo-names) will be the masking technique. Family details, such as your age, the number and gender of your children, will be changed and the identifiable characteristics will be altered in order to protect your confidentiality. Please feel free to express any concerns you may have regarding the privacy, confidentiality, and anonymity. The use of these data will be restricted to the research study, and the research results will be presented in my dissertation as well as in presentations at national or international academic conferences.

You have the option of withdrawing and discontinuing from the research at any point in time, with or without explanation, without penalty or prejudice. I will

fully respect your decision. If there are any questions that arise before the interview, please do not hesitate to contact me. The following information is provided for your convenience:

PhD student: Chia-Chien Chang
Email: chia-chien.chang@helsinki.fi
TEL: 0408478XXX

***Appendix 3***

***Consent Form***

I thank you for participating in my study. Before the research process can continue, please carefully review the information below concerning your rights in this study and ask any questions before you make a decision. Once all your questions have been answered to your satisfaction, please sign this consent form.

I am Chia-Chien Chang, PhD student in Department of Education at University of Helsinki. At the present time I am working on a doctoral dissertation researching how the Taiwanese women utilize their educational qualifications and professional skills to integrate into the host society.

You are invited to tell your own story in your own words based on your own experiences of rebuilding a life in Finland. During the interview, I will take notes and all interviews need to be audio-recorded with a digital recording device. A copy of the transcript made by me will be delivered to you (by email, or a printed version of the transcript if you wish) within a month following the interview. In order to avoid misrepresentation and misunderstandings, you will be invited to review the Chinese transcripts and to provide me with additions and corrections. All materials will be destroyed after the completion of research.

The data collected from you will be restricted to the research study. The use of pseudonyms will be the masking technique. Your family details, such as your age, the number and gender of your children, will be properly changed and the identifiable characteristics will be altered in order to protect your confidentiality. Please feel free to express any concerns you may have regarding the privacy, confidentiality, and anonymity. The research results will be presented in my dissertation as well as in presentations at national or international academic conferences.

By signing this consent form, you agree to participate in the study as it is described. You have the option of withdrawing and discontinuing from the research at any point in time, with or without explanation, without obligation or penalty.

I have read the information provided above. I voluntarily agree to participate in this study. By completing the interview, I indicate my consent to participate in the study.

There are two copies of this consent form, one of which you may keep.

| | |
|---|---|
| Signature of PhD student, Chia-Chien Chang | Date |
| Signature of the Participant, | Date |

***Appendix 4***

***Recruiting Research Participants in Chinese***

各位台灣姊妹們，大家好！

本人去年順利(2005)進入赫爾辛基大學教育所修讀博士學位，研究計劃已確定，初步研究名稱「台灣女性婚姻移民芬蘭之學習歷程與經驗」，此名稱將來還會根據研究發現適度調整。本研究屬於教育社會學領域的女性移民研究。希望這個研究不只是我一個人的學業成就，除了提供芬蘭人機會瞭解台灣女性努力融入芬蘭社會的經歷與瓶頸，也算是對海外的台灣同胞有所助益 。

徵求自願參與本研究的姊妹，礙於研究目的，只能邀請跨國婚姻而移居到芬蘭的台灣女性。屆時就是採面對面、一對一的 interview 訪談，全程會錄音，訪談地點由受訪者決定。我預定 2006 年底完成所有訪談。

有興趣的姊妹，歡迎加入本研究，請直接回覆 email 或打電話給我皆可。我會再進一步提供訪談細節與相關研究資料給有意願參與的受訪姊妹。衷心感謝，祝 平安如意。 以下聯繫方式，歡迎洽詢。

張家倩 Chia-Chien Chang
Email: chia-chien.chang@helsinki.fi
TEL: 0408478XXX
赫爾辛基大學教育(系)所

## *Appendix 5*

### *Information Letter in Chinese*

首先，由衷感謝妳加入本研究「台灣女性婚姻移民芬蘭之學習歷程與經驗」，此名稱極有可能會根據未來研究發現而適度調整。本研究透過敘說分析法，面對面，一對一訪談，以生活故事 life-story interview 方式收集妳所說的資料。參與本研究，代表著妳個人對女性、新移民、弱勢團體的實質支持，再次感謝妳的參與。

採訪地點以妳個人覺得方便與安心的地方為優先考量，可以是妳的住家，或是本人住家、或妳可以建議其他場所。訪談語言以妳的母語中文或台語為主。原則上，訪談主題是：妳可以跟我分享妳移居芬蘭的移民生活經驗嗎？本研究採取深入訪問，以生活故事方式收集妳所說的資料。所以只要是妳願意分享的，妳覺得重要的，妳的個人經驗與相關看法都是我本研究的研究重點，訪談時間與次數並無特別預設值，妳盡可暢所欲言。訪談的過程，為了避免資料遺漏及方便整理成逐字搞，必須全程錄音。如果訪談地點是於妳府上，經妳同意，我也會進行地點拍照。訪談的內容繕打成逐字稿後，會隨即複製一份文字稿給妳，以便讓妳確認訪談內容是否有誤解之處。一旦確認無誤，做完資料分析後，錄音內容將會銷毀。

本研究的訪談內容作為學術研究之用，我不會將訪談內容或過程告知其他人，我會謹守研究倫理。研究論文中妳的名字將會以暱稱代替您的真實姓名，妳的年齡、小孩人數與性別也會稍微調整，以便進一步確保妳的個人隱私保密性；若妳提到他人名字時，也會用暱稱取代。研究所得資料可能發表於學術雜誌，但不會公佈妳個人資料之隱私。

此外，妳有權利拒絕或隨時退出本研究。訪問過程，妳隨時可以中斷或退出研究，並有權收回已經提供的所有資料，而不會受到任何損傷。妳不需要任何理由，可隨時撤銷同意，退出研究，我將會尊重您的意願，且不會引起任何不愉快以及任何不良後果。如有任何相關問題，以下聯繫方式，歡迎洽詢。

張家倩 Chia-Chien Chang
Email: chia-chien.chang@helsinki.fi
電話：0408478XXX
地址：Liljatie XXX, 01300, Vantaa

***Appendix 6***

***Consent Form in Chinese***

受訪同意書

首先謝謝妳同意參與本研究，給我這個機會分享妳的移民生活故事。在訪問之前，請妳詳讀以下關於研究內容及妳參與本研究的權利，若有任何疑問，本人願意立即進一步說明。最後，請妳在受訪同意書上親筆簽名。

本人張家倩目前就讀赫爾辛基大學教育所博士班，論文研究針對台灣女性在芬蘭的移民經驗。本研究的目的主要是要瞭解台灣女性如何融入芬蘭社會的瓶頸與生活經驗。

訪談的過程，為了避免資料遺漏及方便整理成逐字搞，必須全程錄音。錄音內容只供研究者本人進行研究使用，不會提供給他人。第一次訪談結束後，如果妳或本人有相關疑問想進一步澄清，經過彼此同意，可以進行第二次、甚至第三次訪談。訪談的內容繕打成逐字稿後，隨即複製一份文字稿給妳，以便讓妳確認訪談內容是否有出現妳覺得不妥當之處。一旦確認無誤，做完資料分析後，錄音內容將會銷毀。

本研究的訪談內容作為學術研究之用，我不會將訪談內容或過程告知其他人，我會謹守研究倫理。研究論文中妳的名字將會以暱稱代替您的真實姓名，妳的年齡、小孩人數與性別也會稍微調整，以便進一步確保妳的個人隱私之保密性；若妳提到他人名字時，也會用暱稱取代。研究所得資料未來可能發表於學術期刊，但不會公佈妳個人資料之隱私。

妳有權利拒絕或隨時退出本研究。訪問過程，妳隨時可以中斷或退出研究，並有權收回已經提供的所有資料，而不會受到任何損傷。妳不需要任何理由，可隨時撤銷同意，退出研究，我將會尊重您的意願，且不會引起任何不愉快以及任何不良後果。

若妳同意以上內容，請妳於下方欄位親筆簽名並載明日期，本人在此致上萬分的謝意，由衷感謝妳參與本研究。

赫爾辛基大學教育(系)所
博士班研究生
張家倩 Chia-Chien Chang
Email: chia-chien.chang@helsinki.fi

我閱讀過上述的說明，也清楚瞭解相關的細節與我的權利，我願意接受訪問。本同意書正本兩份分別由受訪者與研究者存留。

研究者簽名：　日期：
受訪者簽名：　日期：